

All the News
That's Fit to Print

The New York Times

THE WEATHER

Today, plenty of sunshine, light winds, high 47. Tonight, partly cloudy, not as chilly, low 36. Tomorrow, sunshine, some clouds, milder, high 50. Weather map, Page B12.

VOL. CLXXIII No. 60,057

© 2024 The New York Times Company

WEDNESDAY, FEBRUARY 7, 2024

Prices in Canada may be higher

\$4.00

Videos of Destruction in Gaza

An analysis of hundreds of social media posts found Israeli soldiers filming themselves and destroying what appears to be civilian property. The footage provides a rare, unsanctioned window into the war. Page A6.



In November, an Israeli soldier who is a D.J. posted a video paired with a remix called “Shtayim, Shalosh, Sha-ger” or “Two, Three, Launch.”



In the clip, soldiers dance on camera ...



... and when the word “launch” is heard, the video cuts to a shot of a building being blown up.

Israel Reveals Hostage Toll: 30 Are Dead

By RONEN BERGMAN and PATRICK KINGSLEY

Israel has called securing the freedom of the hostages abducted to Gaza a key goal in its war against Hamas, so many in the country were shocked on Tuesday when it emerged that at least a fifth of the captives were already dead.

The news was likely to worsen a furor in Israel, where a debate over the government’s course of action in Gaza regarding the hostages has become divisive.

Israeli intelligence officers have concluded that at least 30 of the remaining 136 hostages captured by Hamas and its allies on Oct. 7 have died since the start of the war, according to a confidential assessment that was reviewed by The New York Times.

The bodies of two other dead Israelis, killed in 2014 during a previous war between Israel and Hamas, have been held in the territory ever since, bringing the total number of slain hostages inside Gaza to at least 32.

The Israeli government late on Tuesday released a statement saying that only 31 had been confirmed dead; the discrepancy between the two numbers could not be immediately reconciled.

“We have informed 31 families that their captured loved ones are no longer among the living and that we have pronounced them dead,” Rear Adm. Daniel Hagari, the military’s chief spokesman, said Tuesday after The Times published a report about the previously undisclosed hostage deaths.

Four officials said that Israeli intelligence officers were also assessing unconfirmed information that indicated that at least 20 other hostages may have been killed.

Some of the dead were killed inside Israel on Oct. 7. Their deaths were unconfirmed at the time and they were counted among the hostages, but their bodies were taken by Hamas to Gaza, according to two of the officials.

Others were wounded during the Hamas-led assault and died of their injuries after being abducted to Gaza, the officials said. Others still, the officials added, were killed by Hamas once inside Gaza.

At least three hostages were killed by the Israeli military during its ground operations. Another was killed during a failed rescue operation. Israeli soldiers found the bodies of some hostages, intact and without external injuries, inside the warren of tunnels Hamas has dug beneath

Continued on Page A7

Defections Foil G.O.P. Bid to Impeach Mayorkas

By KAROUN DEMIRJIAN

WASHINGTON — The United States House of Representatives on Tuesday defeated impeachment charges against Alejandro N. Mayorkas, the homeland security secretary, after a small group of Republicans broke with their party and refused to support what amounted to a partisan indictment of President Biden’s immigration policies.

The failure of the effort was a stunning setback for Speaker Mike Johnson, who had vowed to indict Mr. Mayorkas and expressed confidence that he had the backing to charge him with high crimes and misdemeanors for failing to lock down the United States border with Mexico amid a migrant surge. House Republicans have been promising to do so for more than a year.

In an extraordinary and chaotic scene on the House floor, Republican leaders at first thought they

In Setback for Speaker, Narrow Vote Rejects Border Charges

had clinched a victory, despite three G.O.P. defections by Representatives Ken Buck of Colorado, Mike Gallagher of Wisconsin and Tom McClintock of California — only to have it slip through their grasp when Democrats who had been absent earlier in the day showed up to vote.

Republican leaders held the vote open for several minutes, scrambling to corral the necessary support for the charges as Democrats jeered and yelled “Order! Order!” and the tally hovered at a tie. In the end, they could not overcome the opposition, and the measure failed by a vote of 216 to 214.

Last week, the House Home-

land Security Committee approved two articles that charged Mr. Mayorkas with refusing to comply with the law and breaching the public trust. But it was only over the past few weeks that Republican leaders, under pressure from the hard right, rushed the impeachment through the committee and to the floor — without ever ensuring they had the requisite support to pass it given their minuscule House majority.

There were signs leading up to Tuesday’s vote that the outcome was in doubt. As it drew near, some Republicans began airing their reservations about impeaching a cabinet secretary for carrying out the policies of the administration he serves.

“Secretary Mayorkas is guilty

Continued on Page A15

BORDER BILL President Biden blamed Donald J. Trump for thwarting a deal. PAGE A15



HILARY SWIFT FOR THE NEW YORK TIMES

Caitlin Clark has another year of eligibility at Iowa but may decide to leave for the W.N.B.A.

A Star’s Range Only Starts at the 3-Point Arc

By MATT FLEGENHEIMER

When Caitlin Clark moves — weaving through defensive traffic; waving unsubtly for a teammate’s pass; wriggling free enough to catch, fire, catch fire — people tend to follow.

This instinct informs every opponent’s scouting report, to the extent that anybody can prepare one with confidence: a triple-undelined directive to shadow Clark, the biggest star in college basketball, lest she splash an-

Clark Propels a Takeoff a Sport Hopes to Ride

other 3-pointer from the Hawkeye beak in the University of Iowa logo near midcourt.

At perpetual sellouts, at home and on the road, crowds approaching 15,000 crane their phones in her general direction from pregame stretches through postgame autograph sessions. Young girls and old men tug at

“22” Clark jerseys that flap above their knees. Small delegations from her Manhattan marketing firm file in to appraise their new asset. Stewards of the sport, wary from experience, permit themselves to wonder if something might be different this time.

“I’ve stayed away from basketball,” said C. Vivian Stringer, the Hall of Fame former coach at Rutgers and Iowa who retired in 2022. “But how can you stay away from Caitlin Clark?”

The question carries far-reach-

Continued on Page A18

Appellate Court Rejects Trump Immunity Claim In Jan. 6 Criminal Case

Ex-President Not Above Law, Panel Says

By ALAN FEUER and CHARLIE SAVAGE

A federal appeals court on Tuesday rejected former President Donald J. Trump’s claim that he was immune from prosecution on charges of plotting to subvert the results of the 2020 election, ruling that he must go to trial on a criminal indictment accusing him of seeking to overturn his loss to President Biden.

The unanimous ruling, by a three-judge panel of the U.S. Court of Appeals for the District of Columbia Circuit, handed Mr. Trump a significant defeat. But it was unlikely to be the final word on his claims of executive immunity: Mr. Trump, who is on a path to locking up the Republican presidential nomination, is expected to continue his appeal to the Supreme Court.

Still, the panel’s 57-page ruling signaled an important moment in American jurisprudence, answering a question that had never been addressed by an appeals court: Can former presidents escape being held accountable by the criminal justice system for things they did while in office?

The question is novel because no former president until Mr. Trump had been indicted, so there was never an opportunity for a defendant to make — and courts to consider — the sweeping claim of executive immunity that he put forward.

The panel, composed of two judges appointed by Democrats and one Republican appointee, said in its decision that, despite the privileges of the office he once held, Mr. Trump was subject to

federal criminal law like any other American.

“For the purpose of this criminal case, former President Trump has become citizen Trump, with all of the defenses of any other criminal defendant,” the panel wrote. “But any executive immunity that may have protected him while he served as president no longer protects him against this prosecution.”

The three judges cast Mr. Trump’s immunity claims as a danger to the nation’s constitutional system.

“At bottom, former President Trump’s stance would collapse our system of separated powers by placing the president beyond the reach of all three branches,” they wrote. “Presidential immunity against federal indictment would mean that, as to the president, the Congress could not legislate, the executive could not prosecute and the judiciary could not review. We cannot accept that the office of the presidency places its former occupants above the law for all time thereafter.”

A spokesman for Jack Smith, the special counsel who brought the case against Mr. Trump, declined to comment on the decision.

Steven Cheung, a spokesman for Mr. Trump’s campaign, said the former president “respectfully disagrees” with the decision and would appeal it.

“If immunity is not granted to a president, every future president who leaves office will be immediately indicted by the opposing

Continued on Page A17

A Jury Convicts A Teen’s Mother In His Rampage

By JACEY FORTIN

Michigan jurors, after 11 hours of deliberations, found Jennifer Crumbley guilty of involuntary manslaughter on Tuesday for the gun rampage committed by her teenage son, who carried out the state’s deadliest school shooting more than two years ago.

The trial became a lightning rod for issues of parental responsibility, in a time of frequent cases of gun violence carried out by minors. It was the most high-profile example of prosecutors seeking to hold parents responsible for violent crimes committed by their children.

Ms. Crumbley, 45, was convicted on four counts of involuntary manslaughter, one for each of the four students who were shot to death by her son at Oxford High School on Nov. 30, 2021. The son, Ethan Crumbley, who was 15 at the time, used a pistol to kill Madisyn Baldwin, 17; Tate Myre, 16; Justin Shilling, 17; and Hana St. Juliana, 14. Seven other people were injured. The gun was a gift from his parents.

“We all know that this is one of the hardest things you’ve ever done,” Judge Cheryl Matthews of the Oakland County Circuit Court told jurors at the courthouse in Pontiac, Mich., immediately after the verdict was read.

Ms. Crumbley sat mostly still, with downcast eyes, until she was handcuffed and led out of the court. She has been held since December at the Oakland County Jail.

Ms. Crumbley faces a maximum penalty of 15 years in prison after being convicted of all four counts. Sentencing is scheduled

Continued on Page A20



PAUL NATKIN/GETTY IMAGES

TOBY KEITH, 1961-2024

Country Giant Steeped in Red, White and Beer

By BILL FRISKICS-WARREN

Toby Keith, the larger-than-life singer-songwriter of No. 1 country hits like “Who’s Your Daddy?” and “Made in America” and one of the biggest stars to come out of Nashville in three decades, died on Monday. He was 62.

His death was announced on his official website. The announcement did not say where he died. Elaine Schock, Mr. Keith’s publicist, said only that he died in Oklahoma, where he had lived his entire life.

Mr. Keith announced in the summer of 2022 that he had been diagnosed with stomach cancer and that he was being treated with chemotherapy, radiation and surgery.

In a recent interview with the Oklahoma City television station KWTW, Mr. Keith, who played a run of shows in Las Vegas in December, said he was still in treatment. “Cancer is a roller coaster,” he said. “You just sit here and wait on it to go away — it may not ever

Continued on Page A21



INTERNATIONAL A4-11

The Road to Pakistan’s Election

The Grand Trunk Road is buzzing with talk of the presidential vote, with many expressing frustration. PAGE A4

Query Implicates Moïse’s Wife

Martine Moïse is named with 70 others as a potential conspirator in the 2021 killing of the Haitian leader. PAGE A11

NATIONAL A12-20

Scores Charged With Bribery

Manhattan’s federal prosecutors said 70 current and former workers of New York City’s troubled Housing Authority were accused. PAGE A16

Climate Scientist Fights Back

Michael Mann is challenging attacks on his work in a defamation suit that’s taken 12 years to come to trial in the District of Columbia. PAGE A13

Gucci and Affordable Housing

A new law lets developers bypass zoning rules if they promise “work force housing.” It has stirred an uproar in Florida’s affluent Bal Harbour. PAGE A12

BUSINESS B1-6

Boeing May Have Missed Parts

Four bolts used to secure the panel that blew off an Alaska Airlines plane were removed, and appear not to have been replaced, a report says. PAGE B1

Origin of Fake Swift Images

The A.I. images of the pop star were traced to people on 4chan who created them as a sort of game. PAGE B1

SPORTS B7-9, 12

One-on-One With a Warrior

Hopes are high as Draymond Green makes his return to action. He reveals more about his mind-set. PAGE B7



FOOD D1-8

Redefining Korean Dining

Hand Hospitality has become a major player in New York by channeling the creative energy of Seoul. PAGE D1

Hot Pot and Thoughts of Home

At celebrations of the Chinese New Year, the dish can foster togetherness among those far from family. PAGE D6

ARTS C1-6

Billy Joel, Back Again

The singer debuted “Turn the Lights Back On,” his first new song in nearly 20 years, at the Grammys. PAGE C1

Touring Sendak’s Studio

For decades, the author of “Where the Wild Things Are” fortified himself at his sprawling home in Connecticut. PAGE C1

OPINION A22-23

Maia Szalavitz

PAGE A22



0 354613 9