Victim or Threat? Shipwrecks, Terrorist Attacks and Asylum Decisions in France

Supplemental Information

Mathilde Emeriau

January 4, 2023

The material is intended for online publication only.

A   Additional Analyses

Table A.1: Additional robustness tests

	(1) Main specification	(2) Excluding cases filed before 2014	(3) Coding those missing a decision as rejections	(4) Coding those missing a decision as acceptances
Panel A: Shipwrecks reported in the news				
Shipwreck *t-1*	0.044*	0.049*	0.041†	0.042*
	(0.021)	(0.023)	(0.021)	(0.021)
Observations	33,286	30,793	33,620	33,620
N of treated units	411	362	411	411
Mean of DV	0.214	0.220	0.210	0.226
R^2	0.368	0.384	0.362	0.359
Panel B: Attacks reported in the news				
Attack *t-1*	-0.026†	-0.027†	-0.027†	-0.023†
	(0.014)	(0.014)	(0.014)	(0.014)
Observations	32,814	30,298	33,138	33,138
N of treated units	884	838	884	884
Mean of DV	0.213	0.220	0.210	0.226
R^2	0.368	0.385	0.362	0.359
Panel C: All Attacks (Associated countries)				
Attack *t-1*	-0.091*	-0.096*	-0.078†	-0.089*
	(0.042)	(0.042)	(0.045)	(0.042)
Observations	1,385	1,378	1,415	1,415
N of treated units	77	77	77	77
Mean of DV	0.934	0.938	0.907	0.936
R^2	0.185	0.171	0.209	0.177
Panel D: Attacks reported in the news (Associated countries)				
Attack *t-1*	-0.132†	-0.118†	-0.134†	-0.126†
	(0.068)	(0.066)	(0.070)	(0.068)
Observations	1,436	1,428	1,468	1,468
N of treated units	42	41	42	42
Mean of DV	0.934	0.938	0.906	0.936
R^2	0.184	0.168	0.214	0.177

Notes: $^{**}p < 0.01$, $^{*}p < 0.05$, $^{†}p < 0.1$. Standard errors, clustered at the asylum officer level, are reported in parentheses in columns 1 to 5. Asylum seekers interviewed on the day of the shipwreck are excluded from the sample. See text for control variable details.

Table A.2: Robustness to varying the threshold used to define shipwrecks

	(1) > 0 drowned	(2) > 10 drowned	(3) > 20 drowned	(4) > 30 drowned	(5) > 40 drowned	(6) > 50 drowned	(7) > 60 drowned	(8) > 70 drowned	(9) > 80 drowned	(10) > 90 drowned
Panel A: All shipwrecks										
Shipwreck *t-1*	0.002	0.005	0.011	0.008	0.008	0.026†	0.036*	0.036*	0.036*	0.038*
	(0.006)	(0.007)	(0.007)	(0.008)	(0.009)	(0.013)	(0.015)	(0.015)	(0.015)	(0.016)
Observations	22,930	29,762	30,806	31,506	32,044	32,806	32,910	32,911	32,911	33,001
N of treated units	6,303	3,556	2,912	2,079	1,557	802	726	726	726	612
Mean of DV	0.208	0.212	0.213	0.213	0.214	0.213	0.213	0.213	0.213	0.214
R^2	0.373	0.368	0.367	0.368	0.369	0.369	0.368	0.368	0.368	0.369
Difference (1) - (10)					-0.036					
Standard error					0.015					
Panel B: Shipwrecks reported in the news										
Shipwreck *t-1*	0.019†	0.026*	0.026*	0.035*	0.044*	0.057*	0.057*	0.057*	0.057*	0.057*
	(0.011)	(0.013)	(0.013)	(0.015)	(0.021)	(0.023)	(0.023)	(0.023)	(0.023)	(0.023)
Observations	32,404	32,815	32,836	32,949	33,286	33,372	33,372	33,372	33,372	33,372
N of treated units	1,443	932	932	720	411	322	322	322	322	322
Mean of DV	0.213	0.214	0.214	0.214	0.214	0.214	0.214	0.214	0.214	0.214
R^2	0.368	0.368	0.368	0.368	0.368	0.368	0.368	0.368	0.368	0.368
Difference (1) - (10)					-0.037					
Standard error					0.020					
Panel C: All migrant deaths in Europe										
Shipwreck *t-1*	-0.001	0.002	0.008	0.008	0.008	0.025†	0.036*	0.036*	0.036*	0.038*
	(0.006)	(0.007)	(0.007)	(0.008)	(0.009)	(0.013)	(0.015)	(0.015)	(0.015)	(0.016)
Observations	19,059	29,163	30,603	31,397	31,951	32,713	32,910	32,911	32,911	33,001
N of treated units	7,160	3,836	3,040	2,144	1,557	802	726	726	726	612
Mean of DV	0.209	0.213	0.213	0.214	0.214	0.214	0.213	0.213	0.213	0.214
R^2	0.379	0.368	0.368	0.368	0.369	0.369	0.368	0.368	0.368	0.369
Difference (1) - (10)					-0.039					
Standard error					0.016					

Notes: $^{**}p < 0.01$, $^{*}p < 0.05$, $^{†}p < 0.1$. Standard errors, clustered at the asylum officer level, are reported in parentheses. Asylum seekers interviewed on the day of the event are excluded from the sample. See text for control variable details.

Table A.3: Balance table

	Interviewed after a shipwreck		Interviewed on any other day		t-test		Interviewed after an attack		Interviewed on any other day		t-test	
	Mean	N	Mean	N	Diff.	p	Mean	N	Mean	N	Diff.	p
Did not come to the interview	0.114	1,648	0.120	33,030	-0.006	0.445	0.128	2,060	0.120	32,618	0.008	0.272
Gender												
Female	0.325	1,648	0.337	33,030	-0.012	0.322	0.318	2,060	0.338	32,618	-0.020	0.066
Male	0.675	1,648	0.663	33,030	0.012	0.322	0.682	2,060	0.662	32,618	0.020	0.066
Age												
Less than 20	0.049	1,648	0.053	33,028	-0.004	0.440	0.048	2,060	0.053	32,616	-0.005	0.332
Between 20 and 30	0.470	1,648	0.465	33,028	0.005	0.695	0.487	2,060	0.464	32,616	0.024	0.035
More than 30	0.482	1,648	0.482	33,028	-0.001	0.963	0.465	2,060	0.483	32,616	-0.019	0.096
Family Situation												
Single	0.538	1,642	0.541	32,828	-0.003	0.818	0.561	2,050	0.539	32,420	0.022	0.050
Married	0.462	1,642	0.459	32,828	0.003	0.818	0.439	2,050	0.461	32,420	-0.022	0.050
Nationality												
Afghanistan	0.035	1,648	0.034	33,030	0.002	0.727	0.033	2,060	0.034	32,618	-0.000	0.961
Albania	0.026	1,648	0.034	33,030	-0.008	0.071	0.041	2,060	0.034	32,618	0.007	0.077
Algeria	0.034	1,648	0.032	33,030	0.002	0.601	0.033	2,060	0.032	32,618	0.001	0.742
Bangladesh	0.055	1,648	0.052	33,030	0.004	0.513	0.036	2,060	0.053	32,618	-0.017	0.001
China	0.036	1,648	0.046	33,030	-0.010	0.059	0.040	2,060	0.046	32,618	-0.006	0.223
DRC	0.062	1,648	0.067	33,030	-0.005	0.407	0.052	2,060	0.068	32,618	-0.016	0.005
Guinea	0.038	1,648	0.040	33,030	-0.003	0.598	0.039	2,060	0.040	32,618	-0.001	0.761
Haiti	0.016	1,648	0.038	33,030	-0.022	0.000	0.072	2,060	0.035	32,618	0.037	0.000
Kosovo	0.050	1,648	0.044	33,030	0.005	0.303	0.039	2,060	0.045	32,618	-0.006	0.188
Nigeria	0.033	1,648	0.031	33,030	0.002	0.703	0.031	2,060	0.031	32,618	-0.000	0.978
Other	0.357	1,648	0.350	33,030	0.007	0.538	0.356	2,060	0.350	32,618	0.006	0.590
Pakistan	0.057	1,648	0.043	33,030	0.015	0.005	0.031	2,060	0.044	32,618	-0.013	0.005
Russia	0.047	1,648	0.044	33,030	0.003	0.567	0.041	2,060	0.045	32,618	-0.003	0.463
Sri Lanka	0.033	1,648	0.029	33,030	0.004	0.332	0.028	2,060	0.029	32,618	-0.001	0.738
Sudan	0.082	1,648	0.079	33,030	0.002	0.721	0.087	2,060	0.079	32,618	0.008	0.207
Syria	0.039	1,648	0.037	33,030	0.002	0.710	0.041	2,060	0.037	32,618	0.004	0.308
Asylum officer ID												
129	0.005	1,648	0.008	33,030	-0.003	0.162	0.007	2,060	0.008	32,618	-0.001	0.588
135	0.008	1,648	0.007	33,030	0.002	0.375	0.013	2,060	0.006	32,618	0.006	0.001
225	0.006	1,648	0.007	33,030	-0.001	0.602	0.009	2,060	0.007	32,618	0.002	0.369
233	0.006	1,648	0.006	33,030	0.000	0.894	0.009	2,060	0.006	32,618	0.004	0.037
245	0.008	1,648	0.007	33,030	0.001	0.562	0.008	2,060	0.007	32,618	0.002	0.390
269	0.004	1,648	0.006	33,030	-0.002	0.367	0.005	2,060	0.006	32,618	-0.001	0.519
324	0.012	1,648	0.007	33,030	0.005	0.021	0.010	2,060	0.007	32,618	0.002	0.203
444	0.008	1,648	0.006	33,030	0.002	0.300	0.005	2,060	0.006	32,618	-0.001	0.498
508	0.007	1,648	0.006	33,030	0.001	0.715	0.005	2,060	0.006	32,618	-0.001	0.690
658	0.002	1,648	0.006	33,030	-0.004	0.043	0.006	2,060	0.006	32,618	-0.000	0.798
669	0.008	1,648	0.006	33,030	0.003	0.139	0.008	2,060	0.006	32,618	0.003	0.130
754	0.005	1,648	0.006	33,030	-0.001	0.644	0.009	2,060	0.006	32,618	0.003	0.158
766	0.005	1,648	0.007	33,030	-0.002	0.405	0.008	2,060	0.006	32,618	0.001	0.445
785	0.003	1,648	0.007	33,030	-0.004	0.041	0.006	2,060	0.007	32,618	-0.001	0.630
786	0.006	1,648	0.006	33,030	0.000	0.957	0.005	2,060	0.006	32,618	-0.001	0.702
Other	0.905	1,648	0.902	33,030	0.003	0.688	0.887	2,060	0.903	32,618	-0.016	0.017

Table A.4: Robustness to reducing the bandwidth before the event

| | Panel A: Shipwrecks reported in the news | | | | | | | | | | |
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)	(10)	(11)
Shipwreck *t-1*	0.060**	0.076**	0.077**	0.080**	0.081**	0.082**	0.082**	0.080**	0.081**	0.081**	0.062*
	(0.023)	(0.026)	(0.027)	(0.027)	(0.027)	(0.027)	(0.027)	(0.027)	(0.027)	(0.027)	(0.031)
Observations	22,930	22,723	21,937	19,795	19,375	19,042	18,239	17,534	16,834	15,268	12,894
N of treated units	318	267	267	267	267	267	267	267	267	267	202
Mean of DV	0.208	0.209	0.208	0.211	0.210	0.210	0.210	0.210	0.210	0.210	0.208
Bandwidth	$[1, \infty)$	[1, 20]	[1, 15]	[1, 10]	[1, 9]	[1, 8]	[1, 7]	[1, 6]	[1, 5]	[1, 4]	[1, 3]
R^2	0.373	0.373	0.374	0.379	0.381	0.381	0.380	0.382	0.383	0.384	0.390
	Panel B: Attacks reported in the news										
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)	(10)	(11)
Attack *t-1*	-0.024	-0.015	-0.018	-0.021	-0.020	-0.024	-0.029	-0.011	-0.012	-0.005	0.025
	(0.015)	(0.019)	(0.020)	(0.020)	(0.020)	(0.021)	(0.022)	(0.030)	(0.050)	(0.054)	(0.057)
Observations	31,809	21,117	17,609	13,330	12,234	10,987	9,686	8,409	7,118	6,136	5,046
N of treated units	805	498	498	498	498	451	451	240	120	120	120
Mean of DV	0.213	0.212	0.212	0.210	0.211	0.211	0.212	0.211	0.211	0.208	0.210
Bandwidth	$[1, \infty)$	[1, 20]	[1, 15]	[1, 10]	[1, 9]	[1, 8]	[1, 7]	[1, 6]	[1, 5]	[1, 4]	[1, 3]
R^2	0.368	0.367	0.370	0.374	0.379	0.384	0.391	0.402	0.411	0.412	0.425
	Panel C: All attacks (Associated countries)										
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)	(10)	(11)
Attack *t-1*	-0.091*	-0.133†	-0.180†	-0.132	-0.153†	-0.166†	-0.156	-0.092	0.054	0.093	0.239
	(0.042)	(0.075)	(0.091)	(0.086)	(0.087)	(0.091)	(0.095)	(0.142)	(0.113)	(0.119)	(0.183)
Observations	1,385	898	729	547	518	465	415	354	298	253	211
N of treated units	77	43	31	26	25	22	22	13	9	9	6
Mean of DV	0.934	0.927	0.925	0.914	0.917	0.916	0.909	0.913	0.920	0.917	0.915
Bandwidth	$[1, \infty)$	[1, 20]	[1, 15]	[1, 10]	[1, 9]	[1, 8]	[1, 7]	[1, 6]	[1, 5]	[1, 4]	[1, 3]
R^2	0.185	0.266	0.281	0.322	0.346	0.357	0.370	0.426	0.494	0.560	0.645
	Panel D: Attacks reported in the news (Associated countries)										
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)	(9)	(10)	(11)
Attack *t-1*	-0.125†	-0.138	-0.152	-0.117	-0.139	-0.161	-0.154	-0.068	0.122	0.155	0.239
	(0.072)	(0.090)	(0.094)	(0.096)	(0.095)	(0.102)	(0.105)	(0.173)	(0.109)	(0.126)	(0.183)
Observations	1,385	898	729	547	518	465	415	354	298	253	211
N of treated units	37	21	21	21	21	18	18	9	6	6	6
Mean of DV	0.934	0.927	0.925	0.914	0.917	0.916	0.909	0.913	0.920	0.917	0.915
Bandwidth	$[1, \infty)$	[1, 20]	[1, 15]	[1, 10]	[1, 9]	[1, 8]	[1, 7]	[1, 6]	[1, 5]	[1, 4]	[1, 3]
R^2	0.185	0.262	0.274	0.320	0.343	0.355	0.369	0.425	0.496	0.562	0.645

Notes: $^{**}p < 0.01$, $^{*}p < 0.05$, $^{†}p < 0.1$. Standard errors, clustered at the asylum officer level, are reported in parentheses. Asylum seekers interviewed on the day of the event featured in the news are excluded from the analysis. See text for control variable details. The bandwidth variable is equal to the number of days to the next event.

Table A.5: Robustness to inclusion of covariates

	Panel A: Shipwrecks reported in the news					
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
Shipwreck t-1	0.044†	0.042*	0.042*	0.044*	0.083**	0.083**
	(0.024)	(0.021)	(0.021)	(0.021)	(0.027)	(0.030)
Observations	33,712	33,286	33,286	33,286	33,286	33,286
N of treated units	411	411	411	411	411	411
Mean of DV	0.214	0.214	0.214	0.214	0.214	0.214
Applicant characteristics	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Bureaucrat fixed effects	N	N	Y	Y	Y	Y
Time fixed effects	N	N	N	Y	Y	Y
Event ID	N	N	N	N	Y	Y
R^2	0.000	0.327	0.367	0.368	0.373	0.373
	Panel B: Attacks reported in the news					
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
Attack t-1	-0.041**	-0.035**	-0.034*	-0.026†	-0.024	-0.024
	(0.015)	(0.013)	(0.013)	(0.014)	(0.017)	(0.015)
Observations	33,235	32,814	32,814	32,814	32,814	32,814
N of treated units	884	884	884	884	884	884
Mean of DV	0.213	0.213	0.213	0.213	0.213	0.213
Applicant characteristics	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Bureaucrat fixed effects	N	N	Y	Y	Y	Y
Time fixed effects	N	N	N	Y	Y	Y
Event ID	N	N	N	N	Y	Y
R^2	0.000	0.327	0.367	0.368	0.369	0.369
	Panel C: All attacks (Associated countries)					
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
Attack t-1	-0.090*	-0.091*	-0.105*	-0.091*	-0.084†	-0.084*
	(0.042)	(0.041)	(0.041)	(0.042)	(0.046)	(0.040)
Observations	1,387	1,385	1,385	1,385	1,385	1,385
N of treated units	77	77	77	77	77	77
Mean of DV	0.934	0.934	0.934	0.934	0.934	0.934
Applicant characteristics	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Bureaucrat fixed effects	N	N	Y	Y	Y	Y
Time fixed effects	N	N	N	Y	Y	Y
Event ID	N	N	N	N	Y	Y
R^2	0.007	0.067	0.150	0.185	0.207	0.207
	Panel D: Attacks reported in the news (Associated countries)					
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)
Attack t-1	-0.138†	-0.152*	-0.148*	-0.132†	-0.133	-0.133
	(0.073)	(0.074)	(0.071)	(0.068)	(0.093)	(0.082)
Observations	1,438	1,436	1,436	1,436	1,436	1,436
N of treated units	42	42	42	42	42	42
Mean of DV	0.934	0.934	0.934	0.934	0.934	0.934
Applicant characteristics	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Bureaucrat fixed effects	N	N	Y	Y	Y	Y
Time fixed effects	N	N	N	Y	Y	Y
Event ID	N	N	N	N	Y	Y
R^2	0.008	0.071	0.151	0.184	0.206	0.206

Notes: $^{**}p < 0.01$, $^{*}p < 0.05$, $^{†}p < 0.1$. Standard errors, clustered at the asylum officer level, are reported in parentheses in columns 1 to 5. In column 6, standard errors are two-way clustered at the asylum officer and week of interview level. Asylum seekers interviewed on the day of the shipwreck are excluded from the sample. See text for control variable details.

Table A.6: Other types of events

	Islamist attacks in France		Other attacks in Europe		Random event
	(1) All	(2) Reported	(3) All	(4) Reported	(5) All
Event t-1	-0.022	-0.025	-0.002	0.001	-0.015
	(0.019)	(0.022)	(0.005)	(0.007)	(0.010)
Observations	32,955	33,261	21,548	30,263	31,851
N of treated units	459	373	8,859	3,745	1,556
R^2	0.368	0.368	0.371	0.368	0.371

Notes: $^{**}p < 0.01$, $^{*}p < 0.05$, $^{\dagger}p < 0.1$. Standard errors, clustered at the asylum officer level, are reported in parentheses. Asylum seekers interviewed on the day of the event featured in the news are excluded from the analysis. See text for control variable details.

Table A.7: Additional heterogeneity analysis by individual characteristics signaling threat and vulnerability

	All attacks		Attacks in the news		All shipwrecks		Shipwrecks in the news	
	(1) Among Syrians and Iraqis men	(2) Among Syrians and Iraqis women	(3) Among Syrians and Iraqis men	(4) Among Syrians and Iraqis women	(5) Among Syrians and Iraqis men	(6) Among Syrians and Iraqis women	(7) Among Syrians and Iraqis men	(8) Among Syrians and Iraqis women
Event $t\text{-}1$	-0.124*	-0.029	-0.185†	-0.054	0.016	-0.013	0.094*	0.031
	(0.059)	(0.065)	(0.103)	(0.067)	(0.020)	(0.057)	(0.047)	(0.037)
Observations	845	540	878	558	873	547	895	568
N of treated units	47	30	24	18	46	22	9	4
Mean of DV	0.923	0.952	0.923	0.952	0.922	0.953	0.923	0.954
R^2	0.261	0.214	0.256	0.209	0.244	0.217	0.242	0.214
Difference	-0.095		-0.131		0.029		0.062	
Standard error	0.085		0.107		0.053		0.059	

	All attacks		Attacks in the news		All shipwrecks		Shipwrecks in the news	
	(1) Among women	(2) Among men	(3) Among women	(4) Among men	(5) Among women	(6) Among men	(7) Among women	(8) Among men
Event $t\text{-}1$	-0.030*	-0.003	-0.025	-0.021	0.020	0.003	0.063†	0.035
	(0.015)	(0.011)	(0.020)	(0.017)	(0.019)	(0.011)	(0.038)	(0.024)
Observations	10,700	21,109	11,027	21,787	10,769	21,275	11,194	22,092
N of treated units	575	1,202	282	602	500	1,057	137	274
Mean of DV	0.213	0.213	0.213	0.214	0.211	0.215	0.212	0.214
R^2	0.399	0.379	0.399	0.378	0.396	0.380	0.398	0.378
Difference	-0.026		-0.004		0.017		0.028	
Standard error	0.017		0.025		0.021		0.042	

Notes: $^{**}p < 0.01$, $^{*}p < 0.05$, $^{†}p < 0.1$. Standard errors, clustered at the asylum officer level, are reported in parentheses. Asylum seekers interviewed on the day of the event featured in the news are excluded from the analysis. See text for control variable details.

Table A.8: Effect of events on probability that applicants were present during the interview

	(1) Shipwrecks in the news	(2) Attacks in the news
Event t-1	0.023	-0.019
	(0.017)	(0.014)
Observations	33,620	33,138
R^2	0.192	0.192

Notes: $^{**}p < 0.01$, $^{*}p < 0.05$, $^{\dagger}p < 0.1$. Standard errors, clustered at the asylum officer level, are reported in parentheses. Asylum seekers interviewed on the day of the event featured in the news are excluded from the analysis. See text for control variable details.