M. Ashraf et al. / International Journal of Greenhouse Gas Control xxx (2013) xxx-xxx

based methods in the context of realistic  $CO_2$  injection scenarios. We implemented this method for a typical  $CO_2$  storage problem. Four uncertain parameters with assumed uncertainty distributions

are considered. Injection and early migration of CO<sub>2</sub> is studied. The

The goal was to demonstrate the application and feasibility of aPC-

flow sensitivity to geological heterogeneity is evaluated and quantified using Sobol indices. Risk analysis is performed on the defined problem. Flow dynamics are discussed and corresponding inter-

pretations and explanations of the sensitivity and risk results are

The performance of the aPC method has been satisfactory. It is very fast, compared to other stochastic methods for low-parametric systems, and this speed-up allows us to perform an extensive Monte-Carlo process on the aPC-based response surface to calculate the probability of response values throughout simulation time.

This study was a first-time application of the aPC to study a realistically complex type of geological structural uncertainty. Based on our assessment of aPC feasibility, we can strongly encourage the use of aPC for sensitivity and risk analysis in complex situations.

The results have shown that the most influential parameter for most of the responses is the aggradation angle of deposition layers of the considered shallow-marine aquifer. The least relevant parameter is the regional groundwater effect, especially during

injection time. We re-iterate that the aim of this study was to demonstrate a practice of using arbitrary polynomial chaos expansion for the sensitivity and risk analysis of a typical  $CO_2$  storage problem. Since, in general, the levels of involved input uncertainty are not unique, the physical and geological conclusions of this study

are restricted to the probability assumptions taken here and should

not be generalized to systems that are very different.

## Acknowledgements The authors would like to acknowledge the sponsors of the

MatMora project defined in the University of Bergen in partnership with SINTEF-ICT and the University of Stuttgart, and the German Research Foundation (DFG) for financial support of the project within the Cluster of Excellence in Simulation Technology (EXC 310/1) at the University of Stuttgart. We would also like to thank the three anonymous reviewers for their constructive comments.

## Abramowitz, M., Stegun, A.I., 1965. Handbook of Mathematical Functions with For-

References

mulas, Graphs, and Mathematical Tables. Dover, New York. E. Aker, E. Skurtveit, L. Grande, F. Cuisiat, Ø. Johnsen, M. Soldal, B. Bohloli, Experimental methods for characterization of cap rock properties for CO2 storage, Multiphysical Testing of Soils and Shales, pp. 303-308.

Ashraf, M., Lie, K., Nilsen, H., Nordbotten, J., Skorstad, A., 2010a. Impact of geological heterogeneity on early-stage CO2 plume migration. In: CMWR Ashraf, M., Lie, K.-A., Nilsen, H.M., Skorstad, A., 2010b. Impact of geological hetero-

geneity on early-stage CO2 plume migration: sensitivity study. In: Proceedings of ECMOR XII. Babuška, I., Nobile, F., Tempone, R., 2007. A stochastic collocation method for elliptic partial differential equations with random input data. SIAM Journal on Numer-

ical Analysis 45 (3), 1005-1034 Bachu, S., 2003. Screening and ranking of sedimentary basins for sequestration of CO<sub>2</sub> in geological media in response to climate change. Environmental Geology 44 (3), 277-289.

Bachu, S., 2008. CO<sub>2</sub> storage in geological media: role, means, status and barriers to deployment. Progress in Energy and Combustion Science 34 (2), 254-273. Barthelmann, V., Novak, E., Ritter, K., 2000. High dimensional polynomial interpolation on sparse grids. Advances in Computational Mathematics 12 (4), 273-288. Birkholzer, J., Zhou, Q., Tsang, C., 2009. Large-scale impact of CO2 storage in deep

saline aquifers: a sensitivity study on pressure response in stratified systems. International Journal of Greenhouse Gas Control 3 (2), 181-194. Brennan, S., Burruss, R., Merrill, M., Freeman, P., Ruppert, L., 2010. A probabilistic assessment methodology for the evaluation of geologic carbon dioxide storage.

US Geological Survey Open-File Report 1127, 31. Celia, M., Bachu, S., Nordbotten, J., Gasda, S., Dahle, H., 2004. Quantitative estimation of CO2 leakage from geological storage: analytical models, numerical models and data needs. In: Proceedings of 7th International Conference on Greenhouse Gas Control Technologies (GHGT-7).

Class, H., Ebigbo, A., Helmig, R., Dahle, H., Nordbotten, J., Celia, M., Audigane, P.,

Darcis, M., Ennis-King, J., Fan, Y., et al., 2009. A benchmark study on problems related to CO2 storage in geologic formations. Computational Geosciences 13

(4), 409-434.E. Commission, European Commission's Communication on Extended Impact Assessment, Brussels, Office for Official Publications of the European Communities, 2002.

Crestaux, T., Le MaiLtre, O., Martinez, J., 2009. Polynomial chaos expansion for sensitivity analysis. Reliability Engineering & System Safety 94 (7), 1161-1172. Dutton, S., Flanders, W., Barton, M., 2003. Reservoir characterization of a Permian deep-water sandstone, East Ford field, Delaware basin, Texas. AAPG Bulletin 87

(4),609-628.Eaton, T., 2006. On the importance of geological heterogeneity for flow simulation. Sedimentary Geology 184 (3-4), 187-201. Eigestad, G., Dahle, H., Hellevang, B., Riis, F., Johansen, W., Øian, E., 2009. Geological modeling and simulation of CO2 injection in the Johansen formation.

Computational Geosciences 13 (4), 435-450. Förster, A., Norden, B., Zinck-Jørgensen, K., Frykman, P., Kulenkampff, J., Spangen-

berg, E., Erzinger, J., Zimmer, M., Kopp, J., Borm, G., et al., 2006. Baseline

characterization of the CO2SINK geological storage site at Ketzin, Germany. Environmental Geosciences 13 (3), 145-161. Fajraoui, N., Ramasomanana, F., Younes, A., Mara, T.A., Ackerer, P., Guadagnini, A.,

2011. Use of global sensitivity analysis and polynomial chaos expansion for interpretation of non-reactive transport experiments in laboratory-scale porous media. Water Resources Research, http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2010WR009639. Foo, J., Karniadakis, G., 2010. Multi-element probabilistic collocation method in high dimensions. Journal of Computational Physics 229 (5), 1536-1557.

Gerstner, T., Griebel, M., 2003. Dimension-adaptive tensor-product quadrature. Computing 71 (1), 65-87. Ghanem, R., Doostan, A., 2006. On the construction and analysis of stochastic models: characterization and propagation of the errors associated with limited data.

Journal of Computational Physics 217 (1), 63-81. Ghanem, R., Spanos, P.D., 1990. Polynomial chaos in stochastic finite elements.

Journal of Applied Mechanics 57, 197-202. Ghanem, R.G., Spanos, P.D., 1991. Stochastic Finite Elements: A Spectral Approach. Springer-Verlag, New York.

Ghanem, R., Spanos, P., 1993. A stochastic Galerkin expansion for nonlinear random vibration analysis. Probabilistic Engineering Mechanics 8, 255-264 Hansson, A., Bryngelsson, M., 2009. Expert opinions on carbon dioxide capture and storage-a framing of uncertainties and possibilities. Energy Policy 37 (6),

2273-2282. Howell, J., Skorstad, A., MacDonald, A., Fordham, A., Flint, S., Fjellvoll, B., Manzocchi, T., 2008. Sedimentological parameterization of shallow-marine reservoirs. Petroleum Geoscience 14 (1), 17-34.

Isukapalli, S.S., Roy, A., Georgopoulos, G.P., 1998. Stochastic response surface methods (srsms) for uncertainty propagation: application to environmental and biological systems. Risk Analysis 18 (3), 351-363. Jang, S.Y., Sitar, N., Kiureghian, D.A., 1994. Reliability analysis of contaminant trans-

port in saturated porous media. Water Resources Research 30 (8), 2435-2448. Keese, A., Matthies, H.G., 2003. Sparse quadrature as an alternative to MC for stochastic finite element techniques. Proceedings in Applied Mathematics and Mechanics 3, 493-494. Kovscek, A., Wang, Y., 2005. Geologic storage of carbon dioxide and enhanced

oil recovery. I. uncertainty quantification employing a streamline based proxy for reservoir flow simulation. Energy Conversion and Management 46 (11),

1920-1940. Le Maî tre, O., Knio, O., 2010. Spectral Methods for Uncertainty Quantification: With Applications to Computational Fluid Dynamics. Springer, New York. Lenzen, M., 2011. Global warming effect of leakage from CO2 storage. Critical

Reviews in Environmental Science and Technology 41 (24), 2169-2185. Li, H., Zhang, D., 2007. Probabilistic collocation method for flow in porous media: comparisons with other stochastic methods. Water Resources Research 43,

44 - 48Manzocchi, T., Walsh, J., Nell, P., Yielding, G., 1999. Fault transmissibility multipliers for flow simulation models. Petroleum Geoscience 5 (1), 53-63 Manzocchi, T., Matthews, J., Strand, J., Carter, J., Skorstad, A., Howell, J., Stephen, K.,

ical uncertainty on production from faulted and unfaulted shallow-marine oil

Walsh, J., 2008. A study of the structural controls on oil recovery from shallow-

marine reservoirs. Petroleum Geoscience 14 (1), 55-70. Manzocchi, T., Carter, J., Skorstad, A., Fjellvoll, B., Stephen, K., Howell, J., Matthews, J., Walsh, J., Nepveu, M., Bos, C., et al., 2008. Sensitivity of the impact of geolog-

reservoirs: objectives and methods. Petroleum Geoscience 14 (1), 3-11.

Matthews, J., Carter, J., Stephen, K., Zimmerman, R., Skorstad, A., Manzocchi, T., Howell, J., 2008. Assessing the effect of geological uncertainty on recovery estimates in shallow-marine reservoirs: the application of reservoir engineering to the SAIGUP project. Petroleum Geoscience 14 (1), 35-44.

 $stochastic\ partial\ differential\ equations.\ Computer\ Methods\ in\ Applied\ Mechandric and the property of the property o$ ics and Engineering 194, 1295-1331. Michael, K., Golab, A., Shulakova, V., Ennis-King, J., Allinson, G., Sharma, S., Aiken, T., 2010. Geological storage of CO2 in saline aquifers - a review of the experi-

ence from existing storage operations. International Journal of Greenhouse Gas Control 4 (4), 659-667

Nobile, F., Tempone, R., Webster, C., 2008. A sparse grid stochastic collocation

method for partial differential equations with random input data. SIAM Journal on Numerical Analysis 46 (5), 2309-2345.

Please cite this article in press as: Ashraf, M., et al., Geological storage of CO<sub>2</sub>: Application, feasibility and efficiency of

Matthies, G., Keese, H.A., 2005. Galerkin methods for linear and nonlinear elliptic

global sensitivity analysis and risk assessment using the arbitrary polynomial chaos. Int. J. Greenhouse Gas Control (2013), http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ijggc.2013.03.023