

# Assessing The Limits of Synthetic Controls: On the Estimation of Causal Effects in Time Series Data Structures

Lennart Boldwin<sup>1</sup>, Justus Töhns<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1,2</sup> University of Cologne, Chair of Statistics and Econometrics  
Supervised by Prof. Jörg Breitung

---

## Abstract

Potential framework: We argue that applications of Synthetic Controls (SC) are faced with a self-selection problem. That is, the method is primarily applied to non-complex data structures that are straightforward to forecast, given the availability of donors in the post-treatment period. Using Monte Carlo studies, we show that the high interpretability of SC comes at the costs of poor predictions and forecasts, which are especially pronounced if the data generating process contains a time series structure. To address this issue, we introduce the intricacy-statistics that informs the applied researcher whether or not the data at hand exceeds a level of time series structure that SC can handle. If the case, more flexible methodologies that combine the strengths of SC and conventional time series techniques promise more accurate predictions and forecasts. Hence we introduce the new VAR-SC estimator, that takes in account both the time series structure and the availability of donors. In order to implement these ideas, we introduce the R-package `complex_synths` that provides ready-to-use functions to compute the intricacy-statistics and, based on the magnitude of the statistics, the functionalities to estimate either the SC or the VAR-SC model. To probe the performance of our methodology outside the experimental setting, we apply it to existing application of SC and to a highly complex data structure: The inclusion of a stock in an index. Specifically, we find that the inclusion of the German multi-national eCommerce company Zalando in the German stock index (DAX) caused an excess capitalization of XXX million euro.

**Keywords:** *Causality; Enjoy Machine Learning*

---

## 1. Introduction (10pt, bold)

some text

## 2. Research Design (10pt, bold)

some text

### 2.1. Case without Covariates (10pt, bold)

some text

### 2.2. Case with Covariates (10pt, bold)

some text

**3. Monte Carlo Study (10pt, bold)**

some text

**4. Empirical Applications (10pt, bold)**

some text

**4.1. Existing Applications (10pt, bold)**

some text

**4.2. The Zalando case/ whatever (10pt, bold)**

some text

**5. Concluding Remarks (if any)**

One influential paper was written by Alberto Abadie [[Abadie, 2021](#)]  
Another one by XXX [[Abadie et al., 2007](#)]  
Another one by XXX [[Hainmueller et al., 2011](#)]  
Another one by XXX [[Abadie and Gardeazabal, 2003](#)]  
Another one by XXX [[Abadie and L'Hour, 2021](#)]  
Another one by XXX [[Amjad et al., 2018](#)]  
Another one by XXX [[Arkhangelsky et al., 2021](#)]  
Another one by XXX [[Athey et al., 2017](#)]  
Another one by XXX [[Athey and Imbens, 2016](#)]

**References**

- [Abadie, 2021] Abadie, A. (2021). Using synthetic controls: Feasibility, data requirements, and methodological aspects. *Journal of Economic Literature*, 59(2):391–425.
- [Abadie et al., 2007] Abadie, A., Diamond, A., and Hainmueller, J. (2007). Synthetic control methods for comparative case studies: Estimating the effect of california’s tobacco control program. *Journal of the American Statistical Association*, 105:493–505.
- [Abadie and Gardeazabal, 2003] Abadie, A. and Gardeazabal, J. (2003). The economic costs of conflict: A case study of the basque country. *American Economic Review*, 93:113–132.
- [Abadie and L’Hour, 2021] Abadie, A. and L’Hour, J. (2021). A penalized synthetic control estimator for disaggregated data. *Journal of the American Statistical Association*, 116:1–34.
- [Amjad et al., 2018] Amjad, M., Shah, D., and Shen, D. (2018). Robust synthetic control. *Journal of the American Statistical Association*, pages 1–51.
- [Arkhangelsky et al., 2021] Arkhangelsky, D., Athey, S., Hirshberg, D., Imbens, G., and Wager, S. (2021). Synthetic difference-in-differences. *American Economic Review*, 111:4088–4118.
- [Athey et al., 2017] Athey, S., Bayati, M., Doudchenko, N., Imbens, G., and Khosravi, K. (2017). Matrix completion methods for causal panel data models. *Journal of the American Statistical Association*, 116.
- [Athey and Imbens, 2016] Athey, S. and Imbens, G. (2016). The state of applied econometrics - causality and policy evaluation. *Journal of Economic Perspectives*, 31.
- [Hainmueller et al., 2011] Hainmueller, J., Diamond, A., and Abadie, A. (2011). Synth: An r package for synthetic control methods in comparative case studies. *Journal of Statistical Software*, 42.