

| Prompt # | Topic | Prompt Structure | Full Prompt | Model Used | Output | Strengths | Weaknesses | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|----------------------|---|--|---|-------------|--|--|---|--------|----------------------|---|--|--------------------------------|--|---|---------------|---|--|----------------------|---|--------------------------------------|------------|--|----|---|---|---|--|
| 1 | Nocturne for piano (theory) | RCTO (Role, Context, Task, Output) | Act as a harmony professor in a music conservatory. Explain to a class of undergraduate students the main characteristics and structure of the piano nocturne in the Romantic period, using a maximum of 150 words. | ChatGPT-4.1 | <p>The Romantic piano nocturne is a lyrical, expressive piece, typically evoking a dreamy, nocturnal atmosphere, inspired by John Field and performed by Chopin. Its main characteristics include a singing, enameled melody in the right hand, often imitating the human voice, and an arpeggiated or broken-chord accompaniment in the left hand, structurally, nocturnes usually follow a ternary (ABA) form; an initial melodic section (Presentation), a more drama or agitation, and a return of the opening material (Continuation). Harmonic language is rich, with frequent chromaticism, modulation, and unexpected chord progressions, enhancing the sense of intimacy and drama. Pedal use is essential for creating a smooth, atmospheric sound. While technically accessible, the challenge lies in expressive phrasing, rubato, and nuanced dynamics, all aimed at creating a poetic, intimate atmosphere characteristic of the Romantic nocturne.</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Clarity : The explanation is clear and easy to follow, especially for a conservatory student. - Accuracy and relevance : the information provided is correct and relevant to the request. - Length and Conciseness : The output is of the right length, as requested, and effectively summarizes the most basic and important information. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Tone and style of conversation : I could have been more authorative, considering that it is addressed to students of a conservatory, who have a technical musical background. Some more technical terms could have been inserted, such as accompanied nocturne. - General description of the structure : The description of the structure is somewhat generalized, it lacks reference to possible exceptions, and above all to the difference between the first nocturnes of John Field and those of Chopin, for example. | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 2 | Sentence analysis | Chain of Thought | Act as a professor of music analysis in a conservatory. Step by step, describe the substructure and structure of a sentence (of the classical period). For each main section of the sentence: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. describe the typical substructure; 2. list possible exceptions or variations; 3. indicate the main cadences expected. Please provide your answer as a numbered list, dedicating a separate section to each part. | ChatGPT-4.1 | <p>Certainty! Here's a clear, step-by-step explanation of the structure and characteristics of a sentence in the Classical period, with a focus on the main sections. Each point will include the typical substructure, possible exceptions, and the main cadences:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Presentation (Bars 1-4) <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Typical Substructure: <p>The sentence usually opens with a basic idea (2 bars), a short, memorable musical gesture or motif. This is immediately followed by a repetition or variation of the basic idea (another 2 bars). The repetition can be literal, sequential, or with slight rhythmic/metric changes.</p> 2. Possible Exceptions/Variations: <p>Sometimes the repetition is in a different voice or register. The repeated idea may be more varied, incorporating a sequence (transposing the idea up or down).</p> 3. Main Cadences: <p>In some cases, the repetition is only partial or rhythmically altered.</p> <p>Usually, no strong cadence at this point; often ends with a weak cadence or is left open, leading directly into the continuation.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 2. Continuation (Bars 5-7) <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Typical Substructure: <p>Features fragmentation: the basic idea is broken into smaller motives, often repeated at a faster harmonic or rhythmic pace.</p> 2. Possible Exceptions/Variations: <p>Harmonic acceleration: harmonies may change more quickly, building momentum.</p> 3. Main Cadences: <p>Sequence: the motives may be sequenced (repeated at different pitch levels) to increase tension and drive.</p> <p>Occasionally, the continuation introduces new material or a contrasting idea.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 3. Cadential (Bars 7-8) <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Typical Substructure: <p>This section brings the sentence to a close with a clear harmonic progression (e.g., I–V–I or similar).</p> 2. Possible Exceptions/Variations: <p>Typically concise, often just 2 bars, focusing on harmonic resolution.</p> 3. Main Cadences: <p>In longer sentences, the cadential section may be extended or elaborated (with extra bars). Sometimes the cadence is evaded or delayed, particularly if the sentence is embedded in a larger structure (e.g., a transition).</p> <p>Summarizing, a classical sentence typically follows an 8-bar pattern: 2x2 (presentation) + 4 (continuation/cadence), but these proportions and procedures can be varied creatively. The final cadence is generally authentic but can be adapted to suit the larger formal context.</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Accuracy : The information provided is correct. - Relevance : The answer is relevant to the request. - Length and Conciseness : The prompt is of an appropriate length, neither too verbose nor too concise. It effectively summarizes the most basic and important information. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Terminology : The terms used are correct, but more technical terms could have been inserted, such as the PAC, IAC, or HC cadences. - Lack of clarity : The output follows the required structure, but it is presented in a somewhat confusing way, using the same numbers for both the main sections and the sub-sections of each section. - Little depth on the harmonic aspect and cadences : for example, in the "presentation" section there is no reference to the initial tonic harmony, or to the dominant chord that may be present in the repetition. In the final section, there is no reference to the acronym of the two main cadences (PAC and IAC) and the HC cadence is not mentioned. | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 3 | Identify the key and assign harmonic functions | Few-shot | Identify the key and assign the harmonic functions. <p>Input: Gm, Cm, Am, D7, Gm Output: Key: C major / Functions: I-IV-V-I</p> <p>Input: Dm, Em, Am, A7, Dm Output: Key: D minor / Functions: I-IV-V-I</p> <p>Input: Gm, Cm, Am, D7, Gm Output: ?</p> | ChatGPT-4.1 | <p>Let's analyze Example 3 step by step:</p> <p>Input: Gm, Cm, Am, D7, Gm</p> <p>Step 1: Identify the Key Gm (G minor) could be in E minor or in F major, but let's see the context. Cm is the iv in G minor.</p> <p>Am (A minor) is a bit unusual in G minor, but could act as a borrowed chord or a secondary function. D7 is the V7 in G minor.</p> <p>Gm resolves back, suggesting tonic.</p> <p>Given this sequence and the strong presence of Gm and D7, the key is G minor.</p> <p>Step 2: Assign Harmonic Functions Now let's label each chord: G minor:</p> <table border="0"> <tr> <td>Chord</td> <td>Gm</td> <td>I</td> <td>Tonic</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Am</td> <td>II</td> <td>(Major II, secondary dominant)</td> <td>V7</td> </tr> <tr> <td>D7</td> <td>IV</td> <td>Subdominant</td> <td>V7</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Gm</td> <td>V</td> <td>Passing chord</td> <td>I</td> </tr> <tr> <td>D7</td> <td>V7</td> <td>Dominant 7th</td> <td>Tonic</td> </tr> </table> <p>Chord Gm I Tonic Am II (Major II, secondary dominant) D7 IV Subdominant Gm V Passing chord D7 V7 Dominant 7th Gm V I Tonic</p> <p>Am is in G minor. Usually, the ii⁷ in G minor would be Adorian, but here we have Am (major). Sometimes Am functions as a secondary dominant (V7/V), which would make it a secondary minor. Am could be seen as a borrowed chord or chromatic passing harmony, or just II (major) as a color.</p> <p>Step 3: Output in Requested Format Output: Key: G minor / Functions: I-IV-V-I</p> <p>If you want, I can explain the function of Am further or adapt for jazz/pop analysis!</p> | Chord | Gm | I | Tonic | Am | II | (Major II, secondary dominant) | V7 | D7 | IV | Subdominant | V7 | Gm | V | Passing chord | I | D7 | V7 | Dominant 7th | Tonic | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Accuracy : the information provided is correct. - Relevance : the response is relevant to the request. - Clarity : all steps of the response are clear and understandable, following a logical flow and order. - Terminology : technical terms and musical chord symbols are used correctly (except for some lowercase errors, such as the IV marked as iv). | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Non-compliance with the required format : the output proceeds step by step, as in the chain of thought typology, working in phases to reach the final goal. The requested table structure is not immediately reported with the same outcome proposed with the few-shot prompting. - Excessive length : the output is excessively long, arriving only at the end at the required output. A better ability to summarize could have been used. |
| Chord | Gm | I | Tonic | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Am | II | (Major II, secondary dominant) | V7 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| D7 | IV | Subdominant | V7 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Gm | V | Passing chord | I | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| D7 | V7 | Dominant 7th | Tonic | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 4 | Beethoven vs Mozart comparison | Table/Comparison | Act as a music historian. Compare the piano writing styles of Beethoven and Mozart's piano sonatas, listing two key differences and one similarity. Exhibit your answer in a table with two separate columns, copyable into a Google Sheet ("Beethoven", "Mozart") and a final row for the similarities. | ChatGPT-4.1 | <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>Beethoven</th> <th>Mozart</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Harmonic Functioning</td> <td>Complex, with frequent modulations and non-diatonic chords.</td> <td>More diatonic, with fewer modulations.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Form and Structure</td> <td>More complex, with longer periods and more varied forms.</td> <td>More traditional, with clearer binary and ternary structures.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Orchestration</td> <td>Often includes the piano as a solo instrument, emphasizing its virtuosic potential.</td> <td>More integrated with the orchestra, using the piano as a harmonic and rhythmic resource.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Style and Expression</td> <td>More dramatic, expressive, and individualistic.</td> <td>More refined, elegant, and balanced.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Similarity</td> <td>Both composers used the piano to explore the full range of the instrument.</td> <td></td> </tr> </tbody> </table> | | Beethoven | Mozart | Harmonic Functioning | Complex, with frequent modulations and non-diatonic chords. | More diatonic, with fewer modulations. | Form and Structure | More complex, with longer periods and more varied forms. | More traditional, with clearer binary and ternary structures. | Orchestration | Often includes the piano as a solo instrument, emphasizing its virtuosic potential. | More integrated with the orchestra, using the piano as a harmonic and rhythmic resource. | Style and Expression | More dramatic, expressive, and individualistic. | More refined, elegant, and balanced. | Similarity | Both composers used the piano to explore the full range of the instrument. | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Accuracy : Musical concepts are correct and stylistically appropriate. - Format compliance : Required table structure is fully respected. - Language : Clear and correct technical musical terminology. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Completeness : Beethoven's exploration of the full keyboard range (including extreme registers) is missing. | | |
| | Beethoven | Mozart | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Harmonic Functioning | Complex, with frequent modulations and non-diatonic chords. | More diatonic, with fewer modulations. | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Form and Structure | More complex, with longer periods and more varied forms. | More traditional, with clearer binary and ternary structures. | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Orchestration | Often includes the piano as a solo instrument, emphasizing its virtuosic potential. | More integrated with the orchestra, using the piano as a harmonic and rhythmic resource. | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Style and Expression | More dramatic, expressive, and individualistic. | More refined, elegant, and balanced. | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Similarity | Both composers used the piano to explore the full range of the instrument. | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 5 | Sentences vs periods (classical theme types) | Error Correction / Evaluative Prompt | Act as a professor of music theory in a conservatory. Review the following statements relating to the two types of classic themes (sentence and period), identifying any errors or omissions to be noted. Your response must be no more than 60 words. <p>Original explanation: Both themes (sentence and period) are normatively eight measures in length, divided into two 4 m. phrases. Both themes have only one cadence.</p> | ChatGPT-4.1 | <p>Review of the Statement:</p> <p>Errors/Clarifications:</p> <p>Both themes are commonly (not normatively) eight measures, but there are many exceptions.</p> <p>A period is divided into two 4-measure phrases (antecedent/consequent).</p> <p>A sentence is divided into presentation (often 4m) and continuation (often 4m), not phrases in the same sense.</p> <p>Both usually have two main cadences, not just one - weaker cadence at the midpoint, and a stronger cadence at the end.</p> <p>Suggested Correct Version (s60 words):</p> <p>Both sentences and periods are typically eight measures long, but this is not a strict rule. A period consists of two 4-measure phrases, each ending with a cadence (usually weak, then strong). A sentence is divided into presentation and continuation sections, with a cadence at the end. Both forms often contain two cadences.</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Specificity : good level of detail provided. - Relevance : the response is relevant to the request. - Clarity : the output uses clear and understandable language. - Format Conformance : follows the required output format, good final summary in less than 60 words. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Inaccuracy : There is one error : the statement that both types of themes have only one cadence. The sentence has one cadence, the period two. The error is repeated in the final summary in less than 60 words. | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |