

FRIEDMAN's translation

Marc CHEVALIER
Thomas PELLISSIER TANON

October 21, 2014

1 FRIEDMAN's Translation

Definition 1. Let R be a formula. The *parametrized negation* is

$$\neg_R := A \Rightarrow R$$

We gather here some basic properties of the parametrized negation

Proposition 2. In intuitionistic logic,

- (i) $B \Rightarrow \neg_R A \vdash A \Rightarrow \neg_R B$
- (ii) $A \vdash \neg_R \neg_R A$
- (iii) $A \Rightarrow B \vdash \neg_R B \Rightarrow \neg_R A$
- (iv) $A \Rightarrow B \vdash \neg_R \neg_R A \Rightarrow \neg_R \neg_R B$
- (v) $\neg_R \neg_R \neg_R A \vdash \neg_R A$

Proof. (i)

$$\frac{\overline{B \Rightarrow \neg_R A, A, B \vdash A} \quad \frac{\overline{B \Rightarrow \neg_R A, A, B \vdash B} \quad \overline{B \Rightarrow \neg_R A, A, B \vdash B \Rightarrow A \Rightarrow R}}{\overline{B \Rightarrow \neg_R A, A, B \vdash A \Rightarrow R}}}{\frac{\overline{B \Rightarrow \neg_R A, A, B \vdash R} \quad \overline{B \Rightarrow \neg_R A, A \vdash \neg_R B}}{\overline{B \Rightarrow \neg_R A \vdash A \Rightarrow \neg_R B}}}$$

(ii)

$$\frac{\overline{A, \neg_R A \vdash A \Rightarrow R} \quad \overline{A, \neg_R A \vdash A}}{\overline{A, \neg_R A \vdash R}} \quad \overline{A \vdash \neg_R \neg_R A}$$

(iii)

$$\frac{\overline{A \Rightarrow B, \neg_R B, A \vdash B \Rightarrow R} \quad \frac{\overline{A \Rightarrow B, \neg_R B, A \vdash A \Rightarrow B} \quad \overline{A \Rightarrow B, \neg_R B, A \vdash A}}{\overline{A \Rightarrow B, \neg_R B, A \vdash B}}}{\frac{\overline{A \Rightarrow B, \neg_R B, A \vdash R} \quad \overline{A \Rightarrow B, \neg_R B \vdash \neg_R A}}{\overline{A \Rightarrow B \vdash \neg_R B \Rightarrow \neg_R A}}}$$

(iv)

$$\frac{\overline{A \Rightarrow B, \neg_R \neg_R A, \neg_R B, A \vdash A \Rightarrow B} \quad \overline{A \Rightarrow B, \neg_R \neg_R A, \neg_R B, A \vdash A}}{(\Pi_0) : A \Rightarrow B, \neg_R \neg_R A, \neg_R B, A \vdash B}$$

$$\frac{\overline{A \Rightarrow B, \neg_R \neg_R A, \neg_R B, A \vdash B \Rightarrow R} \quad \overline{A \Rightarrow B, \neg_R \neg_R A, \neg_R B, A \vdash B}}{\overline{A \Rightarrow B, \neg_R \neg_R A, \neg_R B, A \vdash R}} \quad \Pi_0$$

$$(\Pi_1) : A \Rightarrow B, \neg_R \neg_R A, \neg_R B \vdash A \Rightarrow R$$

$$\frac{\overline{A \Rightarrow B, \neg_R \neg_R A, \neg_R B \vdash A \Rightarrow R \Rightarrow R} \quad \overline{A \Rightarrow B, \neg_R \neg_R A, \neg_R B \vdash A \Rightarrow R}}{\overline{A \Rightarrow B, \neg_R \neg_R A, \neg_R B \vdash R}} \quad \Pi_1$$

$$\frac{\overline{A \Rightarrow B, \neg_R \neg_R A \vdash \neg_R \neg_R B}}{A \Rightarrow B \vdash \neg_R \neg_R A \Rightarrow \neg_R \neg_R B}$$

(v)

$$\frac{\overline{\neg_R \neg_R \neg_R A, A, A \Rightarrow R \vdash A \Rightarrow R} \quad \overline{\neg_R \neg_R \neg_R A, A, A \Rightarrow R \vdash A}}{(\Pi_2) : \neg_R \neg_R \neg_R A, A, A \Rightarrow R \vdash R}$$

$$\frac{\overline{\neg_R \neg_R \neg_R A, A \vdash A \Rightarrow R \Rightarrow R \Rightarrow R} \quad \overline{\neg_R \neg_R \neg_R A, A, A \Rightarrow R \vdash R}}{\overline{\neg_R \neg_R \neg_R A, A \vdash R}} \quad \Pi_2$$

$$\neg_R \neg_R \neg_R A \vdash \neg_R A$$

□

We now define the parametrized translation.

Definition 3. Let R be a formula. The *parametrized negative translation* A^{\neg_R} is defined by induction on A as follows:

$$\begin{aligned} \perp^{\neg_R} &:= R & \top^{\neg_R} &:= \top & (a \doteq b)^{\neg_R} &:= \neg_R \neg_R (a \doteq b) \\ (A \wedge B)^{\neg_R} &:= A^{\neg_R} \wedge B^{\neg_R} & (A \Rightarrow B)^{\neg_R} &:= A^{\neg_R} \Rightarrow B^{\neg_R} \\ (A \vee B)^{\neg_R} &:= \neg_R \neg_R (A^{\neg_R} \vee B^{\neg_R}) \\ (\forall x A)^{\neg_R} &:= \forall x A^{\neg_R} & (\exists x A)^{\neg_R} &:= \neg_R \neg_R (\exists x A^{\neg_R}) \end{aligned}$$

Note that $(\neg A)^{\neg_R} = \neg_R A^{\neg_R}$. We gather here the basic properties of the parametrized translation.

Proposition 4. In intuitionistic logic,

- (i) $\vdash (A \vee \neg A)^{\neg_R}$
- (ii) $R \vdash A^{\neg_R}$
- (iii) $\neg_R \neg_R A^{\neg_R} \vdash A^{\neg_R}$

Proof. (i) We proof this property by induction. We will use intensively these lemmas:

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{\overline{\neg A, A \vdash \neg A} \quad \overline{\neg A, A \vdash A}}{\neg A, A \vdash \perp}}{\neg A, A \vdash \mathbf{R}}}{(\Psi_1) : \neg A \vdash \neg_{\mathbf{R}} A}$$

$(\Psi_2) : A \vdash \neg_{\mathbf{R}} \neg_{\mathbf{R}} A$ (proposition 2 (ii))

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{\overline{\neg_{\mathbf{R}} A \vdash A \Rightarrow \mathbf{R}} \quad \overline{\neg_{\mathbf{R}} A \vdash A}}{\vdots}}{\neg_{\mathbf{R}} A \vdash \mathbf{R}}}{(\Psi_3) : \vdash \neg_{\mathbf{R}} \neg_{\mathbf{R}} A}$$

We will often use this last one with the weakening.

- $A = \top$.

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{\overline{\perp \vdash \perp}}{\perp \vdash \mathbf{R}}}{\vdash (\neg_{\mathbf{R}} \perp)}}{\vdash (\neg_{\mathbf{R}} \top) \vee (\neg_{\mathbf{R}} \perp)} \quad \frac{}{\vdash (\top \vee \neg \top)^{\neg_{\mathbf{R}}}}$$

- $A = \perp$.

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{\overline{\perp \vdash \perp}}{\perp \vdash \mathbf{R}}}{\vdash (\neg_{\mathbf{R}} \perp)}}{\vdash (\perp \Rightarrow \mathbf{R}) \vee (\neg_{\mathbf{R}} \top)} \quad \frac{}{\vdash (\perp \vee \neg \perp)^{\neg_{\mathbf{R}}}}$$

- $A = (a \dot{=} b)$.

$$\frac{\frac{\text{decidability of QF formulas}}{\vdash (a \dot{=} b) \vee (\neg (a \dot{=} b))} \quad \frac{\frac{\Psi_1}{\neg (a \dot{=} b) \vdash \neg_{\mathbf{R}} (a \dot{=} b)}}{(a \dot{=} b) \vdash (a \dot{=} b)}}{(\Pi_3) : \vdash (a \dot{=} b) \vee (\neg_{\mathbf{R}} (a \dot{=} b))}$$

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{\Psi_2}{(a \dot{=} b) \vdash \neg_{\mathbf{R}} \neg_{\mathbf{R}} (a \dot{=} b)}}{(a \dot{=} b) \vdash \neg_{\mathbf{R}} \neg_{\mathbf{R}} (a \dot{=} b) \vee (\neg_{\mathbf{R}} \neg_{\mathbf{R}} \neg_{\mathbf{R}} (a \dot{=} b))} \quad \frac{\frac{\frac{\Psi_2}{\neg_{\mathbf{R}} (a \dot{=} b) \vdash \neg_{\mathbf{R}} \neg_{\mathbf{R}} \neg_{\mathbf{R}} (a \dot{=} b)}}{\neg_{\mathbf{R}} (a \dot{=} b) \vdash \neg_{\mathbf{R}} \neg_{\mathbf{R}} (a \dot{=} b) \vee (\neg_{\mathbf{R}} \neg_{\mathbf{R}} \neg_{\mathbf{R}} (a \dot{=} b))}}{\vdash \neg_{\mathbf{R}} \neg_{\mathbf{R}} (a \dot{=} b) \vee (\neg_{\mathbf{R}} \neg_{\mathbf{R}} \neg_{\mathbf{R}} (a \dot{=} b))} \quad \Pi_3}{\vdash ((a \dot{=} b) \vee \neg (a \dot{=} b))^{\neg_{\mathbf{R}}}}$$

- $A = B \vee C$

$$IH_B : \vdash (B \vee \neg B)^{\neg_{\mathbf{R}}}$$

$$IH_C : \vdash (C \vee \neg C)^{\neg_{\mathbf{R}}}$$

$$\frac{\frac{\overline{B^{\neg_{\mathbf{R}}} \vee C^{\neg_{\mathbf{R}}} \vdash B^{\neg_{\mathbf{R}}} \vee C^{\neg_{\mathbf{R}}}}} \quad \frac{\overline{\neg_{\mathbf{R}} B^{\neg_{\mathbf{R}}}, \neg_{\mathbf{R}} C^{\neg_{\mathbf{R}}}, B^{\neg_{\mathbf{R}}} \vdash B^{\neg_{\mathbf{R}}}}} \quad \frac{\overline{\neg_{\mathbf{R}} B^{\neg_{\mathbf{R}}}, \neg_{\mathbf{R}} C^{\neg_{\mathbf{R}}}, C^{\neg_{\mathbf{R}}} \vdash C^{\neg_{\mathbf{R}}}}}{\neg_{\mathbf{R}} B^{\neg_{\mathbf{R}}}, \neg_{\mathbf{R}} C^{\neg_{\mathbf{R}}}, B^{\neg_{\mathbf{R}}} \vdash \mathbf{R}} \quad \neg_{\mathbf{R}} B^{\neg_{\mathbf{R}}}, \neg_{\mathbf{R}} C^{\neg_{\mathbf{R}}}, C^{\neg_{\mathbf{R}}} \vdash \mathbf{R}}{(\Pi_6) : \neg_{\mathbf{R}} B^{\neg_{\mathbf{R}}}, \neg_{\mathbf{R}} C^{\neg_{\mathbf{R}}}, (B^{\neg_{\mathbf{R}}} \vee C^{\neg_{\mathbf{R}}}) \vdash \mathbf{R}}$$

[illegible]

- $A = B \wedge C$
 $(IH_B) : \vdash (B \vee \neg B)^{\neg R}$
 $(IH_C) : \vdash (C \vee \neg C)^{\neg R}$

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{\frac{B^{\neg\mathsf{R}}, B^{\neg\mathsf{R}} \wedge C^{\neg\mathsf{R}} \vdash B^{\neg\mathsf{R}} \wedge C^{\neg\mathsf{R}}}{B^{\neg\mathsf{R}}, B^{\neg\mathsf{R}} \wedge C^{\neg\mathsf{R}} \vdash C^{\neg\mathsf{R}}}{B^{\neg\mathsf{R}}, \neg C^{\neg\mathsf{R}}, B^{\neg\mathsf{R}} \wedge C^{\neg\mathsf{R}} \vdash \mathsf{R}}}{B^{\neg\mathsf{R}}, \neg C^{\neg\mathsf{R}} \vdash \neg_{\mathsf{R}}(B^{\neg\mathsf{R}} \wedge C^{\neg\mathsf{R}})}}{(\Pi_4) : B^{\neg\mathsf{R}}, \neg_{\mathsf{R}}C^{\neg\mathsf{R}} \vdash (B^{\neg\mathsf{R}} \wedge C^{\neg\mathsf{R}}) \vee \neg_{\mathsf{R}}(B^{\neg\mathsf{R}} \wedge C^{\neg\mathsf{R}})}$$

$$\frac{\frac{IH_C}{\vdash (C \vee \neg C)^{\neg\mathsf{R}}}}{\vdash (C^{\neg\mathsf{R}} \vee \neg_{\mathsf{R}}C^{\neg\mathsf{R}})} \quad \frac{\frac{B^{\neg\mathsf{R}}, C^{\neg\mathsf{R}} \vdash B^{\neg\mathsf{R}}}{B^{\neg\mathsf{R}}, C^{\neg\mathsf{R}} \vdash B^{\neg\mathsf{R}} \wedge C^{\neg\mathsf{R}}} \quad \frac{B^{\neg\mathsf{R}}, C^{\neg\mathsf{R}} \vdash C^{\neg\mathsf{R}}}{B^{\neg\mathsf{R}}, C^{\neg\mathsf{R}} \vdash (B^{\neg\mathsf{R}} \wedge C^{\neg\mathsf{R}}) \vee \neg_{\mathsf{R}}(B^{\neg\mathsf{R}} \wedge C^{\neg\mathsf{R}})}}{\Pi_4} \quad \frac{\vdash (C^{\neg\mathsf{R}} \vee \neg_{\mathsf{R}}C^{\neg\mathsf{R}}) \quad \Pi_4}{\Pi_5 : B^{\neg\mathsf{R}} \vdash (B^{\neg\mathsf{R}} \wedge C^{\neg\mathsf{R}}) \vee \neg_{\mathsf{R}}(B^{\neg\mathsf{R}} \wedge C^{\neg\mathsf{R}})}$$

$$\begin{array}{c}
\frac{IH_B}{\vdash (B \vee \neg B)^{\neg R}} \quad \frac{\frac{\frac{B^{\neg R} \wedge C^{\neg R} \vdash B^{\neg R} \wedge C^{\neg R}}{B^{\neg R} \wedge C^{\neg R} \vdash B^{\neg R}}}{\neg_R B^{\neg R}, B^{\neg R} \wedge C^{\neg R} \vdash R}}{\neg_R B^{\neg R} \vdash \neg_R (B^{\neg R} \wedge C^{\neg R})} \\
\frac{\vdash B^{\neg R} \vee \neg_R B^{\neg R} \quad \frac{B^{\neg R} \vdash (B^{\neg R} \wedge C^{\neg R}) \vee \neg_R (B^{\neg R} \wedge C^{\neg R}) \quad \neg_R B^{\neg R} \vdash (B^{\neg R} \wedge C^{\neg R}) \vee \neg_R (B^{\neg R} \wedge C^{\neg R})}{\vdash (B^{\neg R} \wedge C^{\neg R}) \vee \neg_R (B^{\neg R} \wedge C^{\neg R})}}{\Psi_3} \\
\vdash ((B \wedge C) \vee \neg(B \wedge C))^{\neg R}
\end{array}$$

- $A = B \Rightarrow C$

$$(IH_B) : \vdash (B \vee \neg B)^{\neg R}$$

$$(IH_C) : \vdash (C \vee \neg C)^{\neg R}$$

We use here the property (ii) $R \vdash A^{\neg R}$. It is possible to do so because the proof of (ii) does not relies on the proof of (i).

$$\begin{array}{c}
\frac{\neg_R B^{\neg R}, \neg_R C^{\neg R}, B^{\neg R} \vdash B^{\neg R} \quad \neg_R B^{\neg R}, \neg_R C^{\neg R}, B^{\neg R} \vdash \neg_R B^{\neg R}}{(ii) : \neg_R B^{\neg R}, \neg_R C^{\neg R}, B^{\neg R} \vdash R} \\
\frac{\neg_R B^{\neg R}, \neg_R C^{\neg R}, B^{\neg R} \vdash C^{\neg R}}{\neg_R B^{\neg R}, \neg_R C^{\neg R} \vdash B^{\neg R} \Rightarrow C^{\neg R}} \\
(Pi_8) : \neg_R B^{\neg R}, \neg_R C^{\neg R} \vdash (B \Rightarrow C)^{\neg R}
\end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{c}
\frac{B^{\neg R}, \neg_R C^{\neg R}, B^{\neg R} \Rightarrow C^{\neg R} \vdash B^{\neg R} \quad B^{\neg R} \Rightarrow C^{\neg R} \vdash B^{\neg R} \Rightarrow C^{\neg R}}{B^{\neg R}, \neg_R C^{\neg R}, B^{\neg R} \Rightarrow C^{\neg R} \vdash C^{\neg R}} \quad \neg_R C^{\neg R} \vdash \neg_R C^{\neg R} \\
\frac{B^{\neg R}, \neg_R C^{\neg R}, B^{\neg R} \Rightarrow C^{\neg R} \vdash R}{B^{\neg R}, \neg_R C^{\neg R} \vdash \neg_R (B^{\neg R} \Rightarrow C^{\neg R})} \\
(\Pi_7) : B^{\neg R}, \neg_R C^{\neg R} \vdash \neg_R (B \Rightarrow C)^{\neg R}
\end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{c}
\frac{IH_B}{\vdash (B \vee \neg B)^{\neg R}} \quad \frac{\vdash B^{\neg R} \vee \neg_R B^{\neg R} \quad \frac{B^{\neg R}, \neg_R C^{\neg R} \vdash (B \Rightarrow C)^{\neg R} \vee \neg_R (B \Rightarrow C)^{\neg R} \quad \neg_R B^{\neg R}, \neg_R C^{\neg R} \vdash (B \Rightarrow C)^{\neg R} \vee \neg_R (B \Rightarrow C)^{\neg R}}{(\Pi_6) : \neg_R C^{\neg R} \vdash (B \Rightarrow C)^{\neg R} \vee \neg_R (B \Rightarrow C)^{\neg R}} \\
\Pi_7 \quad \Pi_8
\end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{c}
\frac{IH_C}{\vdash (C \vee \neg C)^{\neg R}} \quad \frac{\frac{C^{\neg R}, B^{\neg R} \vdash C^{\neg R}}{C^{\neg R} \vdash B^{\neg R} \Rightarrow C^{\neg R}}}{C^{\neg R} \vdash (B \Rightarrow C)^{\neg R}} \quad \Pi_6 \\
\frac{\vdash C^{\neg R} \vee \neg_R C^{\neg R} \quad C^{\neg R} \vdash (B \Rightarrow C)^{\neg R} \vee \neg_R (B \Rightarrow C)^{\neg R} \quad \neg_R C^{\neg R} \vdash (B \Rightarrow C)^{\neg R} \vee \neg_R (B \Rightarrow C)^{\neg R}}{\vdash (B \Rightarrow C)^{\neg R} \vee \neg_R (B \Rightarrow C)^{\neg R}} \\
\frac{\vdash \neg_R \neg_R ((B \Rightarrow C)^{\neg R} \vee \neg_R (B \Rightarrow C)^{\neg R})}{\vdash ((B \Rightarrow C) \vee \neg(B \Rightarrow C))^{\neg R}}
\end{array}$$

- $A = \forall x B$

$$IH_B : \vdash (B \vee \neg B)^{\neg R}$$

$$\begin{array}{c}
\frac{IH_B}{\vdash (B \vee \neg_R B)^{\neg_R}} \quad \frac{\overline{B^{\neg_R} \vdash B^{\neg_R}}}{\overline{B^{\neg_R} \vdash \forall x B^{\neg_R}}} \quad \frac{\overline{\forall x B^{\neg_R} \vdash B^{\neg_R}} \quad \overline{\neg_R B^{\neg_R} \vdash \neg_R B^{\neg_R}}}{\overline{\neg_R B^{\neg_R}, \forall x B^{\neg_R} \vdash R}} \\
\vdash B^{\neg_R} \vee \neg_R B^{\neg_R} \quad B^{\neg_R} \vdash (\forall x B)^{\neg_R} \vee \neg_R (\forall x B)^{\neg_R} \quad \neg_R B^{\neg_R} \vdash (\forall x B)^{\neg_R} \vee \neg_R (\forall x B)^{\neg_R} \\
\vdash (\forall x B)^{\neg_R} \vee \neg_R (\forall x B)^{\neg_R} \\
\vdash \neg_R \neg_R ((\forall x B)^{\neg_R} \vee \neg_R (\forall x B)^{\neg_R}) \\
\vdash ((\forall x B) \vee \neg(\forall x B))^{\neg_R}
\end{array}$$

- $A = \exists x B$
 $IH_B : \vdash (B \vee \neg B)^{\neg_R}$

$$\begin{array}{c}
\frac{IH_B}{\vdash (B \vee \neg_R B)^{\neg_R}} \quad \frac{\overline{B^{\neg_R} \vdash B^{\neg_R}}}{\overline{B^{\neg_R} \vdash \exists x B^{\neg_R}}} \quad \frac{\overline{\exists x B^{\neg_R} \vdash \exists x B^{\neg_R}} \quad \overline{B^{\neg_R} \vdash B^{\neg_R}} \quad \overline{\neg_R B^{\neg_R}, \vdash \neg_R B^{\neg_R}}}{\overline{\neg_R B^{\neg_R}, \exists x B^{\neg_R} \vdash R}} \\
\vdash B^{\neg_R} \vee \neg_R B^{\neg_R} \quad B^{\neg_R} \vdash (\exists x B)^{\neg_R} \vee \neg_R (\exists x B)^{\neg_R} \quad \neg_R B^{\neg_R} \vdash (\exists x B)^{\neg_R} \vee \neg_R (\exists x B)^{\neg_R} \\
\vdash (\exists x B)^{\neg_R} \vee \neg_R (\exists x B)^{\neg_R} \\
\vdash \neg_R \neg_R ((\exists x B)^{\neg_R} \vee \neg_R (\exists x B)^{\neg_R}) \\
\vdash ((\exists x B) \vee \neg(\exists x B))^{\neg_R}
\end{array}$$

(ii) We proof this property by induction on A and we denote by IH the induction hypothesis.

- $A = \perp$

$$\overline{\mathbf{R} \vdash \mathbf{R}}$$

- $A = \top$

$$\overline{\mathbf{R} \vdash \top}$$

- $A = (a \doteq b)$

$$\frac{\overline{\mathbf{R}, \neg_R(a \doteq b) \vdash \mathbf{R}}}{\mathbf{R} \vdash (a \doteq b)^{\neg_R}}$$

- $A = B \wedge C$

$$\frac{\frac{IH}{\mathbf{R} \vdash B^{\neg_R}} \quad \frac{IH}{\mathbf{R} \vdash C^{\neg_R}}}{\mathbf{R} \vdash B^{\neg_R} \wedge C^{\neg_R}}$$

- $A = B \Rightarrow C$

$$\frac{\frac{IH}{\mathbf{R}, B^{\neg_R} \vdash C^{\neg_R}}}{\mathbf{R} \vdash B^{\neg_R} \Rightarrow C^{\neg_R}}$$

- $A = B \vee C$

$$\frac{\overline{\mathbf{R}, \neg_R(B^{\neg_R} \vee C^{\neg_R}) \vdash \mathbf{R}}}{\mathbf{R} \vdash \neg_R \neg_R(B^{\neg_R} \vee C^{\neg_R})}$$

- $A = \forall x B$

$$\frac{\frac{IH}{\mathbf{R} \vdash B^{\neg_R}}}{\mathbf{R} \vdash \forall x B^{\neg_R}}$$

- $A = \exists x B$

$$\frac{\overline{\mathbf{R}, \neg_R(\exists x B^{\neg_R}) \vdash \mathbf{R}}}{\mathbf{R} \vdash \neg_R \neg_R(\exists x B^{\neg_R})}$$

So, $R \vdash A^{\neg R}$

(iii) We proof this property by induction on A and we denote by IH the induction hypothesis.

- $A = \perp$

$$\frac{\frac{}{\neg_R \neg_R R \vdash R \Rightarrow R \Rightarrow R} \quad \frac{\overline{\neg_R \neg_R R, R \vdash R}}{\neg_R \neg_R R \vdash R \Rightarrow R}}{\frac{\neg_R \neg_R R \vdash R}{\neg_R \neg_R \perp^{\neg R} \vdash \perp^{\neg R}}}$$

- $A = \top$

$$\frac{\overline{\neg_R \neg_R \top^{\neg R} \vdash \top}}{\neg_R \neg_R \top^{\neg R} \vdash \top^{\neg R}}$$

- $A = (a \dot{=} b)$

$$\frac{\text{Proposition 2 (v)}}{\frac{\neg_R \neg_R \neg_R (\neg_R (a \dot{=} b)) \vdash \neg_R (\neg_R (a \dot{=} b))}{\neg_R \neg_R (a \dot{=} b)^{\neg R} \vdash (a \dot{=} b)^{\neg R}}}$$

- $A = B \wedge C$

$$\frac{\frac{}{\neg_R \neg_R (B \wedge C)^{\neg R}, \neg_R B^{\neg R}, (B \wedge C)^{\neg R} \vdash \neg_R B^{\neg R}} \quad \frac{\overline{\neg_R \neg_R (B \wedge C)^{\neg R}, \neg_R B^{\neg R}, (B \wedge C)^{\neg R} \vdash B^{\neg R} \wedge C^{\neg R}}}{\frac{\neg_R \neg_R (B \wedge C)^{\neg R}, \neg_R B^{\neg R}, (B \wedge C)^{\neg R} \vdash B^{\neg R}}{(\Theta_2) : \neg_R \neg_R (B \wedge C)^{\neg R}, \neg_R B^{\neg R} \vdash \neg_R (B \wedge C)^{\neg R}}}$$

$$\frac{\overline{\neg_R \neg_R (B \wedge C)^{\neg R}, \neg_R B^{\neg R} \vdash \neg_R \neg_R (B \wedge C)^{\neg R}} \quad \Theta_2}{\frac{\neg_R \neg_R (B \wedge C)^{\neg R}, \neg_R B^{\neg R} \vdash R}{(\Theta_3) : \neg_R \neg_R (B \wedge C)^{\neg R} \vdash \neg_R \neg_R B^{\neg R}}}$$

$$\frac{\text{IH}_B}{\frac{\overline{\neg_R \neg_R (B \wedge C)^{\neg R}, \neg_R \neg_R B^{\neg R} \vdash B^{\neg R}}}{\Theta_3 \quad \frac{\neg_R \neg_R (B \wedge C)^{\neg R} \vdash \neg_R \neg_R B^{\neg R} \Rightarrow B^{\neg R}}{(\Theta_4) : \neg_R \neg_R (B \wedge C)^{\neg R} \vdash B^{\neg R}}}}$$

$$\frac{\frac{}{\neg_R \neg_R (B \wedge C)^{\neg R}, \neg_R C^{\neg R}, (B \wedge C)^{\neg R} \vdash \neg_R C^{\neg R}} \quad \frac{\overline{\neg_R \neg_R (B \wedge C)^{\neg R}, \neg_R C^{\neg R}, (B \wedge C)^{\neg R} \vdash B^{\neg R} \wedge C^{\neg R}}}{\frac{\neg_R \neg_R (B \wedge C)^{\neg R}, \neg_R C^{\neg R}, (B \wedge C)^{\neg R} \vdash R}{(\Theta_5) : \neg_R \neg_R (B \wedge C)^{\neg R}, \neg_R C^{\neg R} \vdash \neg_R (B \wedge C)^{\neg R}}}$$

$$\frac{\overline{\neg_R \neg_R (B \wedge C)^{\neg R}, \neg_R C^{\neg R} \vdash \neg_R \neg_R (B \wedge C)^{\neg R}} \quad \Theta_5}{\frac{\neg_R \neg_R (B \wedge C)^{\neg R}, \neg_R C^{\neg R} \vdash R}{(\Theta_6) : \neg_R \neg_R (B \wedge C)^{\neg R} \vdash \neg_R \neg_R C^{\neg R}}}$$

$$\frac{\text{IH}_C}{\frac{\overline{\neg_R \neg_R (B \wedge C)^{\neg R}, \neg_R \neg_R C^{\neg R} \vdash C^{\neg R}}}{\Theta_6 \quad \frac{\neg_R \neg_R (B \wedge C)^{\neg R} \vdash \neg_R \neg_R C^{\neg R} \Rightarrow C^{\neg R}}{(\Theta_7) : \neg_R \neg_R (B \wedge C)^{\neg R} \vdash C^{\neg R}}}}$$

$$\frac{\Theta_4 \quad \Theta_7}{\frac{\neg_R \neg_R (B \wedge C)^{\neg_R} \vdash B^{\neg_R} \wedge C^{\neg_R}}{\neg_R \neg_R (B \wedge C)^{\neg_R} \vdash (B \wedge C)^{\neg_R}}}$$

- $A = B \Rightarrow C$

$$\frac{\frac{\text{todo}}{\neg_R \neg_R (B \Rightarrow C)^{\neg_R}, B^{\neg_R} \vdash C^{\neg_R}}}{\frac{\neg_R \neg_R (B \Rightarrow C)^{\neg_R} \vdash B^{\neg_R} \Rightarrow C^{\neg_R}}{\neg_R \neg_R (B \Rightarrow C)^{\neg_R} \vdash (B \Rightarrow C)^{\neg_R}}}$$

- $A = B \vee C$

$$\frac{\text{Proposition 2 (v)}}{\frac{\neg_R \neg_R \neg_R (\neg_R (B^{\neg_R} \vee C^{\neg_R})) \vdash \neg_R (\neg_R (B^{\neg_R} \vee C^{\neg_R}))}{\neg_R \neg_R (B \vee C)^{\neg_R} \vdash (B \vee C)^{\neg_R}}}$$

- $A = \forall x B$

$$\frac{\frac{IH}{\neg_R \neg_R \forall x B^{\neg_R} \vdash B^{\neg_R}}}{\neg_R \neg_R \forall x B^{\neg_R} \vdash \forall x B^{\neg_R}}$$

- $A = \exists x B$

$$\frac{\text{Proposition 2 (v)}}{\frac{\neg_R \neg_R \neg_R (\neg_R (\exists x B^{\neg_R})) \vdash \neg_R (\neg_R (\exists x B^{\neg_R}))}{\neg_R \neg_R (\exists x B)^{\neg_R} \vdash (\exists x B)^{\neg_R}}}$$

So, $\neg_R \neg_R A^{\neg_R} \vdash A^{\neg_R}$

□

Theorem 5. If $\vdash A$ is derivable in classical predicate logic and if no free variable of R occurs in the derivation, then $\vdash A^{\neg_R}$ is derivable in intuitionistic predicate logic.

Proof. Every rules except excluded middle are the same so we just keep them (and we replace all expression X to X^{\neg_R}) in order to get a derivation of $\vdash A^{\neg_R}$ from a derivation of $\vdash A$. It works because there is no free occurrences of R .

For the excluded middle rule we rewrite:

$$\frac{\vdots}{\frac{\Gamma, \neg A \vdash \perp}{\Gamma \vdash A}}$$

to:

$$\frac{\frac{\text{proposition 4 (i)}}{\vdash (A \wedge \neg A)^{\neg_R}} \quad \frac{\vdots}{\Gamma, \neg_R A^{\neg_R} \vdash \perp}}{\frac{\Gamma \vdash (A \wedge \neg A)^{\neg_R} \quad \Gamma, A^{\neg_R} \vdash A^{\neg_R} \quad \Gamma, \neg_R A^{\neg_R} \vdash A^{\neg_R}}{\Gamma \vdash A^{\neg_R}}}$$

□

Theorem 6. If $PA \vdash A$ and if no free variable of R occurs in the derivation, then $HA \vdash A^{\neg_R}$.

Proof. 1. Injectivity of S

$$\frac{\frac{\neg_R \neg_R S(x) \dot{=} S(y), \neg_R x \dot{=} y, S(x) \dot{=} S(y) \vdash S(x) \dot{=} S(y)}{(\Xi_1) : \neg_R \neg_R S(x) \dot{=} S(y), \neg_R x \dot{=} y, S(x) \dot{=} S(y) \vdash x \dot{=} y}}{\vdash S(x) \dot{=} S(y) \Rightarrow x \dot{=} y}}$$

$$\frac{\frac{\overline{\neg_{\mathbf{R}} \neg_{\mathbf{R}} S(x) \dot{=} S(y)}, \neg_{\mathbf{R}} x \dot{=} y, S(x) \dot{=} S(y) \vdash \neg_{\mathbf{R}} x \dot{=} y} \quad \Xi_1}{\frac{\neg_{\mathbf{R}} \neg_{\mathbf{R}} S(x) \dot{=} S(y), \neg_{\mathbf{R}} x \dot{=} y, S(x) \dot{=} S(y) \vdash \mathbf{R}}{(\Xi_2) : \neg_{\mathbf{R}} \neg_{\mathbf{R}} S(x) \dot{=} S(y), \neg_{\mathbf{R}} x \dot{=} y \vdash \neg_{\mathbf{R}} S(x) \dot{=} S(y)}}$$

$$\frac{\frac{\overline{\neg_{\mathbf{R}} \neg_{\mathbf{R}} S(x) \dot{=} S(y) \vdash \neg_{\mathbf{R}} \neg_{\mathbf{R}} S(x) \dot{=} S(y)} \quad \Xi_2}{\frac{\neg_{\mathbf{R}} \neg_{\mathbf{R}} S(x) \dot{=} S(y), \neg_{\mathbf{R}} x \dot{=} y \vdash \mathbf{R}}{\neg_{\mathbf{R}} \neg_{\mathbf{R}} S(x) \dot{=} S(y) \vdash \neg_{\mathbf{R}} \neg_{\mathbf{R}} x \dot{=} y}}}{\frac{\vdash \neg_{\mathbf{R}} \neg_{\mathbf{R}} S(x) \dot{=} S(y) \Rightarrow \neg_{\mathbf{R}} \neg_{\mathbf{R}} x \dot{=} y}{\vdash \forall x y (\neg_{\mathbf{R}} \neg_{\mathbf{R}} S(x) \dot{=} S(y) \Rightarrow \neg_{\mathbf{R}} \neg_{\mathbf{R}} x \dot{=} y)}}}{\vdash (\forall x y (S(x) \dot{=} S(y) \Rightarrow x \dot{=} y)) \neg_{\mathbf{R}}}$$

2. Non confusion

$$\frac{\frac{\frac{\overline{\neg_{\mathbf{R}} \neg_{\mathbf{R}} S(x) \dot{=} 0, S(x) \dot{=} 0 \vdash S(x) \dot{=} 0} \quad \frac{\overline{\vdash \neg \forall x S(x) \dot{=} 0}}{\vdash \neg S(x) \dot{=} 0}}{\frac{\neg_{\mathbf{R}} \neg_{\mathbf{R}} S(x) \dot{=} 0, S(x) \dot{=} 0 \vdash \perp}{\neg_{\mathbf{R}} \neg_{\mathbf{R}} S(x) \dot{=} 0, S(x) \dot{=} 0 \vdash \mathbf{R}}}}{\frac{\neg_{\mathbf{R}} \neg_{\mathbf{R}} S(x) \dot{=} 0 \vdash \neg_{\mathbf{R}} S(x) \dot{=} 0}{\neg_{\mathbf{R}} \neg_{\mathbf{R}} S(x) \dot{=} 0 \vdash \neg_{\mathbf{R}} \neg_{\mathbf{R}} S(x) \dot{=} 0}}}{\frac{\neg_{\mathbf{R}} \neg_{\mathbf{R}} S(x) \dot{=} 0 \vdash \mathbf{R}}{\vdash \neg_{\mathbf{R}} \neg_{\mathbf{R}} \neg_{\mathbf{R}} S(x) \dot{=} 0}}}{\frac{\vdash \forall x \neg_{\mathbf{R}} \neg_{\mathbf{R}} \neg_{\mathbf{R}} S(x) \dot{=} 0}{\vdash (\forall x \neg S(x) \dot{=} 0) \neg_{\mathbf{R}}}}$$

3. Induction Scheme

$$\frac{\frac{\vdash A[0/x] \neg_{\mathbf{R}} \Rightarrow \forall y (A[y/x] \neg_{\mathbf{R}} \Rightarrow A[S(y)/x] \neg_{\mathbf{R}}) \Rightarrow A \neg_{\mathbf{R}} \quad \overline{A[0/x] \neg_{\mathbf{R}} \vdash A[0/x] \neg_{\mathbf{R}}}}{(\Xi_3) : A[0/x] \neg_{\mathbf{R}}, \forall y (A[y/x] \neg_{\mathbf{R}} \Rightarrow A[S(y)/x] \neg_{\mathbf{R}}) \vdash \forall y (A[y/x] \neg_{\mathbf{R}} \Rightarrow A[S(y)/x] \neg_{\mathbf{R}}) \Rightarrow A \neg_{\mathbf{R}}}}{\Xi_3 \quad \frac{\overline{\forall y (A[y/x] \neg_{\mathbf{R}} \Rightarrow A[S(y)/x] \neg_{\mathbf{R}}) \vdash \forall y (A[y/x] \neg_{\mathbf{R}} \Rightarrow A[S(y)/x] \neg_{\mathbf{R}})}}{\frac{A[0/x] \neg_{\mathbf{R}}, \forall y (A[y/x] \neg_{\mathbf{R}} \Rightarrow A[S(y)/x] \neg_{\mathbf{R}}) \vdash A \neg_{\mathbf{R}}}{\frac{A[0/x] \neg_{\mathbf{R}}, \forall y (A[y/x] \neg_{\mathbf{R}} \Rightarrow A[S(y)/x] \neg_{\mathbf{R}}) \vdash \forall x A \neg_{\mathbf{R}}}{\frac{A[0/x] \neg_{\mathbf{R}} \vdash \forall y (A[y/x] \neg_{\mathbf{R}} \Rightarrow A[S(y)/x] \neg_{\mathbf{R}}) \Rightarrow \forall x A \neg_{\mathbf{R}}}{\vdash A[0/x] \neg_{\mathbf{R}} \Rightarrow \forall y (A[y/x] \neg_{\mathbf{R}} \Rightarrow A[S(y)/x] \neg_{\mathbf{R}}) \Rightarrow \forall x A \neg_{\mathbf{R}}}}}}{\vdash (A[0/x] \Rightarrow \forall y (A[y/x] \Rightarrow A[S(y)/x]) \Rightarrow \forall x A) \neg_{\mathbf{R}}}}$$

□

Theorem 7. If $PA \vdash \forall x, \exists y : (a \dot{=} b)$ then $HA \vdash \forall x, \exists y : (a \dot{=} b)$.

Proof. Let us write $F \forall x, G$ where G is a Σ_1^0 formula. By using $(\forall E)$, if F is provable with PA , so G too. As G is Σ_1^0 , G is provable with HA . By using $(\forall I)$, we deduce that F is provable with HA too. □