GTTSE 2011
Markus Voelter

Language and IDE Modularization and Composition with MPS

Reviewer Feedback Cover Letter

Dear Reviewers,

first of all, please accept my apologies for the state of the paper you reviewed. Based on your feedback there are two major shortcomings. The first one is that the way the paper is structured it is not an academic paper. The second shortcoming is a degree of sloppiness. I address these two major issues here in the cover letter. I will also address the issues in the three reviews specifically.

Academic Rigor: The paper does not introduce the various modularization and composition techniques well enough; it does not define them; it does not have enough related work and references.

Reply: My understanding was that I had been invited to GTTSE primarily to give a tutorial and that the paper is accompanying material. I wrote it in a way that is appropriate for a tutorial, not as an academic paper. Obviously this was a misunderstanding on my part, and I could have avoided it by looking at earlier GTTSE papers. This revision addresses this problem by completely rewriting the introduction, the related work and the discussion section (and lots of other places). In contrast to what some of the reviews suggest, I am aware of many of the related works. However, because of my misinterpretation of the goal of the paper I did not include them. This revision changes this.

Sloppiness: Typos, Formulations, Various formatting issues

Reply: Another misunderstanding. The version I submitted before GTTSE was called a draft. I mistook this to mean that it's a rough writeup of what I will talk about in the tutorial. I was not aware that this would be the version that would be reviewed by three reviewers. So: sorry for having to read a paper with so many typos and mistakes in the text. Obviously this is fixed now in the updated version.

Attached are a new version of the paper as well as the three reviews with my replies to the feedback. My replies in the reviews are marked with the **->** sign.

Regards,
Markus Völter