

network *inference*

introduction to *network analysis* (*ina*)

Lovro Šubelj  
University of Ljubljana  
spring 2021/22

# inference *overview*

- *inferring missing/spurious/hidden nodes/links*
  - due to *sampling, errors, noise* or *other* [GSP09, MBN15]
  - from *network structure, dynamics* or *other* [GRLK12]
- popular *predicting future links* that are likely to occur
  - recommendation of *friendship ties* on *Facebook* [BL11]
  - prediction of *product ratings* on *Amazon* [GLGMSP16]
  - prediction for costly *protein interaction* networks etc.



real, observed & reconstructed air transportation network [GSP09]

link *prediction*

introduction to *network analysis* (*ina*)

Lovro Šubelj  
University of Ljubljana  
spring 2021/22

## prediction *overview*

which *links* are most *likely to occur*?

- link prediction by *local structure/dynamics*
  - *structural equivalence* [LW71] and *topological overlap* [RSM<sup>+</sup>02]
  - *node similarity* [LHN06] and *local dynamics* indices [ZLZ09]
- link prediction by *global structure/dynamics*
  - *regular equivalence* [WR83] and *link analysis* algorithms [JW02]
  - *community detection* [GN02] and *blockmodeling* [DBF05, Pei15]
- link prediction by *maximum likelihood* methods
  - *hierarchical* [CMN08] and *stochastic block* models [GSP09]
- link prediction by *probabilistic inference* methods
  - *probabilistic relational* models [FGKP99, SPH06]

## prediction *equivalence*

*links* predicted by *structural equivalence*

- *common neighbors index* [LW71] for  $i$  and  $j$  is

$$s_{ij} = \sum_x A_{ix} A_{xj} = |\Gamma_i \cap \Gamma_j|$$

- *Jaccard neighbors index* [Jac01] for  $i$  and  $j$  is

$$s_{ij} = \frac{\sum_x A_{ix} A_{xj}}{\sum_x A_{ix} + \sum_x A_{xj} - \sum_x A_{ix} A_{xj}} = \frac{|\Gamma_i \cap \Gamma_j|}{|\Gamma_i \cup \Gamma_j|}$$

- *Salton cosine similarity* [SM83] for  $i$  and  $j$  is

$$s_{ij} = \cos \theta_{ij} = \frac{\sum_x A_{ix} A_{xj}}{\sqrt{\sum_x A_{ix}^2} \sqrt{\sum_x A_{jx}^2}} = \frac{|\Gamma_i \cap \Gamma_j|}{\sqrt{k_i k_j}}$$

- *Leicht similarity index* [LHN06] for  $i$  and  $j$  is

$$s_{ij} = \frac{n \sum_x A_{ix} A_{xj}}{\sum_x A_{ix} \sum_x A_{jx}} = \frac{|\Gamma_i \cap \Gamma_j|}{k_i k_j / n} \approx \frac{|\Gamma_i \cap \Gamma_j|}{k_i k_j}$$

## prediction *overlap*

*links* predicted by *topological overlap*

- *Sørensen neighbors index* [Sør48] for  $i$  and  $j$  is

$$s_{ij} = \frac{\sum_x A_{ix} A_{xj}}{\frac{1}{2}(\sum_x A_{ix} + \sum_x A_{xj})} = \frac{|\Gamma_i \cap \Gamma_j|}{\frac{1}{2}(k_i + k_j)} \approx \frac{|\Gamma_i \cap \Gamma_j|}{k_i + k_j}$$

- *hub promoted index* [RSM<sup>+</sup>02] for  $i$  and  $j$  is

$$s_{ij} = \frac{\sum_x A_{ix} A_{xj}}{\min(\sum_x A_{ix}, \sum_x A_{xj})} = \frac{|\Gamma_i \cap \Gamma_j|}{\min(k_i, k_j)}$$

- *hub depressed index* [LZ10] for  $i$  and  $j$  is

$$s_{ij} = \frac{\sum_x A_{ix} A_{xj}}{\max(\sum_x A_{ix}, \sum_x A_{xj})} = \frac{|\Gamma_i \cap \Gamma_j|}{\max(k_i, k_j)}$$

# prediction *models*

*links* predicted by *graph/network models*

- *configuration model index* [LHN06] for  $i$  and  $j$  is

$$s_{ij} = \frac{n \sum_x A_{ix} A_{xj}}{\sum_x A_{ix} \sum_x A_{jx}} = \frac{|\Gamma_i \cap \Gamma_j|}{k_i k_j / n} \approx \frac{|\Gamma_i \cap \Gamma_j|}{k_i k_j}$$

- *preferential attachment index* [BA99] for  $i$  and  $j$  is

$$s_{ij} = \sum_x A_{ix} \sum_x A_{xj} = k_i k_j$$

- *random graph index* [ER59] for  $i$  and  $j$  is

$$s_{ij} = \frac{\langle k \rangle}{n-1} \approx \text{const.}$$

## prediction *dynamics*

*links* predicted by *local dynamics*

- *resource allocation index* [ZLZ09] for *i* and *j* is

$$s_{ij} = \sum_x \frac{A_{ix}A_{xj}}{\sum_y A_{xy}} = \sum_{x \in \Gamma_i \cap \Gamma_j} \frac{1}{k_x}$$

- *Adamic-Adar similarity index* [AA03] for *i* and *j* is

$$s_{ij} = \sum_x \frac{A_{ix}A_{xj}}{\log \sum_y A_{xy}} = \sum_{x \in \Gamma_i \cap \Gamma_j} \frac{1}{\log k_x}$$

- *random walk similarity index* [TFP06] for *i* and *j* is

$$p_i^t = \alpha \sum_{j \in \Gamma_i} p_j^t / k_j + (1 - \alpha) \delta_{it} \qquad s_{ij} = p_i^j + p_j^i$$



## prediction *clusters*

*links* predicted by *node clusters*

- *community structure index* [YG11] for  $i$  and  $j$  is
  - $\{C\}$  *communities* by *Louvain* [BGLL08] or *Infomap* [RB08]
  - $n_i$  and  $m_{c_i}$  *number of nodes* and *links* within  $C_i$

$$s_{ij} = \begin{cases} \frac{m_{c_i}}{\binom{n_i}{2}} & \text{if } c_i = c_j \\ -\infty & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

- *block model index* [HLL83, DBF05] for  $i$  and  $j$  is
  - $\{C\}$  *clusters* by *stochastic block models* [Pei15]
  - $m_{c_i c_j}$  *number of links* between  $C_i$  and  $C_j$

$$s_{ij} = \begin{cases} \frac{m_{c_i}}{\binom{n_i}{2}} & \text{if } c_i = c_j \\ \frac{m_{c_i c_j}}{n_i n_j} & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

# prediction *framework*

link *prediction* as *ranking problem*

— *standard link prediction* setting

1.  $L_N \leftarrow$  randomly *sample*  $m/10$  *unlinked nodes*  $\{i, j\} \notin L$
2.  $L_P \leftarrow$  *remove* random  $m/10$  *node links*  $\{i, j\} \in L$
3. *compute*  $s_{ij}$  for  $\{i, j\} \in L_N \cup L_P$  on *resulting*  $L$

— *temporal link prediction* setting

1.  $L_N \leftarrow$  randomly *sample*  $|L_P|$  *unlinked nodes*  $\{i, j\} \notin L$
2.  $L_P \leftarrow$  *remove node links*  $\{i, j\} \in L$  *after time*  $t$
3. *compute*  $s_{ij}$  for  $\{i, j\} \in L_N \cup L_P$  on  $L$  *at time*  $t$

— *Pearson/Spearman correlation* or *AUC measure*

$$\left[ \overbrace{0 \ 0 \ 0 \ \dots \ 0 \ 0 \ 0}^{\text{ideal } s_{ij} \text{ for } L_N} \ \overbrace{1 \ 1 \ 1 \ \dots \ 1 \ 1 \ 1}^{\text{ideal } s_{ij} \text{ for } L_P} \right]$$

## prediction *scale-free*

— *link prediction* in synthetic *scale-free graph* [BA99]

1st *highest AUC* by *stochastic block models* [Pei15]

2nd *highest AUC* by *preferential attachment* [BA99]

class	index	Pearson	Spearman	AUC
models	<i>preferential</i>	0.128	0.347	<i>0.701</i>
equivalence	neighbors	0.105	0.135	0.530
	Jaccard	0.019	0.131	0.529
	Salton	0.043	0.131	0.529
	Leicht	-0.008	0.131	0.529
dynamics	allocation	0.091	0.135	0.530
	Adamic-Adar	0.104	0.135	0.530
clusters	modularity	0.002	0.005	0.502
	map equation	0.009	0.034	0.503
	<i>block model</i>	0.168	0.370	<i>0.711</i>
baseline	random	-0.001	-0.001	0.499

# prediction *small-world*

— *link prediction* in synthetic *small-world graph* [WS98]

1st *highest AUC* by *stochastic block models* [Pei15]

2nd *highest AUC* by *common neighbors index* [LW71]

class	index	Pearson	Spearman	AUC
models	preferential	−0.563	−0.547	0.187
equivalence	<i>neighbors</i>	0.721	0.786	<b>0.903</b>
	<i>Jaccard</i>	0.686	0.785	<b>0.903</b>
	<i>Salton</i>	0.729	0.785	<b>0.902</b>
	<i>Leicht</i>	0.730	0.785	<b>0.903</b>
dynamics	<i>allocation</i>	0.719	0.785	<b>0.902</b>
	<i>Adamic-Adar</i>	0.720	0.785	<b>0.902</b>
clusters	modularity	0.743	0.754	0.885
	map equation	0.643	0.649	0.807
	<i>block model</i>	0.737	0.754	<b>0.931</b>
baseline	random	−0.003	−0.002	0.499

## prediction *human*

— *link prediction* in *human protein interaction* map

1st *highest AUC* by *stochastic block models* [Pei15]

2nd *highest AUC* by *preferential attachment* [BA99]

class	index	Pearson	Spearman	AUC
models	<i>preferential</i>	0.231	0.719	<i>0.915</i>
equivalence	neighbors	0.342	0.676	0.845
	Jaccard	0.301	0.648	0.830
	Salton	0.391	0.646	0.830
	Leicht	-0.005	0.625	0.819
dynamics	allocation	0.291	0.681	0.847
	Adamic-Adar	0.343	0.680	0.847
clusters	modularity	0.284	0.381	0.672
	map equation	0.220	0.408	0.660
	<i>block model</i>	0.344	0.746	<i>0.929</i>
baseline	random	0.000	0.000	0.500

# prediction *P2P*

— *link prediction* in *P2P file transfer* network [LKF07]

1st *highest AUC* by *stochastic block models* [Pei15]

2nd *highest AUC* by *preferential attachment* [BA99]

class	index	Pearson	Spearman	AUC
models	<i>preferential</i>	0.379	0.378	<i>0.717</i>
equivalence	neighbors	0.113	0.120	0.515
	Jaccard	0.093	0.120	0.515
	Salton	0.098	0.120	0.515
	Leicht	0.055	0.120	0.515
dynamics	allocation	0.087	0.120	0.515
	Adamic-Adar	0.102	0.120	0.515
clusters	modularity	0.081	0.121	0.531
	map equation	0.096	0.113	0.513
	<i>block model</i>	0.487	0.621	<i>0.837</i>
baseline	random	-0.002	-0.002	0.499

# prediction *IMDb*

— *link prediction* in *IMDb collaboration* network [BA99]

1st *highest AUC* by *stochastic block models* [Pei15]

2nd *highest AUC* by *resource allocation index* [ZLZ09]

class	index	Pearson	Spearman	AUC
models	preferential	0.359	0.589	0.840
equivalence	<i>neighbors</i>	0.491	0.875	<i>0.970</i>
	<i>Jaccard</i>	0.609	0.876	<i>0.970</i>
	<i>Salton</i>	0.724	0.877	<i>0.970</i>
	<i>Leicht</i>	0.355	0.869	<i>0.967</i>
dynamics	<i>allocation</i>	0.627	0.878	<i>0.971</i>
	<i>Adamic-Adar</i>	0.520	0.876	<i>0.970</i>
clusters	modularity	0.345	0.826	0.948
	map equation	0.421	0.785	0.909
	<i>block model</i>	0.544	0.856	<i>0.986</i>
baseline	random	−0.003	−0.003	0.498

# prediction *nd.edu*

- *link prediction* in *nd.edu web* graph [BA99]
  - 1st *highest AUC* by *modularity optimization* [BGLL08]
  - 2nd *highest AUC* by *resource allocation index* [ZLZ09]

class	index	Pearson	Spearman	AUC
models	preferential	0.094	0.548	0.816
equivalence	<i>neighbors</i>	0.346	0.717	<i>0.855</i>
	<i>Jaccard</i>	0.453	0.716	<i>0.854</i>
	<i>Salton</i>	0.526	0.716	<i>0.854</i>
	<i>Leicht</i>	0.257	0.715	<i>0.854</i>
dynamics	<i>allocation</i>	0.181	0.718	<i>0.855</i>
	<i>Adamic-Adar</i>	0.334	0.718	<i>0.855</i>
clusters	<i>modularity</i>	0.197	0.767	<i>0.893</i>
	map equation	0.391	0.703	0.844
	block model	-	-	-
baseline	random	-0.001	-0.001	0.499



# prediction WoS

- *link prediction* in *WoS citation* network [ŠF17]
  - 1st *highest AUC* by *modularity optimization* [BGLL08]
  - 2nd *highest AUC* by *common neighbors index* [LW71]

class	index	Pearson	Spearman	AUC
models	preferential	0.082	0.509	0.794
equivalence	<i>neighbors</i>	0.434	0.754	0.880
	<i>Jaccard</i>	0.499	0.753	0.880
	<i>Salton</i>	0.574	0.753	0.880
	<i>Leicht</i>	0.258	0.753	0.880
dynamics	<i>allocation</i>	0.449	0.754	0.880
	<i>Adamic-Adar</i>	0.454	0.754	0.880
clusters	<i>modularity</i>	0.082	0.779	0.908
	map equation	0.392	0.546	0.734
	block model	-	-	-
baseline	random	0.000	0.000	0.500

# prediction *Texas*

- *link prediction* in *Texas road* map [LLDM09]
  - 1st *highest AUC* by *modularity optimization* [BGLL08]
  - 2nd *highest AUC* by *map equation method* [RB08]

class	index	Pearson	Spearman	AUC
models	<i>preferential</i>	−0.353	−0.311	<i>0.322</i>
equivalence	neighbors	0.230	0.233	0.551
	Jaccard	0.217	0.232	0.551
	Salton	0.225	0.232	0.551
	Leicht	0.202	0.232	0.551
dynamics	allocation	0.225	0.232	0.551
	Adamic-Adar	0.225	0.232	0.551
clusters	<i>modularity</i>	0.060	0.736	<i>0.868</i>
	<i>map equation</i>	0.335	0.362	<i>0.616</i>
	block model	-	-	-
baseline	random	0.000	0.000	0.500

# inference *references*



Lada A Adamic and Eytan Adar.  
Friends and neighbors on the Web.  
*Soc. Networks*, 25(3):211–230, 2003.



A.-L. Barabási and R. Albert.  
Emergence of scaling in random networks.  
*Science*, 286(5439):509–512, 1999.



A.-L. Barabási.  
*Network Science*.  
Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2016.



V. D. Blondel, J.-L. Guillaume, R. Lambiotte, and E. Lefebvre.  
Fast unfolding of communities in large networks.  
*J. Stat. Mech.*, P10008, 2008.



Tom Britton and David Lindenstrand.  
Inhomogeneous epidemics on weighted networks.  
*e-print arXiv:11124718v1*, 2011.



Aaron Clauset, Christopher Moore, and M. E. J. Newman.  
Hierarchical structure and the prediction of missing links in networks.  
*Nature*, 453(7191):98–101, 2008.



Patrick Doreian, Vladimir Batagelj, and Anuska Ferligoj.  
*Generalized Blockmodeling*.  
Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2005.



Wouter de Nooy, Andrej Mrvar, and Vladimir Batagelj.  
*Exploratory Social Network Analysis with Pajek: Expanded and Revised Second Edition*.  
Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2011.

# inference *references*



David Easley and Jon Kleinberg.

*Networks, Crowds, and Markets: Reasoning About a Highly Connected World.*  
Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2010.



Ernesto Estrada and Philip A. Knight.

*A First Course in Network Theory.*  
Oxford University Press, 2015.



P. Erdős and A. Rényi.

On random graphs I.  
*Publ. Math. Debrecen*, 6:290–297, 1959.



Nir Friedman, Lise Getoor, Daphne Koller, and Avi Pfeffer.

Learning probabilistic relational models.  
In *Proceedings of the International Joint Conference on Artificial Intelligence*, pages 1300–1309, Stockholm, Sweden, 1999.



Antonia Godoy-Lorite, Roger Guimerà, Cristopher Moore, and Marta Sales-Pardo.

Accurate and scalable social recommendation using mixed-membership stochastic block models.  
*P. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA*, 113(50):14207–14212, 2016.



M. Girvan and M. E. J Newman.

Community structure in social and biological networks.  
*P. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA*, 99(12):7821–7826, 2002.



Manuel Gomez-Rodriguez, Jure Leskovec, and Andreas Krause.

Inferring networks of diffusion and influence.  
*ACM Trans. Knowl. Discov. Data*, 5(4):21, 2012.

# inference *references*



Roger Guimerà and Marta Sales-Pardo.

Missing and spurious interactions and the reconstruction of complex networks.  
*P. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA*, 106(52):22073–22078, 2009.



Paul W. Holland, Kathryn Blackmond Laskey, and Samuel Leinhardt.

Stochastic blockmodels: First steps.  
*Soc. Networks*, 5(2):109–137, 1983.



Paul Jaccard.

Étude comparative de la distribution florale dans une portion des Alpes et des Jura.  
*Bulletin del la Société Vaudoise des Sciences Naturelles*, 37:547–579, 1901.



G. Jeh and J. Widom.

SimRank: A measure of structural-context similarity.  
In *Proceedings of the ACM SIGKDD International Conference on Knowledge Discovery and Data Mining*, pages 538–543, 2002.



E. A. Leicht, Petter Holme, and M. E. J. Newman.

Vertex similarity in networks.  
*Phys. Rev. E*, 73(2):026120, 2006.



Jure Leskovec, Jon Kleinberg, and Christos Faloutsos.

Graph evolution: Densification and shrinking diameters.  
*ACM Trans. Knowl. Discov. Data*, 1(1):1–41, 2007.



Jure Leskovec, Kevin J Lang, Anirban Dasgupta, and Michael W Mahoney.

Community structure in large networks: Natural cluster sizes and the absence of large well-defined clusters.  
*Internet Math.*, 6(1):29–123, 2009.

# inference *references*



F. Lorrain and H. C. White.  
Structural equivalence of individuals in social networks.  
*J. Math. Sociol.*, 1(1):49–80, 1971.



Linyuan Lü and Tao Zhou.  
Link prediction in complex networks: A survey.  
*Physica A*, 2010.



Travis Martin, Brian Ball, and M. E. J. Newman.  
Structural inference for uncertain networks.  
*e-print arXiv:150605490v1*, 2015.



Mark E. J. Newman.  
*Networks*.  
Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2nd edition, 2018.



Tiago P. Peixoto.  
Model selection and hypothesis testing for large-scale network models with overlapping groups.  
*Phys. Rev. X*, 5(1):011033, 2015.



M. Rosvall and C. T. Bergstrom.  
Maps of random walks on complex networks reveal community structure.  
*P. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA*, 105(4):1118–1123, 2008.



E. Ravasz, A. L. Somera, D. A. Mongru, Z. N. Oltvai, and Albert-László Barabási.  
Hierarchical organization of modularity in metabolic networks.  
*Science*, 297(5586):1551–1555, 2002.



Lovro Šubelj and Dalibor Fiala.  
Publication boost in Web of Science journals and its effect on citation distributions.  
*J. Assoc. Inf. Sci. Tec.*, 68(4):1018–1023, 2017.

# inference *references*



G. Salton and M. J. McGill.

*Introduction to Modern Information Retrieval.*

McGraw-Hill, 1983.



Thorvald Julius Sørensen.

A method of establishing groups of equal amplitude in plant sociology based on similarity of species content and its application to analyses of the vegetation on Danish commons.

*Biol. Skr.*, 5:1–34, 1948.



B. Schölkopf, J. Platt, and T. Hofmann.

Stochastic relational models for discriminative link prediction.

In *Proceedings of the Neural Information Processing Systems Conference*, pages 1553–1560, 2006.



H. Tong, Christos Faloutsos, and Jia-Yu Pan.

Fast random walk with restart and its applications.

In *Proceedings of the IEEE International Conference on Data Mining*, pages 613–622, Washington, DC, USA, 2006.



D. R. White and K. P. Reitz.

Graph and semigroup homomorphisms on networks of relations.

*Soc. Networks*, 5(2):193–234, 1983.



D. J. Watts and S. H. Strogatz.

Collective dynamics of 'small-world' networks.

*Nature*, 393(6684):440–442, 1998.



Bowen Yan and Steve Gregory.

Finding missing edges and communities in incomplete networks.

*J. Phys. A: Math. Theor.*, 44(49):495102, 2011.

# inference *references*



Tao Zhou, Linyuan Lü, and Yi-Cheng Zhang.  
Predicting missing links via local information.  
*Eur. Phys. J. B*, 71(4):623–630, 2009.