Reviews

Summary of reviewers notes and ratings on criteria.

Visualizations of Student Time-Use

Unit / Sub Unit:	Division C - Learning and Instruction / Division C - Section 2a: Cognitive and Motivational Processes

Review Worksheet

Review #1099866

Criteria	Rate
Objectives or purposes	4 / 5
Perspective(s) or theoretical framework	3 / 5
Methods, techniques, or modes of inquiry	3 / 5
Data sources, evidence, objects or materials	3 / 5
Results and/or substantiated conclusions or warrants for arguments/point of view	2 / 5
Scientific or scholarly significance of the study or work	1 / 5

Comments to the Author/Submitter

This study is grounded in a very interesting research question. However, it strikes me as an initial step in what needs to be a more fleshed out research project to make a contribution warranting presentation and eventual publication. The introduction makes a viable claim about the use of time-use representations to capture students' underling conceptions that may underlie goal setting and decision-making about their time-management. This initial study had students generate the representations, and analyzed their dimensions, but the significance of these dimensions is not clear. A step further, perhaps, would have been to interview students asking them to use their representations to explain their use of time and decision-making. Such data might provide an insight into how such a representation manifests (and shapes, after being constructed) mediating cognitive tools for time-related action. It would have been good to cite literature on the role of representational metaphors in decision-making, and perhaps to rely on cultural-historical perspectives of mediating cultural tools (e.g., James Wertsch). Also, it was not clear why the four components/dimensions of sequence, timing, duration, and frequency were chosen? What's their significance over, for example, pace, speed, unit, or rhythm? Moreover, why these participants, and why there was no context and characteristics of these? Is the claim that these students' representations are universal? Clearly not, since the authors recommend research in other majors. So, there's significance to these participants' background and context. This needs to be conceptualized a-priori and provided.

Review #1099867

Criteria	Rate
Objectives or purposes	3 / 5
Perspective(s) or theoretical framework	3 / 5
Methods, techniques, or modes of inquiry	3 / 5
Data sources, evidence, objects or materials	3 / 5
Results and/or substantiated conclusions or warrants for arguments/point of view	2 / 5
Scientific or scholarly significance of the study or work	2 / 5

Comments to the Author/Submitter

You have established an interesting class activity and you do a good job of demonstrating the different kinds of representations. What is missing for me is the "so what" of time representation. How do your findings relate to the literature on time management, metacognition, self-regulation? I would have to see more explanation of the significance of this study in order to highly recommend it for a session.

Review #1099868

Criteria	Rate
Objectives or purposes	4 / 5
Perspective(s) or theoretical framework	4 / 5
Methods, techniques, or modes of inquiry	2 / 5
Data sources, evidence, objects or materials	4 / 5
Results and/or substantiated conclusions or warrants for arguments/point of view	3 / 5
Scientific or scholarly significance of the study or work	3 / 5

Comments to the Author/Submitter

Interesting study and background section to set the stage for different ways of thinking about time-study allocation. I was surprised at what a large proportion of the students used figures in their representations – which made me curious about them. What was their focus in education (e.g., subject area?), and typically what year were they in their programs (the mean age tells me they were either a mixed group with some other students, or later in their programs). Were all of the students from the U.S.? (I expect so, given the program, and that is important information in the use of space). Finally, while the results are interesting, I felt let down in terms of what this is useful for. Knowing what their representations are is one thing, but knowing what the representations mean to them would be more useful in figuring out how these could help students be more successful. Have you considered adding an interview to the study methods?