

“All the News  
That’s Fit to Print”

# The New York Times

**THE WEATHER**  
Today, partly cloudy, light winds, high 58. **Tonight**, cloudy, light winds, low 55. **Tomorrow**, clouds giving way to some sunshine, warmer, high 74. Weather map is on Page A24.

VOL. CLXXIV . . . No. 60,328      © 2024 The New York Times Company      MONDAY, NOVEMBER 4, 2024      Prices in Canada may be higher      \$4.00



JEENAH MOON FOR THE NEW YORK TIMES

**Sneaker-to-Sneaker Traffic**  
The New York City Marathon passing through Brooklyn on Sunday. Thrilling finishes decided the men’s and women’s races. Page F1.

## In Final Days, Frenetic Race For Key States

This article is by Adam Nagourney, Katie Glueck and Michael Gold.

It was the final Sunday of the campaign for president, and Vice President Kamala Harris and Donald J. Trump were continuing to race across battleground states in their search for support. But in message and demeanor, Ms. Harris, the Democrat, and Mr. Trump, the Republican, could not have been more different.

Ms. Harris began her day at a Black church in Detroit where she told congregants that the nation was “ready to bend the arc of history toward justice,” invoking the words of the Rev. Dr. Martin Luther King Jr. Mr. Trump began his at an outdoor rally at an airport in Pennsylvania where, his shoulders slumped and his voice subdued, he threw out his prepared remarks to tell supporters that he “shouldn’t have left” the White House after his loss to President Biden in 2020.

The dueling scenes offered a contrast that captured just how differently these two candidates were using the final days of a campaign that a last round of polls suggested remained as tight as it was when their contest began in August.

Mr. Trump went to Lititz, Pa., where, after announcing he was discarding his prepared speech so the “truth” could come out, he proceeded to deliver dark, rambling and at times angry remarks in which he attacked polls, assailed Democrats as “demonic,” and suggested he would not mind if reporters were shot.

“To get to me, somebody would have to shoot through fake news, and I don’t mind that much, ‘cause, I don’t mind. I don’t mind,” he said as he called attention to the bulletproof glass barriers that have surrounded him at outdoor rallies since he was shot in July in an assassination attempt in Butler, Pa.

Mr. Trump argued that the country had declined since his presidency, pointing to the economy and immigration, and said he should not have left the White House in 2020 — when he fought to upend the election results after he was defeated.

“We had the safest border in the history of our country the day that I left,” he said. “I shouldn’t have left, I mean, honestly,” Mr. Trump

Continued on Page A13

### NEWS ANALYSIS

## Torrent of Lies Redefines Political Norms

By PETER BAKER

WASHINGTON — It took just two minutes for former President Donald J. Trump to utter his first lie of the evening, claiming once again that the 2020 election had been stolen.

By four minutes into the televised interview on Thursday night, he was claiming that this time around “we’re leading by a lot” in the polls, setting up another false claim of a stolen election should he lose on Tuesday.

By five minutes into the program, he had turned to assailing his successor’s record in office

### Over a Lifetime, Trump Has Fabricated His Version of Reality

and was claiming that in the last few years the country had experienced “the worst inflation we’ve ever had.”

None of that was true. And that was just the first 300 seconds. For the rest of the evening, Mr. Trump spouted one statement after another that was fanciful, misleading, distorted or wildly false. He rewrote history.

He claimed accomplishments that he did not accomplish. He cited statistics at odds with the record. He described things that did not happen and denied things that did.

Public appearances by Mr. Trump throughout this year’s campaign have been an Alice-in-Wonderland trip through the political looking glass, a journey into an alternate reality often belied by actual reality. At its most fundamental, it boils down to this: America was paradise on earth when he was in charge, and now it’s a dystopian hellscape. Nuance, subtlety,

Continued on Page A16



MARCO GUALAZZINI FOR THE NEW YORK TIMES

Members of Club dei 27, meeting in Parma, Italy, venerate the composer Giuseppe Verdi.

## Love Verdi? Try Getting Into, or Out of, Fan Club.

By ELISABETTA POVOLEDO

PARMA, Italy — They did not sing “Happy Birthday.” At least, not at first.

Instead, they celebrated Giuseppe Verdi’s birthday last month with a rendition of “Va Pensiero,” a chorus from his opera “Nabucco.” The song is so beloved that there have been proposals to make it Italy’s national anthem.

The choir consisted of men from all walks of life — bankers, a sur-

### Fellowship of Secrecy With a Lifelong Pass

geon, a lawyer, a neuroscientist, a vegetable vendor — and with one burning passion in common: adoration of the 19th-century composer.

They are all members of Club dei 27, an exclusive club based in Parma, not far from Verdi’s birth-

place, whose members take the name of a Verdi opera when they join.

How exclusive is Club dei 27? Men (yes, only men) can join, and only when a member dies or retires.

Naturally, there is a waiting list. “When we get a new request, we touch wood,” as a way to ward off any premature deaths, said Enzo Petrolini, the president of the club, half joking.

Continued on Page A8

## TIGHTEST CONTEST IN DECADES GROWS TIGHTER AT FINISH

### A Stressed Electorate Eagerly Votes Early Shift in Swing States, Times Poll Finds

By NICK CORASANITI

An anxious America, weary from a vitriolic campaign season and worried about the state of the nation’s democracy, is voting with determination, with roughly 75 million people having cast ballots in the early voting period.

In North Carolina, nearly 4.5 million voters set an early in-person voting record in the state amid devastation from Hurricane Helene. Georgia voters also set a record with four million voters casting an early ballot. In Pennsylvania, 1.7 million people voted by mail amid increasingly caustic litigation over whose mail ballots should count. Nine states have seen more than 50 percent of eligible voters already vote.

Projections from early voting indicate that the overall turnout for the election will probably be between the roughly 60 percent of eligible voters who turned out in 2016 and the two-thirds of eligible voters who voted in 2020, according to Michael McDonald, a professor of politics at the University of Florida who tracks voting. While overall turnout is likely to be slightly lower than the modern high-water mark set in the 2020 election, it still puts the country on pace for a historical high compared with almost all other previous years.

As the nation enters one of the most consequential weeks in recent political history, with swaths of Americans nervous about nearly every aspect of the electoral process, officials across the country have mounted a furious effort to shore up the election, including by introducing new protections for their own safety.

Much of their worry stems from the violent culmination of the 2020 presidential race at the Capitol on Jan. 6, 2021. This year, former President Donald J. Trump is working from a familiar playbook, spreading falsehoods about the election and claiming that Democrats are “a bunch of cheats.”

Election officials have already faced some significant tests. A key county in Pennsylvania failed to deliver thousands of mail ballots to voters, while another county in the state was found to have erroneously turned away voters before a deadline. Russian interference was uncovered in Georgia. Partial passwords for election machines were breached in Colorado.

Yet officials note that the problems were quickly detected and resolved, signs that the system is

Continued on Page A14

By LISA LERER and RUTH IGIELNIK

The presidential race appears to be hurtling toward a photo finish, with the final set of polls by The New York Times and Siena College finding Vice President Kamala Harris showing new strength in North Carolina and Georgia as former President Donald J. Trump erases her lead in Pennsylvania and maintains his advantage in Arizona.

It has been decades since the polls have shown the nation facing a presidential race that is so close across so many states in both the Sun Belt and the Rust Belt. The tightly contested landscape means the race remains highly uncertain as the campaign enters its final hours.

Ms. Harris is now narrowly ahead in Nevada, North Carolina and Wisconsin, the polls show, while Mr. Trump leads in Arizona. The polls show them locked in close races in Michigan, Georgia and Pennsylvania. But the results in all seven states are within the margin of sampling error, meaning neither candidate has a definitive lead in any of them.

Both candidates have multiple pathways available to capture the 270 Electoral College votes required to claim victory, assuming that polls are not dramatically underestimating the support for one or the other. In such a close race, even a small systemic polling error could tip the contest decisively in either direction.

But there are signs that late deciders are breaking for Ms. Harris: Among the 8 percent of voters who said they had only recently decided on their vote, she wins the group by 55 percent to 44 percent. (With Election Day nearing, 11 percent of voters remained undecided or persuadable, down from 16 percent about a month ago.)

The polling comes as more than 70 million Americans have al-

Continued on Page A12

### 2024 ELECTION

**PASTOR’S LEGACY** Billy Graham towered over U.S. evangelicalism for decades. His followers flocked to Donald J. Trump. PAGE A10

**YOUTUBE** Researchers say the site is looking the other way and profiting from falsehoods. PAGE B1

**UKRAINE’S FUTURE** The presidential hopefuls have contrasting visions for the U.S. role. PAGE A5

## Republicans May Snatch Senate Should a Few Races Fall in Line

By CARL HULSE

WASHINGTON — After two years and a multibillion-dollar barrage of political attack ads, the fight for Senate control is down to a handful of races, with Republicans holding a clear edge but Democrats maintaining a narrow path to retaining their majority if events break their way.

As the final days of an intensely polarizing campaign season play out, the Senate focus is on seats held by Democrats in Montana, Ohio, Wisconsin, Pennsylvania and Michigan, and on Republican seats in Texas and Nebraska.

The outcome will help determine how much power the next president can wield, given the Senate’s crucial role in approving cabinet and judicial nominations and in setting — or thwarting — the legislative agenda.

Republicans have already all but claimed West Virginia, where the popular governor, Jim Justice, is their candidate for a seat left open by the retirement of Senator Joe Manchin III, a onetime Democrat who changed his affiliation to independent this year. That means the G.O.P. needs a net gain of just one more to flip the current 51 to 49 Democratic majority.

The top Republican target has been in Montana, a state that former President Donald J. Trump is expected to carry easily. Senator Jon Tester, a Democrat who has served three terms there, has trailed consistently in most polls against Tim Sheehy, a Republican and wealthy businessman. But other embattled Democrats have maintained slim polling leads that

Continued on Page A20



NATIONAL A9-20, 24

### Deadliest Year of a Deadly Jail

Riverside County, Calif., reported its highest detainee death count in decades, including many suicides. PAGE A18

### Relief in Botched Raid Case

After a jury found a former detective at fault in Breonna Taylor’s death, residents hope for police reform. PAGE A20

INTERNATIONAL A4-8

### Highlighting Sikh Nationalism

Canadian and U.S. claims of assassination plots have drawn attention to Sikh separatists. India calls their movement a source of organized crime. PAGE A4

### Polio Vaccines in Gaza

Thousands of children have received a second dose, but aid agencies said that many in the north cannot be reached during the Israeli offensive. PAGE A6

### Surge of Volunteers, and Rage

As Spain reels from flooding that has left at least 214 people dead, thousands have flocked to help as anger toward public officials has grown. PAGE A5

BUSINESS B1-5

### Hope for U.S. Factory Towns

Areas affected by plant closings after China joined the global trading system are now gaining an outside share of fresh investment and new jobs. PAGE B1

### Concern Over Nuclear Projects

In Japan, worries about a series of recent natural disasters may affect plans to restart idled plants. PAGE B1

OBITUARIES A21

### Saved Millions With Low Tech

Richard A. Cash showed that a simple rehydration formula could check the ravages of cholera. He was 83.



ARTS C1-6

### Grander Visions Realized

Improvements at the Olana site, above, near Hudson, N.Y., and other major parks have come to fruition. PAGE C6

### Speaking Up for Diversity

John Leguizamo discusses his new play, feeling underappreciated as a dramatist, and Latino representation. PAGE C1

SPORTS D1-8

### New Faces of Women’s Game

JuJu Watkins of U.S.C. and Paige Bueckers of UConn are set to keep a college basketball boom going. PAGE D1

### From N.F.L. to Middle School

Greg Olsen, Luke Kuechly and Jonathan Stewart help coach football at a school in North Carolina. PAGE D3

OPINION A22-23

### The Editorial Board

PAGE A22



0 354613 9