

Audit Report

Core Unit Name: IS
Audit ID: 2022-08-IS001
Audit Cycle: 2022 - 08 /1
Audit Date: 09-15-2022
Audit Result: Needs CU Action
Submission Date: 09-02-2022
Facilitator contact: @psychonaut#7023

Core Unit Clarification Received on Date:

MakerDAO Ecosystem Dashboard: <http://167.71.32.135/core-unit/IS/finances/reports>

Github Transparency Report: <https://github.com/makerdao-is/transparency-reporting/blob/main/Monthly%20Budget%20Statements/2022-08.md>

MIP4c2-SP17: <https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip4c2-sp17-rapid-payment-for-small-bug-bounties-mip64-mip40c3-sp42-amendment/12869>

MIP40c3-SP58: <https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp58-modify-core-unit-budget-immunefi-security-core-unit-budget-is-001/12598>

MIP40c3-SP42: <https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp42-adding-immunefi-security-core-unit-budget-is-001/10813>

MIP40c3-SP41: <https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp41-immunefi-security-core-unit-mkr-budget-is-001/10814>

#	Audit Question	<div>Approved</div>	<div>Approved with comments</div>	<div>Needs action before approval</div>	<div>Disputed</div>	Audit Assessment	Core Unit's Clarification	Immediate CU Action to Improve Monthly Budget Statement	Medium Term CU Action to Improve Monthly Budget Statement
	Audit Questions to the Structure of the Monthly Budget Statement and consistency with IS MIP40c3-SP58					Note.- IS Budget MIP40c3-SP58 was ratified on 02-28-2022 and MIP4c2-SP17 was ratified on 03-28-2022			
0.1	Are the sections in the Monthly Budget Statement in the right order: Actuals, Forecast, MKR vesting and Transfers?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.			
0.2	Does the Actual section include breakdowns with Budget Category, Forecast, Actuals, Difference, Payments and Reason for the diff. ?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.			
0.3	Does the Budget Forecast summary contain the Qly budget cap?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes. IS has added the approved Bounty payout budget of 100,000 +15% per month from April 2022. https://mips.makerdao.com/mips/details/MIP40c3SP58#sentence-summary https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip4c2-sp17-rapid-payment-for-small-bug-bounties-mip64-mip40c3-sp42-amendment/12869			
0.4	Does the Budget Forecast cover 3 months with a summary and Budget Category breakdown?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.			
0.5	Does the Budget Forecast summary and breakdown contain the budget caps for comparison?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes. IS has a periodic budget cap and one time costs.			
0.6	Are the Budget Forecast Breakdown categories in the Monthly Budget Statement the same as in the MIP40c3-SP58 and MIP4c2-SP17?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	No. The IS-specific budget categories nomenclature was replaced with the SF standard chart of accounts nomenclature as of June 2022.			
0.7	Is the Multi-sig wallet setup the same as described in the MIP40c3-SP58?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes: IS Operational Wallet quorum (2:3) Controlled by the IS Core Unit team Address: 0x124c759D1084E67B19a206ab85c4527Fab26c342 Signers 0x2BC5Ffc5De1a83a9e4cDfA138bAEd516D70414b 0xAcA835934eE40E0d5ee3F941E283499F8Ad97eD 0xFFC87601A80d3e4F0aF083a899e3fee203C23cF0			
0.8	Is the IS operational wallet controlled by more than 1 signer?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes, the IS operational wallet has a current policy of 2 out of 3 signers			
0.9	Has the IS auditor wallet received the initial seed funds from the protocol prior transfer to the IS Operational Wallet?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes, the auditor wallet has received 195,443 DAI from the protocol https://etherscan.io/tx/0xab810a967ba4a68862c4433ec4185fbc1a3ff121bf4b38535a2aab4a8e9908a4 The MIP40c3-SP42 total budget cap less contingency buffer is 106,250 DAI. This initial transfer included seed funds as described in the MIP.			
0.10	Has the IS auditor wallet received the initial funds for the operational audits from the protocol prior transfer to the IS Operational Wallet?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes, the auditor wallet has received 138,000 DAI from the protocol on March 6, 2022 https://etherscan.io/tx/0x25a0b1ac21cb1a70f76d14687c56025133d987ebc37d6e538e7a5e7764083600			
0.11	Has the IS Operational wallet received a top-up after the audit of the last Monthly Budget Statement?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	No, the IS Operational wallet did not receive a top up due to plenty of unused funds. The Operational wallet has returned 82,173 DAI to the Auditor Wallet on August 12th 2022. https://etherscan.io/address/0x124c759D1084E67B19a206ab85c4527Fab26c342#tokentxns			
	Audit Questions to the Monthly Budget Statement - Section 1. Last Month Actuals -								
1.1	Is the actuals budget category breakdown the same as in the MIP40c3-SP58?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	The budget categories have adopted the SF nomenclature per June 2022. The MIP40c3-SP58 budget categories are therefore replaced with the standard budget categories in the IS budget statements.			
1.2	Is the transparency report actual's forecast the same as the last published forecast for the same month?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.			
1.3	Are the differences between forecast and actuals explained in the transparency report?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.			

Audit Report

Core Unit Name: IS

Audit ID: 2022-08-IS001

Audit Cycle: 2022 - 08 / 1

Audit Date: 09-15-2022

Audit Result: Needs CU Action

Submission Date: 09-02-2022

Facilitator contact: @psychonaut#7023

Core Unit Clarification Received on Date:

MakerDAO Ecosystem Dashboard: <http://167.71.32.135/core-unit/IS/finances/reports>

Github Transparency Report: <https://github.com/makerdao-is/transparency-reporting/blob/main/Monthly%20Budget%20Statements/2022-08.md>

MIP4c2-SP17: <https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip4c2-sp17-rapid-payment-for-small-bug-bounties-mip64-mip40c3-sp42-amendment/12869>

MIP40c3-SP58: <https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp58-modify-core-unit-budget-immunefi-security-core-unit-budget-is-001/12598>

MIP40c3-SP42: <https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp42-adding-immunefi-security-core-unit-budget-is-001/10813>

MIP40c3-SP41: <https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp41-immunefi-security-core-unit-mkr-budget-is-001/10814>

#	Audit Question					Audit Assessment	Core Unit's Clarification	Immediate CU Action to Improve Monthly Budget Statement	Medium Term CU Action to Improve Monthly Budget Statement
		<div>Approved</div>	<div>Approved with comments</div>	<div>Needs action before approval</div>	<div>Disapprove</div>				
1.4	Are the IS actual expenses within the MIP40c3-SP458 total buget cap?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.			
1.5	Are the IS actual expenses within the total MIP40c3-SP58 budget cap for the current quarter?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.			
1.6	Has the Admin Expense any significant deviations between forecast and actuals?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	No expense reported in this category.			
1.7	Has the IS Compensation and Benefits any significant deviations between forecast and actuals?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	No.			
1.8	Has the IS Professional Services any significant deviations between forecast and actuals?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes, the forecast is 10,000 and the actual expense is 0.	The difference is due to "no usage."		
1.9	Has the IS Gas fees any significant deviations between forecast and actuals?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes. The forecast is 1,000 and the actual expense is 0.	No purchase of ETH in August 2022.		
2.0	Has the IS Software Development any significant deviations between forecast and actuals?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes. The forecast is 100,000 and the actual expense is 58,000. Diff. not specified in the budget statement report.			
2.1	Has the IS Software Expense any significant deviations between forecast and actuals?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	No.			
2.2	Has the IS presented the correct calculation of amounts for the actuals, forecast and difference?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.			
2.3	Has the IS Actuals Section any budget category that seems inconsistent and needs further investigation?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	No.			
2.4	Other observations	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	No.			
Audit Questions to the Monthly Budget Statement - Section 2. Budget Forecast -									
2.1	Are the budget caps (both totals and per category) the same as in the MIP40c3-SP58 and MIP4c2-SP17?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	IS has added the Bounty Payout budget category to its forecast since April 2022. The IS CU has, per March 28th, 2022, an approved budget of 100,000 + 15% = 115,000 DAI per month to be used for bug bounty payments that are categorized as software development expense.			
2.2	Are the quarterly forecast within the bounds of the MIP40c3-SP58 and MIP4c2-SP17 budget caps?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.			
2.3	Are the quarterly forecast totals within the approved MIP40c3-SP58 and MIP4c2-SP17 budget caps?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes. IS has a periodic budget that is calculated based on the information given in the budget MIPs.			
2.4	Has the IS presented the correct calculation of amounts in the Budget Forecast section?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	The Software expense forecast is 26 per month, the 3 month total is 77 DAI. The correct amount should be 78.		IS needs review and correct the budget forecast for the Software expense 3-month total and the Total sum.	
2.5	Is there a year to date forecast versus expenses observation	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	No.			
2.6	Other observations	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	No.			

Audit Report

Core Unit Name: IS

Audit ID: 2022-08-IS001

Audit Cycle: 2022 - 08 /1

Audit Date: 09-15-2022

Audit Result: Needs CU Action

Submission Date: 09-02-2022

Facilitator contact: @psychonaut#7023

Core Unit Clarification Received on Date:

MakerDAO Ecosystem Dashboard: <http://167.71.32.135/core-unit/IS/finances/reports>

Github Transparency Report: <https://github.com/makerdao-is/transparency-reporting/blob/main/Monthly%20Budget%20Statements/2022-08.md>

MIP4c2-SP17: <https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip4c2-sp17-rapid-payment-for-small-bug-bounties-mip64-mip40c3-sp42-amendment/12869>

MIP40c3-SP58: <https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp58-modify-core-unit-budget-immunefi-security-core-unit-budget-is-001/12598>

MIP40c3-SP42: <https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp42-adding-immunefi-security-core-unit-budget-is-001/10813>

MIP40c3-SP41: <https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp41-immunefi-security-core-unit-mkr-budget-is-001/10814>

Approved

Approved with comments

Needs action before approval

Disapprove

#	Audit Question					Audit Assessment	Core Unit's Clarification	Immediate CU Action to Improve Monthly Budget Statement	Medium Term CU Action to Improve Monthly Budget Statement
Audit Questions to the Monthly Budget Statement - Section 3. MKR Vesting Overview -									
3.1	Has IS indicated the number of FTE in the Monthly Budget Statement's MKR vesting overview?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes. The FTE has changed as follows: - Facilitator 0 FTE in August 2022 - Deputy Facilitator 0.8 in August 2022		IS could add a sentence to the budget stament informing that IS facilitator is vacant.	
3.2	Has the MKR vesting overview the same FTE comparing it to the MIP40c3-SP41?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	No. IS FTE were reduce from 1.2 to 0.8.			
3.3	Are the MKR vesting dates the same as in the MIP40c3-SP41?	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Change in FTE and manual pricing was triggered on Aug 5, 2022. Therefore the Vesting dates were updated, this the Aug 2023 is the next first vesting date instead of Dec 2022.			IS should update the MKR table with the complete vesting date M-D-Y e.g. Aug 5 - 2023
3.4	Has IS changed the MKR amounts comparing it to the MIP40c3-SP41?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	No. IS has added a new MKR vest schedule to MIP40c-SP41 https://forum.makerdao.com/t/mip40c3-sp41-immunefi-security-core-unit-mkr-budget-is-001/10814/3			
3.5	Has IS explained the MKR change in the Monthly Budget Statement?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.	"FTEs were reduced from 1.2 to 0.8 (last month) and manual pricing was triggered 05 Aug 2022."		
Audit Questions to the Monthly Budget Statement - Section 4. Transfers -									
4.1	Does the IS Operational Wallet balances match the Monthly Budget Statement current balance in the calculation made for the new transfer?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes. The IS operational wallet balance is 291,052 and the current balance on September 15th, 2022 is 291,051.60677263 DAI.			
4.2	Are the payments from the operational wallet the same as in the actuals payments?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes. On-chain payments do match the 66,026 DAI reported payments in August 2022.			
4.3	Has the IS Auditor wallet sufficient funds to top up the IS operational wallet?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Yes.			
4.4	Does IS Operational wallet need to return excess funds to the auditor wallet based on the August 2022 budget report?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	No.			
4.5	Does IS Auditor wallet needs to return excess funds to the MakerDAO Protocol based on the July 2022 budget report?	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	No. The Auditor wallet current balance is 221,093.33678326 DAI this amount is below the two month approved budget policy.			
4.6	Other observations	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	No.			