

Same Sex Marriage

Marcello Di Bello

Lehman College CUNY

PHI 169 - Fall 2014



Arguments in Favor of Same Sex Marriage

- Prohibiting same sex marriage is discriminatory
- Marriage gives financial benefits, tax breaks, inheritance rights etc. to married couples. Why deny this to same sex couples?
- Banning same sex marriage perpetrates a stigma against homosexuals

What If Someone Told you that **Real Marriage** is ONLY Between a Man and a Woman?

A response can be found in
“The Best Argument Against
Gay Marriage. And Why It
Fails” by By Kenji Yoshino,
December 2010, *Slate*

Common Procreation Argument

ARGUMENT: Marriage is only between a man and a woman **because** the ability (*at least in principle*) to procreate is a necessary condition for marriage.

OBJECTION:
What about heterosexual couples who cannot procreate? Can't they marry still?

Now a Refinement of the Common Procreation Argument

Alan Keynes



<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=KrD8zvCUtWc>

Keynes' Argument

1. Historically, the only reason why the institution of marriage was created was to regulate the rights and obligations pertaining to the procreation of children.

2. So, a necessary condition of marriage is that it is—*in principle*—geared toward procreation.

3. So, marriage is only between a man and a woman.

Keynes'
argument
rests on a
**definition of
the purpose
of marriage
based on
history**

But...

Besides a definition, can there be other considerations that weigh in favor or against same sex marriage?

Examples:

- psychological advantages or disadvantages of same sex marriage
- economic advantages or disadvantages
- harms or benefits to individual or society

Judge Posner (August 2014) on the Indiana and Wisconsin Bans Against Same Sex Marriage

Background

Both Indiana and Wisconsin have same sex marriage bans.

Married couples enjoy health and social benefits that unmarried couples do not enjoy.

Both states do not ban adoption by same sex couples.

"It's a matter of indifference to you"

"You should want to enlist people as adopters"

*"Who's being harmed?
Answer my question!"*

Judge Posner's Point in Brief

By allowing same sex people to marry, we do change the old definition of marriage.

But besides a change in definition, **are there any tangible harms resulting from legalizing same sex marriage?** *If so, what are they?*