

**Problem 5.31.** Let

$$f(x) = \begin{cases} 3x + 1 & \text{for odd } x \\ x/2 & \text{for even } x \end{cases}$$

for any natural number  $x$ . If you start with an integer  $x$  and iterate  $f$ , you obtain a sequence,  $x, f(x), f(f(x)), \dots$ . Stop if you ever hit 1. For example, if  $x = 17$ , you get the sequence 17, 52, 26, 13, 40, 20, 10, 5, 16, 8, 4, 2, 1. Extensive computer tests have shown that every starting point between 1 and a large positive integer gives a sequence that ends in 1. But the question of whether all positive starting points end up at 1 is unsolved; it is called the  $3x + 1$  problem. Suppose that  $A_{TM}$  were decidable by a **TM**  $H$ . Use  $H$  to describe a **TM** that is guaranteed to state the answer to the  $3x + 1$  problem.

*Proof.* We construct a **TM**  $S$  that is guaranteed to state the answer to the  $3x + 1$  problem.  $S$  rejects if there exists some  $x$  for which the  $3x + 1$  problem does not end up at 1. Otherwise,  $S$  accepts.

$S =$  “On any input:

1. Construct **TM**  $M$  to solve the  $3x + 1$  problem for some  $x$ .
2.  $M =$  “On input  $x$ , where  $x \geq 1$ :
  1. Start with  $x$  and iterate  $f$  to obtain each term of the sequence  $x, f(x), f(f(x)), \dots$  step by step.
  2. If some term ever equals 1, then *accept*.”
3. Construct the following **TM**  $F$  that runs the **TM**  $M$  on every positive integer.  $M$  enters its accept state only if there exists some  $x$  for which the  $3x + 1$  problem does not end up at 1.
4.  $F =$  “On any input:
  1. Repeat for each  $i = 1, 2, 3, \dots$
  2. Run  $H$  on  $\langle M, i \rangle$ .
  3. If  $H$  rejects,  $M$  rejects  $i$  by looping, so *accept*.”
5. Run  $H$  on  $\langle F, F \rangle$ .
6. If  $H$  accepts, then there exists some  $x$  for which the  $3x + 1$  problem does not end up at 1, so *reject*. Otherwise, *accept*.

□