

CS 6240: Assignment 4

Pagerank in Spark

Design Discussion

I followed the 3 step design strategy mentioned in the homework as follows:

Preprocessing: For starters I handled the case where the html file had char '&' which is invalid so I added '&' as per world wide web consortium. Apart from that, for a sample graph here's how we handle parsing from Map to Reduce in Spark:

1. Load input file
2. Apply map to parse each line of input using WikiParse
3. Output format of Parser for each line *PageName\tAdjacencyList*
4. Split each line and convert into tuple of format: *(PageName, (AdjacentNodes, 0))*
5. Now to handle a special edge case, for all dangling nodes that do not have a line will be passed through above step and would not be taken into account. So, in order to handle above edge case I've mapped all values in adjacent list and then union those with original graph list and filter all duplicates which leaves us with valid list that we can start with.
6. Calculate the total number of links and initialize it as broadcast variables so that it is available in distributed mode.
7. Once we have the count, I updated all values of pageranks to $1/\text{totalNumberLinks}$.
8. I initialized the graph as a variable and persisted it in memory since it going to be updated multiple iterations which would provide us performance boost.
9. Next I filter out all dangling nodes from normal nodes into two separate RDDs

PageRank: I used the solution 2 for computing dangling node pagerank share for $i+1$ iteration at the beginning of i th iteration phase and making it available to all tasks. I grasped the concept of PageRank from pseudo code which I found logical but since that did not handling dangling nodes, I started programming spark solution for it based off that code and took it from there.

1. **Output format** preprocessing phase *(PageName, (AdjacencyList, initPageRank))*

2. Iterations: 10

- a. Calculate the dangling loss, keeping only pageranks for all dangling nodes and performing a reduce on them
- b. Update pageranks of all dangling nodes with dangling loss calculated in (a)
- c. Update all normal nodes by dividing old pageranks by total number of adjacent nodes and then calculating them with new pagerank
- d. Finally update the graph by taking a union between dangling nodes from step b and c

TopK Sort: Sorting came out pretty easy because of already implemented sorting algorithms in spark using `sortBy` and taking the top 100 from them. Finally for pretty printing purposes after taking the top 100 into *PageName\tPageRank*

Compare

Preprocessing: In MapReduce I had written a custom Map-Reduce job for parsing as a separate job while in spark I had to do it step by step.

PageRank: Implementing pagerank in MapReduce was tricky and inelegant compared to that of Spark, since I had to conditionalize at several steps which seemed tricky too in the beginning with spark but became pretty obvious towards the end. In MapReduce, the pipeline had to be put together starting from the output of preprocessing step as input to pagerank and then consecutive pageranks output acting as input for next generation needed to be written on filesystem whereas in spark this was not the case saved a lot of I/O. Calculating dangling node was not possible in map phase since the computation sum of pageranks of all dangling nodes had to be done in reducer because of which we needed a global counter for reflecting the change in next iteration. One downside or more of a tricky part of spark was the part where we had to segregate dangling and adjacent nodes computation since scala is more of an functional language than imperative.

TopK: For sorting too, I had to write another MapReduce job the uses TopK design pattern and use of a TreeMap limiting the size of TreeMap to top 100 pageranks to increase efficiency. While in the case of spark, sorting is an in-built feature where we can simply define the key to be used for sorting and then simply take 100 from the sorted list. The major tradeoff of Spark is that for efficient computation RDD need heap the size of data structure (size of which cannot be computed on paper) which puts the program at risk

of heap allocation issues while MapReduce is disk based which makes it free of these issues. One advantage of Spark being the ability of to move data around for next computation so it can run reduce without waiting for all MapReduce jobs to complete. The amount of data shuffled is one of the major causes apart from heap allocation issues and the amount of issues one faces when trying to segregate data into two parts and combining them which becomes an issue in case of bigger datasets.

Performance Comparison

Framework	6 Machines	11 Machines
Spark	2hr 15 min	1hr 11 min
MapReduce	1hr 4 min	37 min

The reason behind spark running slow in my case the amount of computations it takes to handle the edge case (dangling node present in adjacent list but no line in it), the reasoning behind that is on my local machine on looking at the rows the part that I mentioned above took 92% of the time (55 seconds for parsing and making graph but 5 seconds for pagerank computation). I can only imagine the case in case of big dataset.

Top 100 Pages

Sorted from highest ranking to lowest

The answers seems reasonable looking at the keywords in the sample dataset while in the mega dataset since the dataset belongs to year 2006 I'm pretty happy with the result in 10 iterations placing 2006 on the top with most pagerank.

The answer don't differ a lot from each other for e.g. in the first two lines I've mentioned the pageranks of MapReduce and spark respectively which do not differ more than ~.005%.

SIMPLE WIKIPEDIA DATA MAPREDUCE

United_States_09d4 0.005355777601255395 0.005548825295802055

Country 0.004027824046355395 0.0041218694048619315

Wikimedia_Commons_7b57 0.0036022714985541565

Week 0.003084465720751175

Earth 0.0026752943563853387

Water 0.002546000793679085

Europe 0.002523803647437281
Sunday 0.002435140370849413
Monday 0.002384176065598382
Wednesday 0.0023542561216078825
United_Kingdom_5ad7 0.002304059494456286
Friday 0.0022884877073897055
Saturday 0.0022622064161520465
Thursday 0.0022291401408207814
Tuesday 0.0022154232994574677
Day 0.002214672571305371
index 0.0021428657009387743
Asia 0.002048696137474343
Animal 0.002019930329063209
France 0.0018433959710020043
City 0.0017698940247303772
Money 0.0017096034585455699
Government 0.0016776941838347683
Number 0.0016539807641294132
Energy 0.0015556498502864366
Sun 0.0015435842672796775
English_language 0.0015398752446945734
Plant 0.0015367815772914688
England 0.0014954793083519719
India 0.001474593356160982
Germany 0.001465669214320054
Italy 0.0013886001687866954
Wiktionary 0.0013628464893483602
Wikimedia_Foundation_83d9 0.0013460253833042647
Computer 0.0013324712512722398
People 0.001305977143147495
Planet 0.0012922282160995502
Science 0.0012772149801701903
Canada 0.0012494104235240542

Human 0.0012150250625922526
State 0.0011455735684420825
China 0.0011447345133376349
Year 0.0011414494449842518
Spain 0.001112032104007919
Wikipedia 0.0010729174818036337
Japan 0.001068713408744579
Mathematics 0.0010629869193989033
Food 0.001059291804649356
Australia 0.0010474679016676523
Geography 0.0010385557642966254
Russia 0.001035641036663431
Greek_language 0.00103330695704128
Capital_(city) 0.001022697843835778
Atom 9.90285448638182E-4
Society 9.627595314902565E-4
Liquid 9.468816031824316E-4
Language 9.435983218665094E-4
Moon 9.263060285517775E-4
Africa 9.220092243932372E-4
Metal 9.11448578054992E-4
World 9.024211689218325E-4
Sound 8.925511641359888E-4
Cyprus 8.884938768969182E-4
Light 8.812600713629492E-4
Culture 8.795620015871022E-4
Greece 8.762906211813577E-4
History 8.696008691701632E-4
Law 8.670235864565729E-4
Turkey 8.55910398497589E-4
Scientist 8.523872220858339E-4
Plural 8.483304168102193E-4
Religion 8.34546008939885E-4

Scotland 8.321642740565298E-4
Circle 8.105646859580774E-4
Gas 8.017461004974286E-4
2004 7.950566438796031E-4
Ocean 7.741850211831742E-4
20th_century 7.732364121600164E-4
Poland 7.643205099705985E-4
Solid 7.636188505689122E-4
Information 7.627704616486011E-4
Sweden 7.593342065596659E-4
Television 7.582907444708231E-4
Nation 7.496152107354E-4
War 7.429907486244271E-4
Trade 7.40708869926796E-4
Denmark 7.354747520959662E-4
Building 7.32203871729194E-4
19th_century 7.320051566582628E-4
Continent 7.316903496399993E-4
Portugal 7.29182994494692E-4
Electricity 7.136784745130115E-4
Chemical_element 7.08076888666907E-4
Austria 6.882539890516241E-4
Image 6.815065310045475E-4
Republic_of_Ireland_10e7 6.780880414452558E-4
Music 6.748331871234114E-4
Belgium 6.669926820299989E-4
Time 6.638254426235764E-4
God 6.552185960502633E-4

SIMPLE WIKIPEDIA DATA SPARK

United_States_09d4 0.005548825295802055
Wikimedia_Commons_7b57 0.0041218694048619315
England 0.003817371277739225

Germany 0.0035332786671783993
France 0.002525059984194524
Inhabitant 0.0022125292087488285
City 0.0019428475458643211
Wiktionary 0.001778641618089768
Computer 0.0016454297465091105
Japan 0.0015939145952123552
Animal 0.0015873020080940702
United_Kingdom_5ad7 0.0015120371716174274
Country 0.0014822397792028155
India 0.0014622273465472201
Europe 0.0014091767849129496
Australia 0.001350428013761719
Italy 0.0013487930818108173
Water 0.0013259229829391584
Canada 0.0013022397106097928
Television 0.0012564213873361462
English_language 0.0012440309959703174
Spain 0.0012439654924628993
Plant 0.001229689883995675
Earth 0.0011519893331854796
London 0.0011032814951953671
Football_(soccer) 0.0010776824681638303
Scotland 0.00107199200206158
Greece 0.0010707386174618092
China 0.0010595623348008474
Money 0.0010485541377480148
Music 0.0010194743435322999
Metal 9.815116345407182E-4
Food 9.785253418010495E-4
Capital_(city) 9.689441566104012E-4
2005 9.668547497985122E-4
Brazil 9.604593284520008E-4

Netherlands 9.485313681422204E-4
Human 9.433428004608947E-4
U.S._state_5a68 9.417402319782708E-4
2006 9.338870651012233E-4
Greek_mythology 9.011728377901181E-4
Poland 8.825157693906941E-4
Russia 8.812785711597241E-4
Book 8.801116929197717E-4
Number 8.677230337955904E-4
Mathematics 8.657794466703634E-4
2004 8.295154088806876E-4
People 8.292099796677795E-4
Actor 8.12638988048379E-4
Language 8.097369871160237E-4
Asia 8.066696615846714E-4
Government 8.035590132424333E-4
California 8.01246146831695E-4
God 7.956744204255607E-4
Year 7.89122190181667E-4
Sweden 7.806550041557545E-4
Religion 7.587719094811818E-4
University 7.536235316625896E-4
Fruit 7.374176280032844E-4
Africa 7.244647175264564E-4
Science 7.190605203975692E-4
Chemical_element 7.001796932530667E-4
Film 6.938896115628842E-4
Car 6.780110390106711E-4
Internet 6.670272510687821E-4
Disease 6.667438793560819E-4
Company 6.586160820945392E-4
World_War_II_d045 6.528190240842213E-4
River 6.444170659173428E-4

Species 6.434692378948752E-4
19th_century 6.406390306797231E-4
Internet_Movie_Database_7ea7 6.351015578478554E-4
Fish 6.342664444332303E-4
Prefecture 6.321128777819253E-4
Video_game 6.316776017577949E-4
North_America_e7c4 6.1826447292494E-4
Liquid 6.120296602864808E-4
Singer 6.059726469577596E-4
1970s 6.047711027779445E-4
Chad 6.006111136666962E-4
Island 6.000193785172712E-4
Sport 5.799847851737136E-4
War 5.765409509519231E-4
County 5.720206167768031E-4
2001 5.691310530775546E-4
Tool 5.687157922399536E-4
1960s 5.562591439048566E-4
German_language 5.526719505718819E-4
Band 5.504566094530488E-4
Greek_language 5.492574080821844E-4
Dinosaur 5.483398421395952E-4
Bird 5.479774667616909E-4
New_York_City_1428 5.463928850621049E-4
Mammal 5.407918844187377E-4
Tree 5.403774580958704E-4
Christianity 5.390665318617126E-4
Austria 5.331423176387067E-4
Paper 5.322931379120414E-4
Word 5.319969109511678E-4
2003 5.272881338406235E-4

BIG WIKIPEDIA DATA SPARK

2006 0.0014920760969739189
United_States_09d4 0.0013299391361721584
United_Kingdom_5ad7 6.909197635236242E-4
2005 6.441475771352479E-4
France 5.094348783496997E-4
2004 4.3436094669958863E-4
Germany 3.997035998660669E-4
England 3.98531940832174E-4
Canada 3.832928601048221E-4
2003 3.477077304703758E-4
Italy 3.2840550275288396E-4
Australia 3.226610267707091E-4
Japan 3.1510698593140103E-4
English_language 2.982189290731356E-4
India 2.811552832867081E-4
World_War_II_d045 2.792335870587863E-4
Europe 2.7640188613208667E-4
Wikimedia_Commons_7b57 2.73873970236108E-4
2002 2.679878469473865E-4
2001 2.604812158757935E-4
Russia 2.5638029261881206E-4
Spain 2.5207580717932315E-4
London 2.5120344963285246E-4
Wiktionary 2.495211489511024E-4
2000 2.464193712173099E-4
index 2.3659248123397047E-4
1999 2.2631894692557494E-4
Geographic_coordinate_system 2.1765131137219774E-4
Race_(United_States_Census)_a07d 2.1420382619338234E-4

New_York_City_1428 2.0066172646246853E-4
1998 1.9285813940081624E-4
Sexagenary_cycle 1.8957189935115052E-4
1997 1.893422167179812E-4
January_1 1.8889021088400158E-4
Latin 1.8623506229802309E-4
Netherlands 1.8227741182140446E-4
Internet_Movie_Database_7ea7 1.822301891127428E-4
China 1.804642512035373E-4
Scotland 1.7897972157917102E-4
Population_density 1.7728840466749174E-4
1996 1.7597487057506258E-4
French_language 1.7583910426884224E-4
1995 1.685701495101728E-4
Gregorian_calendar 1.684480767094944E-4
1991 1.646282046741122E-4
1994 1.6242519872599763E-4
Soviet_Union_ad1f 1.5949092793559583E-4
Sweden 1.5946745704803497E-4
1990 1.586201866380676E-4
Biography 1.5700541482397144E-4
1993 1.5234095439014728E-4
Egypt 1.5084070486255213E-4
1945 1.5019808221113237E-4
1992 1.4878331699088595E-4
1980 1.4671397913761116E-4
New_Zealand_2311 1.4609833964421455E-4
Greek_language 1.45429366519352E-4
International_Phonetic_Alphabet_96f8 1.4455191773350167E-4
1989 1.4424253851408266E-4
California 1.4384412326758444E-4
1974 1.4349615844128658E-4
1970 1.4344085345985232E-4

European_Union_e368 1.4334171287636775E-4
1979 1.4202366295932683E-4
Square_mile 1.4088137097768069E-4
1986 1.404619609612325E-4
1969 1.3917077048323565E-4
1976 1.385833488942994E-4
New_York_3da4 1.3807215052200365E-4
1981 1.3759483030844076E-4
1975 1.373522585895231E-4
Public_domain 1.3625766174258822E-4
19th_century 1.3585219832868968E-4
1982 1.3507222791698785E-4
1972 1.3486427170254686E-4
Ireland 1.346846113607906E-4
Greece 1.3432708987580412E-4
1985 1.3391270939924898E-4
Poland 1.3359057167464184E-4
Switzerland 1.3343608993229795E-4
People's_Republic_of_China_82bf 1.333429603744648E-4
Portugal 1.3314666664759677E-4
Paris 1.3305379337486407E-4
German_language 1.3240932419006092E-4
1971 1.3200428781096066E-4
Austria 1.3198210050315224E-4
1973 1.315162910676586E-4
Television 1.3059789980267192E-4
1984 1.2996518561059735E-4
1983 1.295438106675563E-4
Mexico 1.2951896536378003E-4
1968 1.2949750640369766E-4
World_War_I_9429 1.293959133139155E-4
1977 1.2937730398434192E-4
1967 1.2901472998762647E-4

United_Nations_3208 1.288419414047113E-4
1987 1.2723301598069266E-4
Denmark 1.2711960612723044E-4
Israel 1.2703458560928694E-4
South_Africa_1287 1.2665028789059934E-4

BIG WIKIPEDIA DATA MAPREDUCE

2006 0.0017561678956932896
United_States_09d4 0.0015629256171461271
United_Kingdom_5ad7 8.128548074567297E-4
2005 7.564963469890166E-4
France 5.925301936896899E-4
2004 5.099211551020347E-4
England 4.6864921101578874E-4
Germany 4.673017525794225E-4
Canada 4.5387147485567546E-4
2003 4.0821507598863153E-4
Australia 3.823167537352121E-4
Italy 3.7942937213960887E-4
Japan 3.712414683098072E-4
English_language 3.441478626653587E-4
India 3.306205198168228E-4
World_War_II_d045 3.257223788921249E-4
Europe 3.2413335109059176E-4
Wikimedia_Commons_7b57 3.190315197028015E-4
2002 3.152210480279782E-4
2001 3.067781066910124E-4
Russia 2.976467741991308E-4
London 2.939697118177294E-4
Spain 2.9388671993097197E-4
Wiktionary 2.9087192154469244E-4
2000 2.900563417746145E-4
1999 2.6604268563140676E-4

Geographic_coordinate_system 2.605359080494864E-4
Race_(United_States_Census)_a07d 2.516181276495843E-4
New_York_City_1428 2.349706752953641E-4
1998 2.2683950071502245E-4
index 2.2537299431849066E-4
1997 2.2229350413132716E-4
Internet_Movie_Database_7ea7 2.1809382069533858E-4
January_1 2.1776223196021512E-4
Latin 2.1405555021091627E-4
Sexagenary_cycle 2.1395666889813969E-4
Netherlands 2.1235611032947364E-4
Population_density 2.1084636247127543E-4
Scotland 2.098679197724891E-4
China 2.0940714138364917E-4
1996 2.067576559341469E-4
French_language 2.0358887219561834E-4
1995 1.9784243755527093E-4
1991 1.9256456201430992E-4
1994 1.9057852019116069E-4
Gregorian_calendar 1.9018501335305366E-4
Biography 1.8987844110374437E-4
Sweden 1.877519843059108E-4
1990 1.85735493794695E-4
Soviet_Union_ad1f 1.8442914940787583E-4
1993 1.7870174784252857E-4
1992 1.743009157291231E-4
1945 1.7355067815388685E-4
Egypt 1.7352763673565312E-4
New_Zealand_2311 1.7283377472129526E-4
1980 1.7093646700823602E-4
California 1.6978941783386627E-4
1989 1.686558190404602E-4
1974 1.669965256442851E-4

Greek_language 1.669815145504117E-4
Square_mile 1.6696225923309852E-4
1970 1.6661433343946735E-4
European_Union_e368 1.663306992990674E-4
1979 1.6525851782910593E-4
1986 1.640052552408662E-4
International_Phonetic_Alphabet_96f8 1.6234059557987404E-4
New_York_3da4 1.6218406912468114E-4
1969 1.6165358996418416E-4
1976 1.6109815081919275E-4
1981 1.6020688572732572E-4
1975 1.5964401164388577E-4
Ireland 1.5804692014397817E-4
1982 1.575246188062329E-4
19th_century 1.573149434213807E-4
Public_domain 1.569875990428344E-4
Switzerland 1.5688485519409865E-4
1972 1.5680244312973025E-4
1985 1.5649492178643963E-4
Poland 1.5635162879973753E-4
Television 1.56043197092036E-4
Greece 1.5599289619959325E-4
Portugal 1.554131856898917E-4
People's_Republic_of_China_82bf 1.546906842926289E-4
Paris 1.5466448380756806E-4
Austria 1.5370765775585613E-4
1971 1.5323070188567075E-4
German_language 1.5320009068820422E-4
1973 1.5269889882460117E-4
Mexico 1.524303669140567E-4
1984 1.5184881565541674E-4
1983 1.513047618813404E-4
1977 1.5059998664674107E-4

1968 1.5049201699578754E-4
World_War_I_9429 1.5045643188356077E-4
1967 1.4990820328140901E-4
United_Nations_3208 1.4954232897493303E-4
1987 1.4901742052346803E-4
Denmark 1.4872554335581447E-4
South_Africa_1287 1.4799637778879806E-4
Israel 1.46878199854074E-4