Core Unit Name: SES - Sustainable Ecosystem Scaling Core Unit -

Audit ID: 2022-07-SES001

Audit Cycle: 2023 - 01/1

Audit Result: Audit Date: 2023-02-20

Budget Statement Submission Date: 2023-02-17

Facilitator contact: @Juan

Core Unit Clarification Received on Date:

Transparency, Report: https://github.com/makerdao-ses/transparency-reporting/blob/main/Monthly%20Budget%20Statements/2023-01.md
MIP40c3-SP55: https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp55-modify-core-unit-budget-sustainable-ecosystem-scaling-ses-001/12097



P4UC-5-9-55: https://forum.makeroao.com/t/mip4UC-3-5p3modify-core-unit-buoget-sustainable-ecosystem-scaling-ses-001/1209/ P4UC-5-9-94: https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip4Uc-3-sp17-sustainable-ecosystem-scaling-core-unit-mkr-budget-ses-001/8043									
Audit Question				Audit Assessment	Core Unit's Clarification	Immediate CU Action to improve transparency report	Medium Term CU Action to improve transparency report		
Audit Questions to the Structure of the transparency report and consitency with SES MIP40c3-SP55									
Are the sections in the transparency report in the right order: Actuals, Forecast, MKR vesting and $_{0.1}$ Transfers?	~								
Does the actual section include breakdowns per Budget Category, Forecast, Actuals, Difference and Payments?	~								
Does the budget forecast cover 3 months with summary and budget category breakdown? $$	~								
Does the budget forecast summary and breakdown contain the quarterly budget caps for comparison?	~								
0.5 Does the budget forecast summary contain the Global/total budget cap?	~								
Are the budget forecast categories in the transparency report the same/similar as in the MIP40c3-SP55? $^{0.6}$	~								
Is the SES Permanent Team Operational Multi-sig wallet setup the same as described in the MIP40c3-SP55?				Yes. The SES Permanent Team Operational Wallet quorum (2:3)  Controlled by the SES Core Unit team Address: eth:0xb5eB779cE3000242EDB3dF9b6C007E312584f6F4f Signers eth:0xb2A855Ac8D2a92e8A5a437690875261535c8320C eth:0xb4714C7EfE500213615FC6CBB8717B524eC4338e9a eth:0xFCa6e196c2ad557E64D9397e283C2AFe57344b75					
Is the SES Incubation Program Operational Multi-sig wallet setup the same as described in the MIP40c3-SPSS?	<b>Y</b>			Yes. The SES Incubation Program Operational Wallet quorum (2:3)  Controlled by the SES Core Unit team Address: eth:0x7c09Ff9b59BAAebfd721cbDA3676826aA6d7BaE8 Signers eth:0xA2A855Ac8D2a92e8A5a437690875261535c8320C eth:0x4714C7EfE5D0213615FC6CBB87178524eC433e9a eth:0xFCa6e196c2ad557E64D9397e283C2AFe57344b75					
Is the SES Grants Program Operational Multi-sig wallet setup the same as described in the MIP40c3-SP55?		П		Yes. The SES Grants Program Operational Wallet quorum (2:3)  Controlled by the SES Core Unit team Address: eth:0x/95e88eC63D6059bA62b0A8A7F843c7D92f41de2 Signers eth:0xAZA855Ac8D2a92e8A5a437690875261535c8320C eth:0xAZ714C7EfE500213615FC6CB8871785Z4eC433e9a eth:0xFCa6e196c2ad557E64D9397e283C2AFe57344b75					
Is the SES Permanent Team Operational wallet controlled by more than 1 signer?									
0.10  Is the SES Incubation Program Operational wallet controlled by more than 1 signer?				Yes, the SES Operational wallet has a current policy of 2 out of 3 signers					
Is the SES Grants Program Operational wallet controlled by more than 1 signer?				Yes, the SES Operational wallet has a current policy of 2 out of 3 signers					
Has the SES Permanent Team Operational wallet received a top-up after the audit of the last transparency report?				Yes, the SES Operational wallet has a current policy of 2 out of 3 signers					
Has the SES Incubation Program Operational wallet received a top-up after the audit of the last transparency report?									
Has the SES Grants Program Operational wallet received a top-up after the audit of the last transparency report?									

Core Unit Name: SES - Sustainable Ecosystem Scaling Core Unit -

Audit ID: 2022-07-SES001

Audit Cycle: 2023 - 01/1

Audit Result:

Audit Date: 2023-02-20

Budget Statement Submission Date: 2023-02-17

Facilitator contact: @Juan

Core Unit Clarification Received on Date:

Transparency Report: https://github.com/makerdao-ses/transparency-reporting/blob/main/Monthly%20Budget%20Statements/2023-01.md MIP40c3-SP55: https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp55-modify-core-unit-budget-sustainable-ecosystem-scaling-ses-001/12097

Audit Question					Audit Assessment	Core Unit's Clarification	Immediate CU Action to improve transparency report	Medium Term CU Action to improve transparency report
				_	Yes. SES Auditor Wallet quorum (2:2)	Core offit's clarification	transparency report	transparency report
					eth address: eth:0x87AcDD9208f73bFc9207e1f6F0fDE906bcA95cc6			
Is the SES Auditor Multi-sig wallet setup the same as described in the MIP40c3-SP55?					Controlled by Signers: GovAlpha Auditor Role			
					eth:0xDc85cE806d057f4E5425b1e211b78d5af2728Df3			
	~				SES Accountant Role Wallet eth:0xA2A855Ac8D2a92e8A5a437690875261535c8320C			
Is the SES Auditor wallet controlled by more than 1 signer?	~							
Has the SES Auditor wallet received funds from the protocol?								
Has SES returned the excess funds from last transparency report to the Surplus buffer?								
	~							
Has the SES Auditor wallet sufficient funds to be sent to the SES Operational wallets?	~							
Audit Questions to Transparency Report - Section 1. Permanent Team Last Month Actuals -								
Is the Permanent Team actuals budget category breakdown in line with MIP40c3-SP55?								
Is the transparency report actual's forecast for the Permanent Team the same as the last published								
forecast for the same month?	$\checkmark$							
Are the Permanent Team differences between forecast and actuals explained in the transparency report?	~							
Are the SES Permanent Team actual expenses within the monthly MIP40c3-SP55 buget cap?	$\checkmark$							
Are the SES Permanent Team actual expenses within the quarterly total MIP40c3-SP55 budget cap?								
Has the SES Permanent Team Administration Expenses any significant deviations between forecast and								
actuals?	$\overline{\mathbf{v}}$	П		П				
Has the SES Permanent Team Compensation & Benefits any significant deviations between forecast and								
actuals?								
Has the SES Permanent Team Gas Fees any significant deviations between forecast and actuals?	~							
Has the SES Permanent Team Professional Services any significant deviations between forecast and actuals?	~							
Has the SES Permanent Team Software Development any significant deviations between forecast and actuals?	$\sim$	П		П				
Has the SES Permanent Team Software Expense any significant deviations between forecast and actuals?								
Has the SES Permanent Team Travel & Entertaiment any significant deviations between forecast and								
actuals?	~							
Has the SES Permanent Team presented the correct calculation of amounts for the actuals, forecast and difference?	~							
Has the SES Permanent Team any budget category that seems inconsistent and needs further investigation?		~	П	П	All reasoning provided for deviations			
Has SES explained the difference between the payments and actuals for the Permanent Team?								
Audit Questions to Transparency Report - Section 1. Incubation Program Last Month Actuals -	~							
Is the transparency report actual's forecast for the Incubation Program the same as the last published forecast for the same month?				П				

Core Unit Name: SES - Sustainable Ecosystem Scaling Core Unit -

Audit ID: 2022-07-SES001

Audit Cycle: 2023 - 01/1

Audit Result: Audit Date: 2023-02-20

Budget Statement Submission Date: 2023-02-17

Facilitator contact: @Juan

Core Unit Clarification Received on Date:

Transparency, Report: https://github.com/makerdao-ses/transparency-reporting/blob/main/Monthly%20Budget%20Statements/2023-01.md
MIP40c3-SP55: https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp55-modify-core-unit-budget-sustainable-ecosystem-scaling-ses-001/12097

10c3-SP44: https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp17-sustainable-ecosystem-scaling-core-unit-mkr-bud	, ct ses	001/804	2			Immediate CU Action to improve	Medium Term CU Action to improv
Audit Question				Audit Assessment	Core Unit's Clarification	transparency report	transparency report
Are the SES Incubation Program differences between forecast and actuals explained in the transparency report?	~						
Are the SES Incubation Program's actual expenses within the monthly MIP40c3-SP55 buget cap?	~						
Are the SES Incubation Program's actual expenses within the quarterly total MIP40c3-SP55 budget cap?	~						
Has the SES Incubation Program presented the correct calculation of amounts for the actuals, forecast and difference?	~						
Has the SES Incubation Program any budget category that seems inconsistent and needs further investigation?	~						
Has SES explained the Incubation program's difference between the payments and actuals?	~						
Audit Questions to Transparency Report - Section 1. Grant's Program Last Month Actuals -							
Is the transparency report actual's forecast for the Grant's Program the same as the last published forecast for the same month?	~						
Are the SES Grant's Program differences between forecast and actuals explained in the transparency report?	~						
Are the SES Grant's Program Actual expenses within the monthly MIP40c3-SP55 buget cap?	<b>V</b>						
Are the SES Grant's Program Actual expenses within the quarterly total MIP40c3-SP55 budget cap?	<b>V</b>						
Has the SES Grant's Program presented the correct calculation of amounts for the actuals, forecast and difference?	$\overline{\mathbf{v}}$						
Has the SES Grant's Program any budget category that seems inconsistent and needs further investigation?				Big difference for Community Development - explained by CU			
Has SES explained the Grant's Program difference between the payments and actuals?	~						
Audit Questions to Transparency Report - Section 2. Permanent Team Budget Forecast -							
Does the transparency report display the MIP40c3-SP55 caps for both total and budget categories?	~						
Are the monthly and quarterly budget caps (both totals and per category) the same as in the MIP40c3-SP55?	~						
Are the monthly forecast totals within the MIP40c3-SP55 monthly budget cap?							
		<b></b>		Clarification sought and received			
Is the quarterly forecast within the bounds of the qly MIP40c3-SP55 budget caps?	~						
Has the SES presented the correct calculation of amounts in the Permanent Team budget forecast table?	~						
Audit Questions to Transparency Report - Section 2. Incubation Program Budget Forecast -							
Does the transparency report display the Incubation Program's budget cap?				Winding Down			
Are the monthly and quarterly budget caps the same as in the MIP40c3-SP55?							
Are the Incubation Program's monthly forecast totals within the MIP40c3-SP55 monthly budget cap?							

2/20/2023

3

Core Unit Name: SES - Sustainable Ecosystem Scaling Core Unit -

Audit ID: 2022-07-SES001

Audit Cycle: 2023 - 01/1

Audit Result:

Audit Date: 2023-02-20 Budget Statement Submission Date: 2023-02-17

Facilitator contact: @Juan

Core Unit Clarification Received on Date:

Transparency Report: https://github.com/makerdao-ses/transparency-reporting/blob/main/Monthly%20Budget%20Statements/2023-01.md MIP40c3-SP55: https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp55-modify-core-unit-budget-sustainable-ecosystem-scaling-ses-001/12097



			Audit Assessment	Core Unit's Clarification	Immediate CU Action to improve transparency report	Medium Term CU Action to improve transparency report
<b>~</b>						
<b>~</b>						
~						
<b>V</b>						
~						
~			Yes.			
<b>V</b>			No. The reported FTE is 10.5 and the MIP40c3-SP17 MKR budget is based on 8.80 FTEs.			
	<b>✓</b>		No. The reported vesting dates are different from the MIP40c3-SP17 due to new hires, the changes were explained in the November 2021 budget statement.			
~			Yes			
~			Yes			
<b>✓</b>			Yes. SES Auditor wallet has received 541.47 MKR on May 23rd, 2022. The MKR transfer was added to the Maj 2022 transparency report. https://chtherscan.io/tx/0xd891445bf62cb9df39a07be390f2650be820d4cb2c8ef e51b4506e1763435f97			
<b>~</b>			Yes. The SES Permanent Team Operational wallet received 427.07 MKR on May 31st. 2022. https://etherscan.io/tx/0xc4c0012f446fe28bb76122572c9bfcdf6b7cf96d2df733a40bbb3e07cf9e58a9	1		
<b>~</b>						
~						
		### COLUMN COLUM	### Company of the co	Audit Assessment  Audit Assessment  Yes.  Yes.  No. The reported FTE is 10.5 and the MIP40c3-SP17 MKR budget is based on 8.80 FTEs.  No. The reported vesting dates are different from the MIP40c3-SP17 due to new hires, the changes were explained in the November 2021 budget statement.  Yes  Yes.  Yes.  Yes.  Yes. SES Auditor wallet has received 541.47 MKR on May 23rd, 2022. The MKR transfer was added to the Maj 2022 transparency report.  https://dethora.noi/fx/0x/0x891445bf62cb9df39a07be390f2650be820d4cb2c8ef e51b4506e1763435f97  Yes. The SES Permanent Team Operational wallet received 427.07 MKR on May 31st. 2022.	Audit Assessment  Core Unit's Clarification  Audit Assessment  Core Unit's Clarification  Ver.  No. The reported FE is 10.5 and the MIP40c3-SP17 MKR budget is based on 8.80 FTEs.  No. The reported FE is 10.5 and the MIP40c3-SP17 MKR budget is based on 8.80 FTEs.  No. The reported vesting dates are different from the MIP40c3-SP17 due to new hires, the changes were explained in the November 2021 budget statement.  Ves  Ves  Ves  Ves  Ves  Ves  Ves  Ve	Audit Assessment  Core Unit's Clarification  Immediate CU Action to improve transparency report  Audit Assessment  Core Unit's Clarification  Transparency report  Transparency report  Vec.  No. The reported PTE is 10.5 and the MIP402-5P27 MMR budget is based on 8.80 PTEs.  No. The reported vetting dates are different from the MIP402-5P27 MMR budget is based on 8.80 PTEs.  No. The reported vetting dates are different from the MIP402-5P27 MMR budget is based on 8.80 PTEs.  Vec.  Vec.

Core Unit Name: SES - Sustainable Ecosystem Scaling Core Unit -

Audit ID: 2022-07-SES001

Audit Cycle: 2023 - 01/ 1

Audit Result: Audit Date: 2023-02-20

Budget Statement Submission Date: 2023-02-17

Facilitator contact: @Juan

Core Unit Clarification Received on Date:

Transparency, Report: https://github.com/makerdao-ses/transparency-reporting/blob/main/Monthly%20Budget%20Statements/2023-01.md
MIP40c3-SP55: https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp55-modify-core-unit-budget-sustainable-ecosystem-scaling-ses-001/12097

MIP40c3-SP44: https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp17-sustainable-ecosystem-scaling-core-unit-mkr-budget-ses-001/8043



# Audit Question	Audit Assessment	Core Unit's Clarification	Immediate CU Action to improve transparency report	Medium Term CU Action to improve transparency report
Are the DAI payments to the Payroll Payments Processor from the Incubation Program Operational wallet the same as in the actuals section payments?  4.3				
Are the DAI Direct payments from the Incubation Program Operational wallet the same as in the actuals section payments?				
Are the DAI payments from the Grant's Program Operational wallet the same as in the actuals section payments?				
Are there any other Payments from the Operational wallets that need further clarification?				