

random effects are assumed to be normally distributed, with mean vector 0 and variance terms τ_{xy} .

Because the dependent measures, time and frequency, are skewed, they were log-transformed to make them more symmetrically distributed. We note that because of the discrete nature of the frequency data, a linear regression might not be an appropriate model. We therefore also estimated a nonlinear Poisson regression model. However, because using a Poisson specification yielded similar results to the ones obtained under the linear model of the log-transformed data, we do not discuss the results of this analysis in detail.

For transitions, we modeled the relevant transitions between the eight boxes using a similar model, which has 56 observa-

tions per gamble per participant due to two factors: a transition identifier (28 levels) and phase. Again, we used an intercept, phase and number of reasons as random factors. In addition, as described in the text, we estimated a model that allowed the impact of kind of transition to vary across respondents, which resulted in improved fit and substantively interesting interpretations. We used two-tailed tests throughout, both because this analysis has substantial power and because prior data suggests results that conflict with the predictions of the priority heuristic.

Received August 16, 2006

Revision received January 10, 2007

Accepted January 11, 2007 ■

Postscript: Rejoinder to Brandstätter, Gigerenzer, and Hertwig (2008)

Eric J. Johnson
Columbia University

Michael Schulte-Mecklenbeck
University of Bergen

Martijn C. Willemsen
Eindhoven University of Technology

We appreciate that Brandstätter, Gigerenzer, and Hertwig (2008) agree that process models are indeed useful for advancing researchers' understanding of choice processes. Their statement that choices represent adaptive process is also welcome (see Payne, Bettman, & Johnson, 1993), as is the emphasis on multiple measures. However, we do disagree on two empirical matters:

Describing our research, Brandstätter et al. (2008) posit that most tests are either null or supportive of the priority heuristic (PH) and that only three of the tests were significant in the opposite direction. This "scorekeeping heuristic" implies that all tests are equally weighted in theory testing. However, we believe that, one, the presence of mostly probability-payoff transitions in the data is a critical test for any falsification of the PH. Although Brandstätter et al. consider the existing evidence on this point mixed, we do not. Table 1 contains the results from a series of studies, almost all conducted before Brandstätter et al. started their research and many of which are well-known in the literature. As can be seen from Table 1, the majority of observations show a predominance of probability-payoff transitions.

Brandstätter et al.'s (2008) effort to provide quantitative predictions is laudatory. However, these predictions are *very* sensitive to the assumptions that are made in the first, reading, phase postulated by Brandstätter et al. They originally suggested (Brandstätter, Gigerenzer, & Hertwig, 2006, p. 424) that all choice heuristics have a reading phase in which one looks for relevant information and a choice phase in which the relevant information is used. This means that the choice phase is useful

for understanding heuristics, whereas the reading phase is more epiphenomenal. The purpose of their original reading phase was to find the larger payoffs. On the basis of adjacency (the idea that participants would inspect information when it is needed), we argued that this would naturally lead to comparisons between payoffs (see Figure 2 of Johnson, Schulte-Mecklenbeck, & Willemsen, 2008). Brandstätter et al. now assume that all the information is read first for Gamble A, then for Gamble B, replacing the vertical arrows in our Figure 2 in Johnson et al. (2008) with horizontal arrows. This new position represents a quite testable hypothesis because it suggests large changes in search patterns by phase and orientation.

The bigger point is that Brandstätter et al. (2008), in their new analysis, also ignore empirically their own distinction between reading and choice phase. By stating that their reading phase now consists mainly of probability-payoff transitions, and then combining the two phases, they use those transitions to compensate for their absence in the choice phase, making the PH look artificially good, and remove one of its clearest predictions.

In essence, we agree with the goals of the approach taken by Brandstätter et al. (2008) but argue that if process-tracing data is to inform the development of choice models, then it is important to listen what the data are saying.

Table 1
Ratio of Transitions Types: Between Probabilities and Payoffs/ Within Probabilities and Payoffs, Prior Studies Using Gambles Compatible With the Priority Heuristic

Study	Condition/ experiment	Method	Ratio
Brandstätter et al. (2008)		Mouselab	2.34
Johnson et al. (2008)	2 outcome	Mouselab	2.13
	5 outcome		0.56
Payne & Braustein (1978)	2 outcome	Trackball	1.94
Rosen & Rosenkoetter (1978)		Eye tracking	1.63
Russo & Doshier (1983)	Experiment 3	Eye tracking	2.20 ^a

^a Weighted by number of fixations.

References

- Brandstätter, E., Gigerenzer, G., & Hertwig, R. (2006). The priority heuristic: Making choices without trade-offs. *Psychological Review*, 113, 409–432.
- Brandstätter, E., Gigerenzer, G., & Hertwig, R. (2008). Risky choice with heuristics: Reply to Birnbaum (2008), Johnson, Schulte-Mecklenbeck, and Willemsen (2008), and Rieger and Wang (2008). *Psychological Review*.
- Johnson, E. J., Schulte-Mecklenbeck, M., & Willemsen, M. (2008). Process models deserve process data: A comment on Brandstätter, Gigerenzer, and Hertwig (2006). *Psychological Review*.

- Payne, J. W., Bettman, J. R., & Johnson, E. J. (1993). *The adaptive decision maker*. New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Payne, J. W., & Braunstein, M. L. (1978). Risky choice: An examination of information acquisition behavior. *Memory and Cognition*, 6, 554–561.
- Rosen, L. D., & Rosenkoetter, P. (1978). An eye fixation analysis of choice and judgment with multiattribute stimuli. *Memory and Cognition*, 4, 474–752.
- Russo, J. E., & Doshier, B. A. (1983). Strategies for multiattribute binary choice. *Journal of Experimental Psychology: Learning, Memory, and Cognition*, 9, 676–696.

UNITED STATES POSTAL SERVICE
Statement of Ownership, Management, and Circulation
(All Periodicals Publications Except Requester Publications)

1. Publication Title: **Psychological Review**
 2. Issue Frequency: **Quarterly**
 3. Publication Number: **0033-2909**
 4. Issue Date: **October 2007**
 5. Number of Issues Published Annually: **4**
 6. Annual Subscription Price: **Inst \$448**
 7. Complete Mailing Address of Known Office of Publication (Not printer) (Street, city, county, state, and ZIP+4®):
750 First Street, N.E., Washington, D.C. 20002-4242
 8. Complete Mailing Address of Headquarters or General Business Office of Publisher (Not printer):
750 First Street, N.E., Washington, D.C. 20002-4242
 9. Full Names and Complete Mailing Addresses of Publisher, Editor, and Business Manager:
Publisher (Name and complete mailing address):
American Psychological Association
750 First Street, N.E.
Washington, D.C. 20002-4242
Editor (Name and complete mailing address):
Keith Rayner, PhD, Department of Psychology, Tobin Hall
University of Massachusetts
Amherst, MA 01003
Business Manager (Name and complete mailing address):
Susan J. A. Harris
American Psychological Association
750 First Street, N.E., Washington, D.C. 20002-4242
 10. Owner (Do not leave blank. If the publication is owned by a corporation, give the name and address of the corporation immediately followed by the names and addresses of all stockholders owning or holding 1 percent or more of the total amount of stock. If not owned by a corporation, give the names and addresses of the individual owners. If owned by a partnership or other unincorporated firm, give its name and address as well as those of each individual owner. If the publication is published by a proprietor, give the name and address.)
Full Name: American Psychological Association
Complete Mailing Address: 750 First Street, N.E., Washington, D.C. 20002-4242
 11. Known Bondholders, Mortgagees, and Other Security Holders Owning or Holding 1 Percent or More of Total Amount of Bonds, Mortgages, or Other Securities. If none, check box.
None
 12. Tax Status (For completion by nonprofit organizations authorized to mail at nonprofit rates) (Check one):
☒ The purpose, function, and nonprofit status of this organization and the exempt status for federal income tax purposes:
☐ Has Not Changed During Preceding 12 Months
☐ Has Changed During Preceding 12 Months (Publication must submit explanation of change with this statement)

13. Publication Title: **Psychological Review**
 14. Issue Date for Circulation Data Below: **July 2007**

15. Extent and Nature of Circulation
 Average No. Copies Each Issue During Preceding 12 Months: **3500**
 No. Copies of Single Issue Published Nearest to Filing Date: **3006**

16. Extent and Nature of Circulation (Sum of 16a, 16b, 16c, 16d, 16e, 16f, 16g, 16h, 16i, 16j, 16k, 16l, 16m, 16n, 16o, 16p, 16q, 16r, 16s, 16t, 16u, 16v, 16w, 16x, 16y, 16z, 16aa, 16ab, 16ac, 16ad, 16ae, 16af, 16ag, 16ah, 16ai, 16aj, 16ak, 16al, 16am, 16an, 16ao, 16ap, 16aq, 16ar, 16as, 16at, 16au, 16av, 16aw, 16ax, 16ay, 16az, 16ba, 16bb, 16bc, 16bd, 16be, 16bf, 16bg, 16bh, 16bi, 16bj, 16bk, 16bl, 16bm, 16bn, 16bo, 16bp, 16bq, 16br, 16bs, 16bt, 16bu, 16bv, 16bw, 16bx, 16by, 16bz, 16ca, 16cb, 16cc, 16cd, 16ce, 16cf, 16cg, 16ch, 16ci, 16cj, 16ck, 16cl, 16cm, 16cn, 16co, 16cp, 16cq, 16cr, 16cs, 16ct, 16cu, 16cv, 16cw, 16cx, 16cy, 16cz, 16da, 16db, 16dc, 16dd, 16de, 16df, 16dg, 16dh, 16di, 16dj, 16dk, 16dl, 16dm, 16dn, 16do, 16dp, 16dq, 16dr, 16ds, 16dt, 16du, 16dv, 16dw, 16dx, 16dy, 16dz, 16ea, 16eb, 16ec, 16ed, 16ee, 16ef, 16eg, 16eh, 16ei, 16ej, 16ek, 16el, 16em, 16en, 16eo, 16ep, 16eq, 16er, 16es, 16et, 16eu, 16ev, 16ew, 16ex, 16ey, 16ez, 16fa, 16fb, 16fc, 16fd, 16fe, 16ff, 16fg, 16fh, 16fi, 16fj, 16fk, 16fl, 16fm, 16fn, 16fo, 16fp, 16fq, 16fr, 16fs, 16ft, 16fu, 16fv, 16fw, 16fx, 16fy, 16fz, 16ga, 16gb, 16gc, 16gd, 16ge, 16gf, 16gg, 16gh, 16gi, 16gj, 16gk, 16gl, 16gm, 16gn, 16go, 16gp, 16gq, 16gr, 16gs, 16gt, 16gu, 16gv, 16gw, 16gx, 16gy, 16gz, 16ha, 16hb, 16hc, 16hd, 16he, 16hf, 16hg, 16hh, 16hi, 16hj, 16hk, 16hl, 16hm, 16hn, 16ho, 16hp, 16hq, 16hr, 16hs, 16ht, 16hu, 16hv, 16hw, 16hx, 16hy, 16hz, 16ia, 16ib, 16ic, 16id, 16ie, 16if, 16ig, 16ih, 16ii, 16ij, 16ik, 16il, 16im, 16in, 16io, 16ip, 16iq, 16ir, 16is, 16it, 16iu, 16iv, 16iw, 16ix, 16iy, 16iz, 16ja, 16jb, 16jc, 16jd, 16je, 16jf, 16jg, 16jh, 16ji, 16jj, 16jk, 16jl, 16jm, 16jn, 16jo, 16jp, 16jq, 16jr, 16js, 16jt, 16ju, 16jv, 16jw, 16jx, 16jy, 16jz, 16ka, 16kb, 16kc, 16kd, 16ke, 16kf, 16kg, 16kh, 16ki, 16kj, 16kk, 16kl, 16km, 16kn, 16ko, 16kp, 16kq, 16kr, 16ks, 16kt, 16ku, 16kv, 16kw, 16kx, 16ky, 16kz, 16la, 16lb, 16lc, 16ld, 16le, 16lf, 16lg, 16lh, 16li, 16lj, 16lk, 16ll, 16lm, 16ln, 16lo, 16lp, 16lq, 16lr, 16ls, 16lt, 16lu, 16lv, 16lw, 16lx, 16ly, 16lz, 16ma, 16mb, 16mc, 16md, 16me, 16mf, 16mg, 16mh, 16mi, 16mj, 16mk, 16ml, 16mm, 16mn, 16mo, 16mp, 16mq, 16mr, 16ms, 16mt, 16mu, 16mv, 16mw, 16mx, 16my, 16mz, 16na, 16nb, 16nc, 16nd, 16ne, 16nf, 16ng, 16nh, 16ni, 16nj, 16nk, 16nl, 16nm, 16nn, 16no, 16np, 16nq, 16nr, 16ns, 16nt, 16nu, 16nv, 16nw, 16nx, 16ny, 16nz, 16oa, 16ob, 16oc, 16od, 16oe, 16of, 16og, 16oh, 16oi, 16oj, 16ok, 16ol, 16om, 16on, 16oo, 16op, 16oq, 16or, 16os, 16ot, 16ou, 16ov, 16ow, 16ox, 16oy, 16oz, 16pa, 16pb, 16pc, 16pd, 16pe, 16pf, 16pg, 16ph, 16pi, 16pj, 16pk, 16pl, 16pm, 16pn, 16po, 16pp, 16pq, 16pr, 16ps, 16pt, 16pu, 16pv, 16pw, 16px, 16py, 16pz, 16qa, 16qb, 16qc, 16qd, 16qe, 16qf, 16qg, 16qh, 16qi, 16qj, 16qk, 16ql, 16qm, 16qn, 16qo, 16qp, 16qq, 16qr, 16qs, 16qt, 16qu, 16qv, 16qw, 16qx, 16qy, 16qz, 16ra, 16rb, 16rc, 16rd, 16re, 16rf, 16rg, 16rh, 16ri, 16rj, 16rk, 16rl, 16rm, 16rn, 16ro, 16rp, 16rq, 16rr, 16rs, 16rt, 16ru, 16rv, 16rw, 16rx, 16ry, 16rz, 16sa, 16sb, 16sc, 16sd, 16se, 16sf, 16sg, 16sh, 16si, 16sj, 16sk, 16sl, 16sm, 16sn, 16so, 16sp, 16sq, 16sr, 16ss, 16st, 16su, 16sv, 16sw, 16sx, 16sy, 16sz, 16ta, 16tb, 16tc, 16td, 16te, 16tf, 16tg, 16th, 16ti, 16tj, 16tk, 16tl, 16tm, 16tn, 16to, 16tp, 16tq, 16tr, 16ts, 16tt, 16tu, 16tv, 16tw, 16tx, 16ty, 16tz, 16ua, 16ub, 16uc, 16ud, 16ue, 16uf, 16ug, 16uh, 16ui, 16uj, 16uk, 16ul, 16um, 16un, 16uo, 16up, 16uq, 16ur, 16us, 16ut, 16uu, 16uv, 16uw, 16ux, 16uy, 16uz, 16va, 16vb, 16vc, 16vd, 16ve, 16vf, 16vg, 16vh, 16vi, 16vj, 16vk, 16vl, 16vm, 16vn, 16vo, 16vp, 16vq, 16vr, 16vs, 16vt, 16vu, 16vv, 16vw, 16vx, 16vy, 16vz, 16wa, 16wb, 16wc, 16wd, 16we, 16wf, 16wg, 16wh, 16wi, 16wj, 16wk, 16wl, 16wm, 16wn, 16wo, 16wp, 16wq, 16wr, 16ws, 16wt, 16wu, 16wv, 16ww, 16wx, 16wy, 16wz, 16xa, 16xb, 16xc, 16xd, 16xe, 16xf, 16xg, 16xh, 16xi, 16xj, 16xk, 16xl, 16xm, 16xn, 16xo, 16xp, 16xq, 16xr, 16xs, 16xt, 16xu, 16xv, 16xw, 16xx, 16xy, 16xz, 16ya, 16yb, 16yc, 16yd, 16ye, 16yf, 16yg, 16yh, 16yi, 16yj, 16yk, 16yl, 16ym, 16yn, 16yo, 16yp, 16yq, 16yr, 16ys, 16yt, 16yu, 16yv, 16yw, 16yx, 16yz, 16za, 16zb, 16zc, 16zd, 16ze, 16zf, 16zg, 16zh, 16zi, 16zj, 16zk, 16zl, 16zm, 16zn, 16zo, 16zp, 16zq, 16zr, 16zs, 16zt, 16zu, 16zv, 16zw, 16zx, 16zy, 16zz)

17. Signature and Title of Editor, Publisher, Business Manager, or Owner:
Barbara Spivey, Dir. Service Center Operations
 18. I certify that all information furnished on this form is true and complete. I understand that anyone who furnishes false or misleading information on this form or who omits material or information requested on the form may be subject to criminal sanctions (including fines and imprisonment) and/or civil sanctions (including civil penalties).