The New York Times

THE WEATHER

Today, heavy rain in the morning, high 59. Tonight, a late night rain or snow shower, windy, low 38. **Tomorrow**, a rain or snow shower, high 44. Weather map appears on Page D8.

VOL. CLXXIII No. 60,006

© 2023 The New York Times Company

MONDAY, DECEMBER 18, 2023

Prices in Canada may be higher

\$4.00

Voter Support For Abortion Faces Limits

Some States Trying to Keep Issue Off Ballot

By KATE ZERNIKE

As long as the Supreme Court's decision in Roe v. Wade was the law of the land, conservatives complained that it had squelched the democratic process - that unelected men in black robes had handed down a national edict rather than letting the American people sort out a consensus.

Celebrating Roe's reversal in Dobbs v. Jackson Women's Health Organization, they declared that democracy would finally be allowed to take over and settle the question of abortion once and for all. "Now the American people get their voice back," Senator Mitch McConnell, the Republican leader, said. While the court in Roe had "inflamed debate and deepened division," Justice Samuel A. Alito Jr. wrote for the majority in Dobbs, "the people and their elected representatives" would reach the "national settlement" that had eluded the country for so

Eighteen months later, the American people are indeed using their voices, but not in the way anti-abortion advocates had hoped. In a steady march of ballot measures, even in conservative states like Ohio, they have codified a right to abortion and rejected attempts to restrict it. Polls show increasing support for abortion rights in all 50 states, with majorities in nearly all states even deep red states - saying that abortion should be legal in all or most cases.

The entire dynamic of the debate has shifted: Democrats who once dreaded speaking the word abortion are now running on it, while Republicans struggle to define what exceptions they would allow to bans on the procedure, and former President Donald J. Trump now says overturning Roe was a mistake.

And yet a "national settlement" seems more elusive than ever. One reason is simply American federalism, which allows states to set their own standards where Continued on Page A12



Signs before Ohio voted to codify the right to abortion.

MADDIE McGARVEY FOR THE NEW YORK TIMES

Wednesday to approve a bill that

would make New York the largest

American city to ban solitary con-

finement in city jails in most

cases, part of a national campaign

to end a practice that critics say

The Council's push to ban soli-

 $tary\ confinement\ has\ been\ stalled$

for years over concerns about vio-

lence against jail workers. Mayor

Eric Adams has argued since he

took office two years ago that iso-

lating detainees is an important

The mayor and the union repre-

senting correction officers, which

also fiercely opposes the bill, are

expected to continue to lobby

against the ban right up to the

amounts to torture.

tool to protect them.

Solitary Confinement Is Poised

To End, Despite Adams's Wishes

By EMMA G. FITZSIMMONS

The City Council is expected on vote. But the bill's sponsors and

leader.



The funeral Sunday for Alon Shamriz, one of three Israelis killed by Israeli soldiers in Gaza. He was kidnapped by Hamas on Oct. 7.

Campus Allies Of Palestinians Feel Muzzled

By VIMAL PATEL and ANNA BETTS

At the University of Pennsylvania, approval for the screening of a documentary critical of Israel was

At Brandeis University which expressed a public commitment to free speech — a pro-Palestinian student group was barred for statements made by its national chapter.

At the University of Vermont, a Palestinian poet was set to deliver a talk, but the school pulled the meeting space after students complained he was antisemitic.

There are growing signs that colleges are starting to clamp down on pro-Palestinian protests and events on campus, as the institutions face pressure from donors, alumni and politicians, who are furious over what they say is an antisemitic campaign against

Some schools have simply canceled events, or delayed them. A handful of schools have shut down student groups and disciplined students. Some students have simply stopped participating in protests, concerned for their own safety, spooked by alumni who have started do-not-hire lists and outside groups that have doxxed students.

Continued on Page A14

supporters say there are enough

votes to pass the bill and to over-

There is momentum behind the

effort: A group of 11 Congress

members wrote a letter last week supporting the bill, including Rep-

resentative Adriano Espaillat, a

key ally of the mayor's, and Ha-

keem Jeffries, the House minority

member Council had pushed Adri-

enne Adams, the City Council

speaker, to schedule a vote for the

The city's public advocate, Ju-

maane Williams, who is a sponsor

of the bill, said that isolating de-

Continued on Page A15

bill, which now has 38 sponsors.

Left-leaning members of the 51-

ride Mr. Adams if he vetoes it.

War Erases Full Branches of Gazan Family Trees

By VIVIAN YEE and IYAD ABUHEWEILA

CAIRO - People whispered that Nasser al-Astal had come undone, dazed by grief. Weeks after the Israeli airstrike that he said had crashed into his family's home, his words came in loud, quivering spurts, darting frantically from memory to memory, from loss to loss - his wife, two of their sons and four of their daughters, all dead.

A daughter-in-law and a son-inlaw, dead. His older brother and his family, dead. His first grandchild, dead, he said, his second never born: His elder son's wife had been pregnant.

"When I look at photos of my family on my phone, I cry to myself at night," Mr. al-Astal said by phone a few weeks after his loss. "But men hide their tears, so I try to do it away from people, alone."

A Clan Loses Over 100 Members, Including Dozens of Children

All of their names were there in black and white on a list of 6,747 Palestinians who Gaza health officials said had been killed by Israeli attacks in the first 19 days of the war. No. 14: his wife, Marwa al-Astal, 48. No. 84: their granddaughter, 1, also named Marwa.

The first 88 people on the list were all from the extended al-Astal family. The next 72 were Hassounas. The next 65 al-Najjars. The next 60 al-Masrys. The next 49 al-Kurds.

Such numbers capture the magnitude of Gaza's loss like little else: family trees dismembered, whole branches obliterated.

It has been almost two months since the list was released on Oct. 26, and the death toll given by Gaza's Health Ministry has nearly tripled, approaching 20,000.

A ministry spokesman, Ashraf al-Qudra, said early last month that more than 100 people in the Astal family alone had been killed in Israeli attacks. Of 88 family members on the Oct. 26 list, 39 were identified as children and 25 as women. Israel's war in Gaza is killing

women and children at a faster pace than in almost any other conflict in the world this century. A few of the family's dead were

linked to Hamas, the armed Palestinian group that has ruled Gaza for 16 years and that led the Oct. 7 attacks on Israel that killed about 1,200 people, according to Israeli

One family member, Hamdan Continued on Page A7



A funeral for members of the Astal family. Civilians in Gaza have virtually no safe places to hide.

NETANYAHU VOWS TO KEEP UP FIGHT, **DESPITE CRITICISM**

200 TARGETS IN A DAY

Changing Tone, German and British Officials Call for Cease-Fire

This article is by Rachel Abrams, Adam Sella and Thomas Fuller.

The Israeli military bombarded

dozens of sites in the Gaza Strip over the weekend as Prime Minister Benjamin Netanyahu vowed to keep fighting in the territory, even as anguish over the Israeli military's accidental killings of three hostages raised new questions about how his government is prosecuting the war.

The military said on Sunday that it had struck 200 locations in Gaza over the previous 24 hours amid a mounting outcry over the civilian toll there and calls for restraint by three of Israel's most important allies.

Defense Secretary Lloyd J. Austin III was flying to the Middle East on Sunday, the latest in a series of senior Biden administration officials to travel to the region, to press Israel to scale back its military campaign. And the foreign secretaries of Britain and Germany issued a joint call for a "sustainable" cease-fire, a change in tone from their previous voice of support for Israel.

Mr. Austin will meet this week with Mr. Netanyahu and Israel's defense minister, Yoav Gallant, to discuss in detail when and how Israeli forces might carry out a new phase of fighting. American officials envision it as involving smaller groups of elite forces who would move in and out of population centers in Gaza, conducting more precise, intelligence-driven missions to find and kill Hamas leaders, rescue hostages and destroy tunnels, U.S. officials said.

Mr. Netanyahu said Sunday that Israel's military would "fight to the end." He began a government meeting in Tel Aviv by reading from a letter that he said came from families of Israeli soldiers killed fighting in Gaza. "You have a mandate to fight,"

Mr. Netanyahu read in Hebrew,

according to a statement from his office. "You do not have a mandate to stop in the middle." Caught in the middle are Gaza's

beleaguered and besieged 2.2 million people. Humanitarian aid began to

dribble into Gaza on Sunday morning through a second border crossing, part of a tattered supply chain that the United Nations says is inadequate to address the ceaseless hunger, cold and spread of disease in the territory. The Israeli authorities said Sun-

day evening that nearly 80 trucks passed through the crossing at Kerem Shalom, which the United States had pressured Israel to open. Previously aid was entering only from Egypt at the Rafah crossing. Israel has received a cascade of

criticism both for the humanitarian conditions in Gaza and the deaths of civilians there.

Pope Francis condemned an attack on the compound of the Cath-

Continued on Page A6

In Iran, It's Not Just a Song and Dance. It's a Nationwide Protest.

By FARNAZ FASSIHI and LEILY NIKOUNAZAR

A new form of protest against the government is rocking Iran: a viral dance craze set to an upbeat folk song where crowds clap and chant the rhythmic chorus, "Oh, oh, oh, oh."

In cities across Iran, men and women of all ages are gyrating their hips, swirling their arms in the air, and chanting the song's

catchy lines, according to videos posted on social media, television news channels like BBC Persian and Iranians interviewed.

People are dancing on the streets, in shops, at sport stadiums, in classrooms, malls, restaurants, gyms, parties and everywhere else they congregate. In Tehran, traffic was stopped in a major highway tunnel for an impromptu dance party to the song. Young women, hair uncovered

Public Opinion Revolts Against Crackdown

and flowing, dance in parks and young men performed a choreographed hip-hop dance.

"It's obvious that joining this dance trend sends a strong message," said Mohammad Aghapour, 32, a D.J. who goes by the profes-

sional name DJSonami, in an interview from Tehran. "It's a way of protesting and demanding our freedom and happiness.'

In most countries dancing and singing in public would not be considered taboo. But in Iran, dancing in public, especially by women and between men and women, is banned. Although the rule is regularly defied, enforcing it has been arbitrary. Music, dancing and

Continued on Page A8



OBITUARIES B5-6

A Pioneer of Digital Art

Vera Molnar employed the principles of computation, even before gaining access to a computer. She was 99. PAGE B6

Early Voice on Police Brutality

Paul Chevigny, an eminent civil rights lawyer, won landmark cases and wrote a seminal book. He was 88. PAGE B5 **INTERNATIONAL A4-9**

Unspooling Maori Policies

New Zealand has long been lauded for working with its Indigenous people, but a new government may curtail many of those initiatives. PAGE A4

Hungary Blocks Ukraine Aid

Prime Minister Viktor Orban used E.U. rules on unanimity to sink a \$52 billion package. News Analysis. PAGE A9

SPORTS D1-6

Face to Face With Greatness

When opponents face Shohei Ohtani, no matter the outcome, they have a Ruthian tale to tell forever.



BUSINESS B1-4

An E.V. Tax Credit Crunch

Fewer electric vehicles will entitle buyers to savings because of a new clampdown on Chinese parts. PAGE B1

Holiday Shopping With A.I.

Many retailers are rolling out chatbots to help with selecting gifts. The process isn't quite perfect.

NATIONAL A11-15, 18

A Denomination's Breakup

A quarter of the nation's roughly 30,000 United Methodist churches have left amid the faith's divisions over the issue of ordaining and marrying L.G.B.T.Q. people.

A Seismic Shift for Biden

Discussions about the southern border in negotiations over aid to Ukraine and Israel show how drastically the politics of immigration have moved to the right in the United States.

OPINION A16-17

David French

PAGE A17



ARTS C1-6

Seeking to Silence Criticism

The Brooklyn Rail agreed to Jeff Koons's request to not publish an essay, one of several instances of a publication yielding to such pressures.

