

## UTFA Council Agenda

April 6, 2017 – 1:00 – 3:00 p.m.

OISE Auditorium  
252 Bloor Street West

- 
1. Approval of the Agenda
  2. Minutes of Previous Meetings
    - a. March 21, 2017 \*
  3. Business Arising
    - a. From the Minutes of Council
    - b. From the Summary of the Minutes of the Executive Committee
      - i. March 8, 2017 \*
  4. Announcements (5 mins.)
  5. Report of the President (40 mins.)
    - a. A motion proposing that the Pension Discussions Committee negotiate a multi-employer jointly sponsored pension plan (JSPP).

The Executive Committee recommends to Council that:

UTFA's Pension Discussion Committee, approved at the February 2017 meeting of UTFA Council, be mandated to enter into further discussions and negotiations on a multi-employer jointly sponsored pension plan (JSPP) with the relevant administrations and unions at U of T, Queen's University, and Guelph University. The new committee will be called the UTFA Pension Negotiating Team. The result of this negotiation would go to the general membership for ratification, not before the fall term 2017. If the Ontario government does not confirm that there will be solvency relief for new multi-employer JSPPs, the UTFA Pension Negotiating Team will cease its work and return to UTFA Council for instruction.

The members of the proposed UTFA Pension Negotiating Team are as follows, in alphabetical order: Jennifer Jenkins, Jody Macdonald, Ken MacDonald, Cynthia Messenger, Marcin Peski, Harriet Sonne de Torrens, Terezia Zoric.

- b. AGM
  - c. Pension education (C. Messenger and J. Jenkins)
  - d. Asbestos task force (T. Zoric)
  - e. Post-doctoral fellows at USMC (M. Attridge) (5 mins)
  - f. Other matters
6. Report of the Chair of the Nominating Committee (5 mins.)
- a. Announcement of open positions:  
VP University & External Affairs, Chair of the Appointments Committee,  
Chair of the Membership Committee, Treasurer
7. Report of the Chair of the Membership Committee (10 mins.)
- a. Pension education: town halls on the three campuses and discussion groups in departments
  - b. Open access events
8. Reports from the Members-at-Large
- a. Report on events featuring Richard Freishtat, April 3 and 4 (C. Evans) (5 mins.)
  - b. Report on March for Science, April 22 (A. Moetsch) (5 mins.)
9. Reports from the Floor of Council
10. Other Business
- a. Next meeting of Council  
Thursday, May 18, 2017  
3:00 to 5:00 p.m.  
Room 1065, Rotman School of Management, 105 St. George Street
11. Adjournment
- \*materials attached



720 Spadina Avenue, Suite 419  
Toronto, ON M5S 2T9

T 416 978-3351 F 416 978-7061  
E [faculty@utfa.org](mailto:faculty@utfa.org) / [www.utfa.org](http://www.utfa.org)

## UTFA Council Minutes

March 21, 2017 – 3:00–5:00 p.m.

Room 374, Rotman School of Management  
105 St. George Street

---

### Present:

**Executive:** M. Attridge, K. Banning, E. Damiano, C. Evans, R. Gillis, J. Jenkins, L. Kohn, K. MacDonald, C. Messenger, K. Weaver, T. Zoric

**Present:** E. Barbeau, D. Bar-Natan, K. Bickmore, A. Braun, D. Cooper, E. Fillion, L. Florence, P. Gavreau, P. Hamel, J. Hanssen, A. Hojatollah Taleghani, B. MacDonald, J. Macdonald, J. Nogami, M. Peski, K. Rankin, H. Rodd, L. Shade, V. Skelton

**Regrets:** J. Berkovitz, L. Chen, C. Guberman, A. Guttman, D. Heap, R. Helms-Park, B. McDonagh, A. Motsch, J. Poë, L. Rudin, R. Sarabia, K. Scheaffer, L. Stewart Rose, L. Vaage, N. Wiseman

**Absent:** L. Austin, J. Lanca, S. Prudham, D. Seitler, W. Smieliauskas, S. Smith, H. Sonne de Torrens, A. White

**Also Present:** H. Diggle (General Counsel)  
M. Horban (Business Officer)  
A. Lo (Communications, Outreach Campaign Support Officer)  
J. Newman (Speaker)  
S. Olexson (Counsel)  
R. Schmelzer (Grievance Assistant and Note Taker)  
A. Wright (Administrative Assistant and Note Taker)

J. Newman called the meeting to order at 3:15 p.m.

1. Approval of the Agenda

It was duly moved and seconded that:

the agenda be approved as distributed.

Carried.

2. Minutes of Previous Meetings

a. February 15, 2017 \*

It was duly moved and seconded that:

the minutes of the February 15, 2017, Council meeting be approved as distributed.

Carried.

3. Business Arising

a. From the Minutes of Council

b. From the Summary of the Minutes of the Executive Committee

i. January 12, 2017 \*

ii. January 25, 2017 \*

There was no business arising from the minutes of Council or of the Executive Committee.

4. Announcements (5 min)

There were no announcements.

5. Report of the Vice-President, Salary, Benefits, Pensions and Workload (15 min)

J. Nogami seconded by J. Jenkins moved that

the meeting go in camera.

Carried.

J. Macdonald seconded by L. Kohn, moved that

the meeting go ex camera.

Carried.

K. Macdonald, seconded by L. Kohn, moved that the bargaining proposal, as presented, be approved.

Carried.

6. Report of the President (10 min)

a. Pensions – direction and timeline

C. Messenger, seconded by K. Banning, moved that the following names be added to the ad hoc committee: H. Sonne de Torrens, and J. Jenkins.

Carried.

C. Messenger then offered remarks regarding securing the UofT Pension Plan. She said that UTFA has been working on the possibility of pension reform for at least two years, with members sitting on both the University Pension Committee and the Joint Working Committee. The goal of the JWC, from its

inception, was to work with other groups, such as CUPE and Steelworkers, on exploring conversion to a jointly sponsored pension plan.

With the next provincial election visible on the horizon, pressure has grown to act on pension reform. The Conservatives have in the past indicated a strong preference for defined contribution (DC) pension plans.

C. Messenger said she has been persuaded in recent months that for governance reasons alone, the JSPP, with shared responsibility for planning and governance, on a sponsor board, is preferable to the governance currently in place, in which the University Administration is largely in control. As UofT's premiums rise, the employees are moving closer to the 50% contribution to the plan that should be, in her opinion, accompanied by joint governance. This kind of governance will bring a shared risk: a shortfall in pension funding under a JSPP would clearly mean that increases in premiums and/or cuts in future benefits would have to occur. Both the employee and the employer sides of the sponsor board would have to agree on any such measures.

C. Messenger noted that the U of T administration is clearly seeking relief from solvency payments, and this is its main motivation for wanting to convert to a JSPP. The Administration would lose sole control over the management of the pension plan, but believes nevertheless that moving forward with a JSPP is safer than standing still.

At the end of her remarks, C. Messenger announced the guests who were joining the meeting for the second hour to answer questions: the Administration's actuary, UTFA's actuary, and UTFA's pension lawyer, Darrell Brown. She also introduced Sue Wurtele, a faculty member at Trent University, who would speak about the history of the University Pension Project.

b. Proposed changes to Bylaws

i. Executive Director \*

C. Messenger said that last year the Council approved these changes but because we did not have quorum at the AGM, we could not change the Bylaws. She added that approval of the proposed changes would make it possible to hire an Executive Director.

ii. Executive Recall \*

C. Messenger explained that S. Prudham introduced recall language because there were no means to recall a member of the Executive Committee.

C. Messenger said that these proposed changes to the Bylaws are bundled together to come forward as an Executive motion. She explained that we need to make the motion again even though it was approved by Council last year as there are slight changes.

R. Gillis asked about language for the removal of an Executive Director. M. Horban said that it would be in the employment contract.

The Executive Committee recommends to Council that:

the proposed changes to the Bylaws be approved.

Carried.

c. AGM (Thursday, April 6, 3:30 p.m.)

i. Agenda – to be approved by Council \*

C. Messenger invited the members to review the draft agenda. She noted that the reports are not being presented but questions will be taken, and announced that the order of the day will be a presentation on pensions. When asked about a timeline for the final vote, she said that it could take place in the fall.

The Executive Committee recommends to Council that:

the draft AGM agenda be approved.

Carried.

ii. Guest Panel

There was a brief discussion about the guests on a panel on pensions.

d. Richard Freishtat event (C. Evans)

C. Evans reminded the audience of the two events coming up in April.

e. Other matters

There were no other matters.

7. Report of the Vice-President, Grievances (5 min)

T. Zoric informed the members of an important recent issue around asbestos contamination. She advised that the UofT administration invested a good deal of time in dealing with this contamination, which was, in the view of several affected members, mishandled. T. Zoric reported that the affected labs have been shut, and there is no clear or undisputed knowledge as to the level of exposure. There was also no official notice of exposure, to allow UTFA members to notify the people in their labs about the risks they were exposed to. T. Zoric informed the members that this matter is being taken extremely seriously by UTFA and was discussed extensively at the Grievance Committee meeting. The Ministry of Labour was notified via letter. UTFA is seeking to solve the problem, and not score political points.

8. Report of the Vice-President, University and External Affairs. (5 min)

L. Kohn noted that a written report was submitted.

9. Report of the Chair of the Nominating Committee (5 min)

J. Jenkins announced that there are three open positions, for Chair of the Appointments and Membership Committees and for Treasurer.

She asked the members to propose names of people who might be interested in these positions. She also provided information about the position of Member-at-Large.

10. Report of the Chair of the Membership Committee (5 min)

J. Jenkins announced that together with K. Scheaffer she is organizing a series of intellectual property seminars in the fall. She also announced that on March 28 there is an education session on pensions in the department of A. Hojatollah Taleghani and J. Hanssen, whom she congratulated on organizing the first departmental focus group.

Further strategies for educating UTFA members about pensions were discussed.

11. Report of the Chair of the Retired Members Committee (5 min)

There was a written report.

12. Report of the Treasurer (Attachment only)

a. Year-to-Date\*

13. Order of the Day – 4:00 p.m. (60 min): Pensions: Sue Wurtele, Allan Shapira and Cameron Hunter

J. Newman introduced S. Wurtele by reading her biography.

S. Wurtele began by explaining that the government is looking into the sustainability of pensions. This interest is taking two forms: First, there is a strong interest in consolidation and second, a strong interest in 50/50 contribution and risk sharing. In the pension world, consolidation is very popular as it translates into enhanced stability and good governance. She cited the best known plans in Canada: OMERS, HOOPP, OTPP, CAAT and OPSEU.

C. Hunter pointed out pertinent portions of the documents that had been circulated.

S. Wurtele explained the history behind the decision for the JSPP. In 2012, mainly in light of the 2008 crisis, OCUFA was asked by the Ministry of Training, Colleges and Universities to join a working group, to explore the possible creation of a JSPP. In 2013 meetings were held that focused on collecting data to understand the situation and drawing a large scale vision of an alternative pension plan.

J. Newman next introduced Allan Shapira.

A. Shapira emphasized the need for a sustainable pension plan. UofT needs to make the plan acceptable from a cost perspective. The last valuation in July 2014 showed a deficit of \$730 million, but despite the going concern deficit, UofT has not lowered its contribution. In a JSPP scenario, the deficit will be the responsibility of each university.

A. Shapira and C. Hunter answered members' questions.

D. Brown explained that the Ontario government has been on a mission to get broader public sector plan to a 50/50 contribution, and the logical next step is sharing the governance in a 50/50 model like JSPP.

There is also a timing issue as a new government might not be necessarily as committed to benefits in the broader public sector.

The members showed their appreciation through applause.

14. Reports from the Floor of Council

There were no other reports.

15. Other business

- a. Next meeting of Council  
Thursday, April 6, 2017  
1:00 to 3:00 p.m.
- b. AGM  
Thursday, April 6, 2017  
3:30 to 6:00 pm

16. Adjournment

It was duly moved and seconded that:  
the meeting adjourn.

Carried.

The meeting adjourned at 5:10 p.m.

Rucsandra Schmelzer  
Grievance Assistant and Note Taker



720 Spadina Avenue, Suite 419  
Toronto, ON M5S 2T9

T 416 978-3351 F 416 978-7061  
E [faculty@utfa.org](mailto:faculty@utfa.org) / [www.utfa.org](http://www.utfa.org)

---

## Council Summary

### UTFA Executive Minutes

March 8, 2017 – 2:00 p.m. – 4:00 p.m.

UTFA Boardroom

Chair – C. Messenger

---

**Present:** M. Attridge, K. Banning, E. Damiano, C. Evans, J. Jenkins, L. Kohn, K. MacDonald, C. Messenger (Chair), A. Motsch, K. Weaver, T. Zoric,

**Regrets:** R. Gillis

**Also Present:** Steven Barrett, Darrell Brown (Goldblatt Partners); Susan Deller, Cameron Hunter (Eckler); Hugh Mackenzie (Hugh Mackenzie & Associates); M. Horban (Business Officer); Rucsandra Schmelzer (Grievance Assistant and notes)

C. Messenger called the meeting to order at 2:15 p.m.

1. Approval of the agenda: The agenda was approved as distributed.
2. Minutes of previous meetings: Approval of the minutes was deferred.
3. Business arising (not elsewhere on the agenda)
  - a. Action List: Review of the action list was deferred.
4. Report of the President (30 min)
  - a. AGM
    - i. Agenda\*

C. Messenger invited the members to review the agenda for the AGM and the Bylaws changes in the meeting package. She announced that the focus this year will be on pensions, with a panel generating discussion and answering questions.

C. Messenger, seconded by L. Kohn, moved that:

the draft AGM agenda be proposed for discussion at the March 21 Council meeting.

Carried.

- ii. Newsletter

M. Horban reminded executive members to submit their AGM Newsletter reports.

- iii. Turnout

Discussion of AGM turnout was deferred.



b. Pensions: member education

C. Messenger provided information about the special Council meeting on March 9.

c. Collegial Governance conference March 3 and 4, 2017, Vancouver CUFA

C. Messenger reported that she had just attended the CUFA conference in Vancouver. It was well attended, with strong representation from both the northern universities and small ones.

d. Bylaw change: Executive Director position and Executive member recall \*

Awkward phrasing in the changes was discussed and it was decided that a smaller group would edit it.

e. Motion to approve side table for part-time policy negotiation:

Cynthia Messenger, Michael Attridge, Claude Evans, Kass Banning, and Brian McDonagh

C. Messenger said that she would like to have this team approved. She mentioned that B. McDonagh has a part-time appointment and is keenly interested in fully participating.

C. Messenger, seconded by T. Zoric, moved that:

the team be approved.

Carried.

f. Richard Freishtat and Anne Boring

C. Evans announced that she had started to work on publicity for the Freishtat events. She noted that if you want to attend both, then you have to sign up for both. There will be a reception at the Faculty Club after the lecture on Tuesday, April 4.

C. Evans reported that A. Boring would be interested in giving a lecture next year about gender bias and taking part in a workshop on cultural elements in pedagogy. A. Boring volunteered to contact some speakers in Canada and France and send us bios and CVs.

g. Other matters

M Attridge, seconded by L.Kohn, moved that:

K. Weaver be added to the St. Michael's bargaining team as an Executive member.

Carried.

C. Messengers also welcomed S. Olexson as the new labour lawyer on the UTFA team.

A discussion took place of the pension reform timeline and approval protocol.

5. Report of the Vice-President, Salary, Benefits, Pensions and Workload(10 min)

T. Zoric, seconded by A. Motsch, moved that:

the meeting go in camera

Carried.

K. Weaver, seconded by K. Schaeffer, moved that:

the meeting go ex camera.

Carried.

6. Report of the Treasurer (5 min)

a. YTD\*

E. Damiano presented the year-to-date as of February 28. He noted that the surplus is quite significant, running at \$580,000, and by the end of year it is likely to be at \$800,000.

b. Motion to reduce mill rate

E. Damiano expressed his concern over the accumulating surplus, which has reached a total of over \$1,700,000 over the last six years. He proposed a temporary reduction of the mill rate with a sunset clause at 5 years. He suggested a 1/12 reduction, which would be the equivalent of one dues holiday a year. He cited lower mill rates at other universities, e.g., Waterloo at 5.00 and Simon Fraser at 6.5. His proposal is 6.75, which is still higher than most universities.

E. Damiano moved, seconded by A. Motsch, that:

Executive recommend that Council recommend that the AGM approve a 1/12 reduction in the mill rate.

T. Zoric said that at the beginning of the first round of bargaining with fact-finding we should not assume that future bargaining costs will be the same as past costs. She also expressed concern that UTFA's expenses would grow because of extensive pension negotiations and the hire of an executive director. If in three or five years we found ourselves restricted, it could be hard to increase the mill rate again.

C. Messenger said that she would also be concerned this year but suggested that next year, after we have embarked on pension negotiations, E. Damiano could revisit the motion. A. Motsch agreed.

C. Messenger suggested amending the motion to bring it back to the table in a year. T. Zoric pointed out that there is no longer a seconder for this motion.

Failed.

c. Other matters

There were no other matters.

7. Report of the Chair of the Appointments Committee (5 min)

M. Attridge reported that the part-time survey is under way and closes next Monday.

8. Report of the Chair of the Librarians Committee (5 min)

K. Scheaffer reported that: the librarians' survey closed on March 7, with 43% participation; that she and J. Jenkins are looking at open access; and that she will be organizing an education panel sometime in May.

9. Report of the Vice-President, University and External Affairs \* (5 min)

L. Kohn drew attention to her report in the meeting package, noting that it contained information on asbestos at the U of Manitoba, where a faculty member died because of it.

L. Kohn reported that she went to an OCUFA meeting regarding OCUFA Advocacy Day where she got a report from the Ministry and a PowerPoint presentation. Issues discussed included renewal of faculty and university governance.

C. Messenger, seconded by M. Attridge, moved that:

the meeting be extended an additional half hour.

Carried.

10. Order of the Day – 3:00 pm – Pensions – Cameron Hunter, Susan Deller, Hugh Mackenzie and Steven Barrett

C. Messenger seconded by M. Attridge, moved that:

the meeting go in camera

Carried.

A. Motsch, seconded by K. Scheaffer, moved that:

the meeting go ex camera.

Carried.

11. Other Business \*

- a. Next scheduled Executive Committee meeting  
Friday, March 31, 2017 – 2:00 – 4:00 p.m.
- b. Next scheduled Council Meeting  
Tuesday, March 21, 2017 – 3:00 to 5:00 pm
- c. Adjournment

It was duly moved and seconded that:

the meeting adjourn.

Carried.

The meeting adjourned at 5:45 p.m.

Rucsandra Schmelzer  
Grievance Assistant