Marcello Di Bello

Lehman College CUNY

PHI 169 - Spring 2015

Relevance of the Premises for the Conclusion of an Argument

Which Premise is Not Relevant for the Conclusion? (I)

Premise (1): If one kills another human being, he deserves to be killed.

Premise (2): Mark killed another human being.

Premise (3): The death penalty can prevent crime.

Conclusion (C): Mark deserves to be killed.

**Premise (3)
is not relevant:**

*The conclusion talks about Mark's **deserving** to be killed. The conclusion does not talk about whether putting Mark to death can prevent crime.*

Which Premise is Not Relevant for the Conclusion? (II)

> **Premise (1)**: If one kills another human being, he will kill again.
> **Premises (2)**: Mark killed another human being.
> **Premise (3)**: The death penalty can prevent crime.
> **Conclusion (C):** Mark will kill again.

Premise (3) is not relevant.

The conclusion talks about Mark killing again. The conclusion does not talk about whether putting Mark to death can prevent crime.

Which Premise is Not Relevant for the Conclusion? (III)

Premise (1): Health insurance is expensive.

Premises (2): Young people do not need health insurance.

Premise (3): Young people earn little money.

Conclusion (C): Young people cannot afford health insurance.

Premise (2) is not relevant.

The conclusion talks about young people being able to afford health insurance. The conclusion does not talk about whether young people need it or not.

Back to *Fox News* and Bill O'Reilly

Police Officers Do Not Kill Often

"According to FBI statistics for 2012, there were 12 million arrests of which only 400 involved fatal shooting." (That's 0.0033 percent of 12 million)

O'Reilly is telling us that police officers kill citizens only rarely.

But are these statistics at all relevant?

Are they relevant for the question *whether the officer was justified in killing MB?*

Are they relevant for the question *whether police officers disproportionately kill blacks?*

Black-on-Black Homicide Statistics

"The truth is that 91 % of black homicide victims are killed by other blacks"

O'Reilly is telling us that blacks are mostly killed by other blacks.

But are these statistics at all relevant?

Are they relevant for the question *whether the officer was justified in killing MB?*

Are they relevant for the question *whether police officers disproportionately kill blacks?*