A Tale of Two Composites: A Comparative Analysis of Sustainable Innovation and Ethical Impossibility in Materials Science

Executive Summary

This report presents a detailed comparative analysis of two composite material concepts: the viable and sustainable "Hempoxy" composite and the hypothetical, non-viable "Tobacco Ash–Whale Fat" composite. It establishes the former as a benchmark for 21st-century materials engineering, grounded in principles of the circular economy, lifecycle sustainability, and regulatory compliance. The analysis demonstrates that hemp-based composites, derived from a carbon-negative agricultural feedstock and utilizing advanced bio-resins and nanomaterials, represent a tangible pathway toward decarbonizing the materials sector. In stark contrast, the report deconstructs the "Tobacco Ash–Whale Fat" composite from first principles, revealing it to be a "wicked problem" that is technically unsound, toxicologically hazardous, and prohibited by a comprehensive web of international laws and ethical standards. The juxtaposition of these two concepts is not arbitrary; it is framed as a pedagogical tool designed to equip the next generation of engineers with the critical thinking skills necessary to navigate the complex, multi-domain constraints of their profession. By examining a paradigm of sustainable innovation alongside a case of ethical and technical impossibility, this report aims to instill a holistic engineering mindset that prioritizes not only technical feasibility but also legal compliance, environmental stewardship, and societal responsibility as non-negotiable pillars of modern design and manufacturing.

Part I: The Viable Paradigm - A Deep Dive into Hempoxy Composites

The emergence of hemp-based composites, colloquially termed "Hempoxy," represents a significant advancement in the field of sustainable materials. This class of materials is not merely a "green" alternative but a complex system built upon a foundation of sustainable agriculture, innovative material science, and a supportive regulatory environment. This section provides a comprehensive examination of the entire Hempoxy ecosystem, from the cultivation of industrial hemp as a carbon-negative crop to the synthesis of advanced bio-resins and the development of high-performance nanomaterials. It will demonstrate how the viability of a modern composite material is inextricably linked to its entire lifecycle, establishing a benchmark against which all material innovations, including the hypothetical and deeply flawed concept analyzed in Part II, must be measured.

Section 1.1: The Hemp Bio-Economy: From Sustainable Crop to

Advanced Material

The foundation of any bio-composite is the agricultural system from which its primary components are derived. In the case of hemp, this foundation is exceptionally strong, characterized by environmental benefits that begin at the point of cultivation and extend throughout the material's lifecycle. The viability of this system, however, is not solely a function of its ecological merits; it is fundamentally enabled by a clear and modern legal framework that has allowed for the creation of a legitimate, regulated, and ethically grounded bio-economy.

Lifecycle Assessment (LCA) of Industrial Hemp

Industrial hemp (*Cannabis sativa L.*) stands out as a uniquely sustainable agricultural commodity. Its cultivation requires minimal inputs, such as pesticides and fertilizers, and consumes significantly less water than conventional crops like cotton. The plant's rapid growth and high biomass yield make it a powerful tool for carbon sequestration. During its short growing season, a single acre of industrial hemp can sequester approximately 9 tons of carbon dioxide (CO_2) from the atmosphere. This biological carbon capture is a critical first step in creating a material with a negative carbon footprint.

A formal Life Cycle Assessment (LCA) quantifies this benefit with remarkable clarity. Studies comparing hemp fiber composites to traditional glass fiber composites have found that even a partial substitution of synthetic fibers with hemp can reduce the product's Global Warming Potential (GWP) by up to 25% without compromising mechanical properties. The analysis of hemp's lifecycle reveals that the amount of CO_2 absorbed during cultivation can exceed the greenhouse gas emissions associated with farming operations (soil preparation, planting, harvesting) and initial processing by a factor of up to 15. This results in a net-negative GWP for the raw hemp material itself. For instance, the cumulative GWP for producing 1.0 kg of baled hemp stalks has been calculated at -1.54 kg CO_2 equivalent, signifying a substantial carbon credit embedded within the feedstock before it even enters a manufacturing facility.

This holistic view of sustainability is further captured by the Life Cycle Sustainability Assessment (LCSA) framework, which extends beyond environmental impacts to include economic and social considerations. An LCSA evaluates the "triple bottom line" by integrating Environmental Life Cycle Assessment (ELCA), Life Cycle Costing (LCC), and Social Life Cycle Assessment (SLCA). This comprehensive approach confirms that hemp-based materials not only exhibit lower lifecycle greenhouse gas emissions compared to traditional building materials but also offer economic and social benefits, creating a robust case for their adoption.

Regulatory Landscape and Ethical Farming

The modern hemp bio-economy could not exist without a clear, enabling legal framework. The passage of the 2018 Farm Bill in the United States was a watershed moment, federally legalizing the cultivation of industrial hemp by establishing a critical legal distinction based on cannabinoid content. The law defines industrial hemp as any part of the *Cannabis sativa L.* plant containing a delta-9-tetrahydrocannabinol (Δ^9-THC) concentration of not more than 0.3% on a dry weight basis. This single, science-based metric effectively separated industrial hemp from its psychoactive counterpart, removing it from the purview of the Controlled Substances Act and reclassifying it as an agricultural commodity.

This legal certainty acted as the foundational catalyst that unlocked the entire bio-economy. It provided the necessary security for farmers to invest in cultivation, for processors to build infrastructure, and for companies to develop and market hemp-based products. The regulatory structure requires that all cultivation be conducted under a license from a state, tribal, or federal plan, with mandatory sampling and testing of crops within a 30-day pre-harvest window to ensure THC compliance. Any crop that tests "hot" (exceeds the 0.3% THC limit) must be destroyed, placing significant risk on the grower and emphasizing the importance of stable genetics.

Building on this legal foundation, the industry is developing standards for ethical and responsible production. Initiatives like the Responsible Hemp Standard (RHS) are creating voluntary certification models that promote traceability, transparency, sustainable farming practices, regenerative agriculture, and social compliance. By establishing a certified supply chain, the RHS aims to enhance market opportunities for responsible growers and build consumer confidence, ensuring that the hemp bio-economy grows not just legally, but also ethically.

The Circular Economy Potential

Hemp is a model crop for the circular economy, a system designed to eliminate waste and promote the continual use of resources. Its production is inherently multifunctional; a single harvest can yield strong bast fibers for composites and textiles, woody hurd for building materials like hempcrete, nutrient-rich grain for food products, and floral biomass for extracts. This whole-plant utilization strategy ensures that value is extracted from every part of the crop, minimizing agricultural waste.

Beyond the products it yields, hemp cultivation actively contributes to environmental regeneration. Its deep and extensive root system aerates the soil, improves its structure, and prevents erosion. Hemp can also be used for phytoremediation, as its roots have a high capacity for absorbing and storing heavy metals and other toxic substances from contaminated soils. By improving soil health and supporting biodiversity, hemp farming can help restore degraded agricultural lands.

In the broader economy, hemp-based products serve as direct substitutes for materials derived from fossil fuels or carbon-intensive processes. Hemp composites can replace fiberglass in automotive parts, hempcrete can replace concrete in construction, and hemp pulp can replace wood pulp in paper production. Each substitution helps to mitigate greenhouse gas emissions, reduce reliance on finite resources, and transition the economy toward a more sustainable, bio-based model. The inherent biodegradability and recyclability of hemp products further enhance their circular credentials, offering a superior end-of-life scenario compared to the perpetual landfill burden of synthetic materials.

Section 1.2: Material Science of Hemp-Reinforced Bio-Composites

With a sustainable and legally sound feedstock established, the focus shifts to the material science that transforms raw hemp into a high-performance composite. A "Hempoxy" composite is a sophisticated material system comprising a natural fiber reinforcement and a bio-based polymer matrix. Its performance is not merely the sum of its parts but is dictated by the complex interplay between fiber, matrix, and the interface that binds them. The challenges inherent in working with natural materials have become powerful drivers of innovation, leading to advanced treatments and novel resin formulations that push the boundaries of what bio-composites can achieve.

Anatomy of a Hemp Composite

The primary structural component of a hemp composite is the hemp fiber itself. These fibers, particularly the long bast fibers from the outer stalk, possess mechanical characteristics that are comparable to some synthetic fibers, making them an attractive reinforcement material. The strength of these fibers is derived from their high cellulose content, which can range from 70% to 74%. The stalk's woody inner core, known as hurd, can also be used as a filler or aggregate, particularly in building materials.

A fundamental challenge in designing natural fiber composites is the chemical incompatibility between the reinforcement and the matrix. Hemp fibers are hydrophilic (water-attracting) due to the presence of hydroxyl groups (-OH) on their cellulose and hemicellulose components. Most high-performance polymer matrices, whether synthetic or bio-based, are hydrophobic (water-repelling). This mismatch leads to poor interfacial adhesion, which limits the ability to effectively transfer stress from the matrix to the stronger fibers, thereby compromising the composite's overall mechanical properties.

To overcome this limitation, various surface modification techniques are employed. These treatments are not merely ancillary processing steps; they are critical innovations that unlock the full potential of the natural fibers. Alkaline treatments, for example, involve soaking the fibers in a sodium hydroxide (NaOH) solution. This process removes non-cellulosic components like lignin and waxes from the fiber surface, increasing its roughness and exposing more reactive hydroxyl groups. This enhances mechanical interlocking and improves the potential for chemical bonding with the matrix. Another common method is silane treatment, where fibers are treated with a silane coupling agent. The silane molecule acts as a chemical bridge, forming stable covalent bonds with the hydroxyl groups on the fiber surface on one end, and reacting with the polymer matrix on the other, creating a strong and durable interface.

The "Hempoxy" Matrix - Bio-Based Resins

The "epoxy" in "Hempoxy" signifies a departure from traditional petrochemical-based resins, embracing a new generation of bio-based polymers. This represents a systems-level approach to sustainable design, where not only the reinforcement but also the matrix is derived from renewable resources. This philosophy culminates in the potential for a composite where both major components originate from the same sustainable crop, creating a truly integrated biomaterial.

- **Epoxidized Hemp Oil (EHO):** One of the most promising bio-resins is derived directly from hempseed oil. Hempseed oil is rich in unsaturated fatty acids, such as linoleic acid (57%) and linolenic acid (19%), which contain carbon-carbon double bonds (C=C). These double bonds serve as reactive sites for a chemical process called epoxidation. In this reaction, the C=C bonds are converted into three-membered rings containing an oxygen atom, known as oxirane or epoxide groups. These epoxide groups are highly reactive and can undergo polymerization (curing) in the same way as conventional petroleum-based epoxy resins, forming a hard, cross-linked thermoset polymer. Research has demonstrated that composites made with an Epoxidized Hemp Oil (EHO) matrix exhibit mechanical properties superior to those made with commercial Epoxidized Soybean Oil (ESO). Furthermore, when blended with a synthetic epoxy, formulations containing up to 30% EHO have shown mechanical performance comparable to that of the pure commercial synthetic resin, functioning as an effective bio-based toughener.
- **Lignin-Epoxy Systems:** Lignin, the complex polymer that gives wood its rigidity, is an

abundant and often underutilized byproduct of the paper and biorefining industries. It can be incorporated into hemp-epoxy composites in several ways. As a particulate filler or compatibilizer, lignin can significantly improve the fiber-matrix bond and enhance specific mechanical properties. Studies have shown that adding lignin powder to a hemp-epoxy system can dramatically increase impact strength, with a 145% improvement observed at a 5% weight-for-weight (w/w) concentration. Tensile and flexural modulus also show improvements at an optimal concentration of around 2.5% w/w. However, exceeding this optimal level presents a key engineering trade-off. Higher lignin content increases the viscosity of the resin, which can impede its ability to fully impregnate the fiber mat during manufacturing processes like vacuum infusion, leading to voids and a subsequent decrease in performance. Beyond its use as an additive, lignin itself can be chemically modified through processes like methylolation and subsequent epoxidation to create a lignin-based epoxy resin, further reducing the reliance on petrochemical feedstocks.

Mechanical, Thermal, and Durability Profile

The performance of a finished Hempoxy composite is a function of its components and manufacturing process. While they may not match the absolute strength of high-end carbon fiber composites, they offer a compelling profile for a wide range of applications, particularly when specific properties (strength per unit weight or cost) are considered.

- **Mechanical Performance:** Hemp composites provide an excellent strength-to-weight ratio. They can reduce the weight of a component by 10% compared to an equivalent part made from fiberglass, leading to energy savings in applications like transportation. The tensile strength of hemp composites can be tailored through hybridization. For example, laminates combining hemp and jute fibers have achieved tensile strengths of up to 65.44 MPa. However, natural fiber composites generally exhibit lower absolute strength and are more brittle than their synthetic counterparts. Their performance is highly sensitive to factors like fiber treatment, the orientation of fibers within the matrix, and the quality of the fiber-matrix adhesion, making process control a critical aspect of manufacturing.
- **Thermal Properties:** One of the standout features of hemp fiber is its natural insulating capability. The thermal conductivity of raw hemp fiber mats is approximately 0.04 W/mK, a value comparable to excellent insulators like glass wool and sheep wool. When these fibers are embedded in a polymer matrix to form a composite, the overall thermal conductivity increases to around 0.1 W/mK due to the higher conductivity of the resin. This value is similar to that of pine wood, making hemp composites highly suitable for applications in building construction, such as insulation panels and structural insulated panels (SIPs), where they contribute to energy efficiency.
- **Durability and End-of-Life:** The primary durability challenge for hemp composites is their sensitivity to moisture. The hydrophilic nature of the fibers means they can absorb water, which can cause swelling and degrade the mechanical properties of the composite over time, particularly the fiber-matrix interface. This necessitates the use of protective coatings or careful design considerations for applications in humid environments. From an end-of-life perspective, their biodegradability and recyclability are major advantages. Unlike synthetic composites that persist in landfills for centuries, hemp composites can be designed to biodegrade. As thermoset materials, they cannot be simply melted and reformed. However, they can be recycled through mechanical grinding, where the crushed composite is used as a filler in new materials, contributing to a more circular material lifecycle.

Section 1.3: The Frontier of Hemp Composites: Carbon Nanosheets and Hybridization

The evolution of hemp as an industrial material extends far beyond its traditional use as a bulk fiber. At the frontier of materials science, researchers are transforming this ancient crop into advanced nanomaterials and engineering sophisticated hybrid composites. This work demonstrates a remarkable paradigm shift, upcycling what was once considered agricultural waste into high-value, high-performance materials that can compete with and even surpass conventional technologies in specific applications. This section explores the synthesis and application of hemp-derived carbon nanosheets and the strategic use of hybridization to create designer biomaterials.

Synthesis of Hemp-Derived Carbon Nanosheets (HDCNS)

Hemp-Derived Carbon Nanosheets (HDCNS) are two-dimensional, graphene-like nanomaterials synthesized directly from the plant's fibrous biomass, specifically the bast fibers that are often a byproduct of grain or hurd processing. This innovative process was pioneered by researchers who developed a method combining hydrothermal carbonization with chemical activation.

The synthesis begins with hydrothermal carbonization (HTC), where hemp bast fibers are subjected to high temperature and pressure in an aqueous environment. This process breaks down the complex lignocellulosic structure and forms a carbon-rich solid known as hydrochar. The crucial next step is activation. The hydrochar is treated with a chemical agent, such as potassium hydroxide (KOH), and heated to very high temperatures (e.g., 700°C to 1000°C) in an inert atmosphere. This activation process etches away amorphous carbon and creates an intricate network of pores, dramatically increasing the material's specific surface area.

The result is a unique material architecture: interconnected, partially graphitic carbon nanosheets with thicknesses ranging from 10 to 30 nanometers. These nanosheets possess an exceptionally high specific surface area, measured at up to 2287 m^2/g, and a significant volume of mesopores, which are critical for electrochemical applications. Furthermore, the high-temperature processing imparts good electrical conductivity, with values reported between 211 and 226 S/m. This entire process is significantly more cost-effective and environmentally benign than conventional methods for producing graphene, which often rely on expensive and non-renewable precursors like graphite or petroleum derivatives. The development of HDCNS is a prime example of valorizing agricultural "waste," transforming a low-value byproduct into a high-performance material with applications in advanced technologies like energy storage, specifically for ultrafast supercapacitors.

Integration of HDCNS into Polymer Composites

The exceptional properties of HDCNS make them an ideal nanoscale reinforcement for a new generation of composite materials. Their integration into polymer, ceramic, or even metal matrices has the potential to significantly enhance the performance of the host material. The high mechanical robustness and large surface-to-volume ratio of the nanosheets allow for efficient load transfer within a composite, leading to improvements in strength and stiffness at very low filler concentrations.

The electrical conductivity of HDCNS can be leveraged to impart new functionalities to otherwise insulating polymer composites. This could enable applications such as electromagnetic interference (EMI) shielding, static dissipation, or integrated sensing capabilities. Similarly, their two-dimensional structure provides an efficient pathway for heat dissipation, which could be used to improve the thermal management and stability of electronic components or structural parts. The primary challenge in creating HDCNS-composites lies in achieving a uniform dispersion of the nanosheets within the matrix and ensuring strong interfacial adhesion, areas of active research in the field.

Synergistic Effects of Hybridization

While HDCNS represent the high-performance frontier, a more immediately applicable strategy for enhancing hemp composites is hybridization at the macro-scale. This approach involves combining hemp fibers with other natural or synthetic fibers within a single composite laminate to create a material with a tailored set of properties that surpasses what any single fiber type could achieve alone.
This "designer" approach allows engineers to balance competing requirements such as cost, weight, strength, and impact resistance. For instance, hemp fiber is known for its toughness and stiffness but can be relatively brittle. Jute fiber, on the other hand, exhibits better elongation and ductility. By creating a hybrid composite with hemp fibers as the outer "skin" layers and jute fibers as the inner "core," it is possible to produce a laminate with higher overall tensile and flexural strength than a pure hemp composite, while also mitigating brittleness. Similarly, hemp can be hybridized with flax fiber, which generally offers some of the best mechanical properties among common natural fibers, to fine-tune the flexural and interlaminar shear strength for specific loading conditions. This strategy of intelligent material combination is critical for expanding the application space for bio-composites, enabling their use in more demanding roles in sectors like automotive, aerospace, and sporting goods.

Part II: The Cautionary Tale - Deconstructing the Hypothetical Tobacco Ash–Whale Fat Composite

In stark contrast to the innovative and sustainable paradigm of Hempoxy composites, this section will analyze the hypothetical "Tobacco Ash–Whale Fat Composite." This concept is not presented as a plausible material but as a powerful pedagogical tool—a negative case study designed to illustrate the absolute boundaries of responsible engineering. The deconstruction will proceed from first principles, demonstrating that a material's non-viability is often determined not in the laboratory through mechanical testing, but by fundamental legal, ethical, and toxicological constraints that must be the first consideration in any engineering design process. This analysis serves as a cautionary tale, highlighting the critical importance of a holistic, multi-domain approach to material selection and development.

Section 2.1: Sourcing the Unsourceable: The Insurmountable Legal and Ethical Barriers

Before any technical analysis can begin, the first and most definitive test of a material's viability is the legality and ethics of sourcing its constituent components. For the hypothetical Tobacco Ash–Whale Fat composite, this initial hurdle proves to be an insurmountable wall, built from a multi-layered and redundant system of international treaties, national laws, and environmental regulations. An attempt to create a supply chain for these materials would not be a mere logistical challenge but a flagrant violation of global conservation and public health policies.

International Whaling Conventions

The proposed matrix material, whale fat (blubber), is commercially unobtainable through any legal channel. The global framework for the protection of whales is one of the oldest and most robust in international environmental law. Its cornerstone is the 1946 International Convention for the Regulation of Whaling (ICRW), an international agreement established "to provide for the proper conservation of whale stocks and thus make possible the orderly development of the whaling industry". The ICRW created the International Whaling Commission (IWC) as its decision-making body, comprising representatives from its 88 member nations.

In response to the catastrophic decline of whale populations due to overexploitation, the IWC took a decisive step in 1982 by adopting a moratorium on all commercial whaling, which came into effect for the 1986 season. This moratorium, implemented as a "zero catch limit" in the legally binding Schedule of the ICRW, remains in place today. It effectively prohibits the commercial harvesting of great whales by all IWC member states. This ban is further reinforced by the designation of vast ocean sanctuaries, including the entire Indian Ocean and the Southern Ocean surrounding Antarctica, where commercial whaling is forbidden regardless of the moratorium.

Exceptions and Their Inapplicability

The ICRW framework does include tightly controlled exceptions, but none provide a pathway for industrial sourcing. The IWC permits a very limited amount of Aboriginal Subsistence Whaling (ASW) for specific indigenous communities in countries like the United States (Alaska), the Russian Federation, and Greenland, who have a long-standing cultural and nutritional reliance on whaling. However, ASW is, by definition, non-commercial. The catch is governed by strict quotas based on scientific advice and is intended for local consumption and traditional uses within the community. The products derived from ASW are explicitly forbidden from entering commercial markets.

Furthermore, any international trade in whale products is severely restricted by the Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Fauna and Flora (CITES). Most species of great whales are listed on Appendix I of CITES, which includes species threatened with extinction. Appendix I listing prohibits all international commercial trade in specimens of these species. This combination of the IWC's hunting moratorium and CITES's trade ban creates a redundant legal barrier. Any engineer or company attempting to source whale fat for an industrial composite would be violating multiple international treaties, a clear demonstration that global consensus on conservation has rendered certain biological resources completely off-limits for commercial exploitation.

Regulations for Tobacco Waste

The proposed filler material, tobacco ash, faces a different but equally prohibitive set of regulatory hurdles related to waste management and public health. Tobacco ash is a post-consumer waste product derived from cigarettes, which are known to contain thousands of chemicals, including numerous toxicants and carcinogens. The resulting ash concentrates many

of these hazardous substances.
Under modern environmental law, particularly the principle of Extended Producer Responsibility (EPR), the onus for managing toxic post-consumer waste is shifting from the consumer and municipalities to the manufacturer. Tobacco Product Waste (TPW), including cigarette butts and ash, is increasingly being recognized as a toxic and hazardous waste stream. In the United States, the Resource Conservation and Recovery Act (RCRA) provides the framework for the proper management of hazardous waste. While the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) does not currently classify whole cigarette butts as a "listed" hazardous waste, it explicitly states that it is the responsibility of the waste generator to determine if the waste exhibits hazardous characteristics (e.g., toxicity). Scientific studies confirming the toxicity of cigarette butt leachate suggest they would likely qualify as "characteristic hazardous waste".
Critically, nicotine itself, especially in the concentrated form found in e-liquids, is listed as an acute hazardous waste under RCRA (waste code P075). Any plan to collect and process tons of tobacco ash would fall under the purview of hazardous waste regulations. This would require specialized permits, handling protocols, transportation manifests, and disposal methods, making the process prohibitively complex and expensive. The legal framework is designed to ensure such hazardous materials are safely contained and disposed of, not repurposed into new consumer or industrial products where their toxic components could re-enter the environment or pose a risk to human health.

Section 2.2: A Matrix of Contaminants: The Technical Infeasibility of the Components

If one were to hypothetically ignore the insurmountable legal and ethical barriers, the proposed components would still fail every technical and safety requirement for a viable composite material. Whale fat and tobacco ash are not benign raw materials; they are complex, unstable biological and chemical mixtures that act as reservoirs for environmental and industrial toxins. Combining them would not create a useful product but would instead engineer a new and uniquely hazardous form of solid waste, representing a process of toxic concentration rather than value creation.

Toxicology of the Filler (Tobacco Ash)

Tobacco ash is the residual inorganic material left after the combustion of a cigarette, a product known to contain over 2,000 chemical constituents, with that number doubling during the burning process. The ash acts as a sink, concentrating the non-volatile toxic elements present in the original tobacco leaf and paper.
Scientific analysis of tobacco ash using techniques like Energy-Dispersive X-ray (EDX) spectroscopy and Atomic Absorption Spectroscopy (AAS) has identified a wide array of toxic heavy metals. These include known carcinogens and systemic toxicants such as lead (Pb), cadmium (Cd), arsenic (As), chromium (Cr), and nickel (Ni), as well as other hazardous elements like antimony (Sb) and zinc (Zn). The combustion process concentrates these metals in the ash at levels significantly higher than in the original tobacco; for example, iron (Fe) can be concentrated by a factor of 12–17, and zinc by a factor of 4.
In addition to heavy metals, tobacco products contain up to 599 documented additives, many of which have pharmacological effects and can produce carcinogenic compounds upon combustion. The final ash is therefore a complex and hazardous mixture. While some niche

research has explored using very low weight fractions (1.25% to 4.9%) of cigarette ash powder as a filler in unsaturated polyester resin, the study noted that higher concentrations reduced the material's fatigue life due to weak bonding. Another study investigated using aluminum-oxide-coated ash to adsorb arsenic from water, a process that requires chemical treatment to be effective and still raises concerns about leaching of other toxic substances from the ash. For any mainstream application, the inherent toxicity of the ash makes it fundamentally unsuitable as a filler. It would create a composite that continuously leaches heavy metals, posing a severe risk to anyone handling the material and creating a long-term environmental contamination hazard.

The Unstable and Contaminated Matrix (Whale Fat)

Whale blubber is a highly specialized subcutaneous adipose tissue, not a stable polymer. Its primary functions are thermoregulation, energy storage, and buoyancy. It is composed of lipids, primarily triglycerides (three fatty acids attached to a glycerol molecule), and in some toothed whale species, large amounts of wax esters (a fatty acid attached to a fatty alcohol). As a biological fat, it is chemically unstable and susceptible to oxidation and rancidity, which would result in a material with no long-term durability.

Far more concerning is blubber's role as a site for the bioaccumulation of persistent organic pollutants (POPs). As long-lived apex predators, whales are at the top of the marine food web. Lipophilic (fat-soluble) contaminants present in the ocean are absorbed by plankton, eaten by small fish, which are then eaten by larger fish, and so on up the food chain. At each step, the concentration of these toxins increases. By the time they reach a whale, these pollutants have been magnified to dangerously high levels and are stored in the animal's blubber.

Comprehensive studies on fin whale biopsies have revealed a disturbing chemical profile. Their blubber contains high concentrations of legacy pollutants like polychlorinated biphenyls (PCBs), as well as modern contaminants such as plasticizers (e.g., phthalates), perfluoroalkyl substances (PFAS), industrial anticorrosive agents (benzotriazoles), and even traces of pharmaceuticals. These chemicals are known endocrine disruptors, carcinogens, and immunotoxins. Using this blubber as a composite matrix would mean creating a product saturated with a complex mixture of anthropogenic poisons.

Predicted Composite Properties (A First-Principles Failure Analysis)

A theoretical analysis of the proposed composite, based on the fundamental properties of its components, predicts a catastrophic failure across all performance metrics.

- **Lack of Structural Integrity:** A matrix made of biological fats and waxes lacks the long-chain, cross-linking polymer structure necessary for a functional composite. It would possess virtually no tensile or flexural strength and would have a very low melting/softening point. There is no plausible chemical mechanism for strong adhesion between the lipid matrix and the inorganic, particulate tobacco ash filler. The resulting material would be a weak, greasy, and structurally useless paste, unable to bear any significant load.
- **Extreme Toxicity:** The composite would be a uniquely hazardous material from a toxicological standpoint. The heavy metals from the tobacco ash (Pb, Cd, As) combined with the POPs from the whale blubber (PCBs, PFAS, phthalates) would create a solid-state cocktail of toxins. Manufacturing this material would expose workers to severe health risks. Any end-product would pose a direct threat to consumers through dermal

contact or inhalation of abraded particles, exposing them to a mixture of carcinogens, neurotoxins, and endocrine disruptors.
- **Environmental Nightmare:** The material's end-of-life scenario would be an environmental disaster. It would not be recyclable or safely disposable. Whether placed in a landfill or discarded in the environment, it would act as a concentrated point source of pollution, slowly leaching heavy metals and persistent organic pollutants into soil and groundwater for decades. The very act of creating this composite would be an act of environmental degradation, taking two separate hazardous waste streams and combining them into a new, more dangerous, and more mobile form of contamination.

Part III: A Comparative Synthesis and Pedagogical Conclusion

The preceding analysis has established two starkly contrasting narratives. Part I detailed the story of Hempoxy composites—a material system born from sustainable agriculture, enabled by modern law, and advanced by innovative science. Part II deconstructed the hypothetical Tobacco Ash–Whale Fat composite, revealing it as a concept fundamentally prohibited by legal, ethical, and toxicological realities. This final part brings these two narratives into direct juxtaposition, synthesizing the key differences to articulate the core pedagogical lessons for the education of responsible engineers. The ultimate purpose of this report is not merely to compare two materials, but to use that comparison to build a robust framework for ethical and holistic decision-making in engineering practice.

Section 3.1: Juxtaposition of Principles: A Head-to-Head Analysis

To fully appreciate the chasm that separates a viable, sustainable material from a non-viable, hazardous one, a direct, multi-criteria comparison is essential. This analysis moves beyond simple mechanical properties to encompass the full spectrum of considerations that define 21st-century engineering, including sustainability, legality, safety, and market context.

Comparative Analysis

The following table provides a holistic comparative scorecard, summarizing the fundamental differences between the two composite concepts. This framework illustrates that for a material to be considered viable, it must succeed across all domains; failure in a single critical area, such as legality or safety, renders the entire concept untenable, regardless of any other potential attributes.

Table 1: The Tale of Two Composites: A Holistic Comparative Scorecard

Criterion	Hempoxy Composite	Tobacco Ash–Whale Fat Composite
Raw Material Sustainability	**Excellent:** Derived from a rapidly renewable, carbon-negative crop that improves soil health.	**Catastrophic:** Components sourced from the illegal hunting of endangered species and a toxic post-consumer waste stream.
Carbon Footprint (Lifecycle)	**Net-Negative to Low Positive:**	**Highly Negative:** Sourcing

Criterion	Hempoxy Composite	Tobacco Ash–Whale Fat Composite
	Begins with a significant carbon credit from crop sequestration. Final GWP depends on processing but is far lower than synthetic alternatives.	involves disruption of marine carbon sinks. The material itself concentrates toxins, representing a net environmental liability.
Mechanical Performance	**Good & Tunable:** Comparable to some synthetic fibers like glass fiber in specific strength. Properties can be tailored via hybridization and advanced reinforcements.	**Negligible:** Predicted to have virtually no structural integrity, strength, or stiffness due to an unstable lipid matrix and poor filler-matrix adhesion.
Durability	**Moderate:** Primary challenge is moisture sensitivity, which can be mitigated with coatings and design. Thermoset nature provides good stability.	**Very Poor:** The lipid matrix is prone to oxidation, rancidity, and thermal degradation. The material would be chemically and physically unstable.
End-of-Life Options	**Good:** Biodegradable and recyclable through mechanical grinding, contributing to a circular economy.	**Extremely Hazardous:** A concentrated block of solid hazardous waste, requiring specialized and costly disposal to prevent severe environmental contamination.
Legality of Sourcing	**Legal & Regulated:** Enabled by the 2018 Farm Bill and governed by clear state/tribal/federal licensing and testing protocols.	**Illegal:** Sourcing of whale fat is prohibited by the IWC moratorium on commercial whaling and CITES trade restrictions.
Manufacturing Safety	**Safe:** Based on standard composite manufacturing processes with bio-based, non-toxic materials. Standard PPE is sufficient.	**Extremely Dangerous:** Would require handling of heavy metals, POPs, and other carcinogens. Demands extensive PPE and hazardous material containment.
End-User Safety	**Safe:** The final product is benign, non-toxic, and suitable for consumer-facing applications like building materials and automotive interiors.	**Highly Toxic:** Poses a severe health risk to end-users through dermal contact or inhalation, exposing them to a cocktail of poisons.
Ethical Impact	**Positive:** Promotes sustainable agriculture, rural economic development, and a transition away from fossil fuels.	**Deeply Unethical:** Relies on the destruction of protected marine mammals and utilizes a waste product from an industry with major negative public health impacts.

Criterion	Hempoxy Composite	Tobacco Ash–Whale Fat Composite
Market Viability	**High & Growing:** Part of a rapidly expanding market for sustainable, bio-based materials driven by consumer demand and regulation.	**Zero:** No legal, ethical, or commercial market could possibly exist for such a hazardous and prohibited material.

Market Context for Bio-Composites

The viability of Hempoxy composites is not merely theoretical; it is grounded in a real and rapidly growing global market for natural fiber-reinforced composites. This market context provides the final, pragmatic validation of the Hempoxy paradigm while underscoring the complete absence of any conceivable market for the hypothetical alternative.

- **Flax Fiber Composites:** Often considered a benchmark for natural fibers, flax is recognized for offering some of the best mechanical properties, with a specific modulus higher than that of glass fiber. Its use is well-established in applications ranging from sporting goods to automotive components.
- **Jute Fiber Composites:** As a low-cost and abundant fiber, jute has found significant commercial application in non-structural and semi-structural parts, particularly in the automotive industry for components like door panels and seatbacks, and in the construction industry for panels and furniture.
- **Bamboo Fiber Composites:** Often marketed as "bamboo steel," high-performance bamboo fiber composites are experiencing explosive growth, especially in the construction sector. Driven by its rapid renewability and impressive strength, the global market for these materials was valued at $8.7 billion in 2024 and is projected to grow significantly, with some forecasts predicting a market size of approximately $2.2 billion by 2033 for certain high-performance segments. This growth is heavily concentrated in Asia, particularly China, which leverages its abundant bamboo resources and strong domestic construction demand.

This thriving marketplace for natural fiber composites demonstrates a clear industrial and consumer demand for sustainable materials that offer a balance of performance, cost, and environmental benefit. Hempoxy composites are perfectly positioned to compete and innovate within this sector. Conversely, the market analysis reveals no demand, no supply chain, and no regulatory pathway for materials derived from toxic waste or illegally sourced biological products, confirming the absolute non-viability of the Tobacco Ash–Whale Fat concept.

Section 3.2: Lessons in Engineering Responsibility: The Case Study as a Teaching Tool

The stark contrast between the two composite concepts serves a purpose beyond mere technical comparison. It has been deliberately constructed as a pedagogical instrument to teach the principles of engineering responsibility. By presenting a case of clear success alongside a case of unequivocal failure, this report functions as an educational module designed to cultivate a holistic and ethically aware engineering mindset. This approach draws upon established theories in engineering education, including the use of "wicked problems" and extreme case studies, to move beyond rote memorization and foster higher-order critical thinking.

Applying the "Wicked Problems" Framework

In the lexicon of design and planning, a "wicked problem" is one that is difficult or impossible to solve because of incomplete, contradictory, and changing requirements that are often difficult to recognize. The hypothetical Tobacco Ash–Whale Fat composite is a perfect embodiment of a wicked problem, designed to fail on every conceivable level. Its analysis forces students to grapple with:

- **High Complexity:** The problem intertwines disparate fields, including materials science, international law, toxicology, environmental science, and ethics. A purely mechanical solution is impossible because the problem's constraints are primarily non-mechanical.
- **Deep Uncertainty:** The potential failure modes are numerous and unpredictable, from catastrophic structural collapse to long-term toxic leaching and unforeseen ecological consequences.
- **Deep Conflicts:** The concept creates a fundamental conflict between a hypothetical industrial use and universally accepted values of wildlife conservation and public health.
- **Scale Mismatches:** The problem spans multiple scales, from the molecular interactions within the composite to the global scale of international treaties and oceanic pollution.

By confronting students with such a problem, educators can teach a crucial lesson: the first step in solving a problem is to correctly define its boundaries and constraints. The Tobacco Ash–Whale Fat case demonstrates that some problems are "wicked" because they violate fundamental, non-negotiable principles, and the correct engineering solution is to recognize them as non-starters.

The Power of the Negative and Extreme Case Study

Engineering ethics education has long relied on case studies, often analyzing historical disasters like the Space Shuttle Challenger explosion or the Hyatt Regency walkway collapse to derive lessons about professional responsibility. This report employs a similar methodology but with a prospective, hypothetical case. The use of an "extreme" or exaggerated comparison is a deliberate pedagogical strategy, drawing from concepts like "Extreme Pedagogy," which uses challenging and unconventional scenarios to maximize student engagement and learning.

The absurdity of the Tobacco Ash–Whale Fat composite is its primary educational strength. It creates a memorable and unambiguous example that clearly delineates the boundaries of acceptable engineering practice. It forces students to move beyond simple calculations and engage in critical thinking, analysis, and value-based judgment. This method provides a "virtual apprenticeship" in ethical decision-making, allowing students to practice navigating complex, open-ended problems in a safe, simulated environment where they must defend their conclusions based on a wide range of evidence.

Fostering a Holistic Engineering Mindset

The ultimate objective of this comparative analysis is to contribute to the engineering of a better learning experience—a practice that can be described as "Pedagogical Engineering". This approach views education as a system to be designed, modeled, and optimized to produce a desired outcome: in this case, a generation of engineers with a holistic, responsible, and world-conscious mindset.

Traditional engineering education has been criticized for being too linear, dogmatic, and focused on lower-order thinking skills, often failing to prepare graduates for the complex, interdisciplinary challenges of the modern world. This case study directly addresses that critique. By forcing a confrontation with a concept that is simultaneously a technical, legal, environmental, and moral failure, it compels students and professionals alike to internalize a more comprehensive set of design questions. The engineer's responsibility is not limited to asking, "Can we make this?" They must also, and more importantly, ask:

- "Should we make this?" (The Ethical Question)
- "Are we legally allowed to even consider this?" (The Regulatory Question)
- "What are the full lifecycle consequences of making this?" (The Sustainability Question)

By embedding these questions into the very fabric of the design process, this pedagogical approach aims to ensure that future engineering innovations are not only technologically brilliant but also socially responsible, environmentally sustainable, and fundamentally ethical.

Works cited

1. Bison Biocomposites: Sustainable Building Materials | Hemp-Based Eco-Friendly Solutions, https://bisonbiocomposites.com/ 2. The Sustainability of Hemp: Rooting for a Greener Future | cbdMD Health & Wellness Blog, https://www.cbdmd.com/blogs/posts/hemp-sustainability 3. Assessment of the Environmental Feasibility of Utilizing Hemp ..., https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC12349608/ 4. Advances in Environmental and Engineering Research | Development of a Life Cycle Sustainability Assessment Framework for Hemp-Based Building Materials in Australia - lidsen, https://www.lidsen.com/journals/aeer/aeer-06-01-014 5. An assessment of life cycle studies on hemp fibre applications, https://www.votehemp.com/PDF/11-07-07_META-LCA_Hemp_Fibre_Products.pdf 6. Industrial Hemp Production - ATTRA – Sustainable Agriculture - NCAT, https://attra.ncat.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/11/industrial-hemp-production.pdf 7. Farm Bill Primer: Hemp Industry Support and Regulation | Congress.gov, https://www.congress.gov/crs-product/IF12278 8. Industrial Hemp Cultivation - County of San Diego, https://www.sandiegocounty.gov/content/sdc/awm/industrialhemp.html 9. RHS - Responsible Hemp Standard - Control Union Global, https://www.controlunion.com/certification-program/rhs-responsible-hemp-standard/ 10. Interconnected Carbon Nanosheets Derived from Hemp for Ultrafast Supercapacitors with High Energy | Request PDF - ResearchGate, https://www.researchgate.net/publication/236652568_Interconnected_Carbon_Nanosheets_Derived_from_Hemp_for_Ultrafast_Supercapacitors_with_High_Energy 11. Industrial Hemp (Cannabis sativa L.) Agronomy and Utilization: A Review - MDPI, https://www.mdpi.com/2073-4395/13/3/931 12. Mechanical properties of hemp fiber‐reinforced thermoset and thermoplastic polymer composites: A comprehensive review - ResearchGate, https://www.researchgate.net/publication/387674958_Mechanical_properties_of_hemp_fiber-reinforced_thermoset_and_thermoplastic_polymer_composites_A_comprehensive_review 13. Investigation of Hemp and Flax Fiber-Reinforced EcoPoxy Matrix Biocomposites: Morphological, Mechanical, and Hydrophilic Properties - PMC, https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC9658773/ 14. MECHANICAL PROPERTIES OF HEMP FIBRE/EPOXY COMPOSITES. INFLUENCE OF FIBRE CHEMICAL TREATMENTS - IRIS Unina, https://www.iris.unina.it/retrieve/handle/11588/717256/194455/Sepe_Bollino_Ceparano_Lamanna.pdf 15. (PDF) Mechanical properties of epoxidized hemp oil based biocomposites: preliminary results - ResearchGate,

https://www.researchgate.net/publication/279672473_Mechanical_properties_of_epoxidized_hemp_oil_based_biocomposites_preliminary_results 16. MECHANICAL PROPERTIES OF EPOXIDIZED HEMP OIL BASED BIOCOMPOSITES: PRELIMINARY RESULTS - University of Southern Queensland Repository, https://research.usq.edu.au/download/31de1175e49ba4e2aa1dd35233dd583d8c30d5d3cd407134f9c46dda6a9be4f8/489208/Manthey_Cardona_Aravinthan_eddBE2011_PV.pdf 17. Mechanical properties of epoxidized hemp oil based biocomposites ..., https://research.usq.edu.au/item/q0v5v/mechanical-properties-of-epoxidized-hemp-oil-based-biocomposites-preliminary-results 18. Use of lignin as a compatibiliser in hemp/epoxy composites | Request PDF - ResearchGate, https://www.researchgate.net/publication/251543977_Use_of_lignin_as_a_compatibiliser_in_hempepoxy_composites 19. Use of lignin as a compatibiliser in hemp/epoxy composites, https://kompozit.org.tr/wp-content/uploads/2020/07/Use_of_lignin_as_a_compatibiliser_in_hem.pdf 20. Preparation and properties of wood flour reinforced lignin-epoxy resin composite, https://bioresources.cnr.ncsu.edu/resources/preparation-and-properties-of-wood-flour-reinforced-lignin-epoxy-resin-composite/ 21. Synthesis and characterization of kraft lignin-based epoxy resins - BioResources, https://bioresources.cnr.ncsu.edu/resources/synthesis-and-characterization-of-kraft-lignin-based-epoxy-resins/ 22. Jute/Hemp bio-epoxy hybrid bio-composites: Influence of stacking sequence on adhesion of fiber-matrix - Portsmouth Research Portal, https://researchportal.port.ac.uk/files/49126781/Jute_Hemp_bio_epoxy_hybrid_bio_composites_AAM.pdf 23. Sustainable Composites from Nature to Construction: Hemp and ..., https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC9920535/ 24. Hemp-Derived Carbon Nanosheets in Composite Materials | PDF ..., https://www.scribd.com/document/899769795/Hemp-Derived-Carbon-Nanosheets-in-Composite-Materials 25. US20140328006A1 - Carbon nanosheets - Google Patents, https://patents.google.com/patent/US20140328006A1/en 26. Introducing HDCNS-Composites: Hemp-Derived Carbon Nanosheets Integrated Into Various Matrixes for Composite Materials - Reddit, https://www.reddit.com/r/materials/comments/1jjgqi8/introducing_hdcnscomposites_hempderived_carbon/ 27. Natural Flax Fibre Reinforcement in Composites, https://www.easycomposites.co.uk/learning/flax-fibre-in-composites 28. Investigation on Mechanical Properties of Hemp Fiber-Reinforced in Cellulose Acetate Composite Compared with Other Fiber Composites 2024-01-5073 - SAE International, https://www.sae.org/publications/technical-papers/content/2024-01-5073/ 29. Oxford Public International Law: Whaling, https://opil.ouplaw.com/display/10.1093/law:epil/9780199231690/law-9780199231690-e1236 30. International Convention for the Regulation of Whaling - Wikipedia, https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/International_Convention_for_the_Regulation_of_Whaling 31. International Whaling Commission | NOAA Fisheries, https://www.fisheries.noaa.gov/international-affairs/international-whaling-commission 32. International Whaling - European Commission - Environment, https://environment.ec.europa.eu/topics/nature-and-biodiversity/international-whaling_en 33. Tobacco Smoke and Toxicology - Clearing the Smoke - NCBI Bookshelf, https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/books/NBK222356/ 34. (PDF) Determination of Toxic Elements in Tobacco, Tobacco Smoke ..., https://www.researchgate.net/publication/332493359_Determination_of_Toxic_Elements_in_Tobacco_Tobacco_Smoke_and_Ash_from_Selected_Imported_Cigarettes_Brands 35.

Measurement of Trace Metals in Tobacco and Cigarette Ash by Inductively Coupled Plasma-Atomic Emission Spectroscopy | Journal of Chemical Education - ACS Publications, https://pubs.acs.org/doi/10.1021/ed080p83 36. Tobacco industry responsibility for butts: a Model Tobacco Waste Act, https://tobaccocontrol.bmj.com/content/26/1/113 37. HAZARDOUS WASTE LAWS & TOBACCO PRODUCT WASTE - Public Health Law Center, https://www.publichealthlawcenter.org/sites/default/files/resources/CA-TPW-Hazardous-Waste.pdf 38. Toxic Trash: How Do We Handle Tobacco Product Waste? - ETR.org, https://www.etr.org/blog/toxic-trash-how-do-we-handle-tobacco-product-waste/ 39. Pharmacological and Chemical Effects of Cigarette Additives - PMC - PubMed Central, https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC2040350/ 40. (PDF) LEVERAGE OF CIGARETTE ASH POWDER CONCENTRATIONS ON THE ALTERNATING BENDING FATIGUE OF UNSATURATED POLYESTER RESIN - ResearchGate, https://www.researchgate.net/publication/347621110_LEVERAGE_OF_CIGARETTE_ASH_POWDER_CONCENTRATIONS_ON_THE_ALTERNATING_BENDING_FATIGUE_OF_UNSATURATED_POLYESTER_RESIN 41. A Good Use for Cigarette Ash: A Surprising Solution for Arsenic Removal | Lab Manager, https://www.labmanager.com/a-good-use-for-cigarette-ashes-12566 42. Evolution and function of specialized adipose tissue in whales - The Company of Biologists, https://www.biologists.com/meetings/jeb2017/programme/koopman/ 43. Comprehensive molecular and morphological resolution of blubber stratification in a deep-diving, fasting-adapted seal - PMC, https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC9795062/ 44. Flexible Bionanocomposites from Epoxidized Hemp Seed Oil Thermosetting Resin Reinforced with Halloysite Nanotubes | The Journal of Physical Chemistry B - ACS Publications, https://pubs.acs.org/doi/abs/10.1021/acs.jpcb.7b00103 45. Stratification of lipids, fatty acids and organochlorine contaminants in blubber of white whales and killer whales - ResearchGate, https://www.researchgate.net/publication/260284671_Stratification_of_lipids_fatty_acids_and_organochlorine_contaminants_in_blubber_of_white_whales_and_killer_whales 46. Fin Whale as a Sink of Legacy and Emerging Contaminants: First Integrated Chemical Exposomics and Gene Expression Analysis in Cetaceans | Environmental Science & Technology, https://pubs.acs.org/doi/10.1021/acs.est.5c00844 47. Mechanical Behaviors of Flax Fiber-Reinforced Composites at ..., https://pmc.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/articles/PMC6471640/ 48. Mechanical properties of flax fibers and their composites - DiVA portal, https://www.diva-portal.org/smash/get/diva2:989858/FULLTEXT01.pdf 49. Jute Fibre Reinforced Polymer Composites in Structural Applications: A Review - Research Explorer The University of Manchester, https://research.manchester.ac.uk/en/publications/jute-fibre-reinforced-polymer-composites-in-structural-applicatio 50. Jute Fibre Reinforced Polymer Composites in Structural Applications: A Review - Uniscience Publishers, https://unisciencepub.com/wp-content/uploads/2024/06/Jute-Fibre-Reinforced-Polymer-Composites-in-Structural-Applications-A-Review.pdf 51. (PDF) Jute Based Bio and Hybrid Composites and Their Applications, https://www.researchgate.net/publication/335457660_Jute_Based_Bio_and_Hybrid_Composites_and_Their_Applications 52. Bamboo Steel (High-Performance Bamboo Fiber Composite ..., https://www.datainsightsmarket.com/reports/bamboo-steel-high-performance-bamboo-fiber-composite-material-239304 53. Bamboo Composite Market Size, Share & Growth Report, 2034, https://www.gminsights.com/industry-analysis/bamboo-composite-market 54. Consumer Behavior and Bamboo Steel (High-Performance Bamboo Fiber Composite Material) Trends - Market Insights Report, https://www.marketreportanalytics.com/reports/bamboo-steel-high-performance-bamboo-fiber-composite-material-156634 55. Transformability as a Wicked Problem: A Cautionary Tale? - MDPI, https://www.mdpi.com/2071-1050/12/15/5895 56. Using case studies in engineering ethics education: the case for immersive scenarios through stakeholder engagement and real life data, https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/22054952.2021.1914297 57. Using Case Studies To Teach Engineering Design And Ethics - ASEE PEER, https://peer.asee.org/using-case-studies-to-teach-engineering-design-and-ethics.pdf 58. The Case Method: Using Case Based Instruction To Increase Ethical Understanding In Engineering Courses | Purdue e-Pubs, https://docs.lib.purdue.edu/context/enegs/article/1000/viewcontent/the_case_method_using_case_based_instruction_to_increase_ethical_understanding_in_engineering_courses.pdf 59. Teaching Materials Using Case Studies - EdCuration, https://edcuration.com/resource/vendor/595/Case%20Study.pdf 60. Extreme Pedagogy: An Agile Teaching-Learning Methodology for Engineering Education, https://sciresol.s3.us-east-2.amazonaws.com/IJST/Articles/2015/Issue-9/Article5.pdf 61. eXtreme Teaching-Learning Paradigm: A pedagogical framework for higher education, https://www.researchgate.net/publication/285371819_eXtreme_Teaching-Learning_Paradigm_A_pedagogical_framework_for_higher_education 62. Using Case Studies to Teach Engineering Design and Ethics, https://sites.asee.org/eld/wp-content/uploads/sites/7/2017/10/richards_ethics.ppt 63. Pedagogical Engineering: The Way We Teach Engineering | NMITE X Change Feed Article, https://nmite.ac.uk/NMITEXChange/the-NMITEXChange-feed/pedagogical-engineering 64. Adding Necessary Rigor to Engineering Pedagogical Change | NSTA, https://www.nsta.org/journal-college-science-teaching/journal-college-science-teaching-julyaugust-2021/adding-necessary 65. Full article: Engineering education in change. A case study on the impact of digital transformation on content and teaching methods in different engineering disciplines - Taylor & Francis Online, https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/03043797.2023.2285794