Erratum: Modeling ringdown: Beyond the fundamental quasinormal modes [Phys. Rev. D 90, 124032 (2014)]

L. T. London, 1,2 James Healy, and Deirdre Shoemaker 2

¹School of Physics and Astronomy, Cardiff University, The Parade, Cardiff, CF24 3AA, United Kingdom

²Center for Relativistic Astrophysics, School of Physics,

Georgia Institute of Technology, Atlanta, Georgia 30332, USA

³Center for Computational Relativity and Gravitation, School of Mathematical Sciences,

Rochester Institute of Technology, Rochester, New York 14623, USA

While we currently present corrections and modifications to a subset of the tables, equations and figures in [1], the work's core findings and conclusions do not change: here, we modify the fitting formula, update plots containing overtones, and make a corrections to appropriate equations. We have provided a public IPython notebook to accompany this erratum on github [2].

The algorithm used to generate Tables IV and V, as well as Equations (2-7) in [1] were found to be affected by an indexing error, through which the remnant black hole spin was erroneously equated with the remnant's mass. In addition, the authors now choose to modify the fitting ansatz given by Equation (38) and (A2) such that overall factors of the symmetric mass ratio η do not increase with overtone number. This is motivated by the linearity of the 1st order Quasi-Normal Modes (QNMs) as $\eta \to 0$, and is consistent with Equation (35) of [1]. Correcting the indexing error, and enforcing the more appropriate fitting ansatz for the overtones results in Equations (1-9).

$$A_{220}(\eta) = \tilde{\omega}_{220}^2 \left(0.9252 \, e^{0.0000i} \eta + 0.1323 \, e^{0.0000i} \eta^2\right) \tag{1}$$

$$A_{221}(\eta) = \tilde{\omega}_{221}^2 \left(0.1275 \, e^{5.3106i} \eta + 1.1882 \, e^{0.4873i} \eta^2 + 8.2709 \, e^{3.3895i} \eta^3 + 26.2329 \, e^{0.1372i} \eta^4 \right) \tag{2}$$

$$A_{210}(\eta) = \tilde{\omega}_{210}^2 \sqrt{1 - 4\eta} \left(0.4795 e^{3.5587i} \eta + 1.1736 e^{1.5679i} \eta^2 + 1.2303 e^{6.0496i} \eta^3 \right)$$
 (3)

$$A_{330}(\eta) = \tilde{\omega}_{330}^2 \sqrt{1 - 4\eta} \left(0.4247 e^{5.4979i} \eta + 1.4742 e^{3.6524i} \eta^2 + 4.3139 e^{6.0787i} \eta^3 + 15.7264 e^{3.2053i} \eta^4 \right) \tag{4}$$

$$A_{331}(\eta) = \tilde{\omega}_{331}^2 \sqrt{1 - 4\eta} \left(0.1480 e^{2.9908i} \eta + 1.4874 e^{0.5635i} \eta^2 + 10.1637 e^{4.2348i} \eta^3 + 29.4786 e^{1.7619i} \eta^4 \right)$$
 (5)

$$A_{320}(\eta) = \tilde{\omega}_{320}^2 \left(0.1957 e^{5.8008i} \eta + 1.5830 e^{3.2194i} \eta^2 + 5.0338 e^{0.6843i} \eta^3 + 3.7366 e^{4.1217i} \eta^4\right) \tag{6}$$

$$A_{440}(\eta) = \tilde{\omega}_{440}^2 \left(0.2531 \, e^{1.5961 i} \eta + 2.4040 \, e^{5.1851 i} \eta^2 + 14.7273 \, e^{1.9953 i} \eta^3 + 67.3624 \, e^{4.9143 i} \eta^4 + 126.5858 \, e^{1.8502 i} \eta^5\right) \tag{7}$$

$$A_{430}(\eta) = \tilde{\omega}_{430}^2 \sqrt{1 - 4\eta} \left(0.0938 \, e^{3.2607i} \eta + 0.8273 \, e^{0.7704i} \eta^2 + 3.3385 \, e^{4.8264i} \eta^3 + 4.6639 \, e^{2.7047i} \eta^4 \right) \tag{8}$$

$$A_{550}(\eta) = \tilde{\omega}_{550}^2 \sqrt{1 - 4\eta} \left(0.1548 \, e^{5.3772i} \eta + 1.5091 \, e^{2.5764i} \eta^2 + 8.9333 \, e^{5.5995i} \eta^3 + 42.3431 \, e^{2.1269i} \eta^4 + 89.1947 \, e^{5.3348i} \eta^5 \right)$$
 (9)

Related Figure Changes – The changes above superficially affect Figures 7-9, 12 & 14. Updated figures cannot be distinguished from those present in [1]; therefore they will not be amended here.

Other Comments – The equation just prior to Equation (32) is missing a factor of 2 in its exponent and thus should read $\tilde{\omega}_{lmn}^2 = |\tilde{\omega}_{lmn}|^2 e^{-2\varphi_{lmn}}$. The first line of Equation (32) should contain $\tilde{\omega}_{lmn}^2$ not $\tilde{\omega}_{nlm}^2$. In Equations (1-9), the authors choose to omit the $(l, m, n) \in \{(5, 4, 0), (2, 2, 2)\}$ QNMs due to data quality concerns.

^[1] L. London, D. Shoemaker, and J. Healy, "Modeling ringdown: Beyond the fundamental quasinormal modes," *Phys. Rev.*, vol. D90, no. 12, p. 124032, 2014.

^[2] L. London, "erratum-arxiv-1404.3197." https://github.com/llondon6/erratum-arXiv-1404.3197, 2016.