

Audit Report

Core Unit Name: IS
Audit ID: 2022-10-IS001
Audit Cycle: 2022 - 10 /1
Audit Date: 11-17-2022
Audit Result: Needs CU Action
Submission Date: 11-07-2022
Facilitator contact: @psychonaut#7023
Core Unit Clarification Received on Date:
MakerDAO Ecosystem Dashboard: <http://167.71.32.135/core-unit/IS/finances/reports>
Github Transparency Report: <https://github.com/makerdao-is/transparency-reporting/blob/main/Monthly%20Budget%20Statements/2022-10.md>
MIP4c2-SP17: <https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip4c2-sp17-rapid-payment-for-small-bug-bounties-mip64-mip40c3-sp42-amendment/12869>
MIP40c3-SP58: <https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp58-modify-core-unit-budget-immune-fi-security-core-unit-budget-is-001/12598>
MIP40c3-SP42: <https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp42-adding-immune-fi-security-core-unit-budget-is-001/10813>
MIP40c3-SP41: <https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp41-immune-fi-security-core-unit-mkr-budget-is-001/10814>

Approved
Approved with comments
Needs action before approval
Revoke

#	Audit Question					Audit Assessment	Core Unit's Clarification	Immediate CU Action to Improve Monthly Budget Statement	Medium Term CU Action to Improve Monthly Budget Statement
	Audit Questions to the Structure of the Monthly Budget Statement and consistency with IS MIP40c3-SP58					Note.- IS Budget MIP40c3-SP58 was ratified on 02-28-2022 and MIP4c2-SP17 was ratified on 03-28-2022			
0.1	Are the sections in the Monthly Budget Statement in the right order: Actuals, Forecast, MKR vesting and Transfers?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.			
0.2	Does the Actual section include breakdowns with Budget Category, Forecast, Actuals, Difference, Payments and Reason for the diff. ?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.			
0.3	Does the Budget Forecast summary contain the Qly budget cap?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes. IS has added the approved Bounty payout budget of 100,000 +15% per month from April 2022. https://mips.makerdao.com/mips/details/MIP40c3SP58sentence_summary https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip4c3-sp17-rapid-payment-for-small-bug-bounties-mip64-mip40c3-sp42-amendment/12869 https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip4c3-sp17-rapid-payment-for-small-bug-bounties-mip64-mip40c3-sp42-amendment/12869		IS needs to review the Budget Cap and Budget Cap+Buffer amount as the periodic approved budget expires in Nov. 2022.	
0.4	Does the Budget Forecast cover 3 months with a summary and Budget Category breakdown?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.			
0.5	Does the Budget Forecast summary and breakdown contain the budget caps for comparison?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes. IS has a periodic budget cap and one time costs.		IS needs to review the Budget Cap and Budget Cap+Buffer amount as the periodic approved budget expires in Nov. 2022.	
0.6	Are the Budget Forecast Breakdown categories in the Monthly Budget Statement the same as in the MIP40c3-SP58 and MIP4c2-SP17?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	No. The IS-specific budget categories nomenclature was replaced with the SF standard chart of accounts nomenclature as of June 2022.			
0.7	Is the Multi-sig wallet setup the same as described in the MIP40c3-SP58?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes: IS Operational Wallet quorum (2:3) Controlled by the IS Core Unit team Address: 0x124c759D1084E67B19a206ab85c4527Fab26c342 Signers 0x2BC5Ffc5De1a83a9e4cDDfA138bAEd516D70414b 0xAcf835934eE40E0d5ee3F941E283499F8Ad97eD 0xFc87601A80d3e4F0aF083a899e3fee203C23cF0			
0.8	Is the IS operational wallet controlled by more than 1 signer?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes, the IS operational wallet has a current policy of 2 out of 3 signers			
0.9	Has the IS auditor wallet received the initial seed funds from the protocol prior transfer to the IS Operational Wallet?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes, the auditor wallet has received 195,443 DAI from the protocol https://etherscan.io/tx/0xab810a967ba4a68862c4433ec4185f121bf4b38535a2aab4a8e9908a4 The MIP40c3-SP42 total budget cap less contingency buffer is 106,250 DAI. This initial transfer includes yearly and one time costs described in the MIP.			
0.10	Has the IS auditor wallet received the initial funds for the operational audits from the protocol prior transfer to the IS Operational Wallet?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes, the auditor wallet has received 138,000 DAI from the protocol on March 6, 2022 https://etherscan.io/tx/0x25a0b1ac21cb1a70f76d14687c56025133d987ebc37d6e538e7a5e7764083600			
0.11	Has the IS Operational wallet received a top-up after the audit of the last Monthly Budget Statement?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	No, the operational wallet did not receive the requested 8,025 DAI.			
	Audit Questions to the Monthly Budget Statement - Section 1. Last Month Actuals -								
1.1	Is the actuals budget category breakdown the same as in the MIP40c3-SP58?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	The budget categories have adopted the standard nomenclature per June 2022. The MIP40c3-SP58 budget categories are therefore replaced with the standard budget categories in the IS budget statements.			
1.2	Is the transparency report actual's forecast the same as the last published forecast for the same month?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.			
1.3	Are the differences between forecast and actuals explained in the transparency report?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.			

Audit Report

Core Unit Name: IS
 Audit ID: 2022-10-IS001
 Audit Cycle: 2022 - 10 / 1
 Audit Date: 11-17-2022
 Audit Result: Needs CU Action
 Submission Date: 11-07-2022
 Facilitator contact: @psychonaut#7023
 Core Unit Clarification Received on Date:

MakerDAO Ecosystem Dashboard: <http://167.71.32.135/core-unit/IS/finances/reports>
 Github Transparency Report: <https://github.com/makerdao-is/transparency-reporting/blob/main/Monthly%20Budget%20Statements/2022-10.md>
 MIP4c2-SP17: <https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip4c2-sp17-rapid-payment-for-small-bug-bounties-mip64-mip40c3-sp42-amendment/12869>
 MIP40c3-SP58: <https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp58-modify-core-unit-budget-immune-security-core-unit-budget-is-001/12598>
 MIP40c3-SP42: <https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp42-adding-immune-security-core-unit-budget-is-001/10813>
 MIP40c3-SP41: <https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp41-immune-security-core-unit-mkr-budget-is-001/10814>



#	Audit Question	Approved	Approved with comments	Needs action before approval	Pending	Audit Assessment	Core Unit's Clarification	Immediate CU Action to Improve Monthly Budget Statement	Medium Term CU Action to Improve Monthly Budget Statement
1.4	Are the IS actual expenses within the MIP40c3-SP458 total buget cap?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.			
1.5	Are the IS actual expenses within the total MIP40c3-SP58 budget cap for the current quarter?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.			
1.6	Has the Admin Expense any significant deviations between forecast and actuals?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	No expense reported in this category.			
1.7	Has the IS Compensation and Benefits any significant deviations between forecast and actuals?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	No.			
1.8	Has the IS Professional Services any significant deviations between forecast and actuals?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes, the forecast is 10,000 and the actual expense is 0.	The difference is due to " no ETH purchase this month."		
1.9	Has the IS Gas fees any significant deviations between forecast and actuals?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes. The forecast is 1,000 and the actual expense is 0.	The difference is due to "no usage."		
2.0	Has the IS Software Development any significant deviations between forecast and actuals?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes. The forecast is 100,000 and the actual expense is 250. This gives a difference of 99,750. The reason for the diff. is not indicated in the Actual's table.			
2.1	Has the IS Software Expense any significant deviations between forecast and actuals?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	No.			
2.2	Has the IS presented the correct calculation of amounts for the actuals, forecast and difference?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.			
2.3	Has the IS Actuals Section any budget category that seems inconsistent and needs further investigation?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	No.			
2.4	Other observations	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	The amounts published in the IS Github budget statement report are rounded. Therefore, there is a small discrepancy between the Github data and the MakerDAO Ecosystem Dashboard "Expenses.MakerDAO.Network". The auditor's suggestion is to add two decimals to the amounts in the Github report going forward to avoid differences between the two sources of data information.			IS should add decimals to the Github budget statements as indicated under the assessment.
Audit Questions to the Monthly Budget Statement - Section 2. Budget Forecast -									
2.1	Are the budget caps (both totals and per category) the same as in the MIP40c3-SP58 and MIP4c2-SP17?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	IS has added the Bounty Payout budget category to its forecast since April 2022. The IS CU has, per March 28th, 2022, an approved budget of 100,000 + 15% = 115,000 DAI per month to be used for bug bounty payments that are categorized as software development expense. IS needs to review the budget cap amount for the period of Nov. Dec. 2022 and Jan 2023.		IS needs to review the Budget cap for the months of Nov. Dec.2022 and Jan 2023. The Periodic budget covers until Nov 2022.	
2.2	Are the quarterly forecast within the bounds of the MIP40c3-SP58 and MIP4c2-SP17 budget caps?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.			
2.3	Are the quarterly forecast totals within the approved MIP40c3-SP58 and MIP4c2-SP17 budget caps?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	IS has a periodic budget that is calculated based on the information given in the budget MIPs. IS needs to review the Budget cap in the Forecast section.			
2.4	Has the IS presented the correct calculation of amounts in the Budget Forecast section?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.			
2.5	Is there a year to date forecast versus expenses observation	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	The IS periodic budget period covers a 12 month period from Dec. 2021 to Nov. 2022.			IS needs to review the budget caps in the budget statement.
2.6	Other observations	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	No.			
Audit Questions to the Monthly Budget Statement - Section 3. MKR Vesting Overview -									

Audit Report

Core Unit Name: IS
 Audit ID: 2022-10-IS001
 Audit Cycle: 2022 - 10 /1
 Audit Date: 11-17-2022
 Audit Result: Needs CU Action
 Submission Date: 11-07-2022
 Facilitator contact: @psychonaut#7023
 Core Unit Clarification Received on Date:

MakerDAO Ecosystem Dashboard: <http://167.71.32.135/core-unit/IS/finances/reports>
 Github Transparency Report: <https://github.com/makerdao-is/transparency-reporting/blob/main/Monthly%20Budget%20Statements/2022-10.md>
 MIP4c2-SP17: <https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip4c2-sp17-rapid-payment-for-small-bug-bounties-mip64-mip40c3-sp42-amendment/12869>
 MIP40c3-SP58: <https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp58-modify-core-unit-budget-immune-fi-security-core-unit-budget-is-001/12598>
 MIP40c3-SP42: <https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp42-adding-immune-fi-security-core-unit-budget-is-001/10813>
 MIP40c3-SP41: <https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp41-immune-fi-security-core-unit-mkr-budget-is-001/10814>



#	Audit Question	Approved	Approved with comments	Needs action before approval	Pending	Audit Assessment	Core Unit's Clarification	Immediate CU Action to Improve Monthly Budget Statement	Medium Term CU Action to Improve Monthly Budget Statement
3.1	Has IS indicated the number of FTE in the Monthly Budget Statement's MKR vesting overview?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes. The FTE in October 2022 is as follows: - Facilitator 0 FTE - Deputy Facilitator 0.8			
3.2	Has the MKR vesting overview the same FTE comparing it to the MIP40c3-SP41?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	No. IS FTE were reduce from 1.2 to 0.8.			
3.3	Are the MKR vesting dates the same as in the MIP40c3-SP41?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Change in FTE and manual pricing was triggered on Aug 5, 2022. Therefore the Vesting dates were updated. The Aug 2023 is the next first vesting date instead of Dec 2022.			IS should update the MKR table with the complete vesting date M-D-Y e.g. Aug 5 - 2023
3.4	Has IS changed the MKR amounts comparing it to the MIP40c3-SP41?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	No. IS has added a new MKR vest schedule to MIP40c-SP41 https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp41-immune-fi-security-core-unit-mkr-budget-is-001/10814/3			
3.5	Has IS explained the MKR change in the Monthly Budget Statement?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.	"FTEs were reduced from 1.2 to 0.8 (since July 2022) and manual pricing was triggered on Aug 5th, 2022."		
Audit Questions to the Monthly Budget Statement - Section 4. Transfers -									
4.1	Does the IS Operational Wallet balances match the Monthly Budget Statement current balance in the calculation made for the new transfer?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.			
4.2	Are the payments from the operational wallet the same as in the actuals payments?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	The reported payments in October 2022 is 8,026 DAI and the onchain payment is 8,025.75 DAI. The difference between these two amounts is due to rounding in the Github budget statement.			IS should add decimals to the Github budget statements as indicated under the assessment.
4.3	Has the IS Auditor wallet sufficient funds to top up the IS operational wallet?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.			
4.4	Does IS Operational wallet need to return excess funds to the auditor wallet based on the October 2022 budget report?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	No.			
4.5	Does IS Auditor wallet needs to return excess funds to the MakerDAO Protocol based on the October 2022 budget report?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	SES will coordinate the return of excess funds after consulting with IS.			
4.6	Other observations	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	No.			