Instructor: James Landay

Heuristic Evaluation of [FitUp]

1. Problem/Prototype

I am reviewing FitUp, a web interface for fashion design and sharing.

2. Violations Found

1. H8. Aesthetic and Minimalist Design - Severity 1 - A, D

The account creation page has a large landscape image unrelated to the program. While aesthetically pleasing, it is not relevant and personally distracting. There is no clear area of contrast that my eyes are drawn to first. My focus constantly jumps between the text on the left (drawn to it because of the bold white, capitalized, and spaced out letters and also because eyes are typically drawn to the left side of the screen as if reading a book) and the sign-up box on the right due to the box of white offering some contrast. The letter spacing makes the text a little bit hard to read; the big spaces tend to single out individual letters, hindering me reading them as a full word.

Fix: Find less distracting image, make image relevant, or remove image

2. H3. User Control and Freedom - Severity 2 - A

The account creation/sign in page has no "remember my password" option. This is an expectation of users in modern programs and will lead to frustration.

Fix: add remember password option

3. H7. Efficiency of Use - Severity 2 - D, C

Login/sign-up screen does not scale to fit the dimensions of the window. This means that if I open FitUp in a really small window without anticipating the location of the sign up/sign in form, I wouldn't necessarily be able to see the form on the window at all. You could remedy this by making your design more responsive to the constraints of the device window.

4. H5. Error Prevention - Severity 3 - C

The sign up box looks like what should be a log in box. Also, using the terms sign in and sign up next to each other makes it easy to get confused which box is which. My home screens feature the single username-password combo box as a log in and not a sign up.

5. H7. Flexibility and Efficiency of Use - Severity 2- D

Making the next arrow the only clickable could lead to some confusion because the previous screen (6) allowed me to click wherever to proceed.

6. H8. Aesthetic and Minimalist Design- Severity 0 - D

Spacing between lime green text and arrow varies. Fix this by having a more uniform spacing between arrows.

7. H8. Aesthetic and Minimalist Design - Severity 3 - D, A

The dark color background could make it hard to operate some of the slider options or to even choose colors because of the low contrast. Additionally, some of the buttons also share this low-contrast problem (e.g. save, upload element, flip triangles), which would make operating FitUp very hard for people who are visually impaired or have poor vision. Changing the shirt color to black also has this same problem.

Instructor: James Landay

Remedy this by increasing the contrast of your clickables or putting a white box around all clickable options so that it is much easier to see what you are operating.

8. H6. Recognition Rather Than Recall - Severity 4 - D, C, B, A

Clicking on the menu button in the top left corner after wanting to select a collar detail seems a little counterintuitive; despite the back button in the bottom corner, I feel like still allowing the user the option to browse all of their other designs that they're working/have worked on might interrupt the flow of their design process. Furthermore, if they haven't saved their work and wanted to change the collar but forgot to click on the back button and instead clicked on the menu, all of their work would've been gone.

It would be good to just completely do without that menu option in order to not interrupt the flow of the person working.

9. H6. Recognition Rather Than Recall - Severity 2 - D, A

It is not clear to the user that clicking on the icons of the sleeves, fit, and collar would necessarily lead to options that allow you to customize them. Rather, they seem more like additional pictures that show you details of a piece of clothing (e.g. online shopping has different views and sometimes zooms in on pieces of the clothing to show smaller details).

You could perhaps remedy this by labeling the column of icons with something including the word 'customize' so that users have a better idea of what would happen when clicking on them.

10. H7. Flexibility and Efficiency of Use - Severity 3 - D, C

Controls are a bit spaced out and not exactly grouped in a productive way. I primarily have a concern with the fact that the undo/redo buttons are placed in a more out-of-the-way location such that I initially did not recognize that they were there. You could fix this by perhaps having all of your functions in a similar location for consistency.

11. H2. Match Between System and Real World - Severity 3 - D

You only provide the option to overlay the image over the t-shirt, however the terminology "overlay" might confuse users, as in many artistic software, overlay turns the image semi-transparent.

You could fix this by changing the text to "place image."

12. H1. Visibility of System Status - Severity 2 - D

Uploading an image won't always be instantaneous and may sometimes take a while. It might be a good idea to show some sort of indication that FitUp is uploading and processing the image so that the user knows it didn't freeze up.

13. H4. Consistency and Standards - Severity 3 - D

The share button resembles a lot of other upload buttons, which could get confusing as there is this "upload button" and an "upload element" button, so it might be a good idea to switch to another share icon in order to lend clarity to the user that the button is actually to share the design, not upload it.

14. H8. Aesthetic and Minimalist Design - Severity 1 - D

You might want to have a more consistent usage of color; here, you have a lime green as an accent color, however you use it for both clickable and non-clickable items, which causes confusion as to where users can click.

15. H2. Match Between System and Real World - Severity 3 - D, C

"Upload element" is not really a term we would use in real life. Furthermore, the term "element" is quite vague, despite being only able to upload images to your design. You could fix this by simply changing the button text to "upload image."

Instructor: James Landay

16. H1. Visibility of System Status - Severity 2 - A, B

It is somewhat unclear what "link account" means for sharing (does it auto post? Does it just allow easier sharing?) or whether or not an account was successfully linked. It changes color but only slightly and this is somewhat unclear.

Fix: Explain what linking an account entails and make linked accounts more clear.

17. H3. User Control and Freedom - Severity 2 -A, B, C

The user is automatically entered into a tutorial. If the user is familiar with the product or dislikes tutorials, they cannot skip it. Furthermore, users cannot go backward in the tutorial.

Fix: allow users to skip tutorial and add a back button

18. H3. User Control and Freedom - Severity 4 - A, C

There is currently no option for deleting a design.

Fix: Allow users to delete a design

19. H3. User Control and Freedom - Severity 3 - A

There appears to only be one skin tone and only two body types. Users with or designing for other skin tones or body types are unable to see what their designs will look like in these cases.

Fix: Add options for body and skin types

20. H3. User Control and Freedom - Severity 4 - A

There is currently no option for saturation of color. If users want to make a pastel colored shirt they are unable to do so. This may just be a factor of limitations of the prototype, but I do not see where this is indicated.

Fix: Add finer color control.

21. H5. Error Prevention - Severity 2 - A

When a user is prompted to upload a file, there is no indication of what type of files are allowed. Are they image files? If so, what formats? Without this, this could lead to errors.

Fix: State what file types are allowed before prompting for upload

22. H7. Flexibility and Efficiency of Use - Severity 2 - A

If a user is using the same design element across multiple designs, the user must individually upload the element each time.

Fix: Allow users to select from previously uploaded elements, perhaps sorted by recentness or frequency of use, instead of only being able to upload.

23. H1. Visibility of System Status - Severity 3 - A

When a user is selecting between options of, for example, necklines, it is unclear if the larger image is the currently used neckline or a preview of the one it will be changed to. Fix: Depending on what it is meant to represent, add text saying "current" or "preview" to the option selection screen next to the large image.

24. H5. Error Prevention- Severity 1 - C

The transitions between screens is jarring, if possible, make smooth transitions, either by fade in fade out of foreground objects, or my translating the objects off and onto the screen.

25. H9. Help users recognize, diagnose, and recover from errors - Severity 2 - C

Instructor: James Landay

I would assume a design name has to be unique? You should indicate that, or otherwise indicate what the design name will be used for, whether it can be changed, etc.

26. H10. Help and Documentation - Severity 2 - C, D

The intro help tutorial is not very helpful, also why are there already shirts in my design studio even though it's brand new? I haven't designed anything yet. My suggestion is to have the help tutorial lead you through creating a dummy shirt first, and then removing that dummy shirt, and also giving you a skip option.

27. H4. Consistency and Standards - Severity 1 - C

Sometimes you choose to center align text, sometimes you choose to left align text, pick one for consistency.

28. H3. User control and freedom - Severity 1 - B

The quick tour in the beginning is a helpful feature, but users should be given the option of whether or not they want the tutorial with a small escape button in the corner. To continue, if the user does choose to use the tutorial, users should first be shown a full picture of the entire screen before highlighting specific features so the user can understand what is being shown.

Fix: Escape option for tutorial and full desktop visibility before starting tutorial

29. H6. Recognition rather than recall - Severity 0 - B

In the studio creation interface, the option to name the studio is somewhat hidden in the bottom corner. This is an important aspect of the platform and it should be more centralized so users are immediately able to see it.

Fix: Make the studio naming tool more visible for users

3. Summary of Violations

Category	# Viol. (sev 0)	# Viol. (sev 1)	# Viol. (sev 2)	# Viol. (sev 3)	# Viol. (sev 4)	# Viol. (total)
H1: Visibility of Status			2	1		3
H2: Match Sys & World				2		2
H3: User Control		1	2	1	2	6
H4: Consistency		1		1		2
H5: Error Prevention		1	1	1		3
H6: Recognition not Recall	1		1		1	3
H7: Efficiency of Use			3	1		4
H8: Minimalist Design	1	2		1		4
H9: Help Users with Errors			1			1
H10: Documentation			1			1
Total Violations by Severity	2	5	11	8	3	29
Note: check your answer for the green box by making sure the sum of the last column is equal to the sum of the last row (not including the green box)						

Instructor: James Landay

Instructor: James Landay

4. Evaluation Statistics

Severity /	Evaluator A	Evaluator B	Evaluator C	Evaluator D
Evaluator				
sev. 0	0	1	0	1
sev. 1	1	1	2	2
sev. 2	6	3	4	5
sev. 3	3	0	3	5
sev. 4	3	1	2	1
total (sev. 3 & 4)	6	1	5	6
total (all severity levels)	13	6	11	14

^{*}Note that the bottom rows are not calculated by adding the numbers above it.

5. Summary Recommendations

There was a cluster of issues regarding contrast and color use. Certain parts, like the login box or save/share buttons, are low contrast, which presents visual and accessibility issues. Furthermore, there is some color use consistency that needs to be tweaked.

Another cluster of issues, the largest such cluster we found, was that of control and freedom. For a design program, there are very few design options. We suggest adding more advanced design options, such as more body types and skin tones or more advanced color selection (among others). If the concern is if these will intimidate new users, some sort of staged addition of features or optional enabling of advanced features could be used.

In the intro screen the sign-up box the first thing you see, but that's where more users would expect to see a sign in box instead. Also, signing up without a password confirmation (like input your password a second time to make sure you didn't bork it up) is pretty important. Not to mention email confirmation.

Severity Ratings

- 0 don't agree that this is a usability problem
- 1 cosmetic problem
- 2 minor usability problem
- 3 major usability problem; important to fix
- 4 usability catastrophe; imperative to fix

Instructor: James Landay

Heuristics

H1: Visibility of System Status

• Keep users informed about what is going on

H2: Match Between System & Real World

- Speak the users' language
- Follow real world conventions

H3: User Control & Freedom

- "Exits" for mistaken choices, undo, redo
- Don't force down fixed paths

H4: Consistency & Standards

H5: Error Prevention

H6: Recognition Rather Than Recall

• Make objects, actions, options, & directions visible or easily retrievable

H7: Flexibility & Efficiency of Use

- Accelerators for experts (e.g., gestures, kb shortcuts)
- Allow users to tailor frequent actions (e.g., macros)

H8: Aesthetic & Minimalist Design

• No irrelevant information in dialogues

H9: Help Users Recognize, Diagnose, & Recover from Errors

- Error messages in plain language
- Precisely indicate the problem
- Constructively suggest a solution

H10: Help & Documentation

- Easy to search
- Focused on the user's task
- List concrete steps to carry out
- Not too large