
MODULE *ConsensusPlusCal*

EXTENDS *Integers, Sequences, TLC*

CONSTANTS

Names, a set

Participants, an array of participants, in their order in the state channel

NULL

ASSUME

$\wedge \text{Len}(\text{Participants}) > 1$

$\text{NumParticipants} \triangleq \text{Len}(\text{Participants})$

$\text{Types} \triangleq [$

WAITING \mapsto "WAITING",

SENT \mapsto "SENT",

SUCCESS \mapsto "SUCCESS",

FAILURE \mapsto "FAILURE"

$]$

$\text{Status} \triangleq [$

OK \mapsto "OK",

ABORT \mapsto "ABORT",

SUCCESS \mapsto "SUCCESS"

$]$

$\text{Range}(f) \triangleq \{f[x] : x \in \text{DOMAIN } f\}$

$\text{Running}(\text{state}) \triangleq \text{state.type} \in \{\text{Types.WAITING}, \text{Types.SENT}\}$

$\text{Terminated}(\text{state}) \triangleq \neg \text{Running}(\text{state})$

--algorithm *consensus_update*

For the moment, we assume that participants only send commitments forward.
 Since a read message is then discarded, it's enough to just store one.

variables *msg* = *NULL*

define

Arrays are 1-indexed, while the % operator returns a number between 0 and *NumParticipants*.

This explains the following slightly complicated expression

$\text{mover}(\text{turnNumber}) \triangleq 1 + ((\text{turnNumber} - 1) \% \text{NumParticipants})$

$\text{safeToSend}(\text{state}) \triangleq$

$\wedge \text{state.type} = \text{Types.WAITING}$

$\wedge \vee \text{state.ourIndex} = \text{state.turnNumber} \% \text{NumParticipants}$

$\vee \wedge \text{msg} \neq \text{NULL}$

$\wedge \text{msg.status} = \text{Status.OK}$

$\wedge \text{state.ourIndex} = \text{mover}(\text{msg.turnNumber})$

$\text{target}(\text{turnNumber}) \triangleq \text{Participants}[\text{mover}(\text{turnNumber})]$

end define ;

macro *sendVote*(*turnNumber*, *votesRequired*)

begin

assert *votesRequired* > 0;

```

state := [
  type ↦ Types.SENT,
  turnNumber ↦ turnNumber,
  ourIndex ↦ state.ourIndex
];
msg := [
  to ↦ target(state.turnNumber),
  turnNumber ↦ state.turnNumber,
  votesRequired ↦ votesRequired,
  status ↦ Status.OK
]
end macro ;

macro returnSuccess()
begin
state := [type ↦ Types.SUCCESS] @@ state ;
msg := [
  to ↦ target(state.turnNumber),
  status ↦ Status.SUCCESS
]
end macro ;

macro returnFailure(turnNumber)
begin
state := [
  type ↦ Types.FAILURE,
  turnNumber ↦ turnNumber
] @@ state ;
msg := [
  to ↦ target(state.ourIndex + 1),
  status ↦ Status.ABORT
];
end macro ;

macro vote(turnNumber, votesRequired)
begin
if votesRequired = 0 then returnSuccess()
else sendVote(turnNumber, votesRequired)
end if ; end macro ;

macro waitForUpdate(turnNumber)
begin
state := [
  turnNumber ↦ turnNumber,
  type ↦ Types.WAITING,
  ourIndex ↦ state.ourIndex

```

```

];
msg := NULL;
end macro ;

macro voteOrreturnFailure(turnNumber, votesRequired)
begin
  If the participant agrees with the allocation, they vote
either vote(turnNumber, votesRequired)
  Otherwise, they return FAILURE
or returnFailure(turnNumber)
end either ; end macro ;

```

Calling this a fair process prevents the process from stuttering forever. It's always considered to be valid to take a step where your state variables don't change, which could be the case if some unrelated protocols end up in an infinite loop, for instance. However, we want to check that IF A: wallets always eventually take some valid action THEN B: wallets always eventually terminate the consensus-update protocol Calling the process fair ensures that A is true, and therefore the model checks that under the assumption A, B is also true.

fair process *consensusUpdate* $\in \text{DOMAIN } \textit{Participants}$

variables

```

state = [
  turnNumber  $\mapsto$  1,
  ourIndex  $\mapsto$  self,
  type  $\mapsto$  Types.WAITING
],
me = Participants[self]

```

begin

Each participant either sends a message if it's currently safe to do so, or else it reads a message for the participant, updates their state accordingly, and sends a message if it's then safe. These actions are currently assumed to be atomic, and are therefore assigned to a single label, *ReachConsensus*

ReachConsensus:

```

while Running(state) do
  if safeToSend(state)  $\wedge$  msg = NULL then
    either returnFailure(state.turnNumber) If the commitment is not valid
    or
      if state.type = Types.WAITING then vote(state.turnNumber + 1, NumParticipants - 1);
      elseif state.type = Types.SENT then returnFailure(state.turnNumber);
      else assert FALSE
    end if ;
  end either ;
else
  await msg  $\neq$  NULL  $\wedge$  msg.to = me ;
  if msg.status = Status.OK then
    If the commitment received is not valid, return FAILURE
  end if ;
end

```

```

    TODO : Is this the actual behaviour we want?
    In the readme, we say this is what works, but the reducer does not
    work this way
either returnFailure(state.turnNumber)
or if msg.turnNumber > state.turnNumber then
    First, update our state based on the incoming message
    if msg.votesRequired = 0 then returnSuccess()
    elseif safeToSend(state) then
        if state.type = Types.SENT then returnFailure(msg.turnNumber)
        elseif state.type = Types.WAITING then voteOrreturnFailure(msg.turnNumber + 1, m
        else assert FALSE;
        end if ;
        else waitForUpdate(msg.turnNumber)
        end if ;
    end if ; end either ;
    elseif msg.status = Status.ABORT then returnFailure(state.turnNumber)
    elseif msg.status = Status.SUCCESS then returnSuccess()
    else assert FALSE
    end if ;
end if ;
end while ;
end process ;
end algorithm ;

```

BEGIN TRANSLATION

VARIABLES *msg, pc*

define statement

mover(turnNumber) $\triangleq 1 + ((turnNumber - 1) \% NumParticipants)$

safeToSend(state) \triangleq

$\wedge state.type = Types.WAITING$
 $\wedge \vee state.ourIndex = state.turnNumber \% NumParticipants$
 $\vee \wedge msg \neq NULL$
 $\wedge msg.status = Status.OK$
 $\wedge state.ourIndex = mover(msg.turnNumber)$

target(turnNumber) $\triangleq Participants[mover(turnNumber)]$

VARIABLES *state, me*

vars $\triangleq \langle msg, pc, state, me \rangle$

ProcSet $\triangleq (DOMAIN\ Participants)$

Init \triangleq *Global variables*

$\wedge msg = NULL$

Process consensusUpdate

$\wedge state = [self \in DOMAIN\ Participants \mapsto$ [

$$\begin{aligned}
& \text{turnNumber} \mapsto 1, \\
& \text{ourIndex} \mapsto \text{self}, \\
& \text{type} \mapsto \text{Types.WAITING} \\
& \quad] \\
& \wedge \text{me} = [\text{self} \in \text{DOMAIN } \text{Participants} \mapsto \text{Participants}[\text{self}]] \\
& \wedge \text{pc} = [\text{self} \in \text{ProcSet} \mapsto \text{"ReachConsensus"}] \\
\text{ReachConsensus}(\text{self}) \triangleq & \wedge \text{pc}[\text{self}] = \text{"ReachConsensus"} \\
& \wedge \text{IF } \text{Running}(\text{state}[\text{self}]) \\
& \quad \text{THEN } \wedge \text{IF } \text{safeToSend}(\text{state}[\text{self}]) \wedge \text{msg} = \text{NULL} \\
& \quad \quad \text{THEN } \wedge \vee \wedge \text{state}' = [\text{state} \text{ EXCEPT } ![\text{self}] = [\\
& \quad \quad \quad \text{type} \mapsto \text{Types.F}, \\
& \quad \quad \quad \text{turnNumber} \mapsto \\
& \quad \quad \quad] @@ \text{state}[\text{self}]] \\
& \quad \wedge \text{msg}' = [\\
& \quad \quad \text{to} \mapsto \text{target}(\text{state}'[\text{self}].\text{ourIndex} + 1), \\
& \quad \quad \text{status} \mapsto \text{Status.ABORT} \\
& \quad] \\
& \vee \wedge \text{IF } \text{state}[\text{self}].\text{type} = \text{Types.WAITING} \\
& \quad \text{THEN } \wedge \text{IF } (\text{NumParticipants} - 1) = 0 \\
& \quad \quad \text{THEN } \wedge \text{state}' = [\text{state} \text{ EXCEPT } ![\text{s} \\
& \quad \quad \quad \wedge \text{msg}' = [\\
& \quad \quad \quad \text{to} \mapsto \text{target} \\
& \quad \quad \quad \text{status} \mapsto \text{Status} \\
& \quad \quad \quad] \\
& \quad \quad \text{ELSE } \wedge \text{Assert}((\text{NumParticipants} \\
& \quad \quad \quad \text{"Failure of assertion"} \\
& \quad \quad \wedge \text{state}' = [\text{state} \text{ EXCEPT } ![\text{s} \\
& \quad \quad \quad] \\
& \quad \quad \wedge \text{msg}' = [\\
& \quad \quad \quad \text{to} \mapsto \text{target}(\text{sta} \\
& \quad \quad \quad \text{turnNumber} \\
& \quad \quad \quad \text{votesRequired} \\
& \quad \quad \quad \text{status} \\
& \quad \quad \quad] \\
& \quad \text{ELSE } \wedge \text{IF } \text{state}[\text{self}].\text{type} = \text{Types.SENT} \\
& \quad \quad \text{THEN } \wedge \text{state}' = [\text{state} \text{ EXCEPT } ![\text{s} \\
& \quad \quad \quad] \\
& \quad \quad \wedge \text{msg}' = [\\
& \quad \quad \quad \text{to} \mapsto \text{target}(\text{sta}
\end{aligned}$$

```

                                status  $\mapsto$  Status
                                ]
ELSE  $\wedge$  Assert(FALSE,
                                "Failure of assertion
                                 $\wedge$  UNCHANGED  $\langle$ msg,
                                state $\rangle$ 
ELSE  $\wedge$  msg  $\neq$  NULL  $\wedge$  msg.to = me[self]
 $\wedge$  IF msg.status = Status.OK
    THEN  $\wedge \vee \wedge$  state' = [state EXCEPT ![self] =
                                typ
                                tur
                                ] @@ st
                                 $\wedge$  msg' =
                                [
                                to  $\mapsto$  target(state'[self].ourI
                                status  $\mapsto$  Status.ABORT
                                ]
 $\vee \wedge$  IF msg.turnNumber > state[self].turnN
    THEN  $\wedge$  IF msg.votesRequired = 0
        THEN  $\wedge$  state' = [state
                             $\wedge$  msg' =
                                to
                                sta
                                ]
    ELSE  $\wedge$  IF safeToSend
        THEN  $\wedge$  I

```

```

ELSE  $\wedge s$ 

 $\wedge r$ 

ELSE  $\wedge$  TRUE
 $\wedge$  UNCHANGED  $\langle msg, state \rangle$ 
ELSE  $\wedge$  IF  $msg.status = Status.ABORT$ 
THEN  $\wedge state' = [state \text{ EXCEPT } ![self] =$ 

 $\wedge msg' =$ 
 $\left[ \begin{array}{l} to \mapsto target(state'[se \\ status \mapsto Status.ABORT \end{array} \right]$ 
ELSE  $\wedge$  IF  $msg.status = Status.SUCCESS$ 
THEN  $\wedge state' = [state \text{ EXCEPT }$ 
 $\wedge msg' =$ 
 $\left[ \begin{array}{l} to \mapsto \\ status \mapsto \end{array} \right]$ 
ELSE  $\wedge Assert(FALSE,$ 

```

“Failure of
 \wedge UNCHANGED $\langle msg, state \rangle$

$$\begin{aligned} & \wedge pc' = [pc \text{ EXCEPT } ![self] = \text{“ReachConsensus”}] \\ \text{ELSE } & \wedge pc' = [pc \text{ EXCEPT } ![self] = \text{“Done”}] \\ & \wedge \text{UNCHANGED } \langle msg, state \rangle \end{aligned}$$

$$\wedge me' = me$$

$$consensusUpdate(self) \triangleq ReachConsensus(self)$$

Allow infinite stuttering to prevent deadlock on termination.

$$\begin{aligned} Terminating & \triangleq \wedge \forall self \in ProcSet : pc[self] = \text{“Done”} \\ & \wedge \text{UNCHANGED } vars \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} Next & \triangleq (\exists self \in \text{DOMAIN } Participants : consensusUpdate(self)) \\ & \vee Terminating \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} Spec & \triangleq \wedge Init \wedge \square [Next]_{vars} \\ & \wedge \forall self \in \text{DOMAIN } Participants : WF_{vars}(consensusUpdate(self)) \end{aligned}$$

$$Termination \triangleq \diamond (\forall self \in ProcSet : pc[self] = \text{“Done”})$$

END TRANSLATION

$$\begin{aligned} AllowedMessages & \triangleq \\ & [\\ & \quad turnNumber : Nat, \\ & \quad votesRequired : 0 \dots (NumParticipants - 1), \\ & \quad to : Names, \\ & \quad status : \{Status.OK\} \\ &] \\ & \cup \{NULL\} \\ & \cup [\\ & \quad to : Names, \\ & \quad status : \{Status.ABORT, Status.SUCCESS\} \\ &] \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} States & \triangleq \{ \} \\ & \cup [turnNumber : Nat, ourIndex : \text{DOMAIN } Participants, type : Range(Types)] \end{aligned}$$

Safety properties

$$\begin{aligned} TypeOK & \triangleq \\ & \text{The following two conditions specify the format of each message and} \\ & \text{participant state.} \\ & \wedge state \in [\text{DOMAIN } Participants \rightarrow States] \\ & \wedge msg \in AllowedMessages \end{aligned}$$

TODO : Get TurnNumberDoesNotDecrease and StaysTerminated

For some reason, $state[p].turnNumber$ is not valid

$TurnNumberDoesNotDecrease \triangleq$

$$\wedge \forall p \in \text{DOMAIN } Participants : state[p].turnNumber' \geq state[p].turnNumber$$

Once a process has terminated, its state does not change.

$StaysTerminated \triangleq \forall p \in \text{DOMAIN } Participants : (Terminated(state[p]) \Rightarrow (state'[p] = state[p]))$

Liveness properties

The protocol always terminates consistently across all processes.

TODO: Is this actually feasible, or actually what we want?

For example, perhaps the last person to vote agrees, and sends a message reaching consensus.

Their process terminates in the *SUCCESS* state, but for whatever reason their

commitment was invalid, and the other processes therefore terminate in *FAILURE*.

$ProtocolTerminates \triangleq$

$$\vee \wedge (\forall p \in \text{DOMAIN } Participants : \Diamond \Box (state[p].type = Types.SUCCESS))$$

$$\wedge \text{TRUE } \textit{TODO: In this case, should we specify that they reach the same turn number?}$$

$$\vee (\forall p \in \text{DOMAIN } Participants : \Diamond \Box (state[p].type = Types.FAILURE))$$

The value of msg should eventually always be *NULL*

$MessagesAreRead \triangleq \Diamond \Box (msg = NULL)$

\ * Modification History

\ * Last modified *Fri Aug 09 12:11:18 MDT 2019* by *andrewstewart*

\ * Created *Tue Aug 06 14:38:11 MDT 2019* by *andrewstewart*