

Player A is the recommended choice. He is younger and has performed better than Player B, especially in recent seasons.

Although Player B has more hits and a higher overall batting average, Player A reaches base at a higher rate (OBP). This is largely due to Player A drawing nearly twice as many walks as Player B in a similar number of plate appearances. Player A also leads in On Base Plus Slugging Plus (OPS+) which factors total bases into batting statistics and adjusts for other factors such as ballpark dimensions.

Weighted On Base Average (wOBA), like slugging percentage, values extra base hits higher than singles and walks. wOBA also applies weights for each of these outcomes based on season-specific run values rather than simply using total bases. Player A has a higher wOBA overall compared to Player B, and a significantly higher wOBA than Player B in each of the last two years. The expected Weighted On Base Average (xwOBA) is slightly lower than actual wOBA for Player A. This disparity suggests that Player A may be getting somewhat lucky at the plate and there could be regression in future performance. Both wOBA and xwOBA, however, are higher for Player A than they are for Player B. This indicates that Player A provides more offensive value overall than Player B.

Player A has scored more runs (348) than Player B (315) and leads in advanced statistics for quantifying run creation such as Weighted Runs Above Average (wRAA), Weighted Runs Created Plus (wRC+) and Deserved Runs Created Plus (DRC+). DRC+ uses additional context such as stadiums and opposing pitchers to get a true representation of how a player contributes at the plate. DRC+ for Player A is at least 34% higher than the league average in each of the last three seasons.

Both players have good fielding percentages, indicating that they do not make many errors. Player A, however, leads Player B in all major defensive statistics including Range Factor, Defensive Runs Saved, Ultimate Zone Rating, Outs Above Average, and Fielding Runs Above Average (FRAA). FRAA quantifies how many plays a player can make compared to an average player at their position. FRAA accounts for situational factors such as handedness and position. Player A is a left-handed first baseman while Player B is right-handed and plays both first base and designated hitter. In the most recent season Player A's FRAA was an excellent 11.3 compared to a well below average score of -10.5 for Player B.

Wins Above Replacement (WAR) considers the full picture of a player's performance including hitting, defense, and baserunning. Baseball Reference, FanGraphs and Baseball Prospectus each rank Player A with a higher overall WAR compared to Player B. Player A has had a WAR above 4.0 in each of the last three seasons, which corresponds to All-Star level or higher playing performance.

Player A is recommended because of his better performance across all phases of the game compared to Player B, his consistently high performance over the last three seasons on offense, excellent defense last year, and the fact that he is six years younger than Player B.