

“All the News  
That’s Fit to Print”

# The New York Times

**THE WEATHER**  
Today, partly sunny, seasonable, a northwest wind, high 48. **Tonight**, clear skies, low 32. **Tomorrow**, partly sunny, cold, a light west wind, high 41. Weather map is on Page B10.

VOL. CLXXIII . . . No. 59,982      © 2023 The New York Times Company      FRIDAY, NOVEMBER 24, 2023      Prices in Canada may be higher      \$4.00



AMIR HAMJA/THE NEW YORK TIMES

**Parading, and Protesting, on Thanksgiving**  
The parade was a showcase for balloons like Ronald McDonald, and a platform for demonstrators around various causes. Page A16.

## Right Is Using Jan. 6 Footage To Distort Past

This article is by **Luke Broadwater, Alan Feuer and Angelo Fichera.**  
WASHINGTON — Speaker Mike Johnson's decision to publicly release thousands of hours of Capitol security footage from Jan. 6, 2021, has fueled a renewed effort by Republican lawmakers and far-right activists to rewrite the history of the attack that day and exonerate the pro-Trump rioters who took part.  
Mr. Johnson's move last week to make the footage available — something the far right has long demanded — came as he tried to allay the anger of hard-line Republican lawmakers for working with Democrats to keep the government funded. Now, some of the same people who were irate about that decision are using the Jan. 6 video to circulate an array of false claims and conspiracy theories about the largest attack on the Capitol in centuries.

Representative Marjorie Taylor Greene, the hard-right Georgia Republican, was among the first lawmakers to post false information about the newly released videos. She claimed on the social media site X that surveillance video showed a rioter holding a law enforcement badge in his hand, suggesting that he was an undercover police officer “disguised as a Trump supporter” and the attack was an inside job.  
But the item in the man's hand in the screen grab she circulated appears, upon closer inspection, to be a vape pen. And the man who is seen in that image, Kevin Lyons, was in fact a heating-and-cooling technician — not a police officer — who was later convicted at a public trial of multiple federal charges and sentenced to more than four years in prison.  
Ms. Greene later edited her post to remove the false claim, but not before it had spread widely among Trump supporters.  
Senator Mike Lee, Republican  
Continued on Page A17

**LEARNING CURVE** As Mike Johnson settles into the speaker role, his party has complaints. PAGE A17

## Retailers Worry About Holiday Shoppers’ Mood

This article is by **Julie Creswell, Jeanna Smialek and Jordyn Holman.**  
Christina Beck is approaching this holiday season cautiously.  
Ms. Beck, a 58-year-old administrative director at a school, makes lists of gifts she plans to buy for her family and friends and sticks with it. But her spending this year will be kept in check by the high cost of food in grocery stores and restaurants, and the mortgage for a home in Minneapolis she bought last year with her best friend.  
That best friend, Kristin Aitchison, cannot wait for the holidays. Ms. Aitchison, 55, who works for a senior living home, advises her family each year that she plans to make the holidays smaller, spending less. And every year, she spends more than she did the year before.  
“I’m a huge gift giver,” Ms.

**Predictions Are Hazy as Consumer Spending Remains Steady**  
Yet consumer spending has been surprisingly strong throughout 2023. For retailers, the question is whether people will continue to spend their way through the holiday season or decide this is the time to pull back.  
Predictions are murky. The National Retail Federation said it expected holiday sales to increase 3 to 4 percent from last year, without adjusting for inflation, on a par with the prepandemic 2019 season. But in a survey by the Conference Board, a nonprofit research group, consumers said they planned to spend an average of \$985 on holiday-related items this year, down slightly from the \$1,006 they anticipated spending last year.  
One closely watched early indicator, Amazon's Prime Day in October, showed consumers were spending more, but only slightly. They spent an average of \$144.53  
Continued on Page A16

## Netherlands’ Sharp Right Turn Lifts Provocateur

By **CLAIRE MOSES**  
AMSTERDAM — The Netherlands, long regarded as one of Europe's most socially liberal countries, woke up to a drastically changed political landscape on Thursday after a far-right party swept national elections in a result that has reverberated throughout Europe.  
Geert Wilders' Party for Freedom, which advocates banning the Quran, closing Islamic schools and entirely halting the acceptance of asylum seekers, won 37 seats in the 150-seat House of Representatives, making it by far the biggest party, in a clear rebuke of the country's political establishment.  
The results, tabulated overnight after Wednesday's voting, give Mr. Wilders enough support to try to form a governing coalition. Centrist and center-right parties long wary of the firebrand have left the door ajar to a possible partnership, giving Mr. Wilders a chance to become the Netherlands' first far-right prime minister.  
While people across the politi-



YVES HERMAN/REUTERS

**Geert Wilders is closer than ever to becoming prime minister.**  
cal spectrum expressed surprise at the election outcome, and the Dutch reputation of liberalism persists, experts say that Mr. Wilders succeeded by tapping into a discontent with government that dates back at least two decades.  
“It's not suddenly out of nowhere,” said Janka Stoker, a professor of leadership and organizational change at the University of Groningen.  
Mr. Wilders has been a persistent political presence in the Netherlands through those years, and now it seemed his time had come.  
A career politician, Mr. Wilders has served as a member of the Dutch House of Representatives since 1998. In 2004, he split from the party headed by Prime Minister Mark Rutte, forming the Party for Freedom two years later.  
Continued on Page A6

## ISRAEL AND HAMAS AGREE ON A PAUSE AND A FIRST SWAP

*In Diplomatic Advance, a Release Time Is Set for a Group of 13 Hostages*

This article is by **Aaron Boxerman, Hiba Yazbek and Jason Horowitz.**  
JERUSALEM — After tortuous, weekslong negotiations, Israel and Hamas reached an agreement Thursday for a brief cease-fire to begin on Friday morning and allow for the release of at least 50 women and children held hostage in Gaza. In return, Israel agreed to a pause in hostilities of at least four days and the release of 150 Palestinian women and minors imprisoned in Israeli jails.  
The cease-fire, announced by the Qatari Foreign Ministry, marks the most significant diplomatic breakthrough since Hamas's Oct. 7 attack on Israel, which killed 1,200 people, according to the Israeli authorities, and prompted a devastating Israeli invasion of Gaza. It was scheduled to take effect at 7 a.m. local time.  
The first 13 hostages will be released to Mossad, Israel's foreign intelligence agency, apparently in good health, at 4 p.m., according to Qatar, which helped broker the deal. Lists of freed hostages and prisoners will be released day to day, with the goal of a further agreement to extend the pause in hostilities and release more hostages.  
“The first glimmer of light at the end of the tunnel,” said Majed al-Ansari, a spokesman for Qatar's Foreign Ministry, in announcing the deal.  
The Biden administration played a significant role in pushing for the deal, along with the governments of Qatar and Egypt. The cease-fire was originally expected as early as Thursday morning, but negotiators required more time to hammer out details — sticking points included the number of hostages Hamas actually held — underscoring the

agreement's fragility.  
But even as the deal came together, the Israeli bombardment continued in Gaza, where at least 12,700 people have been killed, according to health officials in the enclave. Lt. Col. Richard Hecht, an Israeli military spokesman, told reporters, “Until we're given the order to hold our fire, our operations are continuing.” In some communities in southern Israel, air-raid sirens warning of incom-



LEO CORREA/ASSOCIATED PRESS

**A bombing Thursday in Gaza.**  
ing rocket fire from Gaza wailed.  
Israeli forces said on Thursday that they had detained the director of Al-Shifa Hospital, Dr. Mohammad Abu Salmiya, for questioning “following evidence showing that the Al-Shifa Hospital, under his direct management, served as a Hamas command and control center.”  
And on both sides of the border, families of the detained people waited with terrible trepidation, counting down the hours, hoping their loved ones might be among those released and that nothing at the last minute would go wrong.  
The family of Avigail Idan, a small child whose parents were  
Continued on Page A12

**FAMILIES' GUILT** Gaza residents' relatives abroad feel helpless to ease the intense suffering of their loved ones trapped in wartime. PAGE A10  
**ANXIETY** Some of the children taken captive on Oct. 7 will be freed, but maybe not all, leaving families between hope and anguish. PAGE A10

## In Struggle Over Future of A.I., The Capitalist Perspective Wins

What happened at OpenAI over the past five days could be described in many ways: A juicy boardroom drama, a tug of war over one of America's biggest start-ups, a clash between those who want A.I. to progress faster and those who want to slow it down.  
But it was, most importantly, a fight between two dueling visions of artificial intelligence.  
In one vision, A.I. is a transformative new tool, the latest in a line of world-changing innovations that includes the steam engine, electricity and the personal computer, and that, if put to the right uses, could usher in a new era of prosperity and make gobs of money for the businesses that harness its potential.  
In another vision, A.I. is something closer to an alien life form — a leviathan being summoned from the mathematical depths of neural networks — that must be restrained and deployed with extreme caution in order to pre-

vent it from taking over and killing us all.  
With the return of Sam Altman on Tuesday to OpenAI, the company whose board fired him as chief executive last Friday, the battle between these two views appears to be over.  
Team Capitalism won. Team Leviathan lost.  
OpenAI's new board will consist of three people, at least initially: Adam D'Angelo, the chief executive of Quora (and the only holdover from the old board); Bret Taylor, a former executive at Facebook and Salesforce; and Lawrence H. Summers, the former Treasury secretary. The board is expected to grow from there.  
OpenAI's largest investor, Microsoft, is also expected to have a larger voice in OpenAI's governance going forward. That may include a board seat.  
Gone from the board are three of the members who pushed for Mr. Altman's ouster: Ilya Sutskever, OpenAI's chief scien-  
Continued on Page A19

INTERNATIONAL A4-12	NATIONAL A14-19	BUSINESS B1-5	WEEKEND ARTS C1-14	OPINION A20-21
<b>Families Uprooted in Pakistan</b> Thousands of Afghan migrants are being expelled from Pakistan, even though many of them were born there, as border tensions rise. PAGE A4	<b>Whither the Wild Turkey?</b> In fields and forests across the South and Midwest, scientists are working to understand why populations of wild turkeys are on the decline. PAGE A14	<b>Counting on Holiday Spending</b> As the last few weeks of 2023 near, a look at three decades of monthly retail spending shows how valuable the holiday season is to the economy. PAGE B1	<b>Snowflakes and Candy Canes</b> For the children who perform in New York City Ballet's production of “The Nutcracker,” Lincoln Center becomes something of a second home. PAGE C1	<b>David Brooks</b> PAGE A21



Jean Schlumberger by Tiffany

TIFFANY & Co.