

STAT 547T Homework 2

Instructions: Typeset your solutions and submit them as a PDF via Canvas.

Grading: One problem will be fully graded, and the other will be graded on a binary scale (full points or no points) based on effort.

Problem 1

Let \mathcal{H}_0 be a set of candidate null hypotheses that could be selected from some data $X \sim F_X$.

Let \mathcal{A} be an arbitrary subset of the support of F_X . Suppose that we have a test with the following property:

$$\sup_{F_X \in \mathcal{F}_{H_0}} \mathbb{P}_{F_X}(\text{Reject } H_0 \text{ based on } X \mid \text{Select } H_0 \text{ from } X, X \in \mathcal{A}) = \alpha, \quad \text{for all } 0 \leq \alpha \leq 1, \text{ for all } H_0 \in \mathcal{H}_0,$$

where \mathcal{F}_{H_0} denotes the set of all distributions that satisfy H_0 . Show that this test controls the selective type I error rate. That is, show that:

$$\sup_{F_X \in \mathcal{F}_{H_0}} \mathbb{P}_{F_X}(\text{Reject } H_0 \text{ based on } X \mid \text{Select } H_0 \text{ from } X) = \alpha, \quad \text{for all } 0 \leq \alpha \leq 1, \text{ for all } H_0 \in \mathcal{H}_0.$$

Problem 2

Let $\tilde{M}(\cdot)$ denote the variable selection procedure that uniformly selects a subset of variables in $\{1, 2, \dots, p\}$ at random without looking at the data. To put it more formally, for the response variable $Y \sim F_Y$ with support on \mathbb{R}^n , we have that $\tilde{M}(Y)$ is independent of Y , and that:

$$\mathbb{P}_{F_Y}(\tilde{M}(Y) = M) = 1/|2^{\{1, 2, \dots, p\}}|, \quad \text{for any } M \subseteq \{1, 2, \dots, p\},$$

where $2^{\{1, 2, \dots, p\}} = \{\emptyset, \{1\}, \dots, \{p\}, \{1, 2\}, \{1, 3\}, \dots, \{p-1, p\}, \dots, \{1, 2, \dots, p\}\}$ denotes the set of all possible subsets of $\{1, 2, \dots, p\}$

Given any realization y from Y and a fixed covariate matrix $X \in \mathbb{R}^{n \times p}$, suppose that we fit a regression model with y as the response and the variables in $\tilde{M}(y)$ as covariates, and report the p-values and rejections without adjusting.

Does this procedure control the selective type I error rate? Specifically, it would control the selective type I error rate if for all $0 \leq \alpha \leq 1$, and for all F_Y such that $[\beta^*(M)]_j = [(X^T X)^{-1} X^T \mathbb{E}_{F_Y}[Y]]_j = 0$, we have:

$$\mathbb{P}_{F_Y}(\text{Reject } H_0 : [\beta^*(\tilde{M}(Y))]_j = 0 \mid \tilde{M}(Y) = M) \leq \alpha, \quad \text{for all } M \subseteq \{1, 2, \dots, p\}, j \in \{1, 2, \dots, |M|\}.$$

You can assume without argument that for any fixed subset $M \subseteq \{1, 2, \dots, p\}$, and for any F_Y such that $[\beta^*(M)]_j = [(X^T X)^{-1} X^T \mathbb{E}_{F_Y}[Y]]_j = 0$, we have:

$$\mathbb{P}_{F_Y}(\text{Reject } H_0 : H_0 : [\beta^*(M)]_j = 0) = \alpha, \quad \text{for all } 0 \leq \alpha \leq 1, j = 1, 2, \dots, |M|.$$