

**Problem 7.33.** In the following solitaire game, you are given an  $m \times m$  board. On each of its  $m^2$  positions lies either a blue stone, a red stone, or nothing at all. You play by removing stones from the board until each column contains only stones of a single color and each row contains at least one stone. You win if you achieve this objective. Winning may or may not be possible, depending upon the initial configuration. Let  $SOLITAIRE = \{\langle G \rangle \mid G \text{ is a winnable game configuration}\}$ . Prove that  $SOLITAIRE$  is NP-complete.

*Proof.* To show that  $SOLITAIRE$  is NP-complete, we must show that it is in NP and that all NP-problems are polynomial time reducible to it. The first part is easy; a certificate is simply the set of positions that needs to be cleared. To prove the second part, we show that  $3SAT$  is polynomial time reducible to  $SOLITAIRE$ . The reduction converts a Boolean formula  $\phi$  in 3CNF into an  $m \times m$  board  $G$  having either a blue stone, a red stone, or nothing at all placed on each of its  $m^2$  positions, so that  $G$  is a winnable game configuration, iff  $\phi$  is satisfiable.

Let  $\phi$  be any Boolean formula in 3CNF containing  $p$  clauses:

$$\phi = (a_1 \vee b_1 \vee c_1) \wedge (a_2 \vee b_2 \vee c_2) \wedge \cdots \wedge (a_p \vee b_p \vee c_p).$$

where each  $a$ ,  $b$  and  $c$  is a literal  $x_i$  or  $\overline{x_i}$ , and  $x_1, x_2, \dots, x_n$  are the  $n$  variables of  $\phi$ . Now we show how to convert  $\phi$  to  $G$ .

The board  $G$  contains a row for each clause in  $\phi$  and 3 consecutive columns  $3i - 2$ ,  $3i - 1$  and  $3i$  for each variable  $x_i$  in  $\phi$ . For each clause  $C_i$  in  $\phi$ , place stones in  $G$  for each of the three literals in  $C_i$  as follows:

1. If  $a_i$  is literal  $x_j$ , then place a red stone at row  $i$  and column  $3j - 2$ . Otherwise, place a blue stone.
2. If  $b_i$  is literal  $x_j$ , then place a red stone at row  $i$  and column  $3j - 1$ . Otherwise, place a blue stone.
3. If  $c_i$  is literal  $x_j$ , then place a red stone at row  $i$  and column  $3j$ . Otherwise, place a blue stone.

Next, we make sure that all three columns of a variable can only contain stones of a single color. This constraint is imposed by using the following configuration.

•	•	•
•	•	•
⋮	⋮	⋮
B	R	
R	B	
B		R
R		B

The placement of stones in the bottom four rows ensure that all three columns can only contain stones of a single color.

The above configuration is repeatedly used in columns of every variable as shown in the following figure.

	$x_1$			$x_2$			...	$x_n$		
$C_1$							...			
$C_2$							...			
⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮
$C_p$								...		
	B	R						...		
	R	B						...		
	B		R					...		
	R		B					...		
				B	R			...		
				R	B			...		
				B		R		...		
				R		B		...		
⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮	⋮
									B	R
									R	B
									B	
									R	

Cells in the shaded area of the board are empty.

