

March 22, 2023

Dear Charles:

I am writing with regards to your paper “Beyond “Horizontal” and “Vertical” The Welfare Effects of Complex Integration” (IJIO-D-22-00489), which you have submitted to the International Journal of Industrial Organization. I have contacted two reviewers who are true experts in the topic area of the paper.

R1 (“This paper extends...”) recommends rejection because the paper’s marginal contribution relative to Sheu and Taragin (2021) seems limited. By contrast, R2 recommends R&R based on the methodological contribution of the paper.

Given the seemingly conflicting recommendations, I paid close attention to the nature of the paper’s contribution. My understanding is that the paper’s setup is nearly identical to Sheu and Taragin (2021) as R1 points out. Hence, most of the methodological contribution—based on which R2 recommends R&R—would seem to accrue to the previous paper. Meanwhile, the bar that R1 sets is high and the outcome of such an open-ended revision task is uncertain. Consequently, I have decided to reject this submission.

My hope is that some of the comments become useful as you plan the next phase of this project.

I would like to thank you for the opportunity to consider your work, and hope that you will continue to view the International Journal of Industrial Organization as a possible outlet for publication in the future.

Sincerely yours,



Mitsuru Igami

Co-Editor, IJIO
Associate Professor of Economics
Yale Department of Economics