

Philosophy 101

Consciousness & Objectivity

January 28, 2014

Philosophy 101

Consciousness
& Objectivity

Consciousness
& Physicalism

Nagel's
Argument

Consciousness & Physicalism

Physicalism

Physicalism: Everything that could exist is either physical or depends on the physical

Why be a Physicalist?

- Explanation
- Causal closure

Reductionism

Deducing, explaining, or otherwise showing a dependence relation to exist between one set of properties, facts, or concepts, and another privileged set of properties, facts, or concepts.

Reducing Consciousness

- Reduce features of conscious experience → Matter/energy organized according to physical laws (reduction base)
 - Can we deduce, explain, or otherwise show that conscious experience depends on matter/energy operating under physical laws?
 - If the answer is "yes" then we have "reduced" or "given a reduction" of conscious experience in terms of physics

Philosophy 101

Consciousness
& Objectivity

Consciousness
& Physicalism

Nagel's
Argument

Nagel's Argument

Nagel on the Problem of Consciousness

Consciousness is what makes the mind-body problem really intractable (435)

fundamentally an organism has conscious mental states if and only if there is something that it is like to be that organism—something it is like for the organism (436).

Nagel on the Problem of Consciousness

- ① **Sentience:** being able to discriminate, categorize, and react to environmental stimuli
 - ② **Wakefulness:** being awake and capable of attending to something
 - ③ **Autonomy:** The deliberate control of one's behavior
 - ④ **Introspection:** the internal accessibility of one's mental states
 - ⑤ **Communicability:** the reportability of one's mental states
 - ⑥ **Phenomenal consciousness:** The first-person experiential aspect of what it is like to be something
- Nagel means to indicate consciousness in the sense of (6) — phenomenal experience

Nagel on the Problem of Consciousness

we have at present no conception of what an explanation of the physical nature of a mental phenomenon would be...The most important and characteristic feature of conscious mental phenomena is very poorly understood. Most reductionist theories do not even try to explain it. And careful examination will show that no currently available concept of reduction is applicable to it. Perhaps a new theoretical form can be devised for the purpose, but such a solution, if it exists, lies in the distant intellectual future (436).

Why is Consciousness a Problem?

If physicalism is to be defended, the phenomenological features must themselves be given a physical account. But when we examine their subjective character it seems that such a result is impossible. The reason is that every subjective phenomenon is essentially connected with a single point of view, and it seems inevitable that an objective, physical theory will abandon that point of view (437).

Why is Consciousness a Problem?

if the facts of experience—facts about what it is like for the experiencing organism—are accessible only from one point of view, then it is a mystery how the true character of experiences could be revealed in the physical operation of that organism. The latter is a domain of objective facts par excellence—the kind that can be observed and understood from many points of view and by individuals with differing perceptual systems (442).

The Argument from Consciousness

- ① Physicalism requires that all aspects of reality be amenable to being "given a physical account"
- ② Giving a physical account of something means giving an account that is accessible from many different points of view
- ③ Facts about phenomenal consciousness are accessible from only one point of view
- ④ \therefore Facts about phenomenal consciousness are not amenable to a physical account

Examining the Argument

- ② Giving a physical account of something means giving an account that is accessible from many different points of view
- ③ Facts about phenomenal consciousness are accessible from only one point of view

Why think that the notion of a "point of view" is relevant to the truth of physicalism?

Facts & Points of View

- ① Physicalism entails that all facts are physical facts
- ② Physical facts are objective facts
- ③ Objective facts are independent of any particular point of view
- ④ Facts about consciousness depend on particular points of view
- ⑤ \therefore Facts about consciousness are not objective
- ⑥ \therefore Facts about consciousness are not physical

The Absolute Conception & Physicalism

Why are physical facts objective—i.e. independent of any particular point of view?

- Physical facts are facts about primary qualities, which are qualities that exist independently of any particular point of view

Primary Qualities and the Absolute Conception

- ① The absolute conception of the world is a conception of the world maximally free of the peculiarities of any subject's representation of the world
- ② Primary qualities are qualities of the world that do not depend on the peculiarities of perceiving subjects
- ③ \therefore Primary qualities are part of the absolute conception

The "General Difficulty"

We appear to be faced with a general difficulty about psycho-physical reduction. In other areas the process of reduction is a move in the direction of greater objectivity, toward a more accurate view of the real nature of things...Experience itself, however, does not seem to fit the pattern. The idea of moving from appearance to reality seems to make no sense here. What is the analogue in this case to pursuing a more objective understanding of the same phenomena by abandoning the initial subjective viewpoint toward them in favor of another that is more objective but concerns the same thing? (444)