

## Firing up the Ranks: Replication Memo

Hi Michael, Joshua, and John!

Your files were very clear, legible, and quick for replicating Figures 1 and 2. In addition, the outline for the paper is well organized and this newest iteration of your abstract makes the motivation for this research clear. One question I have: is this paper about just the Chinese military or are you trying to generalize about other militaries? Your abstract and title suggest “revolutionary autocratic regimes,” but you are only examining China’s PLA here, so it might be better to narrow the focus a bit at the front or demonstrate how this is generalizable at some point. Your current methods section provides a lot of historical context which might be better suited to the Introduction section and/or condensed so that you are really only including information that motivates why you are pursuing particular questions/methods. I think your finding, that there is shift in the treatment of combat experience before and after the cultural revolution, has significant implications to be included in the discussion section. How does this affect combat-readiness and the structural formation of the Chinese military? I imagine it is controversial to put out work that might question another nation’s military strength, so how do you plan to address that (although, I assume that there is a precedent for this in IR)? Lastly, are these results sufficient to fill in the last sentence of your abstract: “X%”? As per Figure 1, there is a post-war decrease in the effect of combat experience by 5% and you’ve provided further convincing support for this in Table 2 and Figure 2. Unless you’re planning to do further analysis, I think you have your final results and could include that in the abstract now? Overall, this is a really interesting project- wishing you all the best on the last draft!

-Mary