Core Unit Name: SES - Sustainable Ecosystem Scaling Core Unit -

Audit ID: 2022-07-SES001

Audit Cycle: 2022 - 07/1

Audit Result: Needs action before approval

Audit Date: 2022-09-29

Budget Statement Submission Date: 2022-09-28

Facilitator contact: @Juan

Core Unit Clarification Received on Date:

Transparency Report: https://github.com/makerdao-ses/transparency-reporting/blob/main/Monthly%20Budget%20Statements/2022-07.md

Needs action before approval

| MIP40c3-SP55: https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp55-modify-core-unit-budget-sustainable-ecosystem-scaling-ses-001/12097 MIP40c3-SP44: https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp17-sustainable-ecosystem-scaling-core-unit-mkr-budget-ses-001/8043 | | | | | | | | | | |
|---|--|--------------|---|---|--|--|---------------------------|--|--|--|
| | Audit Question | | | | | Audit Assessment | Core Unit's Clarification | Immediate CU Action to improve transparency report | Medium Term CU Action to improve transparency report | |
| | Audit Questions to the Structure of the transparency report and consitency with SES MIP40c3-SP55 | | | | | | | | | |
| 0. | Are the sections in the transparency report in the right order: Actuals, Forecast, MKR vesting and Transfers? | \checkmark | | | | | | | | |
| 0. | Does the actual section include breakdowns per Budget Category, Forecast, Actuals, Difference and 2 Payments? | ~ | | | | | | | | |
| 0. | Does the budget forecast cover 3 months with summary and budget category breakdown? | ~ | | | | | | | | |
| 0. | Does the budget forecast summary and breakdown contain the quarterly budget caps for comparison? | ~ | | | | | | | | |
| 0. | Does the budget forecast summary contain the Global/total budget cap? | ~ | | | | | | | | |
| 0. | Are the budget forecast categories in the transparency report the same/similar as in the MIP40c3-SP557 | ~ | | | | | | | | |
| 0. | is the SES Permanent Team Operational Multi-sig wallet setup the same as described in the MIP40c3-SP55? | V | | | | | | | | |
| 0. | Is the SES Incubation Program Operational Multi-sig wallet setup the same as described in the MIP40c3-SP55? | Y | | | | Yes. The SES Incubation Program Operational Wallet quorum (2:3) Controlled by the SES Core Unit team Address: eth:0x7c09Ff9b59BAAebfd721cbDA3676826aA6d7BaE8 Signers eth:0x40468fbDa0B772FD639C82A216480A1ef2EE44B3 eth:0x4714C7EfESD0213615FC6C8B8717B524eC433e9a eth:0xFCa6e196c2ad557E64D9397e283C2AFe57344b75 | | | | |
| 0. | Is the SES Grants Program Operational Multi-sig wallet setup the same as described in the MIP40c3-SP5S? | ✓ | | | | Yes. The SES Grants Program Operational Wallet quorum (2:3) Controlled by the SES Core Unit team Address: eth:0x/95eB8eC63D6059bA62b0A8A7F843c7D92f41de2 Signers eth:0x40468fbDa0B772FD639C82A216480A1ef2EE44B3 eth:0x40468fbDa0B772FD639C82A216480A1ef2EE44B3 eth:0x4714C7FEE5D0213615FC6CB88717B524Ec433e9a eth:0xFCa6e196c2ad557E64D9397e283C2AFe57344b75 | | | | |
| 0.1 | Is the SES Permanent Team Operational wallet controlled by more than 1 signer? | ~ | | | | Yes, the SES Operational wallet has a current policy of 2 out of 3 signers | | | | |
| 0.1 | Is the SES Incubation Program Operational wallet controlled by more than 1 signer? | ~ | | | | Yes, the SES Operational wallet has a current policy of 2 out of 3 signers | | | | |
| 0.1 | Is the SES Grants Program Operational wallet controlled by more than 1 signer? | ~ | | | | Yes, the SES Operational wallet has a current policy of 2 out of 3 signers | | | | |
| 0.1 | Has the SES Permanent Team Operational wallet received a top-up after the audit of the last transparency report? | ~ | | | | Yes. Received 65,253.29 DAI on 2022-08-16 https://etherscan. io/tx/0xc5a2f89ac6bc861c3a8d0a1927ad9edb5994d4e4e3408ba3a208c7804fbadf 5a | | | | |
| 0.1 | Has the SES Incubation Program Operational wallet received a top-up after the audit of the last | | | | | Yes. Received 147,280.14 DAI on 2022-08-16 https://etherscan. io/tx/0x72605486984f47b138dbac5d060accdcfa8731c1b117a453ceb9affa514f360 7 | | | | |
| 0.1 | Has the SES Grants Program Operational wallet received a top-up after the audit of the last transparency report? | П | П | П | | Yes. Received 100,052.43 DAI on 2022-08-16 https://etherscan. io/tx/0x43983721f18a23ff2047a902bb3da75422c3dbdbb5fe927339a0dc41ded82d 9a | | | | |

9/29/2022

Core Unit Name: SES - Sustainable Ecosystem Scaling Core Unit -

Audit ID: 2022-07-SES001

Audit Cycle: 2022 - 07/1

Audit Result: Needs action before approval

Audit Date: 2022-09-29

Budget Statement Submission Date: 2022-09-28

Facilitator contact: @Juan

Core Unit Clarification Received on Date:

Transparency Report: https://github.com/makerdao-ses/transparency-reporting/blob/main/Monthly%20Budget%20Statements/2022-07.md
MIP40c3-SP55: https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp55-modify-core-unit-budget-sustainable-ecosystem-scaling-ses-001/12097

Needs action before approval

| MIP4 | /IIIP40c3-SP44: https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp17-sustainable-ecosystem-scaling-core-unit-mkr-budget-ses-001/8043 | | | | | | | | | | |
|------|---|----------------|----------|--|--|---|---------------------------|---|---|--|--|
| # | Audit Question | | | | | Audit Assessment | Core Unit's Clarification | Immediate CU Action to improve transparency report | Medium Term CU Action to improve transparency report | | |
| 0.16 | Is the SES Auditor Multi-sig wallet setup the same as described in the MIP40c3-SP55? | ✓ | | | | Yes. SES Auditor Wallet quorum (2:2) eth address: eth:0x87AcDD9208f73bFc9207e1f6F0fDE906bcA95cc6 Controlled by Signers: GowAlpha Auditor Role eth:0xDc85cE806d057f4E5425b1e211b78d5af2728Df3 SES Accountant Role Wallet eth:0xADc85cE806d057f4E5425b1e211b78d5af2728Df3 | | | | | |
| 0.17 | Is the SES Auditor wallet controlled by more than 1 signer? | ~ | | | | Yes | | | | | |
| 0.18 | Has the SES Auditor wallet received funds from the protocol? | | ~ | | | Funds being received and transfers assigned with August budget report. | | | | | |
| 0.19 | Has SES returned the excess funds from last transparency report to the Surplus buffer? | ~ | | | | Yes. 373,033.58 DAI returned to DssBlow. https://etherscan. io/tx/0xeeb261e9fa57120a9c0596bc452f7f164fd77f360f2aeeab16f69bb04d7c956 4 | | | | | |
| 0.20 | Has the SES Auditor wallet sufficient funds to be sent to the SES Operational wallets? | ~ | | | | Yes. | | | | | |
| | Audit Questions to Transparency Report - Section 1. Permanent Team Last Month Actuals - | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1.10 | Is the Permanent Team actuals budget category breakdown in line with MIP40c3-SP55? | ~ | | | | Yes. | | | | | |
| | Is the transparency report actual's forecast for the Permanent Team the same as the last published forecast for the same month? | ~ | | | | Yes. | | | | | |
| 1.30 | Are the Permanent Team differences between forecast and actuals explained in the transparency report? | ~ | | | | Yes. | | | | | |
| 1.40 | Are the SES Permanent Team actual expenses within the monthly MIP40c3-SP55 buget cap? | ~ | | | | Yes. | | | | | |
| 1.50 | Are the SES Permanent Team actual expenses within the quarterly total MIP40c3-SP55 budget cap? | ~ | | | | Yes. | | | | | |
| | Has the SES Permanent Team Administration Expenses any significant deviations between forecast and actuals? | | | | | | | | | | |
| | Has the SES Permanent Team Compensation & Benefits any significant deviations between forecast and actuals? | | | | | | | | | | |
| | Has the SES Permanent Team Gas Fees any significant deviations between forecast and actuals? | - | 1 | | | | | | | | |
| 1.90 | Has the SES Permanent Team Professional Services any significant deviations between forecast and actuals? | | | | | | | | | | |
| | Has the SES Permanent Team Softaware Development any significant deviations between forecast and actuals? | ~ | | | | No. | | | | | |
| 1.11 | Has the SES Permanent Team Software Expense any significant deviations between forecast and actuals? | $ \mathbf{Z} $ | <u> </u> | | | Yes but justified. | | | | | |
| | Has the SES Permanent Team Travel & Entertaiment any significant deviations between forecast and actuals? | ~ | | | | No. | | | | | |
| | Has the SES Permanent Team presented the correct calculation of amounts for the actuals, forecast and difference? | ~ | | | | Yes. | | | | | |
| 1.14 | Has the SES Permanent Team any budget category that seems inconsistent and needs further investigation? | ~ | | | | No. | | | | | |
| 1.15 | | ~ | | | | Yes. | | | | | |
| | Audit Questions to Transparency Report - Section 1. Incubation Program Last Month Actuals - | | | | | | | | | | |
| | Is the transparency report actual's forecast for the Incubation Program the same as the last published forecast for the same month? | ~ | | | | Yes. | | | | | |

9/29/2022

2

Core Unit Name: SES - Sustainable Ecosystem Scaling Core Unit -

Audit ID: 2022-07-SES001

Audit Cycle: 2022 - 07/1

Audit Result: Needs action before approval

Audit Date: 2022-09-29

Budget Statement Submission Date: 2022-09-28

Facilitator contact: @Juan

Core Unit Clarification Received on Date:

 $\underline{ Transparency Report: https://github.com/makerdao-ses/transparency-reporting/blob/main/Monthly\%20Budget\%20Statements/2022-07.md}$ MIP40c3-SP55: https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp55-modify-core-unit-budget-sustainable-ecosystem-scaling-ses-001/12097

| Audit Question | | | | Audit Assessment | Core Unit's Clarification | Immediate CU Action to improve transparency report | Medium Term CU Action to impro transparency report |
|---|----------|-----|----|------------------|----------------------------|---|---|
| Are the SES Incubation Program differences between forecast and actuals explained in the transparency | | | | | Core offic s clarification | transparency report | transparency report |
| report? | | | | Yes. | | | |
| Are the SES Incubation Program's actual expenses within the monthly MIP40c3-SP55 buget cap? | | | | | | | |
| | V | | −⊔ | Yes. | | | |
| Are the SES Incubation Program's actual expenses within the quarterly total MIP40c3-SP55 budget cap? | | | | Yes. | | | |
| Has the SES Incubation Program presented the correct calculation of amounts for the actuals, forecast and difference? | | 1 0 | | Yes. | | | |
| Has the SES Incubation Program any budget category that seems inconsistent and needs further | | | | | | | |
| investigation? | | | | No. | | | |
| Has SES explained the Incubation program's difference between the payments and actuals? | | | | Yes. | | | |
| Audit Questions to Transparency Report - Section 1. Grant's Program Last Month Actuals - | | | | | | | |
| Is the transparency report actual's forecast for the Grant's Program the same as the last published forecast | | | | | | | |
| for the same month? | | | | Yes. | | | |
| Are the SES Grant's Program differences between forecast and actuals explained in the transparency report? | | | | Yes. | | | |
| Are the SES Grant's Program Actual expenses within the monthly MIP40c3-SP55 buget cap? | | | | | | | |
| | | | | Yes. | | | |
| Are the SES Grant's Program Actual expenses within the quarterly total MIP40c3-SP55 budget cap? | | | | Yes. | | | |
| Has the SES Grant's Program presented the correct calculation of amounts for the actuals, forecast and difference? | | | | Voc | | | |
| Has the SES Grant's Program any budget category that seems inconsistent and needs further investigation? | | | | | | | |
| rias tile 3.53 Grant 3 7 Tograni any budget category tilat seems inconsistent and needs further investigation: | | | | Yes. | | | |
| Has SES explained the Grant's Program difference between the payments and actuals? | | | | Yes. | | | |
| Audit Questions to Transparency Report - Section 2. Permanent Team Budget Forecast - | | | | | | | |
| Does the transparency report display the MIP40c3-SP55 caps for both total and budget categories? | | | | | | | |
| Does the transparency report display the IVIII 4003-37-33 caps for both total and dauget categories: | | | | Yes. | | | |
| Are the monthly and quarterly budget caps (both totals and per category) the same as in the MIP40c3-SP55? | | | | Yes. | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| Are the monthly forecast totals within the MIP40c3-SP55 monthly budget cap? | | | | | | | |
| | | | | Yes. | | | |
| Is the quarterly forecast within the bounds of the qly MIP40c3-SP55 budget caps? | | | | Yes. | | | |
| Has the SES presented the correct calculation of amounts in the Permanent Team budget forecast table? | | | | Yes | | | |
| Audit Questions to Transparency Report - Section 2. Incubation Program Budget Forecast - | | | | Tour | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| Does the transparency report display the Incubation Program's budget cap? | | | | Yes. | | | |
| Are the monthly and quarterly budget caps the same as in the MIP40c3-SP55? | | | | Voc | | | |
| | | | | | | | |
| Are the Incubation Program's monthly forecast totals within the MIP40c3-SP55 monthly budget cap? | | | | Yes. | | | |

9/29/2022

3

| | it | | | |
|--|----|--|--|--|
| | | | | |
| | | | | |

Core Unit Name: SES - Sustainable Ecosystem Scaling Core Unit -

Audit ID: 2022-07-SES001

Audit Cycle: 2022 - 07/1

Audit Result: Needs action before approval

Audit Date: 2022-09-29

Budget Statement Submission Date: 2022-09-28

Facilitator contact: @Juan

Core Unit Clarification Received on Date:

Transparency Report: https://github.com/makerdao-ses/transparency-reporting/blob/main/Monthly%20Budget%20Statements/2022-07.md
MIP40c3-SP55: https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp55-modify-core-unit-budget-sustainable-ecosystem-scaling-ses-001/12097

Needs action before approval

| MIP40c3-SP44: https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp17-sustainable-ecosystem-scaling-core-unit-mkr-budget-ses-001/8043 | | | | | | | | | |
|---|----------|----------|----------|--|---|---------------------------|---|---|--|
| Audit Question | | | | | Audit Assessment | Core Unit's Clarification | Immediate CU Action to improve transparency report | Medium Term CU Action to improve transparency report | |
| Is the Incubation Program quarterly forecast within the bounds of the qly MIP40c3-SP55 budget caps? $ 2.9 $ | ~ | | | | Yes. | | | | |
| Has the SES presented the correct calculation of amounts in the Incubation Program budget forecast table? $^{2.10}$ | ~ | | | | Yes. | | | | |
| Audit Questions to Transparency Report - Section 2. Grant's Program Budget Forecast - | | | | | | | | | |
| Does the transparency report display the Grant's Program Budget cap? | ~ | | | | Yes. | | | | |
| Are the monthly and quarterly budget caps the same as in the MIP40c3-SP55? | ~ | | | | Yes. | | | | |
| Are the Grant's Program monthly forecast totals within the MIP40c3-SP55 monthly budget cap? 2.13 | ~ | | | | Yes. | | | | |
| Is the Grant's Program quarterly forecast within the bounds of the qly MIP40c3-SP55 budget caps? | ~ | | | | Yes. | | | | |
| Has the SES presented the correct calculation of amounts in the Grant's Program budget forecast table? | ~ | | | | Yes. | | | | |
| Audit Questions to Transparency Report - Section 3. MKR Vesting Overview - | | | | | | | | | |
| Has the SES indicated the number of FTE in the transparency report's MKR vesting overview? | ~ | | | | Yes. | | | | |
| Has the MKR vesting overview the same FTE comparing it to the MIP40c3-SP17? | | ~ | | | No. The reported FTE is 10.5 and the MIP40c3-SP17 MKR budget is based on 8.93 FTEs. | | | | |
| Are the MKR vesting dates the same as in the MIP40c3-SP17? | | ✓ | | | No. The reported vesting dates are different from the MIP40c3-SP17 due to new hires, the changes were explained in the November 2021 budget statement. | | | | |
| Has SES changed the MKR amounts since the last transparency report? | ~ | | | | No. | | | | |
| Has SES explained the MKR change in the transparency report? | | | | | This control can only be made if the above question is yes. | | | | |
| Has the SES Auditor wallet received the vested MKR amount corresponding to the vesting date of June 1st, 2022? | V | | | | Yes. SES Auditor wallet has received 541.47 MKR on May 23rd, 2022. The MKR transfer was added to the Maj 2022 transparency report. https://etherscan.io/tx/0xd891445bf62cb9df39a07be390f2650be820d4cb2c8efe51b4506e1763435f | | | | |
| Has the Operational wallet received the vested MKR amount corresponding to the vesting date of June 1st, 2022. | V | | | | Yes. The SES Permanent Team Operational wallet received 427.07 MKR on May 31st. 2022. https://etherscan. io/tx/0xc4c0012f446fe28bb76122572c9bfcdf6b7cf96d2df733a40bbb3e07cf9e58a 9 | | | | |
| Other relevant observations? | | | <u>~</u> | | Update June 2022 MKR Actual amount to 427.07 MKR - see June statement where this was done | | | | |
| Audit Questions to Transparency Report - Section 4. Transfers - | | | | | | | | | |
| Does the SES Operational wallets balance match the transparency report current balances in the calculation made for the new transfer? | П | | П | | Received a month later, further payments have been made. | | | | |
| Are the DAI payments from the Permanent Team Operational wallet the same as in the actuals section payments? | | | | | | | | | |

9/29/2022

Core Unit Name: SES - Sustainable Ecosystem Scaling Core Unit -

Audit ID: 2022-07-SES001

Audit Cycle: 2022 - 07/1

Audit Result: Needs action before approval

Audit Date: 2022-09-29

Budget Statement Submission Date: 2022-09-28

Facilitator contact: @Juan

Core Unit Clarification Received on Date:

Iransparency Report: https://github.com/makerdao-ses/transparency-reporting/blob/main/Monthly%20Budget%20Statements/2022-07.md
MIP40c3-SP55: https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp55-modify-core-unit-budget-sustainable-ecosystem-scaling-ses-001/12097

Needs action before approval

MIP40c3-SP44: https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp17-sustainable-ecosystem-scaling-core-unit-mkr-budget-ses-001/8043



9/29/2022