November 26, 2018

Dr. Donald R. Strong

Editor

Ecological Society of America

Dear Dr. Strong and Editorial Board Members,

Please find our attached manuscript entitled “Effects of salmon inputs to soil nitrogen pools, transformations, and stable isotope ratios: implications for marine derived nitrogen subsidies to riparian areas,” which we are submitting as an Article.

A major theme in ecology is identifying important nutrient sources that support ecosystem processes and quantifying ecosystem responses to these sources. Using nitrogen (N) stable isotope analysis, it has been established anadromous, semelparous fish species contribute substantial amounts of nutrients to coastal ecosystems and their importance to consumers is widely recognized1. There is also widespread belief that salmon nutrients enhance terrestrial primary productivity through nutrient fertilization and this, in-turn, enhances salmon populations (sensu, Helfield and Naiman). In fact, the scientific basis for this belief is generally weak (reviewed in this manuscript) and recent work published in Ecology shows an equivocal response of riparian tree growth to an extremely large salmon nutrient manipulation (Quinn 2018).

In this manuscript, we follow up on the work in Quinn et al. (2018) by measuring the response of soil N pools, N transformation rates, and N stable isotope ratios to a 20-year salmon carcass manipulation.

Key finding in our paper are:

1. Salmon carcass manipulation did not increase plant-available nitrogen pools (NH4+ and NO3-) or inorganic nitrogen transformation rates.
2. The stable isotope signature of NH4+ is enriched in soils, thus previous percent marine derived nutrient calculations for terrestrial producers are likely overestimated.
3. Landscape factors, such as demography or water availability, are likely more important drivers of vegetative growth than salmon derived nitrogen.

We believe this work is well-suited for *Ecology* for the following reasons:

1. This study examines a single ecosystem in Alaska, but we believe these results are applicable in all salmon systems (Pacific, Atlantic, and Great Lakes). Specifically, this work illustrates the overall importance of salmon to terrestrial producers has been overemphasized and that soil biogeochemical processes are substantially altering isotopic signatures, resulting in overestimates of marine-derived nutrient contributions to terrestrial producers.
2. This work is really the first large-scale experiment to examine soil responses to a salmon manipulation in detail. Given that soils have an essential mediating role in the transfer of salmon nutrients to plants, this is has been a major gap in knowledge to date.
3. The manuscript provides additional insight into the salmon manipulation conducted in Quinn et al. 2018 (previously published by Ecology) by measuring separate but complimentary ecological responses thus providing a more complete understanding of salmon contributions to the entirety of riparian ecosystems.

This manuscript has been approved for submission by all authors and is not being considered for publication elsewhere. Please address correspondence to me at: University of Washington, School of Aquatic and Fishery Sciences, Seattle, WA 98195. Email: mfeddern@uw.edu; Phone: (603) 651-6802.

Please contact me with any questions.

Sincerely,

Megan Feddern

**References**

1. Cederholm, C.J., M.D. Kunze, T. Murota, and A. Sibatani. 1999. Pacific salmon carcasses: essential contributions of nutrients and energy for aquatic and terrestrial ecosystems. *Fisheries* **24**: 6-15.

2. Quinn, T.P., J. Helfield, C.S. Austin, R. Hovel, and A.G. Bunn. 2018. A multidecade experiment shows that fertilization by salmon carcasses enhanced tree growth in the riparian zone. *Ecology* **99**: 2433-2441.

3. Helfield, J. M. and R. J. Naiman. 2002. Effects of salmon-derived nitrogen on riparian forest growth and implications for stream productivity. *Ecology* **82**: 2403-2409.