

Audit Report

Core Unit Name: SES - Sustainable Ecosystem Scaling Core Unit -  
Audit ID: 2023-10-SES001  
Audit Cycle: 2023 - 10/ 1  
Audit Result: Needs action  
Budget Statement Submission Date:  
Facilitator and team lead: @Juan @Wouter  
Core Unit Clarification Received on Date: -  
Audit Assessment made by: Odeniz  
Transparency Report: <https://expenses.makerdao.network/core-unit/SES/finances/reports?searchText=se&section=forecast&viewMonth=Oct2023>  
MIP40C3-SP87: <https://mips.makerdao.com/mips/details/MIP40C3SP87>  
MIP40C3-SP44: <https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp17-sustainable-ecosystem-scaling-core-unit-mkt-budget-ses-01/8043>



#	Audit Question	<div><div></div><div></div><div></div><div></div></div>	Audit Assessment	Core Unit's Clarification	Immediate CU Action to improve transparency report	Medium Term CU Action to improve transparency report
	"The SES expense report's standard structure includes Actuals, forecasts, MKR vesting, transfers, and comments. This audit assessment will be based on the data available on the MakerDAO finances dashboard. " Audit Questions to the Structure of the transparency report, and consistency with SES <a href="#">MIP40C3-SP87</a>					
	Is the SES Permanent Team Operational Multi-sig wallet setup the same as described in the MIP40C3-SP87?					
0.1		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>			
	Is the SES Incubation Team Operational Multi-sig wallet setup the same as described in the MIP40C3-SP87?					
0.2		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>			
	Is the SES Grants Program Operational Multi-sig wallet setup the same as described in the MIP40C3-SP87?					
0.3		<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>		Does not apply as grants program budget is deprecated	
0.4	Is the SES Permanent Team Operational wallet controlled by more than 1 signer?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>			
0.5	Is the SES Incubation Team Operational wallet controlled by more than 1 signer?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>			
0.6	Has the SES Permanent Team Operational wallet received a top-up after the audit of the last transparency report?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>		Yes, on Oct 24	
0.7	Has the SES Incubation Team Operational wallet received a top-up after the audit of the last transparency report?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>		Yes, on Oct 24	
	Is the SES Auditor Multi-sig wallet setup the same as described in the MIP40C3-SP87?					
0.8		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>			
0.9	Is the SES Auditor wallet controlled by more than 1 signer?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>			
1.10	Has the SES Auditor wallet received funds from the protocol?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>			
1.11	Has SES returned any excess funds based on the last transparency report to the Surplus buffer?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>		No returns since last top-up transactions in October	

Audit Report

Core Unit Name: SES - Sustainable Ecosystem Scaling Core Unit -  
Audit ID: 2023-10-SES001  
Audit Cycle: 2023 - 10/ 1  
Audit Result: Needs action  
Audit Date: 2023-12-18  
Budget Statement Submission Date:  
Facilitator and team lead: @Juan @Wouter  
Core Unit Clarification Received on Date: -  
Audit Assessment made by: Odeniz  
Transparency Report: <https://expenses.makardao.network/core-unit/SES/finances/reports?searchText=ses&section=forecast&viewMonth=Oct2023>  
MIP40c3-SP87: <https://mips.makardao.com/mips/details/MIP40c3SP87>  
MIP40c3-SP94: <https://forum.makardao.com/t/mip40c3-sp12-sustainable-ecosystem-scaling-core-unit-mkt-budget-ses-001/8043>



#	Audit Question	<div><div></div><div></div><div></div><div></div></div>	Audit Assessment	Core Unit's Clarification	Immediate CU Action to improve transparency report	Medium Term CU Action to improve transparency report
1.12	Has the SES Auditor wallet sufficient funds to be sent to the SES Operational wallets?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, over €30k DAI			
Audit Questions to Transparency Report - Section 1. Permanent Team Last Month Actuals -						
1.10	Is the Permanent Team actuals budget category breakdown in line with MIP40c3-SP87?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>			
1.20	Is the transparency report actual's forecast for the Permanent Team the same as the last published forecast for the same month?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>			
1.30	Are the Permanent Team differences between forecast and actuals explained in the transparency report?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>			
1.40	Are the SES Permanent Team actual expenses within the monthly MIP40c3-SP87 budget cap?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, apart from professional services category due to delayed invoice the total spending is under the monthly cap.			
1.50	Are the SES Permanent Team actual expenses within the quarterly total MIP40c3-SP87 budget cap?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>			
1.60	Has the SES Permanent Team Administration Expenses any significant deviations between forecast and actuals?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>			
1.70	Has the SES Permanent Team Compensation & Benefits any significant deviations between forecast and actuals?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, due to delayed invoices. This seems to happen every month so I advise to be a bit more stringent here.			
1.80	Has the SES Permanent Team Gas Fees any significant deviations between forecast and actuals?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>			
1.90	Has the SES Permanent Team Professional Services any significant deviations between forecast and actuals?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> Yes, due to delayed invoices. This seems to happen every month so I advise to be a bit more stringent here.			
1.10	Has the SES Permanent Team Software Development any significant deviations between forecast and actuals?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>			
1.11	Has the SES Permanent Team Software Expense any significant deviations between forecast and actuals?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>			
1.12	Has the SES Permanent Team Travel & Entertainment any significant deviations between forecast and actuals?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>			
1.13	Has the SES Permanent Team presented the correct calculation of amounts for the actuals, forecast and difference?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>			
1.14	Has the SES Permanent Team any budget category that seems inconsistent and needs further investigation?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>			
1.15	Has SES explained the difference between the payments and actuals for the Permanent Team?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>			
Audit Questions to Transparency Report - Section 1. Incubation program > Incubation Team Last Month Actuals -						
1.16	Is the transparency report actual's forecast for the Incubation Team the same as the last published forecast for the same month?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>			
1.17	Are the SES Incubation Team differences between forecast and actuals explained in the transparency report?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>			
1.18	Are the SES Incubation Team's actual expenses within the monthly MIP40c3-SP87 budget cap?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>			
1.19	Are the SES Incubation Team's actual expenses within the quarterly total MIP40c3-SP87 budget cap?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>			
1.20	Has the SES Incubation Team presented the correct calculation of amounts for the actuals, forecast and difference?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>			
1.21	Has the SES Incubation Team any budget category that seems inconsistent and needs further investigation?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/> <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> Incubation team has no specified budget for some categories, please fix			
1.22	Has SES explained the Incubation Team's difference between the payments and actuals?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/> <input type="checkbox"/>			

Audit Report

Core Unit Name: SES - Sustainable Ecosystem Scaling Core Unit -  
Audit ID: 2023-10-SES001  
Audit Cycle: 2023 - 10 / 1  
Audit Result: Needs action  
Audit Date: 2023-12-18  
Budget Statement Submission Date:  
Facilitator and team lead: @Juan @Wouter  
Core Unit Clarification Received on Date: -  
Audit Assessment made by: Odeniz  
Transparency Report: <https://expenses.makardao.network/core-unit/SES/finances/reports?searchText=section:forecast&viewMonth=Oct2023>  
MIP40c3-SP87: <https://mips.makardao.com/mips/details/MIP40c3SP87>  
MIP40c3-SP44: <https://forum.makardao.com/t/mip40c3-sp17-sustainable-ecosystem-scaling-core-unit-mkr-budget-ses-001/8043>



Audit Question #					Audit Assessment	Core Unit's Clarification	Immediate CU Action to improve transparency report	Medium Term CU Action to improve transparency report
Audit Questions to Transparency Report - Section 2. Permanent Team Budget Forecast -								
2.1	Does the transparency report display the MIP40c3-SP87 caps for both total and budget categories?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>			
2.2	Are the monthly and quarterly budget caps (both totals and per category) the same as in the MIP40c3-SP87?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>			
2.3	Are the monthly forecast totals within the MIP40c3-SP87 monthly budget cap?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Total expenses are within CU budget cap, as clarified by Claudia		
2.4	Is the quarterly forecast within the bounds of the qly MIP40c3-SP87 budget caps?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Total quarterly forecast exceeds the quarterly budget cap, please elaborate		
2.5	Has the SES presented the correct calculation of amounts in the Permanent Team budget forecast table?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>			
Audit Questions to Transparency Report - Section 2. Incubation Program > Team 2 Budget Forecast -								
2.6	Does the transparency report display the Incubation Team's budget cap?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>			
2.7	Are the monthly and quarterly budget caps the same as in the MIP40c3-SP87?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>			
2.8	Are the Incubation Team's monthly forecast totals within the MIP40c3-SP87 monthly budget cap?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>			
2.9	Is the Incubation Team quarterly forecast within the bounds of the qly MIP40c3-SP87 budget caps?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>			
2.10	Has the SES presented the correct calculation of amounts in the Incubation Team budget forecast table?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>			
Audit Questions to Transparency Report - Section 2. Grant's Program Budget Forecast -								
Note that the Grant Program was closed in February 2023.								
2.11	Does the transparency report display the Grant's Program Budget cap?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	N/A		
2.12	Are the monthly and quarterly budget caps the same as in the MIP40c3-SP87?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	N/A		
2.13	Are the Grant's Program monthly forecast totals within the MIP40c3-SP87 monthly budget cap?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	N/A		
2.14	Is the Grant's Program quarterly forecast within the bounds of the qly MIP40c3-SP87 budget caps?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	N/A		
2.15	Has the SES presented the correct calculation of amounts in the Grant's Program budget forecast table?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	N/A		
Audit Questions to Transparency Report - Section 3. MKR Vesting Overview -								
3.1	Has the SES indicated the number of FTE in the transparency report's MKR vesting overview?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>			
3.2	Has the MKR vesting overview the same FTE comparing it to the MIP40c3-SP17?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	No, due to new hires		
3.3	Are the MKR vesting dates the same as in the MIP40c3-SP17?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	No. The reported vesting dates are different from the MIP40c3-SP17 due to new hires, the changes were explained in the November 2021 budget statement.		
3.4	Has SES changed the MKR amounts since the last transparency report?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Unchanged		
3.5	Has SES explained the MKR change in the transparency report?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	This control can only be made if the above question is yes.		

Audit Report

Core Unit Name: SES - Sustainable Ecosystem Scaling Core Unit -  
Audit ID: 2023-10-SES001  
Audit Cycle: 2023 - 10/ 1  
Audit Result: Needs action  
Budget Statement Submission Date: 2023-12-18  
Facilitator and team lead: @Juan @Wouter  
Core Unit Clarification Received on Date: -  
Audit Assessment made by: Odeniz  
Transparency Report: <https://expenses.makerdao.network/core-unit/SES/finances/reports?searchText=ses&section=forecast&viewMonth=Oct2023>  
MIP40c3-SP87: <https://mips.makerdao.com/mips/details/MIP40c3SP87>  
MIP40c3-SP44: <https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp12-sustainable-ecosystem-scaling-core-unit-mkr-budget-ses-01/8043>



#	Audit Question	<div><div></div><div></div><div></div><div></div></div>	Audit Assessment	Core Unit's Clarification	Immediate CU Action to improve transparency report	Medium Term CU Action to improve transparency report
3.6	Has the SES Auditor wallet received the vested MKR amount corresponding to this month if any?	<div><div></div><div></div><div></div><div></div></div>	<div><div></div><div></div><div></div><div></div></div>			
3.7	Has the SES Operational wallet received the vested MKR amount corresponding to this month if any?	<div><div></div><div></div><div></div><div></div></div>	<div><div></div><div></div><div></div><div></div></div>			
3.8	Other relevant observations?	<div><div></div><div></div><div></div><div></div></div>	<div><div></div><div></div><div></div><div></div></div>			
Audit Questions to Transparency Report - Section 4. Transfers -						
4.1	Does the SES Operational wallets balance match the transparency report current balances in the calculation made for the new transfer?	<div><div></div><div></div><div></div><div></div></div>	<div><div></div><div></div><div></div><div></div></div>			
4.2	Are the DAI payments from the Permanent Team Operational wallet the same as in the actuals section payments?	<div><div></div><div></div><div></div><div></div></div>	<div><div></div><div></div><div></div><div></div></div>			
4.3	Are the DAI payments to the Payroll Payments Processor from the Incubation Team Operational wallet the same as in the actuals section payments?	<div><div></div><div></div><div></div><div></div></div>	<div><div></div><div></div><div></div><div></div></div>			
4.4	Are the DAI Direct payments from the Incubation Team Operational wallet the same as in the actuals section payments?	<div><div></div><div></div><div></div><div></div></div>	<div><div></div><div></div><div></div><div></div></div>			
4.5	Are the DAI payments from the Grant's Program Operational wallet the same as in the actuals section payments?	<div><div></div><div></div><div></div><div></div></div>	<div><div></div><div></div><div></div><div></div></div>			
4.6	Are there any other Payments from the Operational wallets that need further clarification?	<div><div></div><div></div><div></div><div></div></div>	<div><div></div><div></div><div></div><div></div></div>			