

# Results

**Model** LeNet  
**Optimizer** SGD  
**Learning rate** 0.001  
**Batch size** 32  
*All attacks are black-box*

Method	Baseline	PGD linf, 10, 0.01					
Epochs	51						
Seed	Training time	Benign	4/255	8/255	16/255	32/255	
0	747		88.11	78.69	65.26	40.5	23.12
1	732		88.24	78.44	64.78	39.62	21.96
2	769		88.27	78.82	65.01	39.28	21.05
3	727		88.57	79.46	65.37	39.21	21.29
4	715		88.55	79.24	65.55	41	23.75
Mean	<b>738</b>		<b>88.35</b>	<b>78.93</b>	<b>65.19</b>	<b>39.92</b>	<b>22.23</b>
Std	20.78		0.2	0.41	0.3	0.79	1.17

Method	Isoreg	PGD linf, 10, 0.01					
Epochs	51						
Lambda	0.1						
Warm-up	1 epoch						
Epsilon	3.5 ~16/255						
Norm	Holder						
Seed	Training time	Benign	4/255	8/255	16/255	32/255	
0	3580		88.14	78.96	66.11	42.74	25.26
1	3650		88.12	78.22	65.07	40.88	24.08
2	3807		88.32	79.1	65.44	40.55	22.33
3	4029		88.6	79.47	66.07	41.14	22.95
4	3834		88.23	79.39	66.92	43.46	26.51
Mean	<b>3780</b>		<b>88.28</b>	<b>79.03</b>	<b>65.92</b>	<b>41.75</b>	<b>24.23</b>
Std	175.03		0.19	0.5	0.71	1.27	1.7

**Method** Isoreg

# Results

Epochs	51						
Lambda	3						
Warm-up	1 epoch						
Epsilon	3.5 ~16/255						
Norm	Holder		PGD linf, 10, 0.01				
Seed	Training time	Benign	4/255	8/255	16/255	32/255	
	0	3981	71.24	63.59	53.85	38.97	29.44
	1	4078	87.54	78.04	64.77	41.88	26.58
	2	3828	86.49	78.3	67.1	47.3	30.97
	3	3389	83.1	75.34	64.25	46.21	32.6
	4	3304	82.87	74.65	64.53	47.88	34.55
Mean		<b>3716</b>	<b>82.25</b>	<b>73.98</b>	<b>62.9</b>	<b>44.45</b>	<b>30.83</b>
Std		350.17	6.49	6.03	5.18	3.86	3.04

Method	Isoreg						
Epochs	51						
Lambda	4						
Warm-up	1 epoch						
Epsilon	3.5 ~16/255						
Norm	Holder		PGD linf, 10, 0.01				
Seed	Training time	Benign	4/255	8/255	16/255	32/255	
	5	3885	79.79	71.97	60.99	44.13	31.5
	6	3479	81.49	72.19	61.51	43.85	30.99
	7	3721	83.03	74.03	62.79	44.71	30.14
	8	3919	69.68	62.03	52.54	37.73	28.51
	9	3865	80.01	71.62	60.99	43.87	30.11
Mean		<b>3773.8</b>	<b>78.8</b>	<b>70.37</b>	<b>59.76</b>	<b>42.86</b>	<b>30.25</b>
Std		181.29	5.26	4.75	4.1	2.89	1.14

Method	Isoreg	
Epochs	51	
Lambda	2	
Warm-up	1 epoch	

# Results

<b>Epsilon</b>	3.5 ~16/255						
<b>Norm</b>	Holder		<b>PGD linf, 10, 0.01</b>				
<b>Seed</b>	<b>Training time</b>	<b>Benign</b>	<b>4/255</b>	<b>8/255</b>	<b>16/255</b>	<b>32/255</b>	
	0	3544	87.89	78.19	64.83	40.8	23.68
	1	3939	87.99	78.01	64.43	40.05	23.12
	2	4002	87.96	78.23	64.74	39.86	21.92
	3	3950	88.27	78.58	64.93	39.82	22.15
	4	3825	88.21	78.78	65.39	41.62	25.31
<b>Mean</b>	<b>3852</b>		<b>88.06</b>	<b>78.36</b>	<b>64.86</b>	<b>40.43</b>	<b>23.24</b>
<b>Std</b>	183.89		0.17	0.31	0.35	0.77	1.36

<b>Method</b>	Isoreg						
<b>Batch size</b>	64						
<b>Epochs</b>	51						
<b>Lambda</b>	3						
<b>Warm-up</b>	1 epoch						
<b>Epsilon</b>	3.5 ~16/255						
<b>Norm</b>	Holder		<b>PGD linf, 10, 0.01</b>				
<b>Seed</b>	<b>Training time</b>	<b>Benign</b>	<b>4/255</b>	<b>8/255</b>	<b>16/255</b>	<b>32/255</b>	
	10	2062	85.8	75.86	62.88	40.9	25.13
	11	2105	85.94	76.28	64.25	41.62	25.78
	12	2085	85.55	75.65	63.16	41.11	25.78
	13	2045	85.97	75.73	63.21	40.62	25.03
	14	2045	86.05	76	63.47	40.77	25.22
<b>Mean</b>	<b>2068.4</b>		<b>85.86</b>	<b>75.9</b>	<b>63.39</b>	<b>41</b>	<b>25.39</b>
<b>Std</b>	26.23		0.2	0.25	0.52	0.39	0.36

<b>Method</b>	Isoreg						
<b>Batch size</b>	64						
<b>Epochs</b>	51						
<b>Lambda</b>	12						
<b>Warm-up</b>	1 epoch						
<b>Epsilon</b>	3.5 ~16/255						

# Results

Norm Seed	Holder		PGD linf, 10, 0.01				
	Training time	Benign	4/255	8/255	16/255	32/255	
	15	1934	65.8	52.45	42.95	31.64	23.01
	16	1853	69.83	56.21	45.43	33.17	24.67
	17	1779	71.46	58.55	47.83	34.93	26.48
	18	1745	67.07	54.13	44.2	32.71	24.17
	19	1735	67.04	54.84	45.9	34.38	25.55
Mean	<b>1809.2</b>		<b>68.24</b>	<b>55.24</b>	<b>45.26</b>	<b>33.37</b>	<b>24.78</b>
Std	83.71		2.33	2.3	1.84	1.32	1.32

Method	Isoreg						
Batch size	128						
Epochs	51						
Lambda	4						
Warm-up	1 epoch						
Epsilon	3.5 ~16/255						
Norm Seed	Holder		PGD linf, 10, 0.01				
	Training time	Benign	4/255	8/255	16/255	32/255	
	30	1123	84.18	75.91	65.43	46.24	30.01
	31	1454	84.01	75.92	65.34	46.39	30.39
	32	1734	83.59	75.4	65.32	46.58	30.76
	33	1733	83.73	74.99	64.26	45.32	30.16
	34	1718	83.5	75.49	65.2	46.36	30.86
Mean	<b>1552.4</b>		<b>83.8</b>	<b>75.54</b>	<b>65.11</b>	<b>46.18</b>	<b>30.44</b>
Std	267.9		0.29	0.39	0.48	0.49	0.37

Method	Isorandom						
Batch size	64						
Epochs	51						
Lambda	5						
Warm-up	1 epoch						
Epsilon	3.5 ~16/255						
Norm	Holder		PGD linf, 10, 0.01				

# Results

Seed	Training time	Benign	4/255	8/255	16/255	32/255	
	0	1153	75.76	67.69	58.74	41.05	26.18
	1	1131	74.97	65.44	55.41	37.28	24.9
	2	1125	73.58	63.9	54.51	40.3	28.85
	3	1108	75.14	65.96	55.53	38.64	27.3
	4	1129	75.29	66.16	56.04	39.38	27.75
Mean		1129.2	74.95	65.83	56.05	39.33	27
Std		16.1	0.82	1.37	1.6	1.46	1.51

Method	Isorandom						
Batch size	64						
Epochs	51						
Lambda	3						
Warm-up	1 epoch						
Epsilon	3.5 ~16/255						
Norm	Holder						
Seed			PGD linf, 10, 0.01				
	Training time	Benign	4/255	8/255	16/255	32/255	
	0	1097	80.21	70.88	60.39	40.37	24.89
	1	1102	77.96	67.91	56.51	38.7	26.98
	2	1017	77.52	66.97	55.4	37.47	24.17
	3	1034	77.8	68.67	58.47	40.15	25.5
	4	1024	80.56	71.63	60.43	40.2	24.9
Mean	1054.8	78.81	69.21	58.24	39.38	25.29	
Std	41.29	1.45	1.98	2.27	1.26	1.06	

Method	Temperature						
Batch size	64						
Epochs	51						
Warm-up	2 epochs						
Epsilon	1.74 ~8/255		PGD linf, 10, 0.01				
Seed	Training time	Benign	4/255	8/255	16/255	32/255	
	0	2929	78.23	74.9	71.44	62.42	50.4
	1	2880	79.13	75.51	71.3	60.45	47.9

		Results					
	2	1842	79.2	75.72	71.46	60.95	47.94
	3	1739	78.91	75.16	71.04	60.91	47.52
	4	1735	79.47	75.56	71.33	60.33	48.04
Mean		<b>2225</b>	<b>78.99</b>	<b>75.37</b>	<b>71.31</b>	<b>61.01</b>	<b>48.36</b>
Std		622.02	0.47	0.33	0.17	0.83	1.16
Method	Eigenbound						
Epochs	51						
Lambda	2						
Warm-up	1 epoch						
Epsilon	3.5 ~16/255						
Norm	Holder						
Seed	Training time	Benign	PGD linf, 10, 0.01				
			4/255	8/255	16/255	32/255	
	0	3471	62.01	51.19	42.45	31.14	22.84
	1	3847	60.43	49.61	41.03	31.38	22.88
	2	3917	60.26	49.02	40.12	30.03	21.33
	3	3889	58.41	47.82	40.12	30.42	21.59
	4	3753	58.2	48	40.75	31.72	24.05
Mean		<b>3775.4</b>	<b>59.86</b>	<b>49.13</b>	<b>40.89</b>	<b>30.94</b>	<b>22.54</b>
Std		181.14	1.58	1.37	0.96	0.7	1.1
Method	Teacher						
Epochs	51						
Temp	20						
Seed	Training time	Benign	PGD linf, 10, 0.01				
			4/255	8/255	16/255	32/255	
	-5	832	81.36	75.02	66.66	49.77	34.01
	-4	838	81.68	74.92	65.92	48.41	32.44
	-3	831	81.3	75.2	68	53.05	37.63
	-2	834	81.09	74.67	66.92	51.03	35.64
	-1	850	81.23	75.22	67.12	51.45	35.82
Mean		<b>837</b>	<b>81.33</b>	<b>75.01</b>	<b>66.92</b>	<b>50.74</b>	<b>35.11</b>
Std		7.75	0.22	0.23	0.75	1.75	1.97

# Results

Method	Distillation						
Epochs	51						
Temp	20						
Seed	Training time	Benign	PGD linf, 10, 0.01				
			4/255	8/255	16/255	32/255	
0	1385		79.07	74.1	68.37	56.36	43.22
1	1391		79.69	74.22	67.63	53.91	39.31
2	1394		78.97	74.74	69.71	59.59	47.77
3	1385		78.98	74.02	68.27	56.21	42.46
4	1380		79.29	74.34	68.16	56.13	42.61
Mean	1387		79.2	74.28	68.43	56.44	43.07
Std	5.52		0.3	0.28	0.77	2.03	3.03

Method	Gn						
Epochs	51						
Std	16/255						
Seed	Training time	Benign	PGD linf, 10, 0.01				
			4/255	8/255	16/255	32/255	
0	814		87.77	79.95	68.83	45.85	25.69
1	837		87.68	80.17	68.5	44.65	24.67
2	831		87.87	80.09	69.04	44.76	24.04
3	833		88.12	80.55	69.77	45.54	24.13
4	846		88.19	80.54	68.83	46.28	26.72
Mean	832.2		87.93	80.26	68.99	45.42	25.05
Std	11.69		0.22	0.27	0.47	0.7	1.14

Method	FGSM						
Epochs	51						
Budget	16/255						
Seed	Training time	Benign	PGD linf, 10, 0.01				
			4/255	8/255	16/255	32/255	
0	1410		83.95	82.64	81.26	77.84	70.94
1	1425		84.11	82.92	81.6	77.89	70.16
2	1433		84.05	82.66	81.17	77.72	69.93
3	1410		84.23	83.1	81.68	78.28	70.6

Results							
	4	1403	84.33	83.04	81.56	78.54	72.33
Mean		<b>1416.2</b>	<b>84.13</b>	<b>82.87</b>	<b>81.45</b>	<b>78.05</b>	<b>70.79</b>
Std		12.36	0.15	0.21	0.22	0.34	0.94
Method	Jacreg	<i>Randomized</i>					
Epochs		51					
Lambda		5					
Seed			PGD linf, 10, 0.01				
	Training time	Benign	4/255	8/255	16/255	32/255	
	0	866	88.11	78.69	65.26	40.5	23.12
	1	863	88.24	78.44	64.78	39.62	21.96
	2	857	88.27	78.82	65.01	39.28	21.05
	3	849	88.57	79.46	65.37	39.21	21.29
	4	903	88.55	79.24	65.55	41	23.75
Mean		<b>867.6</b>	<b>88.35</b>	<b>78.93</b>	<b>65.19</b>	<b>39.92</b>	<b>22.23</b>
Std		20.83	0.2	0.41	0.3	0.79	1.17
Method	Jacreg	<i>Randomized</i>					
Epochs		51					
Lambda		$0.9(1-lbd)*ce+lbd*reg$					
Seed			PGD linf, 10, 0.01				
	Training time	Benign	4/255	8/255	16/255	32/255	
	5	1042	80.56	75.88	70.36	58.69	47.61
	6	1057	80.35	75.19	69.25	57.04	43.79
	7	1041	80.39	75.41	69.92	58.17	45.87
	8	1020	80.8	75.68	69.17	56.73	43.92
	9	1020	80.53	75.58	70.15	59.02	46.45
Mean		<b>1036</b>	<b>80.53</b>	<b>75.55</b>	<b>69.77</b>	<b>57.93</b>	<b>45.53</b>
Std		15.92	0.18	0.26	0.54	1.01	1.65