

Audit Report

Core Unit Name: IS
Audit ID: 2022-02-IS001
Audit Cycle: 2022 - 02 /4
Audit Date: 03-07-2022
Audit Result: Approved with comments
Iteration Date: 03-21-2022
Facilitator contact: @psychonaut#7023

Core Unit Clarification Received on Date: 03-18-2022

Transparency Report: <https://github.com/makerdao-is/transparency-reporting/blob/main/Monthly%20Budget%20Statements/2022-02.md>
MIP40c3-SP58: <https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp58-modify-core-unit-budget-immunefi-security-core-unit-budget-is-001/12598>
MIP40c3-SP42: <https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp42-adding-immunefi-security-core-unit-budget-is-001/10813>
MIP40c3-SP41: <https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp41-immunefi-security-core-unit-mkr-budget-is-001/10814>

Approved

Approved with comments

Needs action before approval

Disputed

#	Audit Question					Audit Assessment	Core Unit's Clarification	Immediate CU Action to Improve Monthly Budget Statement	Medium Term CU Action to Improve Monthly Budget Statement
	Audit Questions to the Structure of the Monthly Budget Statement and consistency with IS MIP40c3-SP58					IS Budget MIP40c3-SP58 was ratified on 02-28-2022			
0.1	Are the sections in the Monthly Budget Statement in the right order: Actuals, Forecast, MKR vesting and Transfers?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.			
0.2	Does the Actual section include breakdowns with Budget Category, Forecast, Actuals, Difference, Payments and Reason for the diff. ?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.			
0.3	Does the Budget Forecast summary contain the Global/total budget cap?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	No. The Total budget cap is not in the summary. The calculation of the global budget amount in the MIP40c3-SP58 does not match the IS Budget total per category in the MIP40c3-SP58. IS has requested a new budget of 979,972.45 DAI, however according to the audit calculation they should have only requested 907,005 = 562,005.00 + 345,000.00 DAI. Clarification is scheduled for March 8th, 2022.	IS clarified that the difference is due to a calculation mistake. IS will correct the total budget in the MIP.	IS needs to correct the total budget in the MIP40c3-SP58	
0.4	Does the Budget Forecast cover 3 months with a summary and Budget Category breakdown?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.			
0.5	Does the Budget Forecast summary and breakdown contain the budget caps for comparison?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	IS has reviewed the summary budget cap and corrected it according with the new approved budget MIP. The Budget Cap summary does include the requested 40% for the operational audits.			
0.6	Are the Budget Forecast Breakdown categories in the Monthly Budget Statement the same as in the MIP40c3-SP58?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	IS added the approved operational audits budget as a budget category in the Budget Forecast Breakdown.			
0.7	Is the Multi-sig wallet setup the same as described in the MIP40c3-SP58?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes: IS Operational Wallet quorum (2:3) Controlled by the IS Core Unit team Address: 0x124c759D1084E67B19a206ab85c4527Fab26c342 Signers 0x28C5ffc5De1a83a9e4cDDfA138bAEd516D70414b 0xAcAf835934eE40E0d5ee3F941E283499F8Ad97eD 0xFFC87601A80d3e4F0aF083a899e3fee203C23cF0			
0.8	Is the IS operational wallet controlled by more than 1 signer?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes, the IS operational wallet has a current policy of 2 out of 3 signers			
0.9	Has the IS auditor wallet received the initial seed funds from the protocol prior transfer to the IS Operational Wallet?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes, the auditor wallet has received 195,443 DAI from the protocol https://etherscan.io/tx/0xab810a967ba4a68862c4433ec4185fbc1a3ff121bf4b38535a2aab4a8e9908a4 The MIP40c3-SP42 total budget cap less contingency buffer is 106,250 DAI. This initial transfer includes seed funds and one-time costs described in the MIP.			
0.10	Has the IS auditor wallet received the initial funds for the operational audits from the protocol prior transfer to the IS Operational Wallet?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes, the auditor wallet has received 138,000 DAI from the protocol on March 6, 2022 https://etherscan.io/tx/0x25a0b1ac21cb1a70f76d14687c56025133d987ebc37d6e538e7a5e7764083600			
0.11	Has the IS Operational wallet received a top-up after the audit of the last Monthly Budget Statement?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes, the IS Operational wallet received 33,082 DAI as requested in the January 2021 Budget Statement. https://etherscan.io/tx/0x0af93222da3297108043be180f70cc51cf17d440e075f2446a3de6e53fd635			
	Audit Questions to the Monthly Budget Statement - Section 1. Last Month Actuals -								
1.1	Is the actuals budget category breakdown the same as in the MIP40c3-SP42?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.			
1.2	Is the transparency report actual's forecast the same as the forecast the last published forecast for the same month?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	IS has replaced the January 2022 forecast with the last months published February 2022 forecast in the actuals section of the budget statement.			
1.3	Are the differences between forecast and actuals explained in the transparency report?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.			
1.4	Are the IS actual expenses within the MIP40c3-SP458 total buget cap?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.			

Audit Report

Core Unit Name: IS
Audit ID: 2022-02-IS001
Audit Cycle: 2022 - 02 /4
Audit Date: 03-07-2022
Audit Result: Approved with comments
Iteration Date: 03-21-2022
Facilitator contact: @psychonaut#7023
Core Unit Clarification Received on Date: 03-18-2022

Transparency Report: <https://github.com/makerdao-is/transparency-reporting/blob/main/Monthly%20Budget%20Statements/2022-02.md>
MIP40c3-SP58: <https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp58-modify-core-unit-budget-immunefi-security-core-unit-budget-is-001/12598>
MIP40c3-SP42: <https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp42-adding-immunefi-security-core-unit-budget-is-001/10813>
MIP40c3-SP41: <https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp41-immunefi-security-core-unit-mkr-budget-is-001/10814>

#	Audit Question					Audit Assessment	Core Unit’s Clarification	Immediate CU Action to Improve Monthly Budget Statement	Medium Term CU Action to Improve Monthly Budget Statement
1.5	Are the IS actual expenses within the total MIP40c3-SP42 budget cap for the current quarter?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.			
1.6	Has the IS ChainSecurity fees any significant deviations between forecast and actuals?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes. The forecast is 20,000 and the actual expense is 0.	No use of service in Feb 2022.		
	Has the IS DeFi Safety any significant deviations between forecast and actuals?							If this is a fixed cost of 5k per month then IS needs to review why the cost is higher for Feb 2022 and provide the reason and adjust the forecast accordingly.	
1.7		<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes, the forecast is 10,000 and the actual expense is 5,100, this givea a difference of 4,900.	Defi Safety always invoices 5k.		
1.8	Has the IS Facilitator fee any significant deviations between forecast and actuals?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes. The forecast is 4,167 and the actual expense is 0.	Corp set up delay.		
1.9	Has the IS Company set up fees any significant deviations between forecast and actuals?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes. The forecast is 2,200 and the actual expense is 0.	Corp set up delay.		
1.10	Has the IS Gas fees any significant deviations between forecast and actuals?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes. The forecast is 1,000 and the actual expense is 839, this gives a difference of 161.	IS explains in the budget statement that the setup was done via CowSawp.		
1.11	Has the Immunifi fees any significant deviations between forecast and actuals?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes. The forecast is 20,000 and the actuals is 0.	Corp set up delay.		
1.12	Has the IS payment fees any significant deviations between forecast and actuals?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes. The forecast is 2,000 and the actuals is 0.	IS explains in the budget statement that the software and infrastructure expenses are delayed.		
1.13	Has the IS presented the correct calculation of amounts for the actuals, forecast and difference?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.			
1.14	Has the IS any budget category that seems inconsistent and needs further investigation?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	No.			
Audit Questions to the Monthly Budget Statement - Section 2. Budget Forecast -									
	Are the montly and quarterly budget caps (both totals and per category) the same as in the MIP40c3-SP58?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes. IS has added the Fees Budget Cap 2,200 and the budget cap + buffer 2,530 to the forecast table as adviced in the Feb audit report V3.			
2.1		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>				
2.2	Are the quarterly forecast within the bounds of the MIP40c3-SP58 budget caps?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes. The summary contains the forecast for (Mar, Apr, May 2022).			
2.3	Are the quarterly forecast totals within the approved MIP40c3-SP58 budget caps?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.			
2.4	Has the IS presented the correct calculation of amounts in the Budget Forecast section?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.			
Audit Questions to the Monthly Budget Statement - Section 3. MKR Vesting Overview -									
	Has IS indicated the number of FTE in the Monthly Budget Statement’s MKR vesting overview?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.			
3.1		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.			
3.2	Has the MKR vesting overview the same FTE comparing it to the MIP40c3-SP41?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.			
3.3	Are the MKR vesting dates the same as in the MIP40c3-SP41?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.			
3.4	Has IS changed the MKR amounts comparing it to the MIP40c3-SP41?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	No.			
3.5	Has IS explained the MKR change in the Monthly Budget Statement?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	This control can only be made if the answer to the above question is yes.			
Audit Questions to the Monthly Budget Statement - Section 4. Transfers -									
	Does the IS Operational Wallet balances match the Monthly Budget Statement current balance in the calculation made for the new transfer?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes, there is a perfect match.			
4.1		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>				

Audit Report

Core Unit Name: IS
Audit ID: 2022-02-IS001
Audit Cycle: 2022 - 02 /4
Audit Date: 03-07-2022
Audit Result: Approved with comments
Iteration Date: 03-21-2022
Facilitator contact: @psychonaut#7023

Approved

Approved with comments

Needs action before approval

Disapprove

Core Unit Clarification Received on Date: 03-18-2022
Transparency Report: <https://github.com/makerdao-is/transparency-reporting/blob/main/Monthly%20Budget%20Statements/2022-02.md>
MIP40c3-SP58: <https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp58-modify-core-unit-budget-immunefi-security-core-unit-budget-is-001/12598>
MIP40c3-SP42: <https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp42-adding-immunefi-security-core-unit-budget-is-001/10813>
MIP40c3-SP41: <https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp41-immunefi-security-core-unit-mkr-budget-is-001/10814>

#	Audit Question					Audit Assessment	Core Unit´s Clarification	Immediate CU Action to Improve Monthly Budget Statement	Medium Term CU Action to Improve Monthly Budget Statement
4.2	Are the payments from the operational wallet the same as in the actuals payments?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.			