

8330f16, Peer Rev. of A03 (AR) by _____ (authors' names)

	Beginning, 1	Developing, 2	Accomplished, 3	Exemplary, 4	Score
Word File Organization & Citations	Problems with at least one key component (text, refs., Tables, Figs.). Major deficiencies with regard to requested format.	Contains discussion, endnotes, 2 Tables & 2 Figs. Sequencing issues. Noticeable inconsistencies with font, size, line spacing.	Discussion followed by endnotes, 2 Tables & 2 Figs. Minor issues with font, size, line spacing, page numbers, or header.	Discussion in Section 1, endnotes follow, section 2 with 2 Tables & 2 Figs. on separate pages. Formatted exactly as requested.	/4
Structures Figure 1 Counts 0.5	At least two str. correct. "Ball & Bond" models are shown.	At least two str. correct. "Ball & Bond", white BG. Issues with perspective <u>and</u> alignment.	Three str. correct. "Ball & Bond", white BG. Minor issues w/ perspective <u>or</u> alignment.	Three str. correct. "Ball & Bond", 65%, white BG. Well oriented & aligned.	/2
PES Scans Figure 2	Fewer than three correct unmarked PES scans.	Three correct unmarked scans. Color <u>and/or</u> marks indicate level. Format close. Proper units.	Four correct unmarked scans; TS and M2 marked. Color <u>and/or</u> marks indicate level. Format OK. Proper units.	Five unmarked scans with marks for TS and M2 . Color & marks indicate level. Perfect format. Proper units.	/4
Tables Data Counts 0.5	More than 4 data points are incorrect in number or unit.	At least 4 data point are incorrect in number or unit.	At least 2 data points are incorrect in number or unit.	Data internally consistent, given with correct units, and appear fully correct.	/2
Tables Format Counts 0.5	Column or row missing.	Complete data listed in 5 or 3 columns. Minor issues with column sequence <u>and</u> units.	Complete data listed in 5 or 3 columns. Minor issues with column sequence <u>or</u> units.	Data listed in 5 or 3 columns, in the requested order, and with correct units.	/2
Legends Tables & Figs. Counts 0.5	Content of Tables and Figures remains unclear to a novice reader.	Content of Tables and Figures clearly described to a novice reader.	Content of Tables and Figures is clearly described. Relevant parameters (str. or rel. E) provided.	Legends "self-contained". Relevant parameters (str. or rel. E) provided. Main point is communicated.	/2
Discussion	Basis set effects correctly described for at least one of the three criteria.	Effects on reaction energies and activation energies described. Makes sense.	Effects on structures, rxn. and act. energies described. Correct.	Effects on structures, rxn. and act. energies described. Brief, concise, correct.	/4
Total (Max. 20)					

Constructive Comments (to guide the authors' revision):