

## **Voices**

- I. Section Overview
- II. Five Frustrations (2-5)
- III. What is the Relevance: Women and the Appearance Factor (5-6)
- IV. Comments Section (6-8)
- V. Quotes from the Media (8-13)
- VI. Interesting Facts in Women's History (13)
- VII. Anecdotes (13-14)

### **I. Section Overview**

This section shares some of the personal ideas, experiences, and thoughts of many women and a few men as they consider the issues facing women in America. Included are comments from *Women Will Get it Done* readers, along with folks with whom Mike has had conversations about these issues, as well as quotes from experts and professionals working to strengthen the rights and roles of women in the United States. Finally, there are some interesting historical notes and some telling anecdotes.

## II. FIVE FRUSTRATIONS

1) **The foundation is flawed.** I am frustrated, first and foremost, by the deep structural problems that persist in this country and act as detriments both to women's achievement of full equality, and to men who desire more options. We pale in comparison to other industrialized nations when it comes to providing both affordable and high-quality child care; "flextime" remains for most more a convenient ideal than a reality; working remotely is often far more difficult than it sounds; and part-time jobs that offer real benefits and can sustain a family are few and far between, even with two wage-earners in a household. It's lovely to think about the kinds of women that have schedules flexible enough that they can "make it work"—writers, psychologists in private practice, teachers of night classes, to name a few. But the vast majority of American women trying to provide for themselves are consumed each day by boring old full-time jobs, and simply "fitting a baby" around this schedule is a daunting—and for many, simply impossible.

And yet, I would argue that this is not a particularly prominent part of the national conversation right now, in spite of the fact that it affects (literally) one in two people in the United States. I earnestly believe that the reason women are still so woefully underrepresented in government, science, and positions of corporate leadership has as much, if not more, to do with these structural factors than with personal discrimination or bias—and that no matter how much we progress in terms of the latter, it won't matter if we can't fix the former. In fact—and part of me hates to say this—I suspect that sometimes the continued focus on personal discrimination or gender bias distracts from these basic conversations. People think, "But I'm not prejudiced! Of *course* I believe a woman can do anything a man can do, and it would be bigoted to believe otherwise," and then they tend to just tune out—assuming all their actions will inevitably conform with this fundamental belief...when in reality, they don't. Meanwhile, several crucially important problems continue to be ignored.

2) **Diversifying our voices.** To add to this frustration, the wonderful, brave, inspiring, and extremely intelligent women who have taken the stage recently (albeit, each in her own particular way) to highlight these issues are not exactly representative of the broader population that the issues actually affect. Women like Sheryl Sandberg, Elsa Walsh, and Marissa Mayer are extraordinarily successful, and each has had both the financial means and the support of key people at home (namely, their husbands) to be able to be both great moms *and* great at their respective jobs. (They admit to not "having it all," but I'd argue that each has come pretty darn close.) However, these women are the exception, not the rule. Moreover, it's unfortunate but true that most of the wage gains women have made in the past few decades have gone to the top twenty percent of women—according to a report released by the Council on Contemporary Families—and that childless women have also made far more wage progress

than mothers. Inequality in pay persists between men and women, but it's important to remember that it also persists *among* women—a major roadblock if we as a gender are to make the strides forward we wish to make. Generations before us fought for *all* women, not just for some, and perhaps it is time to hand the microphone to a few in that other eighty percent.

3) **My own blindness.** I, like many women my age, have taken the women's movement that came before me for granted. I've never really questioned the idea of women as equal: the valedictorian and salutatorian of my high school class were both female; one went to Yale, the other to Harvard, and they are both now in medical school. My courses in college were packed with eager young women, many who attained better grades and received higher accolades than their male counterparts. I've seen brilliant girls launch technology start-ups; even I landed a job post-college that many young men would have likely grabbed, if given the chance. And now, in my office, I see women in leadership positions—including women with children—and I have never been witness to an incident of sexual harassment or overt sexual discrimination.

But as grateful as I am for this wonderful world I live in, I now recognize that I've been blind for a long time to problems that still lurk under the surface, biases that linger on—and I'm not just talking about in the workplace, or in society at large. I'm embarrassed to admit that—when I truly think about it—my *own* expectations for women do not quite conform with mine for men; I think that, subconsciously, and in spite of all I know, I hold members of the two sexes to slightly different standards. I'm more ashamed to admit that I take a more competitive attitude when it comes to other females than I do with males. It makes no logical sense: aren't I competing for the same jobs and opportunities as men my age? And yet, I catch myself unknowingly complying with the antiquated idea that there is *only so much space* out there for bright young women, and I want to be one of the lucky ones to occupy it. If we as individuals keep thinking like this, women will never attain true equality. And what's more, we'll never challenge ourselves to each reach our highest potential. I hope to alter this mindset and eradicate these differences, starting first and foremost with myself.

4) **The Appearance Factor.** I don't want to spend too much time on this, because I fundamentally believe it is not nearly as important as the other issues I have mentioned—nor is it as difficult to overcome, or at least to ignore. But: it is in many ways true that women have this whole other “appearance” thing to worry about that just does not affect men in quite the same way. Do I think I would not sit at the same desk I sit in each day if I looked a different way? No. Do I think there aren't plenty of men out there who get discriminated against, or even chastised, for being overweight? Of course not. But I do believe that judgment (from *both* sexes) is harsher when it comes to females. We tend to pay much more attention to our appearance, and hold ourselves to harsher standards and stricter requirements, than the men

around us do. It's a small thing (and I think we each can do our part to help each other, even just by talking about it), but it would certainly be nice to be relieved of some of this pressure—because between advancing in the workplace, raising a family, and solving world peace, we just don't have time to worry about things that are so superficial and ultimately superfluous. And yet, so many of us, myself included, do.

**5) Initiating the Conversation.** As I mentioned, I was surrounded in college by impressive women: tomorrow's doctors, teachers, politicians, artists, and engineers. I also saw young women, with visible passion and rigor, embrace causes such as fighting sexual violence and standing up for LGBT rights—both efforts I deeply respect. But yet, I never once sat down with a group of women and talked about these other issues, issues that would inevitably affect almost each and every one of us one day. I never took part in a constructive conversation that went beyond abstractions (or moved past the feminist theories I read in a gender studies class): what are we *actually* going to do? Or, more aptly, what *can* we actually do? *What are the options?* And if the options aren't good enough, *how do we change them?* It's time to begin this conversation—not at thirty-five when we may be married and deep into careers and feel stuck or lost or ambivalent—but now, when we can initiate the fight. Right now is when we can build foundations: we can *create* the options, instead of one day lamenting that they aren't there. I am by no means saying that the logistical details of our lives need to be planned out years in advance; that would be ridiculous, unnecessary, and needlessly stressful. But it may be useful to start this conversation earlier—embracing it with the fire we've shown on these other awareness campaigns—thereby setting the wheels in motion to affect the kind of change that will, someday, lead to real equality and real choice.

[Observation by a woman, single, age early 20s, employed]

\* \* \* \* \*

I agree, to an extent, that part of the “Female Advantage” is in an increased willingness to compromise and cooperate. However, the female politician I worked for (and am still fairly close with) was a firm and strong leader

What I saw in my (admittedly limited) exposure to politics was that, to men, politics is a game. Politics is about conquest and victory. The male politician I worked for lived and breathed politics, sought power for its own sake, and loved to win.

For the female politician I worked for, politics was just a job. She cared little about conquest or victory, often citing that Truman quote about not caring “who gets the credit.” She takes her job seriously, but doesn't let it consume her. For her, the motivation to do well is her career, in the same way that a lawyer or doctor strives to do good work. She finds no excitement in others losing.

However I'm not sure that this is true of the well-known female governors and senators—it seems that often the women who are elected are the ones who act like men. But I do think there is great value in electing women who do not have that traditionally-male desire to win and make others lose.

[Observation by a man, College Senior]

\* \* \* \* \*

### **III. WHAT IS THE RELEVANCE: Women and the Appearance Factor**

Physical appearance has long been a factor in determining the value of a woman. No matter her successes, if she fails to look good while achieving them, they are to some degree diminished. The media plays a major role in perpetuating this problem by including unnecessary editorials on wardrobe, hairstyle and looks in articles about women in fields unrelated to fashion. Until society can look past these superficial details and see the true value of women and their work, articles like the following will continue to be published and considered acceptable.

During the time of her nomination and confirmation, Roll Call reporter Warren Rojas wrote a piece on soon-to-be-head of the Federal Reserve Board Janet Yellen's wardrobe and its lack of depth. Yellen had worn the same simple black outfit to both her official nomination ceremony with President Obama and then again to a nomination hearing on the Hill, prompting Rojas to write his piece entitled "*Somebody Spot Janet Yellen Some New Threads.*" He commented that while it remains to be seen how Ms. Yellen's work might affect the economy, "at least we know her mind won't be preoccupied with haute couture." After being posted online, the comments section erupted as readers cried sexism. One wrote, "I must have missed the one where you critiqued the lack of originality in Ben Bernanke's wardrobe. Get over yourselves and stop making a woman's clothes a thing to talk about when you wouldn't talk about a man's." When current head Ben Bernanke steps down in January Yellen will be the first woman to take the head position at the Fed and it appears that she will not be judged based solely on her financial abilities, but on her appearance and style as well.

Additionally, in an article about the Lara Logan Benghazi report scandal, Washington Post reporter Paul Farhi spent several paragraphs commenting on Logan's "globetrotting lifestyle and striking looks" along with the fact that "she was once a swimsuit model" before getting to the actual meat of the article- her work and the error she had made. The article included the completely unrelated note that "On Halloween, people who live in Logan's neighborhood were startled to see the famous TV correspondent trick-or-treating with her children while dressed in a hot-pink bodysuit costume, set off with high heels." How this relates to her work as a

reporter and to the current controversy over her work is not made clear. What is clear is that she is an attractive female reporter and writing an article on her work without including comments on her looks and wardrobe choices would be a waste of newsprint.

[Observation by a woman, single, age late 20s, employed]

[Prompted by a 49 year old, businessman, married with children]

\*\*\*\*\*

#### **IV. COMMENTS**

“Men are threatened by the fact that women can create life.”

[comment by a woman- single age 40]

Whether or not a person (usually women but increasingly men) can have it all depends on how you define “all” and it depends on the nature of each element of your career, family, other thing and how you define them. You may not have the choice of limiting each element to a combination that lets it be possible.

[comment—woman, employed full-time, married, age early 50s]

Women tend to do a better job of listening to people/voters.

[comment – woman]

One of the things that I find most objectionable are 7:30 a.m. meetings in the morning.

[comments – several women, married, children at home, employed full-time]

You get up each morning, take a quick shower, pick a black suit or a blue suit, a white shirt or blue shirts, a red tie or a black tie, and head off to work. When I get up the first thing I do is check my schedule to determine how much attention I need to pay to my hair and how I dress because I know that those things will draw attention in various meetings. Then I get the kids up and give them breakfast and see them off to school and then I return to getting myself ready.

[comment – woman, married, children, employed full-time age early 40s]

When I was interviewing people for jobs, men would reach out without reservation. Women would ask whether I thought they could do the job.

[comment – woman, married, retired from government, age early 60s]

Women work through issues, they listen, voice opinion, men start fighting.

[comment – woman, age 45]

Women have definitely taken over the family.

[comment – woman]

Do not let the country go backwards as relates to women's rights.

[comment – woman, employed in financial community, age late 50s]

Women should step forward on their own behalf and they can have it all.

[comment – senior woman executive, age 40s]

Women have a natural instinct to want to be loved – that is not the same for men.

[comment – woman, married, retired, age 60s]

We have created a situation where it is impossible for women to raise families and pursue professional careers outside of the home without family or career suffering – at very high levels, jobs that required extraordinary numbers of hours are very difficult.

[comment – woman, married, retired, age 60s]

Most women who are speaking out on this subject, such as [Sheryl] Sandberg and [Anne-Marie] Slaughter do not represent the average American female worker.

[comment – woman, married, employed full-time, age 40s]

Do husbands of professional occupied women really carry their weight?

[comment – woman, married, young children, employed full-time, age late 30s]

Many women who have balanced full-time work outside the home and raising a family eventually express guilt about the amount of attention they are not giving to their children.

[observation]

A Woman with two children in grade school appears to be the principal breadwinner, husband works from home, when asked whether she feels guilty about being away from her children so much, says she feels a little bit guilty. She goes on to say she really believes she would not be a good full-time mother and believes there are any number of women like her.

[comment – woman, married, young children, employed full-time, age mid 40s]

Men believe the world is their oyster. There are different male views of marriage. Men have a sense of entitlement.

[comment – woman, married, employed full-time, age late 50s]

“Why don't women run the world? Maybe it's because they don't want to.”

[comment- woman, married, mother of grown children, works in journalism, 50s]

“Real women’s empowerment is being able to do what you want to when you want to.”

[comment- woman, married, children at home, Ivy-league grad, mid 40s]

“I believe that a lot of problems in our society stem from the fact that we devalue the role of motherhood.”

[comment, female, works full time but stayed home when kids were young]

“Women today, if we think about feminism at all, we see it as a battle fought for ‘the choice.’ For us, the freedom to choose work if we want to work is the feminist strain in our lives.”

[comment, female, Princeton Grad, quit her job after her second child was born]

“No matter what the dynamics of the family, people still blame my wife for our messy home.”

[comment, male, 30s, father of two, employed full time]

“Sometimes it comes down between cleaning the house and taking [my children] to the park. Or spending time having fun with them or teaching them to read or write. Sometimes I can either do the dishes or teach our son how to ride a bike or our daughter how to walk. I’d rather do those things, frankly. I’d rather not be that mom who ignores our kids, and myself, because I’m so busy worrying about what the neighbors might think of our messy house.”

[comment, female, 30s, mother of two, stay-at-home mom]

## V. QUOTES FROM THE MEDIA

“We’ve got to stop talking about the gender gap as a separate women’s issue. This is worth doing for the sake of families and for the sake of the labor market.”

[Betsey Stevenson, member of President Obama’s council of Economic Advisors. Quoted from: Betsey Stevenson, Justin Wolfers, *The Paradox of Declining Female Happiness*, May 2009.]

“The way we view women changed radically [during the feminist revolution]. The way we view men not at all.”



[Anne-Marie Slaughter, Princeton professor]

“Let’s be clear: Demeaning women for fun and profit may be legal and permissible in a free society, but it shouldn’t be acceptable. The argument that comedians fall into a different category is valid to a point, but journalists and public leaders don’t have to be parties to their act. It isn’t funny, even if some women apparently think so.

Therein lies at least half the problem. As long as women are yukking it up alongside men while women are reduced to disposable sexual objects and their children regarded as sub-human, well, we have a ways to go. And though such remarks may not hurt successful women like [Greta] Van Susteren, who is the longest-sitting news anchor on cable TV, they do hurt young women and little girls.

And they also hurt young men and especially little boys, who adore their mothers and who, provided the right example, are capable of becoming the honorable and decent men everyone, including the president, hopes their daughters will marry.”

[Kathleen Parker, Washington Post, *The Silence of the Lions*, March 15, 2012.]

“The key issue is that the female universal no longer exists. We might therefore hope that media commentators and politicians will cease to talk about “women” en masse and address a new reality that has profound implications for social and economic policy from cradle to grave.”

[Alison Wolf, *The XX Factor: How the Rise of Working Women has Created a Far less Equal World*, Crown Publishers, New York, 2013.]

“I would love to see a world where men, as well as women, mix the masculine and the feminine. In fact, much of contemporary leadership advice recommends a collaborative style for everyone. But what we have is a world where men get a pass when they do things—such as exercise authority, express anger, self-promote – that often trigger pushback when women do them. This double standard reinforces the idea that women should be selfless and noncompetitive, self-effacing and nice; should always think of others and should never, ever interrupt.”

[Joan C Williams, The Washington Post, Op-ed 2014.]

“I’ve become convinced that we’ve made more progress in the workforce than in the home... and that’s a problem, because we have to make it as important a job, because it is the hardest job in the world to work inside the home, for people of both genders, if we’re going to even things out and let women stay in the workforce.”

“As a society we put more pressure on our boys to succeed than we do on our girls.”

“Women systematically underestimate their own abilities.”

[Sheryl Sandberg, Remarks at Barnard College, 2011; Speech: Why we have so few Women Leaders]

“I do not believe fathers love their children any less than mothers do, but men do seem more likely to choose their job at a cost to their family, while women seem more likely to choose their family at a cost to their job... It is clear which set of choices society values more today. Workers who put their careers first are typically rewarded; workers who choose their families are overlooked, disbelieved, or accused of unprofessionalism.”

“Seeking out a more balanced life is not a women’s issue; balance would be better for us all.”

“At the core of all this is self-interest. Losing smart and motivated women not only diminishes a company’s talent pool; it also reduces the return on its investment in training and mentoring.”

[Anne-Marie Slaughter, The Atlantic, *Why Women Still Can’t Have it All*, 2012.]

“What does ‘having it all’ even mean? ...It is a trap, a setup for inevitable feminist short-fall. Irresponsibly conflating liberation with satisfaction, the “have it all” formulation sets an impossible bar for female success and then ensures that when women fail to clear it, it’s feminism—as opposed to persistent gender inequality – that’s to blame.”

“There are miles to go before feminism sleeps. But part of the point is: Look how many miles we’ve come, in such a short amount of time! We are still very much in the midst of reversing eons of gendered injustice... Brains are still getting rewired; systems are still being reworked to accommodate evolving roles.”

[Rebecca Traister, Salon.com, *Can modern women “have it all”? 6.21.2012.*]

“Women’s Status in the world will change when women are kind to each other. Then, men may catch on.”

[Lynn Tilton, CEO Patriarch Partners]

“Full-time work as it exists in America today is, for the most part, not compatible with family life, especially if you are a professional and have ambitions.”

“For a woman to say I am searching for a good enough life is not failure, but maturity and self-knowledge.”

[Elsa Walsh, Washington Post, *Why women should embrace a ‘good enough’ life*, 4.18.2013.]

“If we truly want gender equality, we need to challenge the assumption that more is always better, and the assumption that men don’t suffer as much as women when they’re exhausted and have not time for family or fun. And we need to challenge those assumptions wherever we find them, both in the workplace and in the family.”

“Ladies, if we want to rule the world—or even just gain an equitable share of leadership positions—we need to stop leaning in. It’s killing us.

[Rosa Brooks, Foreign Policy Magazine, *Recline! Why “leaning in” is killing us*, 2014.]

“Instead of treating low-wage mothers as the struggling heroines they are, our political culture still tends to view them as miscreants and contributors to the ‘cycle of poverty.’”

“The Great Recession should have put the victim-blaming theory of poverty to rest... Poverty is not a character failing or a lack of motivation. Poverty is a shortage of money.”

[Barbara Ehrenreich, *The Shriver Report*, Rosetta Books, 1.9.2014.]

“Because of caregiving responsibilities, women often have to cycle in and out of the labor force, affecting their opportunities for both pay raises and promotions. Yet, even though most workers now have some responsibilities for care, U.S. labor laws and social policies have not been updated to reflect this reality. Instead, they reflect a vision of family life in the 1930s when these policies were first laid out.”

[Olivia Morgan and Karen Skelton, *The Shriver Report*, Rosetta Books, 1.9.2014.]

“Could I ask my board to pay me more? I guess I could, but I don’t. I do think there’s something about men and money—and women and money—that’s different.”

[Carolyn Miles, CEO of Save the Children]

“Decades into the discussion about how to ensure women’s equality, we have a culture that still places a different set of expectations and burdens on women and that still nudges or even shames them into certain roles.”

“If we’re concerned about all working women, we have to talk about child care, flexible hours, paid leave. We have to talk about gender stereotypes and whether they steer women into professions with lower compensation. We have to talk about the choices that women make and which of those they feel muscled into.”

[Frank Bruni, New York Times, *Women’s Unequal Lot*, 4.12.14.]

“What holds back women in Washington is not so much that they lack the proverbial “seat at the table,” ... It’s not how they negotiate their salaries, either, or when they choose to have children, or whether they “lean in” enough; Washington has no shortage of brilliant, assertive young women. They are held back by a culture that often marginalizes their voices, by a society that undervalues their work, and by public policy that fails to support and empower them. You shouldn’t have to win the boss lottery, or the husband lottery, to be able to thrive professionally while raising your children. But that’s still the reality for too many.

[Neera Tanden, President of the Center for American Progress, National Journal, *Working Mother, Washington Powerhouse? Good luck.*, 7.26.2014.]

“Even as our understanding of confidence expanded, however, we found that our original suspicion was dead-on: there *is* a particular crisis for women—a vast confidence gap that separates the sexes. Compared with men, women don’t consider themselves as ready for promotions, they predict they’ll do worse on tests, and they generally underestimate their abilities. This disparity stems from factors ranging from upbringing to biology.

“A growing body of evidence shows just how devastating this lack of confidence can be. Success, it turns out, correlates just as closely with confidence as it does with competence. No wonder that women, despite all our progress, are still woefully underrepresented at the highest levels. All of that is the bad news. The good news is that with work, confidence can be acquired. Which means that the confidence gap, in turn, can be closed.”

[Katty Kay and Clair Shipman, The Atlantic, *The Confidence Gap*, May 2014.]

“You need to spend political capital – be unafraid to introduce people, compliment somebody when it’s deserved and stand up for something you really believe in. It’s about having conviction and courage. Women can and should do a better job of helping one another to be in that transactional forum, and to get over the anxiety that we’re going to be found wanting on the wrong side of the equation.”

[Amy Schulman, Executive VP and General Counsel at Pfizer, Quoted by Gretchen Morgenson, New York Times, *Corner Office: Women and Leadership*, 10.13.2013.]

“Girls are taught to be cooperative more than boys. I don’t think girls get the tools they need in school to get that self-assuredness. We still don’t encourage girls to speak up, to use their voice, to use their instinct, to not be afraid, and teach them how to combat the bullying. You have to believe in yourself, but I think many women don’t. And you watch some men just take advantage of that.

[Doreen Lorenzo, President at Quirky, Quoted by Gretchen Morgenson, New York Times, *Corner Office: Women and Leadership*, 10.13.2013.]

“It’s easy for women to be read as too nice, too kind. But it’s important to be able to make that choice. One of the values that I – as a person and as a woman – bring to the workplace is that I want to be nice at work. Niceness and kindness are not the opposite of ambition and drive. It is powerful to choose to be nice.”

[Marjorie Kaplan, Group president, Animal Planet, Science and Velocity Networks, Quoted by Gretchen Morgenson, New York Times, *Corner Office: Women and Leadership*, 10.13.2013.]

“A female politician is an adversary, an accessory, a distortion, a dress size—but rarely a thinker or leader... For male politicians, the media spotlight illuminates flaws, often in a ruthless way. For women, it creates silhouettes, veiled versions of what publications think their audience wants to see.”

[Sarah Kendzior, Politico, *The Princess Effect*, 7.2.2014.]

“I’m sometimes asked, “When will there be enough [women]?” And I answer, “When there are nine women.” People are shocked. But there have been nine men for most of the Court’s history, and nobody has ever raised a question about that.”

[Justice Ruth Bader Ginsburg, University of Colorado Law Review

## **VI. INTERESTING FACTS IN WOMEN’S HISTORY**

“In 1933, Eleanor Roosevelt became the first First Lady to hold her own press conference. In an attempt to afford equal time to women—who were traditionally barred from presidential press conferences—she allowed only female reports to attend.”

-Franklin D. Roosevelt Presidential Library and Museum biography of Eleanor Roosevelt

Sandra Day O'Connor, the first woman appointed to the Supreme Court, graduated top of her class at Stanford Law in 1952 but because she was a woman, no one would hire her. She volunteered to work for a county attorney free for four months on this condition: "If you think I'm worth it at the end of four months, you can put me on the payroll." That's how she got her first job.

-Justice Ruth Bader Ginsburg, "A Conversation with Justice Ginsburg" University of Colorado, Fall 2013

## **VII. Anecdotes**

**Never Argue with a Woman:**

One morning, the husband returns the boat to their lakeside cottage after several hours of fishing and decides to take a nap. Although not familiar with the lake, the wife decides to take the boat out herself.

She motors out a short distance, anchors, puts her feet up, and begins to read a book. The peace and solitude are magnificent.

Along comes a Fish & Game Warden in his boat. He pulls up alongside the woman and says, 'Good morning, Ma'am. What are you doing?'

'Reading a book,' she replies, (thinking, 'Isn't that quite obvious?')

'You're in a Restricted Fishing Area,' he informs her.

'I'm sorry, officer, but I'm not fishing. I am reading!'

'Yes, but I see you have all the equipment. For all I know you could start at any moment. I'll have to take you in and write you up a ticket.'

'If you do that, I'll have to charge you with sexual assault,' says the woman.

'But I haven't even touched you,' says the Game Warden.

'That's true, but you have all the equipment. For all I know you could start at any moment.'

'Have a nice day ma'am,' and he left.