

Constraint-based type inference can be used for reconstruction of preconditions, invariants and postconditions of recursive functions written in languages with GADTs.

- InvarGenT infers preconditions and invariants as types of recursive definitions, and postconditions as existential types.
- Generalized Algebraic Data Types type system  $\text{MMG}(X)$  based on François Pottier and Vincent Simonet's  $\text{HMG}(X)$  but without type annotations.
- Extended to a language with existential types represented as implicitly defined and used GADTs.
- Type inference problem as satisfaction of second order constraints over a multi-sorted domain.
- Invariants found by *Joint Constraint Abduction under Quantifier Prefix*, postconditions found by *disjunction elimination* – e.g. anti-unification for terms, extended convex hull.
- A numerical sort with linear equations and inequalities over rationals, and  $k \doteq \min(m, n)$ ,  $k \doteq \max(m, n)$  relations (reconstructed only for postconditions).

# The Type System

## Patterns (syntax-directed)

### p-Empty

$$C \vdash 0: \tau \longrightarrow \exists \emptyset [F] \{ \}$$

### p-Wild

$$C \vdash 1: \tau \longrightarrow \exists \emptyset [T] \{ \}$$

### p-And

$$\frac{\forall i \quad C \vdash p_i: \tau \longrightarrow \Delta_i}{C \vdash p_1 \wedge p_2: \tau \longrightarrow \Delta_1 \times \Delta_2}$$

### p-Var

$$C \vdash x: \tau \longrightarrow \exists \emptyset [T] \{ x \mapsto \tau \}$$

### p-Cstr

$$\frac{\forall i \quad C \wedge D \vdash p_i: \tau_i \longrightarrow \Delta_i \quad K :: \forall \bar{\alpha} \bar{\beta} [D]. \tau_1 \times \dots \times \tau_n \rightarrow \varepsilon(\bar{\alpha}) \quad \bar{\beta} \# \text{FV}(C)}{C \vdash K p_1 \dots p_n: \varepsilon(\bar{\alpha}) \longrightarrow \exists \bar{\beta} [D] (\Delta_1 \times \dots \times \Delta_n)}$$

## Patterns (non-syntax-directed)

### p-EqIn

$$\frac{C \vdash p: \tau' \longrightarrow \Delta \quad C \models \tau \doteq \tau'}{C \vdash p: \tau \longrightarrow \Delta}$$

### p-SubOut

$$\frac{C \vdash p: \tau \longrightarrow \Delta' \quad C \models \Delta' \leq \Delta}{C \vdash p: \tau \longrightarrow \Delta}$$

### p-Hide

$$\frac{C \vdash p: \tau \longrightarrow \Delta \quad \bar{\alpha} \# \text{FV}(\tau, \Delta)}{\exists \bar{\alpha}. C \vdash p: \tau \longrightarrow \Delta}$$

## Existential Type System extension – modified App, added rules

### App

$$\frac{C, \Gamma, \Sigma \vdash e_1: \tau' \rightarrow \tau \quad C, \Gamma, \Sigma \vdash e_2: \tau' \quad C \models \#(\tau')}{C, \Gamma, \Sigma \vdash e_1 e_2: \tau}$$

### ExLetIn

$$\frac{\varepsilon_K(\bar{\alpha}) \text{ in } \Sigma \quad C, \Gamma, \Sigma \vdash e_1: \tau' \quad C, \Gamma, \Sigma \vdash K p. e_2: \tau' \rightarrow \tau}{C, \Gamma, \Sigma \vdash \text{let } p = e_1 \text{ in } e_2: \tau}$$

### ExIntro

$$\frac{\text{Dom}(\Sigma') \setminus \text{Dom}(\Sigma) = \mathcal{E}(e) \quad C, \Gamma, \Sigma' \vdash n(e): \tau}{C, \Gamma, \Sigma \vdash e: \tau}$$

## Expressions (syntax-directed)

### Var

$$\frac{\Gamma(x) = \forall \beta [\exists \bar{\alpha}. D]. \beta \quad C \models D}{C, \Gamma \vdash x: \beta}$$

### AssertFalse

$$\frac{C \models F}{C, \Gamma \vdash \text{assert false}: \tau}$$

### Cstr

$$\frac{\forall i \quad C, \Gamma \vdash e_i: \tau_i \quad C \models D \quad K :: \forall \bar{\alpha} \bar{\beta} [D]. \tau_1 \dots \tau_n \rightarrow \varepsilon(\bar{\alpha})}{C, \Gamma \vdash K e_1 \dots e_n: \varepsilon(\bar{\alpha})}$$

### LetIn

$$\frac{C, \Gamma \vdash \lambda(p. e_2) e_1: \tau}{C, \Gamma \vdash \text{let } p = e_1 \text{ in } e_2: \tau}$$

### App

$$\frac{C, \Gamma \vdash e_1: \tau' \rightarrow \tau \quad C, \Gamma \vdash e_2: \tau'}{C, \Gamma \vdash e_1 e_2: \tau}$$

### LetRec

$$\frac{C, \Gamma' \vdash e_1: \sigma \quad C, \Gamma' \vdash e_2: \tau \quad \sigma = \forall \beta [\exists \bar{\alpha}. D]. \beta \quad \Gamma' = \Gamma \{x \mapsto \sigma\}}{C, \Gamma \vdash \text{letrec } x = e_1 \text{ in } e_2: \tau}$$

### Abs

$$\frac{\forall i \quad C, \Gamma \vdash c_i: \tau_i \rightarrow \tau_2}{C, \Gamma \vdash \lambda(c_1 \dots c_n): \tau_1 \rightarrow \tau_2}$$

## Expressions (non-syntax-directed)

### Gen

$$\frac{C \wedge D, \Gamma \vdash e: \beta \quad \beta \bar{\alpha} \# \text{FV}(\Gamma, C)}{C \wedge \exists \beta \bar{\alpha}. D, \Gamma \vdash e: \forall \beta [\exists \bar{\alpha}. D]. \beta}$$

### Hide

$$\frac{C, \Gamma \vdash e: \tau \quad \bar{\alpha} \# \text{FV}(\Gamma, \tau)}{\exists \bar{\alpha}. C, \Gamma \vdash e: \tau}$$

### Inst

$$\frac{C, \Gamma \vdash e: \forall \bar{\alpha} [D]. \tau' \quad C \models D[\bar{\alpha} := \bar{\tau}]}{C, \Gamma \vdash e: \tau'[\bar{\alpha} := \bar{\tau}]}$$

### Eqv

$$\frac{C, \Gamma \vdash e: \tau \quad C \models \tau \doteq \tau'}{C, \Gamma \vdash e: \tau'}$$

### DisjElim

$$\frac{C, \Gamma \vdash e: \tau \quad D, \Gamma \vdash e: \tau}{C \vee D, \Gamma \vdash e: \tau}$$

### FElim

$$\frac{}{F, \Gamma \vdash e: \tau}$$

## Existential Type System extension – ExIntro processing

$$\begin{aligned} n(e, K') &= \text{let } x = n(e, \perp) \text{ in } K' x \quad \text{for } K' \neq \perp \wedge l(e) = F \\ n(x, \perp) &= x \\ n(\lambda \bar{c}. \perp) &= \lambda(\overline{n(c, \perp)}) \\ n(e_1 e_2, K') &= n(e_1, K') n(e_2, \perp) \\ n(\lambda[K] \bar{c}. \perp) &= \lambda(\overline{n(c, K')}) \\ n(\lambda[K] \bar{c}. K') &= \lambda(\overline{n(c, K')}) \quad \text{for } K' \neq \perp \\ n(p.e, K') &= p.n(e, K') \\ n(\text{let } p = e_1 \text{ in } e_2, K') &= \text{let } p = n(e_1, \perp) \text{ in } n(e_2, K') \end{aligned}$$

$$\frac{\Gamma(x) = \forall\beta[\exists\bar{\alpha}.D].\beta \quad C \models D}{C, \Gamma \vdash x : \beta}$$

$$\llbracket \Gamma \vdash x : \tau \rrbracket = \exists\beta'\bar{\alpha}'.D[\beta\bar{\alpha} := \beta'\bar{\alpha}'] \wedge \beta' \doteq \tau$$

$$\text{where } \Gamma(x) = \forall\beta[\exists\bar{\alpha}.D].\beta, \beta'\bar{\alpha}' \# \text{FV}(\Gamma, \tau)$$

*slide3.gadt:*

```
newtype Tau
external x : ∀b[b = Tau → Tau].b = "x"
```

```
let var_rule = x
```

*shell:*

```
# invargent slide3.gadt -inform
val var_rule : Tau → Tau
```

$$\frac{C, \Gamma \vdash e_1 : \tau' \rightarrow \tau \quad C, \Gamma \vdash e_2 : \tau'}{C, \Gamma \vdash e_1 e_2 : \tau}$$

$$\llbracket \Gamma \vdash e_1 e_2 : \tau \rrbracket = \exists \alpha. \llbracket \Gamma \vdash e_1 : \alpha \rightarrow \tau \rrbracket \wedge \llbracket \Gamma \vdash e_2 : \alpha \rrbracket, \alpha \# \text{FV}(\Gamma, \tau)$$

*slide4.gadt:*

```
newtype Tau
newtype Tau'
newcons E2 : Tau'
external e1 : Tau' → Tau = "e1"
```

```
let app_rule = e1 E2
```

*shell:*

```
# invargent slide4.gadt -inform
val app_rule : Tau
```

$$\frac{\forall i C, \Gamma \vdash c_i : \tau_1 \rightarrow \tau_2}{C, \Gamma \vdash \lambda(c_1 \dots c_n) : \tau_1 \rightarrow \tau_2}, \text{ where } c_i = p_i.e_i$$

$$\llbracket \Gamma \vdash \lambda \bar{c} : \tau \rrbracket = \exists \alpha_1 \alpha_2. \llbracket \Gamma \vdash \bar{c} : \alpha_1 \rightarrow \alpha_2 \rrbracket \wedge \alpha_1 \rightarrow \alpha_2 \dot{=} \tau, \alpha_1 \alpha_2 \# \text{FV}(\Gamma, \tau)$$

$$\frac{C \vdash p : \tau_1 \longrightarrow \exists \bar{\beta} [D] \Gamma' \quad C \wedge D, \Gamma \Gamma' \vdash e : \tau_2 \quad \bar{\beta} \# \text{FV}(C, \Gamma, \tau_2)}{C, \Gamma \vdash p.e : \tau_1 \rightarrow \tau_2}$$

$$\llbracket \Gamma \vdash p.e : \tau_1 \rightarrow \tau_2 \rrbracket = \llbracket \vdash p \downarrow \tau_1 \rrbracket \wedge \forall \bar{\beta}. D \Rightarrow \llbracket \Gamma \Gamma' \vdash e : \tau_2 \rrbracket$$

$$C \vdash x : \tau \longrightarrow \exists \emptyset [\mathbf{T}] \{x \mapsto \tau\}$$

*slide5.gadt*:  $C \vdash Kx : \tau \longrightarrow \exists \bar{\alpha} \bar{\beta} [D] \{x \mapsto \tau_1\}$

```
let abs_gen_rules = fun x -> x
```

*shell*:

```
# invargent slide5.gadt -inform
```

```
val abs_gen_rules : ∀a. a → a
```

$$\frac{\forall i C, \Gamma \vdash e_i : \tau_i \quad C \models D \quad K :: \forall \bar{\alpha} \bar{\beta} [D]. \tau_1 \dots \tau_n \rightarrow \varepsilon(\bar{\alpha})}{C, \Gamma \vdash K e_1 \dots e_n : \varepsilon(\bar{\alpha})}$$

$$\llbracket \Gamma \vdash K e_1 \dots e_n : \tau \rrbracket = \exists \bar{\alpha}' \bar{\beta}'. (\wedge_i \llbracket \Gamma \vdash e_i : \tau_i [\bar{\alpha} \bar{\beta} := \bar{\alpha}' \bar{\beta}'] \rrbracket \wedge D[\bar{\alpha} \bar{\beta} := \bar{\alpha}' \bar{\beta}'] \wedge \varepsilon(\bar{\alpha}') \doteq \tau)$$

Type Num could be defined as:

```
newtype Num : num    newcons 1 : Num 1    newcons 2 : Num 2    ...
```

*slide6.gadt*:

```
newtype Box : num
newcons Small : ∀n,k [n ≤ 7 ∧ k = n+6]. Num n → Box k
```

```
let gift = Small 4
let package = fun x -> Small (x + -3)
```

*shell*:

```
# invargent slide6.gadt -inform
val gift : Box 10
val package : ∀n[n ≤ 10]. Num n → Box (n + 3)
```

Height of left sibling,  $m$ , differs by at most 2 from height of the right sibling,  $n$ .

Resulting height is  $\max(m,n)+1$ . Height value is stored with the node.

*slide7.gadt:*

```
newtype Avl : type * num
newcons Empty :  $\forall a. \text{Avl } (a, 0)$ 
newcons Node :
   $\forall a, k, m, n [k = \max(m, n) \wedge 0 \leq m \wedge 0 \leq n \wedge n \leq m+2 \wedge m \leq n+2].$ 
   $\text{Avl } (a, m) * a * \text{Avl } (a, n) * \text{Num } (k+1) \longrightarrow \text{Avl } (a, k+1)$ 
```

```
let singleton = fun x -> Node (Empty, x, Empty, 1)
```

*shell:*

```
# invargent slide7.gadt -inform
val singleton :  $\forall a. a \rightarrow \text{Avl } (a, 1)$ 
```

$$\begin{array}{c}
 C \wedge D, \Gamma\Gamma' \vdash m_i : \text{Num}(\tau_{m_i}) \quad e \neq \mathbf{assert\ false} \wedge \dots \wedge \\
 C \wedge D, \Gamma\Gamma' \vdash n_i : \text{Num}(\tau_{n_i}) \quad e \neq \lambda(p' \dots \lambda(p''. \mathbf{assert\ false})) \\
 C \vdash p : \tau_1 \longrightarrow \exists \bar{\beta}[D]\Gamma' \quad C \wedge D \wedge_i \tau_{m_i} \leq \tau_{n_i}, \Gamma\Gamma' \vdash e : \tau_2 \quad \bar{\beta} \# \text{FV}(C, \Gamma, \tau_2) \\
 \hline
 C, \Gamma \vdash p \mathbf{when} \wedge_i m_i \leq n_i . e : \tau_1 \rightarrow \tau_2
 \end{array}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 \llbracket \Gamma \vdash p \mathbf{when} \wedge_i m_i \leq n_i . e : \tau_1 \rightarrow \tau_2 \rrbracket &= \exists \overline{\alpha_i^1 \alpha_i^2} . \llbracket \vdash p \downarrow \tau_1 \rrbracket \wedge \forall \bar{\beta} . D \Rightarrow \\
 &\quad \wedge_i \llbracket \Gamma\Gamma' \vdash m_i : \text{Num}(\alpha_i^1) \rrbracket \wedge_i \llbracket \Gamma\Gamma' \vdash n_i : \text{Num}(\alpha_i^2) \rrbracket \\
 &\quad \wedge (\wedge_i \alpha_i^1 \leq \alpha_i^2 \Rightarrow \llbracket \Gamma\Gamma' \vdash e : \tau_2 \rrbracket) \\
 &\quad \text{when } e \neq \mathbf{assert\ false} \wedge \dots \wedge \\
 &\quad e \neq \lambda(p' \dots \lambda(p''. \mathbf{assert\ false})) \quad \text{where } \exists \bar{\beta}[D]\Gamma' \text{ is } \llbracket \vdash p \uparrow \tau_1 \rrbracket, \bar{\beta} \overline{\alpha_i^1 \alpha_i^2} \# \text{FV}(\Gamma, \tau_1, \tau_2)
 \end{aligned}$$

*slide8.gadt:*

```

newtype Signed : num
newcons Pos : ∀n [0 ≤ n]. Num n → Signed n
newcons Neg : ∀n [n ≤ 0]. Num n → Signed n
let foo = function
  | i when 7 <= i -> Pos (i + -7)
  | i when i <= 7 -> Neg (i + -7)

```

Result: val foo : ∀n. Num (n + 7) → Signed n



*slide9.gadt:*

```

newtype Avl : type * num
newcons Empty :  $\forall a. \text{Avl } (a, 0)$ 
newcons Node :
   $\forall a, k, m, n [k = \max(m, n) \wedge 0 \leq m \wedge 0 \leq n \wedge n \leq m + 2 \wedge m \leq n + 2].$ 
   $\text{Avl } (a, m) * a * \text{Avl } (a, n) * \text{Num } (k + 1) \longrightarrow \text{Avl } (a, k + 1)$ 

```

```

let height = function
  | Empty -> 0
  | Node (_, _, _, k) -> k

let create = fun l x r ->
  ematch height l, height r with
  | i, j when j <= i -> Node (l, x, r, i + 1)
  | i, j when i <= j -> Node (l, x, r, j + 1)

```

Result:

```

val height :  $\forall n, a. \text{Avl } (a, n) \rightarrow \text{Num } n$ 
val create :
   $\forall k, n, a [k \leq n + 2 \wedge n \leq k + 2 \wedge 0 \leq k \wedge 0 \leq n].$ 
   $\text{Avl } (a, k) \rightarrow a \rightarrow \text{Avl } (a, n) \rightarrow \exists i [i = \max(k + 1, n + 1)]. \text{Avl } (a, i)$ 

```

$$\begin{array}{c}
 C \wedge D, \Gamma\Gamma' \vdash m_i: \text{Num}(\tau_{m_i}) \quad e = \mathbf{assert\ false} \vee \dots \vee \\
 C \wedge D, \Gamma\Gamma' \vdash n_i: \text{Num}(\tau_{n_i}) \quad e = \lambda(p' \dots \lambda(p''. \mathbf{assert\ false})) \\
 C \vdash p: \tau_3 \longrightarrow \exists \bar{\beta}[D]\Gamma' \quad C \wedge D \wedge \tau_1 \dot{=} \tau_3 \wedge_i \tau_{m_i} \leq \tau_{n_i}, \Gamma\Gamma' \vdash e: \tau_2 \quad \bar{\beta} \# \text{FV}(C, \Gamma, \tau_2) \\
 \hline
 C, \Gamma \vdash p \mathbf{when} \wedge_i m_i \leq n_i. e: \tau_1 \rightarrow \tau_2
 \end{array}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 \llbracket \Gamma \vdash p \mathbf{when} \wedge_i m_i \leq n_i. e: \tau_1 \rightarrow \tau_2 \rrbracket &= \exists \alpha_3 \overline{\alpha_i^1 \alpha_i^2}. \llbracket \vdash p \downarrow \alpha_3 \rrbracket \wedge \forall \bar{\beta}. D \Rightarrow \\
 &\quad \wedge_i \llbracket \Gamma\Gamma' \vdash m_i: \text{Num}(\alpha_i^1) \rrbracket \wedge_i \llbracket \Gamma\Gamma' \vdash n_i: \text{Num}(\alpha_i^2) \rrbracket \\
 &\quad \wedge (\alpha_3 \dot{=} \tau_1 \wedge_i \alpha_i^1 \leq \alpha_i^2 \Rightarrow \llbracket \Gamma\Gamma' \vdash e: \tau_2 \rrbracket) \\
 &\quad \text{when } e = \mathbf{assert\ false} \vee \dots \vee \\
 &\quad e = \lambda(p' \dots \lambda(p''. \mathbf{assert\ false})) \\
 &\quad \text{where } \exists \bar{\beta}[D]\Gamma' \text{ is } \llbracket \vdash p \uparrow \alpha_3 \rrbracket, \bar{\beta} \alpha_3 \overline{\alpha_i^1 \alpha_i^2} \# \text{FV}(\Gamma, \tau_1, \tau_2)
 \end{aligned}$$

$$\frac{C \models \mathbf{F}}{C, \Gamma \vdash \mathbf{assert\ false}: \tau}$$

In the solver, we assume for negation, that the numerical domain is integers, while in general we take it to be rational numbers.

*slide11.gadt:*

```

newtype Avl : type * num
newcons Empty :  $\forall a. \text{Avl } (a, 0)$ 
newcons Node :
   $\forall a, k, m, n \ [k = \max(m, n) \wedge 0 \leq m \wedge 0 \leq n \wedge n \leq m + 2 \wedge m \leq n + 2].$ 
   $\text{Avl } (a, m) * a * \text{Avl } (a, n) * \text{Num } (k + 1) \longrightarrow \text{Avl } (a, k + 1)$ 

```

```

let rec min_binding = function
| Empty -> assert false
| Node (Empty, x, r, _) -> x
| Node ((Node (_, _, _, _) as l), x, r, _) -> min_binding l

```

*shell:*

```

# invargent slide11.gadt -inform
val min_binding :  $\forall n, a[1 \leq n]. \text{Avl } (a, n) \rightarrow a$ 

```

$$\frac{C, \Gamma' \vdash e_1 : \sigma \quad C, \Gamma' \vdash e_2 : \tau \quad \sigma = \forall \beta [\exists \bar{\alpha}. D]. \beta \quad \Gamma' = \Gamma \{x \mapsto \sigma\}}{C, \Gamma \vdash \mathbf{letrec} \, x = e_1 \mathbf{in} \, e_2 : \tau}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \llbracket \Gamma \vdash \mathbf{letrec} \, x = e_1 \mathbf{in} \, e_2 : \tau \rrbracket &= (\forall \beta (\chi(\beta) \Rightarrow \llbracket \Gamma \{x \mapsto \forall \beta [\chi(\beta)]. \beta \} \vdash e_1 : \beta \rrbracket)) \wedge \\ &\quad (\exists \alpha. \chi(\alpha)) \wedge \llbracket \Gamma \{x \mapsto \forall \beta [\chi(\beta)]. \beta \} \vdash e_2 : \tau \rrbracket \\ &\quad \text{where } \beta \# \text{FV}(\Gamma, \tau), \chi \# \text{PV}(\Gamma) \end{aligned}$$

$\chi(\cdot)$  is a second order variable.

*slide12.gadt:*

```
newtype List : type * num
newcons LNil : ∀a. List (a, 0)
newcons LCons : ∀a, n [0 ≤ n]. a * List (a, n) → List (a, n+1)
```

```
let rec map = fun f ->
  function LNil -> LNil
  | LCons (x, xs) -> LCons (f x, map f xs)
```

Result: val map : ∀n, a, b. (a → b) → List (a, n) → List (b, n)

*binary\_plus.gadt*:

```

newtype Binary : num
newtype Carry : num
newcons Zero : Binary 0
newcons PZero :  $\forall n [0 \leq n]. \text{Binary } n \longrightarrow \text{Binary}(2 \ n)$ 
newcons POne :  $\forall n [0 \leq n]. \text{Binary } n \longrightarrow \text{Binary}(2 \ n + 1)$ 
newcons CZero : Carry 0
newcons COne : Carry 1

```

```

let rec plus =
  function CZero ->
    (function
      | Zero ->
        (function Zero -> Zero [...])
      | COne ->
        (function Zero ->
          (function Zero -> POne(Zero)
            | PZero b1 -> POne b1
            | POne b1 -> PZero (plus COne Zero b1)) [...])

```

*re. plus*:  $\forall i, k, n. \text{Carry } i \rightarrow \text{Binary } k \rightarrow \text{Binary } n \rightarrow \text{Binary } (n + k + i)$

$$\frac{C, \Gamma, \Sigma \vdash e_1 : \tau' \rightarrow \tau \quad C, \Gamma, \Sigma \vdash e_2 : \tau' \quad C \models \not E(\tau')}{C, \Gamma, \Sigma \vdash e_1 e_2 : \tau}$$

$$\llbracket \Gamma \vdash e_1 e_2 : \tau \rrbracket = \exists \alpha. \llbracket \Gamma \vdash e_1 : \alpha \rightarrow \tau \rrbracket \wedge \llbracket \Gamma \vdash e_2 : \alpha \rrbracket \wedge \not E(\alpha), \alpha \# \text{FV}(\Gamma, \tau)$$

Above,  $\not E(\tau')$  means that  $\tau'$  is not an existential type. Therefore *slide14.gadt* fails:

```
newtype List : type * num
newcons LNil : ∀a. List(a, 0)
newcons LCons : ∀n, a [0≤n]. a * List(a, n) → List(a, n+1)
let rec filter = fun f ->
  efunction LNil -> LNil
  | LCons (x, xs) ->
    ematch f x with
    | True -> LCons (x, filter f xs)
    | False -> filter f xs
```

*shell*: unfortunately, error not informative in current implementation

```
../invariant slide14.gadt -inform
File "slide14.gadt", line 5, characters 2-134:
No answer in type: term abduction failed
```

*filter.gadt:*

```
newtype List : type * num
newcons LNil :  $\forall a.$  List(a, 0)
newcons LCons :  $\forall n, a$  [ $0 \leq n$ ].  $a * \text{List}(a, n) \longrightarrow \text{List}(a, n+1)$ 
```

```
let rec filter = fun f ->
  efunction LNil -> LNil
  | LCons (x, xs) ->
    ematch f x with
    | True ->
      let ys = filter f xs in
      LCons (x, ys)
    | False ->
      filter f xs
```

We use both efunction and ematch (a  $\beta$ -redex for efunction), because function and match would require the types of branch bodies to be equal: to be lists of the same length.

```
val filter :
   $\forall n, a.$ 
   $(a \longrightarrow \text{Bool}) \longrightarrow \text{List } (a, n) \longrightarrow \exists k[0 \leq k \wedge k \leq n]. \text{List } (a, k)$ 
```

$$\frac{\begin{array}{l} \varepsilon_K(\bar{\alpha}) \text{ in } \Sigma \quad C, \Gamma, \Sigma \vdash e_1 : \tau' \\ C, \Gamma, \Sigma \vdash Kp.e_2 : \tau' \rightarrow \tau \end{array}}{C, \Gamma, \Sigma \vdash \text{let } p = e_1 \text{ in } e_2 : \tau}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \llbracket \Gamma \vdash \text{let } p = e_1 \text{ in } e_2 : \tau \rrbracket &= \exists \alpha_0. \llbracket \Gamma \vdash e_1 : \alpha_0 \rrbracket \wedge \\ &(\llbracket \Gamma \vdash p.e_2 : \alpha_0 \rightarrow \tau \rrbracket \wedge \nexists (\alpha_0) \vee_{K \in \mathcal{E}} \llbracket \Gamma \vdash Kp.e_2 : \alpha_0 \rightarrow \tau \rrbracket) \\ &\text{where } \mathcal{E} = \{K \mid K :: \forall \bar{\alpha} \bar{\beta} [E]. \tau \rightarrow \varepsilon_K(\bar{\alpha}) \in \Sigma\} \end{aligned}$$

OCaml code generated for *filter.gadt* – *filter.ml*:

```
type _ list =
  | LNil : (*∀'a.*) ('a (* 0 *)) list
  | LCons : (*∀'n, 'a[0 ≤ n].*) 'a * ('a (* n *)) list ->
    ('a (* n + 1 *)) list
type _ ex2 =
  | Ex2 : (*∀'k, 'n, 'a[0 ≤ k ∧ k ≤ n].*) ('a (* k *)) list ->
    ((* n,*) 'a) ex2
let rec filter :
  type (*n*) a . (((a -> bool)) -> (a (* n *)) list -> ((* n,*) a) ex2) =
  (fun f ->
    (function LNil -> let xcase = LNil in Ex2 xcase
    | LCons (x, xs) ->
      (if f x then
        let Ex2 ys = filter f xs in let xcase = LCons (x, ys) in Ex2 xcase
        else let Ex2 xcase = filter f xs in Ex2 xcase)))
```



*equal1\_wrong.gadt*: compare two values of types as encoded

```

newtype Ty : type
newtype List : type
newcons Zero : Int
newcons Nil :  $\forall a. \text{List } a$ 
newcons TInt : Ty Int
newcons TPair :  $\forall a, b. \text{Ty } a * \text{Ty } b \longrightarrow \text{Ty } (a, b)$ 
newcons TList :  $\forall a. \text{Ty } a \longrightarrow \text{Ty } (\text{List } a)$ 
external let eq_int : Int  $\rightarrow$  Int  $\rightarrow$  Bool = "(=)"
external let b_and : Bool  $\rightarrow$  Bool  $\rightarrow$  Bool = "&&"
external let b_not : Bool  $\rightarrow$  Bool = "not"
external forall2 :  $\forall a, b. (a \rightarrow b \rightarrow \text{Bool}) \rightarrow \text{List } a \rightarrow \text{List } b \rightarrow \text{Bool} = \text{"forall2"}$ 

let rec equal1 = function
  | TInt, TInt -> fun x y -> eq_int x y
  | TPair (t1, t2), TPair (u1, u2) ->
    (fun (x1, x2) (y1, y2) ->
      b_and (equal1 (t1, u1) x1 y1)
            (equal1 (t2, u2) x2 y2))
  | TList t, TList u -> forall2 (equal1 (t, u))
  | _ -> fun _ _ -> False

```

Result: val equal1 :  $\forall a, b. (\text{Ty } a, \text{Ty } b) \rightarrow a \rightarrow a \rightarrow \text{Bool}$

**Exercise 1.** Find remaining three maximally general types of equal1.

*equal\_assert.gadt*:

[...]

```
let rec equal = function
  | TInt, TInt -> fun x y -> eq_int x y
  | TPair (t1, t2), TPair (u1, u2) ->
    (fun (x1, x2) (y1, y2) ->
      b_and (equal (t1, u1) x1 y1)
            (equal (t2, u2) x2 y2))
  | TList t, TList u -> forall2 (equal (t, u))
  | _ -> fun _ _ -> False
  | TInt, TList l -> (function Nil -> assert false)
  | TList l, TInt -> (fun _ -> function Nil -> assert false)
```

Result:

```
val equal :  $\forall a, b. (Ty\ a, Ty\ b) \rightarrow a \rightarrow b \rightarrow Bool$ 
```

*equal\_test.gadt*:

```
[...]
let rec equal = function
  | TInt, TInt -> fun x y -> eq_int x y
  | TPair (t1, t2), TPair (u1, u2) ->
    (fun (x1, x2) (y1, y2) ->
      b_and (equal (t1, u1) x1 y1)
            (equal (t2, u2) x2 y2))
  | TList t, TList u -> forall2 (equal (t, u))
  | _ -> fun _ _ -> False
test b_not (equal (TInt, TList TInt) zero Nil)
```

OCaml code generated – *equal\_test.ml*:

```
[...]
let rec equal : type a b . ((a ty * b ty) -> a -> b -> bool) =
  (function (TInt, TInt) -> (fun x y -> eq_int x y)
    | (TPair (t1, t2), TPair (u1, u2)) ->
      (fun ((x1, x2)) ((y1, y2)) ->
        b_and (equal ((t1, u1)) x1 y1) (equal ((t2, u2)) x2 y2))
    | (TList t, TList u) -> forall2 (equal ((t, u)))
    | _ -> (fun _ _ -> false))
let () = assert (b_not (equal ((TInt, TList TInt)) zero Nil)); ()
```

Chuan-kai Lin developed an efficient type inference algorithm for GADTs, however in a type system restricted to so-called pointwise types.

Toy example – *non\_pointwise\_split.gadt*:

```
newtype Split : type * type
newcons Whole : Split (Int, Int)
newcons Parts :  $\Lambda a, b.$  Split ((Int, a), (b, Bool))
external let seven : Int = "7"
external let three : Int = "3"
```

```
let joint = function
  | Whole -> seven
  | Parts -> three, True
```

Needs non-default setting – *shell*:

```
# invargent non_pointwise_split.gadt -inform -richer_answers
val joint :  $\forall a.$  Split (a, a)  $\rightarrow$  a
```

**Exercise 2.** Check that this is the correct type.

Chuan-kai Lin's system needs a workaround, InvarGenT works with `def. settings - non_pointwise_avl.gadt`:

```
(** Normally we would use [num], but this is a stress test for [type]. *)
newtype Z
newtype S : type
newtype Balance : type * type * type
newcons Less :  $\forall a. \text{Balance } (a, S\ a, S\ a)$ 
newcons Same :  $\forall a. \text{Balance } (a, a, a)$ 
newcons More :  $\forall a. \text{Balance } (S\ a, a, S\ a)$ 
newtype AVL : type
newcons Leaf : AVL Z
newcons Node :
   $\forall a, b, c. \text{Balance } (a, b, c) * \text{AVL } a * \text{Int} * \text{AVL } b \longrightarrow \text{AVL } (S\ c)$ 

newtype Choice : type * type
newcons Left :  $\forall a, b. a \longrightarrow \text{Choice } (a, b)$ 
newcons Right :  $\forall a, b. b \longrightarrow \text{Choice } (a, b)$ 

let rotr = fun z d -> function
  | Leaf -> assert false
  | Node (Less, a, x, Leaf) -> assert false
  | Node (Same, a, x, (Node (_,_,_,_) as b)) ->
    Right (Node (Less, a, x, Node (More, b, z, d))) [...]

Result:  $\forall a. \text{Int} \longrightarrow \text{AVL } a \longrightarrow \text{AVL } (S\ (S\ a)) \longrightarrow \text{Choice } (\text{AVL } (S\ (S\ a)), \text{AVL } (S\ (S\ (S\ a))))$ 
```

A solution to at least one branch of implications, correspondingly of pattern matching, must be implied by the conjunction of the premise and the conclusion of the branch. I.e., some branch must be solvable without arbitrary guessing. If solving a branch requires guessing, for some ordering of branches, the solution to already solved branches must be a good guess.

*non\_pointwise\_vary.gadt*:

```
newtype EquLR : type * type * type
newcons EquL :  $\forall a, b.$  EquLR (a, a, b)
newcons EquR :  $\forall a, b.$  EquLR (a, b, b)
newtype Box : type
newcons Cons :  $\forall a.$  a  $\longrightarrow$  Box a
external let eq :  $\forall a.$  a  $\rightarrow$  a  $\rightarrow$  Bool = "(=)"
let vary = fun e y ->
  match e with
  | EquL, EquL -> eq y "c"
  | EquR, EquR -> Cons (match y with True -> 5 | False -> 7)
```

*shell*:

```
# invargent non_pointwise_vary.gadt -inform
File "non_pointwise_vary.gadt", line 11, characters 18-60:
No answer in type: term abduction failed
```

**Exercise 3.** Find a type or two for vary. Check that the type does not meet the above requirement.

**Theorem 1.** Correctness (*expressions*).  $\llbracket \Gamma \vdash \text{ce} : \tau \rrbracket, \Gamma \vdash \text{ce} : \tau$ .

**Theorem 2.** Completeness (*expressions*). If  $PV(C, \Gamma) = \emptyset$  and  $C, \Gamma \vdash \text{ce} : \tau$ , then there exists an interpretation of predicate variables  $\mathcal{I}$  such that  $\mathcal{I}, C \models \llbracket \Gamma \vdash \text{ce} : \tau \rrbracket$ .

- We use an extension of *fully maximal Simple Constraint Abduction* – “fully maximal” is the restriction that we do not guess facts not implied by premise and conclusion of a given implication.
- Without existential types, the problem in principle is caused by the complexity of constraint abduction – not known to be decidable. Given a correct program with appropriate `assert false` clauses, and using an oracle for Simple Constraint Abduction, the intended type scheme will ultimately be found.
  - This could be shown formally, but the proof is very tedious.
- Without existential types, the problem in practice is that although the *fully maximal* restriction, when not imposed on all branches but with accumulating the solution as discussed on slide 22, seems sufficient for practical programs, fully maximal SCA is still exponential in the size of input.
- With existential types, there are no guarantees. The intended solution to the postconditions could be missed by the algorithm.
  - We have not yet found a definite, and practical, such counterexample.