CSCI8380 (Spring 2012): Paper Review Form

Reviewer Name: Mehdi Allahyari

Paper Name: YAGO2: Exploring and Querying World Knowledge in Time, Space, Context, and Many Languages

Section I. Overview

A. Reader Interest

1. Which category describes this manuscript?
   ___Practice/Application/Case Study/Experience Report
   _✔__Research/Technology
   ___Survey/Tutorial/How-To

B. Content

1. Please explain how this manuscript advances this field of research and/or contributes something new to the literature.

Answer: *This manuscript describes YAGO2 which extends YAGO knowledge base in terms of temporal and spatial knowledge. It introduces a methodology for enriching large knowledge bases of entity-relationship-oriented facts along the dimension of time and space. This knowledge is a crucial asset for many applications including entity linkage across independent sources like in the Linked Data cloud and Semantic Search.*

C. Presentation

1. Does the introduction state the objectives of the manuscript in terms that encourage the reader to read on?
   _✔__Yes
   ___Could be improved
   ___No

2. How would you rate the organization of the manuscript? Is it focused? Is the length appropriate for the topic?
   _✔__Satisfactory
   ___Could be improved
   ___Poor

3. Please rate and comment on the readability of this manuscript.
   _✔__Easy to read
   ___Readable - but requires some effort to understand
   ___Difficult to read and understand
   ___Unreadable

Section II. Evaluation

Please rate the manuscript. Explain your choice.

___Award Quality
___Excellent
__✔_Good
___Fair
___Poor

Section III. Detailed Comments (provide your thoughts/criticism about the ideas in the paper; not only summarize the paper but have a critical look here)

Answer: *In this paper authors presented a new extraction of YAGO knowledge base with the focus on temporal and spatial knowledge. Although the current RDF standard has been enriched with means of storing additional fields, it does not include time and space, better to say temporal and spatial dimensions of events. So they have added to each triple in YAGO2, three more dimensions, time, location and context that yields a 6-tuple representation, which they have called it, SPOTLX.*
The authors have designed new declarative rules, but I think the list could be extended.

Additional Comments:

1. Provide one aspect that you liked the most in this paper.

   The idea of using temporal and spatial dimension in RDF is pretty cool. It can be very beneficial in many different applications.

2. Provide one aspect that you disliked the most in this paper.

   In this paper there's no comparison result in terms of performance between this knowledge base having temporal and spatial dimensions in RDF and the others without this capability. There is no metrics, no comparison of any kind.

Section IV. Discussion Points (provide at least 3 discussion topics/questions related to ideas/techniques described in the paper; these will be used for discussions in the class)

1. *Although adding temporal and spatial dimensions to current RDF standard looks advantageous but doesn't it make the queries more complex?*
2. *Is there any comparison showing that the result of this new aspect is more accurate?*
3. *Do the rules they have defined cover all possible situations?*