

# **AN ANSWER TO A CASTILIAN CHAUVINIST ON THE ISSUE OF CATALONIA**

Recently I was been accused by a great-Spanish chauvinist going by the pseudonym of "Cesnark" of being an enemy of the Spanish working class and an enemy of communism for saying that the Catalan's compose a different nation than the Castilian Speaking population residing in central Spain. Cesnark also went and wrote a small article<sup>[1]</sup> attacking my position and not only that, but doubting our knowledge of Marxism. This is fine, since we aren't afraid of petty critiques which rely more on sentimentalism saying nothing of essence; we aren't afraid, but it is tiring for us to deal with whatever a chauvinist who does not think of terms of nations at all, but of terms of an identity implanted by the dominant nation within the state. In this case, it seems to me that a lot of "leftists" within Spain are a bunch of assimilationist chauvinists who endanger our movement globally.

We will deal with Cesnark's article piece by piece, and hopefully this response will be used in the future too against most chauvinists facing a similar situation in their countries.

It is interesting how you use Stalin to say that a territory like Catalonia that does not fulfill the characteristics of a nation according to Stalin and then nation-states constituted for 200 like those of the American territory that if they comply,

you affirm that they are the same. Are Australia and New Zealand the same nation? No.

Here we will focus on some specific things which we have highlighted too. It highlights three points of Cesnark and both of these three points reveal the outer misunderstanding of what Mr. Cesnark views as a nation.

- A) Catalonia does not fulfil the characteristics of a nation as formulated by Stalin
- B) The Mestizo Spanish speaking populations of the Americas dont constitute a single nation
- C) Are "Australia" and "New Zealand" the same nation?  
Mr. Cesnark in an affirmative manner declares "No!".

We will analyse point A. Mr. Cesnark uses some old quotes by Marx and Engels which obviously say nothing more than the sheer fact that the question of nations *was not* on the forefront and never much analyzed on detail before the Bolsheviks, and when it did, it was done on a wrong manner (Bauer). Then he proceeds to quote Lenin on "ABC of Marxism" which again, says nothing at all if a community consists of a nation or not. Here Cesnark can't even comprehend that there is a reason why he and all other Spanish "Marxists" are not much relevant and that the trade unions are full of non-spanish nationalists while the Communist Party is on cahoots with the compradorist government. We have pointed the link of his writing, anyone wishing can go check it. But for now, we will ignore his rambling and speak of concrete facts

concerning the implications of reality and not abstract quotes of Marx and Engels of 200 years ago.

Cesnark said that i misunderstand Stalin. Here are the characteristics of the nation for Stalin.

A nation is a historically constituted, stable community of people, formed on the basis of a common language, territory, economic life, and psychological make-up manifested in a common culture. [2]

From these, *the most important* ones are of course territory, historical constitution, and a common language. A common culture and economic life were mostly used as *dividers* which arent that strong either once they break into the realm of reality(do Cretans form a separate nations from Greeks? e.t.c). It is obvious that in the real world, these three matter the most. But the crux of the matter is that culture and economy were used by Stalin to keep his writing up to the marxist canon of the idea than nations "are recent", and thus their creation denote the feudal epoch of the "divided people and economy" e.t.c. It is obvious to everyone that this feudal epoch is not present in Catalonia at the moment, the therefore this arguement is mostly obselete.

Language? It is there. Cesnark admits that indeed Catalan and Spanish are *different languages*. Here is what Stalin says about language.

There is no nation which at one and the same time speaks

several languages, but this does not mean that there cannot be two nations speaking the same language!

Thus, either one of two; either the Spanish *dont constitute a nation at all*, or the Spanish are a nation *but the Catalans are too*. I wont even mention the attack on me being "idealist" for saying what is obvious to everyone and the masses of Catalonia themselves know. What Cesnark is defending is Francoism which is indeed what kept Spain together for so many years, but i guess that this is at least not "idealistic speech typical of Fichte or Hergert, that is, German idealism" in his mind!

Territory? The Catalans do have that in western Spain where they form the majority. Culture, economy and historical constitution too, their language is not a new invention and neither they settled in the places they are now yesterday.

Of course, he attacks me of focusing on Language, because this is the most *strongest divider*. As Stalin said, two languages = two nations and period. Either Cesnark agrees with Stalin or not.

On Spanish speaking Americas; they speak one language (save some native nations), share a contiguous territory e.t.c. Of course, they are *one single nation* and every communist and anti-imperialist force in this nation thinks in this manner, be it the Bolivarians, the CPCuba, e.t.c. There is a reason ALBA exist.

The only ones who think that these states are different nations are the fascists and their compradors, like the Colombian government which fights the people who think

that Colombia is not a nation but a part of a larger nation (The FARC) and the minions of Anez in Bolivia which, when in government, the first thing they did was to remove Bolivia from ALBA.

On "New Zealand" and "Australia"? Obviously, *they form one nation*. What separates the english speaking population of the two states if not an *artificial border*?

I would like you to call "Tuscan Chauvinist" to the Italian comrades who precisely defend the unity of Italy against the independence fascists from the north of their country, an area richer for its industry and that qualifies the Neapolitans and Sicilians in a derogatory way as Africans, the same case with Catalonia and the Basque Country, more industrialized areas, with higher political privileges than the rest of the territory and who are dedicated to launching those same messages. Donating the Spanish working class as parasites only shows what you are, as I said, before an enemy of the working class.

Again in this sentimental manure, we will focus on Italy and the "parasites".

Here Cesnarks makes obvious that he does not understand what a nation is at all; for Cesnark, the nation is linked by the class position of its inhabitants, or the goals of the ones pushing for secession. In his mind, nations aren't an objective fact, but rely on how their representatives think of politics. This is a separate issue. It is an issue of at any given moment, a separatist movement *should be supported or not* based on its relation to imperialism. For example, should the Uyghur current separatist movement be supported? No, because it is backed by imperialist powers and it will be detrimental to our cause. But are the Uyghurs a separate

nation? Yes.

To acknowledge if something is a nation, and if a X movement should be supported, *are two separate things*.

But is not only this, he now speaks on Italy. Obviously, indeed, we criticize these "Communists" who say that "there are no other nations than Italian in Italy". The question if the Lombard independence movement (like the Catalan) should be supported is something else.

On parasitism, i bet that Cesnark thinks that imperialism does not exist and that a 1500 euros paid cashier in Spain is an exploited proletarian *because he works for a wage*. Like a good Spaniard, i bet he loves to watch football on TV. Real Madrid gave a wage to Christiano Rolando too, and made profit out of him. I guess that Rolando too is an exploited proletariat.

On the argument that most Catalans speak more spanish than Catalan, yes, Cesnark just made the discovery of national oppression and the fact that it was only 46 years ago that the Spanish Government gave them the right to use their language in an official manner.

What is his views on Ireland where not even 10% speak Irish as their first language? What about Nigeria where about 180 million people (or about 90% of the population) speak English thanks to colonialism?

What Cesnark said he can apply it to the Bolshevik policy and also on the writings of Stalin on the issue and see if what i say is correct or wrong. Too much time is spend to someone who defends the Spanish compradorist government and the idea pushed by the Falangists of a

"no non-spanish nation exists in Spain".

F. U. Kuqe 9 September 2021

REFERENCES:

[1]<https://files.fm/f/xq374cqak>

[2]

<https://www.marxists.org/reference/archive/stalin/works/1913/03a.htm#s1>