

Association for Computing Machinery, 2006), 113–20; Yee Whye Teh et al., “Hierarchical Dirichlet Processes,” *Journal of the American Statistical Association* 101, no. 476 (2006): 1566–81; Hannah Wallach, David Mimno, and Andrew McCallum, “Rethinking LDA: Why Priors Matter,” in *Advances in Neural Information Processing Systems* 22, ed. Y. Bengio et al. (La Jolla, CA: Neural Information Processing Systems: 2009), 1973–81; Sinead Williamson, Chong Wang, Katherine A. Heller, and David M. Blei. “The IBP Compound Dirichlet Process and Its Application to Focused Topic Modeling,” in *Proceedings of the 27th International Conference on Machine Learning*, ed. Thorsten Joachims and Johannes Fürnkranz (Madison, WI: International Machine Learning Society, 2010), 1151–58.

<sup>21</sup> Other introductions to LDA include Blei, “Introduction to Probabilistic Topic Models,” and David M. Blei and John D. Lafferty, “Topic Models,” in *Text Mining: Classification, Clustering, and Applications*, ed. Ashok Srivastava and Mehran Sahami (Boca Raton, FL: CRC Press, 2009), 71–94.

<sup>22</sup> Allen B. Riddell, “A Simple Topic Model,” accessed October 29, 2013, <http://purl.org/NET/how-to-read-n-articles-appendix>.

<sup>23</sup> The validation of topic models is an area of research in its own right. For a discussion of the issue, see Jonathan Chang et al., “Reading Tea Leaves: How Humans Interpret Topic Models,” in *Advances in Neural Information Processing Systems* 22, ed. Y. Bengio (La Jolla, CA: Neural Information Processing Systems, 2009), 288–96.

<sup>24</sup> The specific number of topics has no meaning itself, apart from the particular probabilistic model used. In practice, however, varying the number of topics tends to vary how “finely grained” the resulting topics are. For further discussion, see Wallach, Mimno, and McCallum, “Rethinking LDA, 1973–81.” The R software environment was used to model the data in conjunction with the *tm* and *topic-models* packages; visualizations were made using *ggplot2*. See R Development Core Team, *R: A Language and Environment for Statistical Computing* (Vienna: R Foundation for Statistical Computing, 2011); Ingo Feinerer, Kurt Hornik, and David Meyer, “Text Mining Infrastructure in R,” *Journal of Statistical Software* 25, no. 5 (March 2008): 1–54; Bettina Grün and Kurt Hornik, “topicmodels: An R Package for Fitting Topic Models,” *Journal of Statistical Software* 40, no. 13 (2011): 1–30.

<sup>25</sup> Louis Menand, *The Marketplace of Ideas: Reform and Resistance in the American University* (New York: W. W. Norton, 2010), 64–66, 74–77.

<sup>26</sup> This description comes from the journal’s page on its publisher’s website (<http://www.dukeupress.edu/Catalog/ViewProduct.php?viewby=journal&productid=45622>).

<sup>27</sup> Chang et al., “Reading Tea Leaves,” 288–96.

<sup>28</sup> Blei, Ng, and Jordan, “Latent Dirichlet Allocation,” 996n1.

<sup>29</sup> Wallach, Mimno, and McCallum, “Rethinking LDA”; Williamson et al., “The IBP Compound Dirichlet Process and Its Application to Focused Topic Modeling”; David M. Blei and John D. Lafferty, “A Correlated Topic Model of Science,” *The Annals of Applied Statistics* 1, no. 1 (2007): 17–35, doi:10.1214/07-AOAS114; Blei and Lafferty, “Dynamic Topic Models.”

<sup>30</sup> Hall, “Tracking the Evolution of Science”; Hall, Jurafsky, and Manning, “Studying the History of Ideas Using Topic Models”; Yanchuan Sim, Noah Smith, and David Smith, “Discovering Factions in the Computational Linguistics Community,” in *Proceedings of the ACL Workshop on Rediscovering Fifty Years of Discoveries* (Jeju, Korea: Association for Computational Linguistics, 2012): 22–23.

<sup>31</sup> Thomas S. Kuhn, *The Structure of Scientific Revolutions* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1962).

## Abstract

This compilation thesis contains an introductory chapter and four original articles. The studies comprising this thesis all concern aspects of how historical culture is constituted in historical media and history teachers’ narratives and teaching. It is argued that the teaching of history is a complex matter due to an internal tension resulting from the fact that history is both a product and a process at the same time. While historical facts, and knowledge thereof, are an important aspect of history, history is also a product of careful interpretation and reconstruction. This study analyses and discusses how history is constituted in history textbooks and popular history magazines, i.e. two common historical media, and in teachers’ narratives and teaching of history.

The study finds that the historical media studied generally tend to present history as void of perspective, interpretation and representation, suggesting this to be the culturally warranted form of historical exposition. Moreover, the teachers studied also tend to approach history as if it were not contingent on interpretation and reconstruction. These results indicate that the history disseminated in historical media and history classrooms presents history in a factual way and disregards the procedural aspects of history.

Applying the history didactical concepts of historical consciousness, historical culture and uses of history, this thesis argues that an essential aspect of historical understanding is an appreciation of the contextual contingency that characterises history. All history is conceived within a particular context that is pertinent to why and how a certain version of history is constructed. Furthermore, all history is also received within a particular context by people with particular preconceptions of history that are contextually contingent, in the sense that they are situated in a certain historical culture. Readers of historical media are members of societies and are thus affected by how history is perceived and discussed in these contexts. This thesis argues that an awareness of these aspects of history is an important factor for furthering a complex understanding of history that encompasses the tension highlighted above.

## Introduction

It has been claimed that history is a fundamental aspect of how we perceive ourselves and the world around us.<sup>1</sup> The historical dimension helps us to navigate in life and is an integral part of

our identity constitution.<sup>2</sup> As such, it could be argued that history is something larger than what is produced in academic institutions across the world or that is being disseminated in history textbooks or in history classrooms.<sup>3</sup> It could further be argued that there are cultural aspects related to history as well, and that we partake in a number of historical cultures<sup>4</sup> in our everyday and professional lives. These historical cultures affect what we perceive to be historically relevant and meaningful, and at the same time we affect and influence these historical cultures through our relations to, and dissemination of, history.<sup>5</sup> With this view, our relations to history take on the character of contingency: who we are, where we are situated and when we live become crucial aspects of how we perceive and approach history. This also has repercussions for history education.

According to what has sometimes been termed the ‘practical’ or ‘cultural turn’ in research, all meaning that can be derived from various media is contingent on how it is interpreted and negotiated by people<sup>6</sup> and this overarching perspective has inspired the hermeneutic approach taken in this thesis. If we focus on history and history education, this means that how we approach, interpret and teach history is contingent on our preconceptions and uses of it. From this perspective, studies of how historical media are perceived or interpreted need to pay close attention to the contexts in which these historical media are conceived and interpreted.<sup>7</sup> This research project

---

<sup>1</sup> See Klas-Göran Karlsson, ‘Historia, historiedidaktik och historiekultur - teori och perspektiv’, in *Historien är närvarande: Historiedidaktik som teori och tillämpning*, ed. Klas-Göran Karlsson and Ulf Zander (Lund: Studentlitteratur, 2014), 13–89; Paul Boghos Zazanian, *Historical Consciousness and the Construction of Inter-Group Relations: The Case of Francophone and Anglophone History School Teachers in Quebec* (Montréal: Université de Montréal, 2009), 23–24.

<sup>2</sup> Jörn Rüsen, ‘Historical Consciousness: Narrative, Structure, Moral Function, and Ontogenetic Development’, in *Theorizing Historical Consciousness*, ed. Peter Seixas (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2006), 67.

<sup>3</sup> Bernard Eric Jensen, ‘Historiemedvetande - begreppsanalys, samhällsteori, didaktik’, in *Historiedidaktik*, ed. Christer Karlegård and Klas-Göran Karlsson (Lund: Studentlitteratur, 1997), 49–81.

<sup>4</sup> The notion ‘historical culture’ is understood in this context as a notion that deals with what relationships individuals, groups, or societies may have to history that may be studied through various artefacts, such as historical media.

<sup>5</sup> See Henrik Åström Elmersjö, ‘Historical Culture and Peace Education: Some Issues for History Teaching as a Means of Conflict Resolution’, in *Contesting and Constructing International Perspectives on Global Education*, ed. Ruth Reynolds et al. (Rotterdam: Sense Publishers, 2015), 161–62.

<sup>6</sup> See David G. Stern, ‘The Practical Turn’, in *The Blackwell Guide to the Philosophy of the Social Sciences*, ed. Stephen P. Turner and Paul A. Roth (Padstow: Blackwell Publishing Ltd, 2003), 185, 192–200.

<sup>7</sup> See Robert J. Parkes, *Interrupting History: Rethinking History Curriculum after ‘The End of History’*, Counterpoints: Studies in the Postmodern Theory of Education., Volume 404 (New York: Peter Lang Publishing, 2011), 5; K. H. Sievers, ‘Toward a Direct Realist Account of Observation’, *Science & Education* 8, no. 4 (1 July 1999): 387–93.

aligns with this theoretical position, and it aims to analyse and discuss how historical culture is constituted in historical media and in history teachers’ narratives and implemented teaching. This research uses the central history didactical concepts of historical consciousness, uses of history and historical culture to enable comprehensive analyses of how historical media present history. Furthermore, analyses are carried out of how teachers narrate their interpretations of a textbook

account relating the outbreak of the Cold War, their personal experiences of the same historical event, and how they teach it to their pupils. These history didactical concepts are, as has been pointed out in research, vague and difficult to apply, and their inter-relations are in need of further theoretical specification.<sup>8</sup> Consequently, one ambition of this research has been to specify, operationalise and apply these concepts in analysis to enable studies of how history is represented, approached and perceived, both regarding personal and public aspects that are pertinent concerning history didactics in particular, and history in general. For these reasons, effort has been made to specifying and operationalising these concepts to enable a study of how historical culture is constituted in historical media and history teachers' narratives and teaching.

History teachers could be regarded as having multiple and, perhaps, conflicting, roles to play. On the one hand they are individuals with their own personal experiences and views of history. On the other, they are professionals that are expected to teach what could be regarded as 'the official history' as portrayed in history curricula and historical media,<sup>9</sup> i.e. they may have to navigate between different historical cultures and both public and personal aspects of these historical cultures.<sup>10</sup> Furthermore, history education has gone through rather fundamental changes during the last 50 years. It has gone from being aimed at disseminating a mono-perspectival national narrative to being a subject aimed at developing a complex historical understand-

---

<sup>1</sup> See Erik Axelsson, 'Historia i bruk och medvetande: En kritisk diskussion av två historiografiska begrepp', in *En helt annan historia: Tolv historiografiska uppsatser*, ed. Samuel Edquist et al., vol. s. 11-26, *Opuscula Historica Upsalensia* 31 (Uppsala: Uppsala universitet, 2004); Karl-Ernst Jeismann, 'Geschichtsbewußtsein - Theorie', in *Handbuch Der Geschichtsdidaktik*, ed. Klaus Bergmann et al., 5th ed. (Hannover: Kallmeyer'sche Verlagsbuchhandlung, 1997), 42; Klas-Göran Karlsson, 'Historical Consciousness – The Fundament of Historical Thinking and History Teaching', in *The Processes of History Teaching: An International Symposium Held at Malmö University, Sweden, March 5th-7th 2009*, ed. Per Eliasson, Carina Rönnqvist and Kenneth Nordgren, *Studier i de samhällsvetenskapliga ämnernas didaktik* 15 (Karlstad: Karlstads universitet, 2011), 34–41; Kenneth Nordgren, *Vems är historien?: Historia som medvetande, kultur och handling i det mångkulturella Sverige*, *Doktorsavhandlingar inom den nationella forskarskolan i pedagogiskt arbete*, 1653-6894; 3 (Umeå: Fakultetsnämnden för lärarutbildning, Umeå universitet, 2006), 15.

<sup>2</sup> See Bjorn G. J. Wansink et al., 'Epistemological Tensions in Prospective Dutch History Teachers' Beliefs about the Objectives of Secondary Education', *The Journal of Social Studies Research*, n.d., accessed 14 April 2016.

<sup>3</sup> See K. G. Hammarlund, 'Historia som ämnesdisciplin och vardagsliv – ämnesdidaktiska utmaningar i ett flerkulturellt samhälle', *Nordidactica: Journal of Humanities and Social Science Education*, no. 2015:3 (2015): 5–6.

ing and an international multi-perspectival approach to history.<sup>11</sup> Research has noted, however, that a traditional approach to history education characterised by a focus on a national or Eurocentric perspective and content knowledge is still practiced despite these curricular changes, indicating what may be called a historical cultural lag.<sup>12</sup> On a more general level, this raises the question of what history is taught and should be taught in schools and what the characteristics of the subject are perceived to be. The results presented here will be used to further a discussion about these aspects of history education.

By designing four independent case studies, different kinds of empirical data were collected that allowed for further enhancement and fine tuning of the theoretical and methodological approaches taken. In the first case study I analysed an extract from a history textbook relating Swedish post World War II history; in the second case study I analysed popular history magazines' portrayals of the outbreak of World War I; in the third case study I analysed how lower secondary school history teachers analysed a quotation from a history textbook detailing the emergence of the Cold War conflict; and in the fourth case study I interviewed lower secondary school history teachers about their experiences of growing up during the Cold War, and observed these teachers when teaching the same unit in class. Thus, through analyses of historical media (i.e. history textbooks and popular history magazines), teacher interviews and classroom observations, a variety of different data was collected in order to analyse how teachers relate to different aspects of historical culture as professionals, i.e. how they use history in history education. The research questions I posed were:

1. How is history represented in contemporary history textbooks and popular history magazines in terms of content and uses of history?
2. How do history teachers relate to history concerning history textbooks, personal experiences of history and the teaching of history, in terms of content and uses of history?
3. What aspects of historical culture are constituted in historical media and history teachers' narratives and teaching?

---

<sup>8</sup> Sirkka Ahonen, 'History Education in Post-Conflict Societies', *Historical Encounters* 1, no. 1 (30 June 2014): 76; Maria Johansson, *Historieundervisning och interkulturell kompetens* (Karlstad: Karlstads universitet, 2012), 9–10; Andreas Körber, 'Translation and Its Discontents II: A German Perspective', *Journal of Curriculum Studies* 48, no. 4 (3 July 2016): 441; Thomas Nygren, *History in the Service of Mankind: International Guidelines and History Education in Upper Secondary Schools in Sweden, 1927–2002*, Umeå Studies in History and Education 5 (Umeå: Umeå universitet, 2011).

<sup>9</sup> Keith C. Barton and Linda S. Levstik, *Teaching History for the Common Good* (Routledge, 2004), 249–51; Vanja Lozić, *I historiekansons skugga: Historieämne och identifikationsformering i 2000-talets mångkulturella samhälle* (Malmö: Lärarutbildningen, Malmö högskola, 2010), 217–19; Jukka Rantala, 'How Finnish Adolescents Understand History: Disciplinary Thinking in History and Its Assessment Among 16-Year-Old Finns', *Education Sciences* 2, no. 4 (31 October 2012): 193–207.

## Previous Research

This section presents previous history didactical research that is relevant to the present study in terms of how historical media (i.e. history textbooks and popular history magazines) constitute and portray aspects of historical culture and how history teachers relate to historical media and history. The first sub-section presents research on history textbooks and popular history magazines (since this is the focus of this study) and the second sub-section presents research focused on history teachers. Since this study takes place in and relates to a Swedish context both regarding historical media and history education, I have chosen to focus primarily on Swedish research within these fields and supplement this research with relevant international research.

## Historical Media: History Textbooks and Popular History Magazines

A large number of recent studies have analysed historical media from the perspectives of production, content and reception. These studies have analysed historical educational media such



as textbooks, popular and documentary films, primary sources and popular history magazines from a number of perspectives. More specifically, and in relation to this particular study, a number of studies have focused on history textbooks and popular history magazines, and these are the ones I will address below.

While textbook research has generally been a discipline inclined towards analyses of content (and this appears to be the most dominant trend in contemporary research on history textbooks),<sup>15</sup> some research has also looked at the use and reception of textbooks in educational practice. Studies of the content of history textbooks have analysed that content to identify the characteristics that certain textbook narratives have generally<sup>16</sup> and on a number

---

<sup>10</sup> See Simone Lässig, 'Textbooks and Beyond: Educational Media in Context(s)', *Journal of Educational Media, Memory, and Society* 1, no. 1 (1 April 2009): 14–15.

<sup>11</sup> See Samira Alayan and Naseema Al-Khalidi, 'Gender and Agency in History, Civics, and National Education Textbooks of Jordan and Palestine', *Journal of Educational Media, Memory, and Society* 2, no. 1 (30 May 2010): 78–96; Mireille Estivalèzes, 'Teaching about Islam in the History Curriculum and in Textbooks in France', *Journal of Educational Media, Memory, and Society* 3, no. 1 (30 April 2011): 45–60; Shreya Ghosh,

'Identity, Politics, and Nation-Building in History Textbooks in Bangladesh', *Journal of Educational Media, Memory, and Society* 6, no. 2 (1 September 2014): 25–41; Eleftherios Klerides, 'Imagining the Textbook:

Textbooks as Discourse and Genre', *Journal of Educational Media, Memory, and Society* 2, no. 1 (30 May 2010): 31–54; Arie Kizel, 'The Presentation of Germany in Israeli History Textbooks between 1948 and 2014', *Journal of Educational Media, Memory, and Society* 7, no. 1 (1 March 2015): 94–115; Jörg Lehmann, 'Civilization versus Barbarism: The Franco-Prussian War in French History Textbooks, 1875–1895', *Journal of Educational Media, Memory, and Society* 7, no. 1 (1 March 2015): 51–65; Willeke Los, 'Remembering or Forgetting? Accounts of the Recent Revolutionary Past in Dutch History Textbooks for Primary Education in the Early Nineteenth Century', *Journal of Educational Media, Memory, and Society* 4, no. 1 (5 June 2012): 26–39; Ina Markova, 'Balancing Victimhood and Complicity in Austrian History Textbooks: Visual and Verbal Strategies of Representing the Past in Post-Waldheim Austria', *Journal of Educational Media, Memory, and Society* 3, no. 2 (15 November 2011): 58–73; Deepa Nair, 'Contending "Historical" Identities in India', *Journal of Educational Media, Memory, and Society* 1, no. 1 (1 April 2009): 145–64; Ryôta Nishino, 'Narrative Strate-

of issues (e.g. minority groups,<sup>17</sup> relations to a larger historical culture<sup>18</sup> and specific historical topics or events<sup>19</sup>), as well as the propensities in textbook narratives that develop certain features in their readers.<sup>20</sup> Research has also noted that history textbooks tend to reflect political and social trends in the societies for which they were intended, both concerning what motives publishers and authors may have had regarding choice of content and exposition, and what is considered to be historically relevant and meaningful.<sup>21</sup> In this sense, history textbooks may be argued to reflect the dominant historical culture in the societies to which they correspond since they present a version

---

gies Regarding Japanese Ethnic Origins and Cultural Identities in Japanese Middle-School History Textbooks', *Journal of Educational Media, Memory, and Society* 2, no. 1 (30 May 2010): 97–112; Gabriel Pirický, 'The Ottoman Age in Southern Central Europe as Represented in Secondary School History Textbooks in the

Czech Republic, Hungary, Poland, and Slovakia', *Journal of Educational Media, Memory, and Society* 5, no. 1 (22 May 2013): 108–29; Seth B. Scott, 'The Perpetuation of War in U. S. History Textbooks', *Journal of Educational Media, Memory, and Society* 1, no. 1 (1 April 2009): 59–70.

<sup>12</sup> See Keith Crawford, 'Constructing Aboriginal Australians, 1930–1960 Projecting False Memories', *Journal of Educational Media, Memory, and Society* 5, no. 1 (22 May 2013): 90–107; Stuart J. Foster, 'The Struggle for American Identity: Treatment of Ethnic Groups in United States History Textbooks', *History of Education* 28, no. 3 (1 September 1999): 251–78; Anne Gaul, 'Where Are the Minorities? The Elusiveness of Multiculturalism and Positive Recognition in Sri Lankan History Textbooks', *Journal of Educational Media, Memory, and Society* 6, no. 2 (1 September 2014): 87–105; Nordgren, *Vems är historien?*

<sup>13</sup> See Lena Almqvist Nielsen, *Förhistorien som kulturellt minne: Historiekulturell förändring i svenska läroböcker 1903–2010*, Licentiatavhandlingar från forskarskolan historiska medier 10 (Umeå: Umeå universitet, 2014); Shinichi Arai, 'History Textbooks in Twentieth Century Japan: A Chronological Overview', *Journal of Educational Media, Memory, and Society* 2, no. 2 (30 October 2010): 113–21; Catherine Broom, 'Change and Continuity in British Columbian Perspectives as Illustrated in Social Studies Textbooks from 1885 to 2006', *Journal of Educational Media, Memory, and Society* 3, no. 2 (15 November 2011): 42–57; Foster, 'The Struggle for American Identity'; Nair, 'Contending "Historical" Identities in India'; Marcus Otto, 'The Challenge of Decolonization School History Textbooks as Media and Objects of the Postcolonial Politics of Memory in France since the 1960s', *Journal of Educational Media, Memory, and Society* 5, no. 1 (22 May 2013): 14–32.

<sup>14</sup> See Luigi Cajani, 'The Image of Italian Colonialism in Italian History Textbooks for Secondary Schools', *Journal of Educational Media, Memory, and Society* 5, no. 1 (22 May 2013): 72–89; Stuart Foster and Adrian Burgess, 'Problematic Portrayals and Contentious Content: Representations of the Holocaust in English

History Textbooks', *Journal of Educational Media, Memory, and Society* 5, no. 2 (1 September 2013): 20–38; Janne Holmén, *Den politiska läroboken: Bilden av USA och Sovjetunionen i norska, svenska och finländska läroböcker under kalla kriget*, Studia Historica Upsaliensia, 0081-6531; 221 (Uppsala: Acta Universitatis Upsaliensis, 2006); Kizel, 'The Presentation of Germany in Israeli History Textbooks between 1948 and 2014'; Jason Nicholls, 'The Portrayal of the Atomic Bombing of Nagasaki in US and English School History Textbooks', *Internationale Schulbuchforschung* 25, no. 1/2 (2003): 63–84; Anders Persson, 'Mormor, önskad tyskar och en hänsynslös dansk: Några reflektioner om identifikation och mening, efter en kritisk läsning av en nytgiven lärobok i historia för den svenska grundskolans mellanår', in *Kulturell reproduktion i skola och nation: En vänbok till Lars Pettersson*, ed. Urban Claesson and Dick Åhman (Hedemora: Gidlunds, 2016), 251–68; Heather Sharp, 'Representing Australia's Involvement in the First World War: Discrepancies between Public Discourses and School History Textbooks

from 1916 to 1936', *Journal of Educational Media, Memory, and Society* 6, no. 1 (1 March 2014): 1–23.

<sup>15</sup> See Niklas Ammert, *Det osamtidigas samtidighet: Historiemedvetande i svenska historieläroböcker under hundra år* (Uppsala: Sisyfos, 2008); Niklas Ammert, 'To Bridge Time: Historical Consciousness in Swedish History Textbooks', *Journal of Educational Media, Memory, and Society* 2, no. 1 (30 May 2010): 17–30; Halvdan Eikeland, *Et laereverks bidrag til historiebevisssthet og narrativ kompetanse. Analyse og praktisk bruk av historiedelen av Aschehougs laereverk i samfunnstag for ungdomstrinnet: 'Innblikk'* (Tönsberg: Högskolen i Vestfold, 2002); Nordgren, *Vems är historien?*

<sup>16</sup> See Ingmarie Danielsson Malmros, *Det var en gång ett land... Berättelser om svenskhet i historieläro- böcker och elevers föreställningsvärldar* (Höör: Agering, 2012), 261–64; Foster, 'The Struggle for American Identity', 275–77; Holmén, *Den politiska läroboken*, 314ff.



of the past that often takes political and social considerations of history into account.<sup>22</sup> Recent studies of Swedish history textbooks have highlighted this tendency. Ingmarie Danielsson Malmros studied how Swedish history textbooks narrated a Swedish national identity. She found that changes in textbook narratives seemed to coincide with social and political changes in Swedish society.<sup>23</sup> Janne Holmén examined how Swedish textbooks presented the USA and the USSR in the period between the 1930's and the early 21<sup>st</sup> century. Holmén found that the images presented of these countries corresponded with political relations between Sweden and these countries. Of particular relevance here are Holmén's results that show a tendency in Swedish textbooks to increase their criticism of the USSR since its collapse in 1991.<sup>24</sup> Holmén finds that Swedish history textbooks published between 1990 and 2004 generally had nothing positive to say about the Soviet system, which in turn could be regarded as corresponding to a similar trend in contemporary Sweden.<sup>25</sup>

However, it has been noted that history textbook research not only needs to pay attention to content, but also to context both regarding the production and consumption of these books, since textbooks are intended to be used in a particular context.<sup>26</sup> In this regard, some studies have looked at the question of reception: how do readers' preconceptions affect how they read and interpret a narrative,<sup>27</sup> and other studies have analysed how textbooks are used and perceived by teachers and/or pupils.<sup>28</sup> Israeli researcher Dan Porat's study of how Israeli adolescents interpreted a textbook narrative has been an inspiration to the approach taken in this study. Porat's results show that

---

<sup>17</sup> See Thomas Bender, 'Can National History Be De-Provincialized? U. S. History Textbook Controversies in the 1940s and 1990s', *Journal of Educational Media, Memory, and Society* 1, no. 1 (1 April 2009): 33–35; Harry Haue, 'Transformation of History Textbooks from National Monument to Global Agent', *Nordidactica: Journal of Humanities and Social Science Education*, no. 2013:1 (2013): 80–89; Henrik Åström Elmersjö, *Norden, nationen och historien: Perspektiv på föreningarna Nordens historieläroboksrevision 1919-1972* (Lund: Nordic Academic Press, 2013), 148–51; Arja Virta, 'Finska kriget 1808-1809 i svenska och finska gymnasieböcker i historie', *Nordidactica - Journal of Humanities and Social Science Education*, no. 2012:1 (2012): 55–60.

<sup>18</sup> Danielsson Malmros, *Det var en gång ett land*, 279.

<sup>19</sup> Holmén, *Den politiska läroboken*, 324–25.

<sup>25</sup> *Ibid.*, 282.

<sup>26</sup> See Carsten Heinze, 'Historical Textbook Research: Textbooks in the Context of the "Grammar of School-ing"', *Journal of Educational Media, Memory, and Society* 2, no. 2 (30 October 2010): 122–31.

<sup>27</sup> See Neveen Eid, 'The Inner Conflict: How Palestinian Students in Israel React to the Dual Narrative Approach Concerning the Events of 1948', *Journal of Educational Media, Memory, and Society* 2, no. 1 (30 May 2010): 55–77; Dan A. Porat, 'It's Not Written Here, but This Is What Happened: Students' Cultural Comprehension of Textbook Narratives on the Israeli-Arab Conflict', *American Educational Research Journal* 41, no. 4 (1 December 2004): 963–96.

<sup>28</sup> E.g. Danielsson Malmros, *Det var en gång ett land*; Annie Olsson, *Läroboken i historieundervisningen: En fallstudie med fokus på elever, lärare och läroboksförfattare*, Licentiatavhandlingar från forskarskolan historiska medier 7 (Umeå universitet, 2014); Amina Triki-Yamani, Marie McAndrew and Sahar El Shourbagi, 'Perceptions du traitement de l'islam et du monde musulman dans les manuels d'histoire par des enseignants du secondaire au Québec', *Journal of Educational Media, Memory, and Society* 3, no. 1 (30 April 2011): 97–117.

textbook narratives are subordinate to the ‘cultural views’ of the adolescents that took part in his study. They interpreted the textbook quotation according to what their preconceptions on the historical event in question were.<sup>29</sup> Porat found that the cultural environment of his respondents played a crucial role in how they interpreted and remembered a textbook narrative.<sup>30</sup> These results suggest that studies of how textbook accounts are interpreted and used may complement analyses of the content of textbooks, and the present study should be seen as an attempt at analysing textbooks from the perspective of reception and use, and what influence these may have on how they are interpreted by active history teachers.

To summarise briefly, the research studied finds that textbooks generally seem to manifest one certain version and perspective of history and that textbook narratives are closed and one-dimensional, meaning that the narratives present a mono-perspectival rendering of history.<sup>31</sup> This is regarded as problematic since only one perspective of the past is made manifest and is reinforced through the textbook narratives.

Research on popular history magazines from the perspective of history didactics is not as wide and diverse as the research on textbooks, but shows some similarities. This research also has a focus on content<sup>32</sup> and it generally discusses deficits in the content of popular history magazines: it is too nationalistic, mono-perspectivistic, commercial or masculine in focus. However, there are some signs in research that indicate that history teachers may use popular history magazines as a source of inspiration and learning.<sup>33</sup>

---

<sup>29</sup> Porat, ‘It’s Not Written Here, but This Is What Happened’, 978. <sup>30</sup> Ibid., 991–92.

<sup>31</sup> See Eikeland, *Et laereverks bidrag til historiebevisssthet og narrativ kompetanse*, 158; Foster and Burgess, ‘Problematic Portrayals and Contentious Content’; Gaul, ‘Where Are the Minorities?’; Ghosh, ‘Identity, Politics, and Nation-Building in History Textbooks in Bangladesh’; Nishino, ‘Narrative Strategies Regarding Japanese Ethnic Origins and Cultural Identities in Japanese Middle-School History Textbooks’; Scott, ‘The Perpetuation of War in U. S. History Textbooks’.

<sup>32</sup> E.g. Bodil Axelsson, ‘History in Popular Magazines: Negotiating Masculinities, the Low of the Popular and the High of History’, *Culture Unbound: Journal of Current Cultural Research*, no. 4 (2012): 275–95; Katja Gorbahn, ‘Perpetrators, Victims, Heroes - the Second World War and National Socialism in Danish History Magazines’, in *Commercialised History: Popular History Magazines in Europe*, ed. Susanne Popp, Jutta Schumann and Miriam Hannig, 1st ed. (Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang Publishing, 2015), 319–34; Susanne Popp, ‘Popular History Magazines between Transmission of Knowledge and Entertainment - Some Theoretical Remarks’, in *Commercialised History: Popular History Magazines in Europe*, ed. Susanne Popp, Jutta Schumann and Miriam Hannig, 1st ed. (Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang Publishing, 2015), 42–69; Marianne Sjöland, *Historia i magasin: En studie av tidskriften Populär Historias historieskrivning och av kommersiellt historiebruk* (Lund: Lunds universitet, 2011); Marianne Sjöland, ‘The Use of History in Popular History Magazines. A Theoretical Approach’, in *Commercialised History: Popular History Magazines in Europe*, ed. Susanne Popp, Jutta Schumann and Miriam Hannig, 1st ed. (Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang Publishing, 2015), 223–37; Monika Vinterek, ‘The Use of Powerful Men, Naked Women and War to Sell. Popular History Magazines in Sweden’, in *Commercialised History: Popular History Magazines in Europe*, ed. Susanne Popp, Jutta Schumann and Miriam Hannig, 1st ed. (Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang Publishing, 2015), 295–318.

<sup>33</sup> Terry Haydn, ‘Using Popular History Magazines in History Teaching: A Case Study’, in *Commercialised History: Popular History Magazines in Europe*, ed. Susanne Popp, Jutta Schumann and Miriam Hannig, 1st ed. (Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang Publishing, 2015), 354–70.