

# Tables

# Tables

Table 1: Summary Statistics

|                                      | Mean                     | Std. Dev.                | Min                  | Max                        | N         |
|--------------------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|----------------------|----------------------------|-----------|
| <b>Panel A: Priority 1 Outcomes:</b> |                          |                          |                      |                            |           |
| Call-to-Dispatch                     | 281.89<br>(4.70 mins)    | 436.53<br>(7.28 mins)    | 2.00<br>(0.03 mins)  | 3,111.00<br>(51.85 mins)   | 3,582,560 |
| Call-to-On-Scene                     | 770.86<br>(12.85 mins)   | 784.69<br>(13.08 mins)   | 11.00<br>(0.18 mins) | 7,671.00<br>(127.85 mins)  | 1,997,102 |
| Arrest Made                          | 0.02                     | 0.15                     | 0.00                 | 1.00                       | 3,582,560 |
| Victim Injury (Time-Sensitive)       | 0.01                     | 0.12                     | 0.00                 | 1.00                       | 2,434,526 |
| <b>Panel B: Secondary Outcomes:</b>  |                          |                          |                      |                            |           |
| Call-to-Dispatch (Priority 2)        | 362.04<br>(6.03 mins)    | 524.78<br>(8.75 mins)    | 2.00<br>(0.03 mins)  | 3,577.00<br>(59.62 mins)   | 1,604,709 |
| Call-to-On-Scene (Priority 2)        | 964.45<br>(16.07 mins)   | 901.10<br>(15.02 mins)   | 14.00<br>(0.23 mins) | 6,615.00<br>(110.25 mins)  | 776,304   |
| Call-to-Dispatch (Priority 3)        | 1,012.99<br>(16.88 mins) | 1,258.17<br>(20.97 mins) | 2.00<br>(0.03 mins)  | 6,550.00<br>(109.17 mins)  | 3,284,127 |
| Call-to-On-Scene (Priority 3)        | 1,915.35<br>(31.92 mins) | 1,820.17<br>(30.34 mins) | 10.00<br>(0.17 mins) | 11,702.00<br>(195.03 mins) | 1,226,135 |
| <b>Panel C: Other Variables:</b>     |                          |                          |                      |                            |           |
| Number Dispatches                    | 73.01                    | 24.63                    | 8.00                 | 223.00                     | 3,582,560 |
| Number SST Dispatches                | 2.56                     | 3.72                     | 0.00                 | 55.00                      | 3,582,560 |
| Officer Hours                        | 1,259.50                 | 316.36                   | 200.50               | 3,431.50                   | 3,582,560 |

*Note:*

Units are in seconds unless otherwise noted. Data is at the call-level. Call-to-Dispatch represents the amount of time from the 911 call to an officer dispatching to the scene. Call-to-On-Scene is the time from a 911 call to when an officer arrives on scene. Call-to-On-Scene is missing approximately 45 percent of on-scene times. This is discussed further in Appendix A. Arrest Probability is the probability of an arrest occurring during a dispatch. Victim Injury Probability is the probability of a victim being injured during a time-sensitive dispatch call. A time-sensitive dispatch call is one in which the injury outcome has not yet been realized. Priority 1 refers to an immediate dispatch, Priority 2 a rapid dispatch, and Priority 3 a routine dispatch. Officer Hours are the number of working hours sworn police officers work at the district-day level. Number of Dispatches is the number of Priority 1 dispatches at the district-day level. Number of SST Dispatches is the number of dispatches due to ShotSpotter alerts. Importantly, Number of SST Dispatches is also at the district-by-day level and includes days in which ShotSpotter is not implemented. The average daily number of ShotSpotter dispatches across Chicago once all 12 districts have implemented ShotSpotter is approximately 60. Note that New Years Eve/New Years Day/Fourth of July are excluded from the sample as ShotSpotter alerts can be as high as 392 on these days.

Table 2: Effect of ShotSpotter on Response Times (OLS)

|                                  | (1)                    | (2)                    | (3)                    | (4)                    | (5)                    |
|----------------------------------|------------------------|------------------------|------------------------|------------------------|------------------------|
| <i>Panel A: Call-to-Dispatch</i> |                        |                        |                        |                        |                        |
| ShotSpotter Activated            | 64.142***<br>(21.541)  | 64.058***<br>(22.394)  | 63.954***<br>(22.235)  | 71.929***<br>(22.405)  | 61.373***<br>(21.641)  |
| Border District Activated        |                        |                        |                        |                        | 21.406<br>(16.503)     |
| Mean of Dependent Variable       | 281.890                | 281.890                | 281.890                | 281.890                | 281.890                |
| Observations                     | 3,582,560              | 3,582,560              | 3,582,560              | 3,582,528              | 3,582,560              |
| Wild Bootstrap P-Value           | 0.015                  | 0.012                  | 0.015                  |                        | 0.017                  |
| <i>Panel B: Call-to-On-Scene</i> |                        |                        |                        |                        |                        |
| ShotSpotter Activated            | 101.813***<br>(26.205) | 103.107***<br>(28.801) | 103.566***<br>(28.182) | 120.721***<br>(27.992) | 101.392***<br>(28.167) |
| Border District Activated        |                        |                        |                        |                        | 24.407<br>(17.882)     |
| Mean of Dependent Variable       | 770.863                | 770.863                | 770.863                | 770.863                | 770.863                |
| Observations                     | 1,997,102              | 1,997,102              | 1,997,102              | 1,997,075              | 1,997,102              |
| Wild Bootstrap P-Value           | 0.005                  | 0.001                  | 0.002                  |                        | 0.001                  |
| FE: Day-by-Month-by-Year         | X                      | X                      | X                      | X                      | X                      |
| FE: District                     | X                      | X                      | X                      | X                      | X                      |
| FE: Call-Type                    |                        | X                      | X                      | X                      | X                      |
| FE: Hour-of-Day                  |                        | X                      | X                      | X                      | X                      |
| Officer Hours                    |                        |                        | X                      |                        |                        |
| Number 911 Dispatches            |                        |                        | X                      |                        |                        |
| Gardner (2022) Robust            |                        |                        |                        | X                      |                        |

*Note:*

\*  $p < 0.1$ , \*\*  $p < 0.05$ , \*\*\*  $p < 0.01$

Standard errors are clustered by district. Shotspotter is activated in 12 of the 22 police districts in Chicago. Panel A shows results for Call-to-Dispatch while Panel B shows results for Call-to-On-Scene. Column 1 reports no controls, and only fixed effects. Controls in all other columns include officer hours and number of 911 dispatches. Column 2 reports the preferred specification from Equation 1. Column 3 reports estimates using the Gardner (2022) estimator which is robust to heterogeneous treatment effects across groups and time periods in staggered designs. Column 4 includes Border District Activated which is an indicator for when a police district is adjacent to a ShotSpotter implemented district. Wild cluster bootstrap p-values are also reported as the number of clusters (22) is below the threshold of 30 put forth in Cameron et al. (2008). Columns 5 and 6 split the sample by district median levels of officer hours. Observations for Call-to-On-Scene do not exactly match Call-to-Dispatch since there is one district-day that is missing information for Call-to-On-Scene.

Table 3: Effect of ShotSpotter on Response Times Mechanisms (OLS)

|                                  | ShotSpotter Rollout    |                      |                        | ShotSpotter Dispatches |                     |                     |
|----------------------------------|------------------------|----------------------|------------------------|------------------------|---------------------|---------------------|
|                                  | Officer Hours          |                      |                        | Officer Hours          |                     |                     |
|                                  | Full Sample            | > Median             | <= Median              | Full Sample            | > Median            | <= Median           |
|                                  | (1)                    | (2)                  | (3)                    | (4)                    | (5)                 | (6)                 |
| <i>Panel A: Call-to-Dispatch</i> |                        |                      |                        |                        |                     |                     |
| ShotSpotter Activated            | 64.131***<br>(22.379)  | 27.222**<br>(12.382) | 93.794***<br>(31.497)  |                        |                     |                     |
| Number SST Dispatches            |                        |                      |                        | 5.272***<br>(1.490)    | 3.344***<br>(0.945) | 4.237***<br>(0.879) |
| Mean of Dependent Variable       | 281.890                | 229.785              | 333.871                | 291.300                | 232.886             | 349.536             |
| Observations                     | 3,582,560              | 1,789,157            | 1,793,403              | 2,958,754              | 1,477,121           | 1,481,633           |
| <i>Panel B: Call-to-On-Scene</i> |                        |                      |                        |                        |                     |                     |
| ShotSpotter Activated            | 102.682***<br>(28.724) | 55.508**<br>(21.030) | 141.492***<br>(38.611) |                        |                     |                     |
| Number SST Dispatches            |                        |                      |                        | 7.053***<br>(1.885)    | 4.857***<br>(1.158) | 5.152***<br>(1.133) |
| Mean of Dependent Variable       | 770.863                | 700.283              | 837.941                | 771.964                | 690.147             | 853.515             |
| Observations                     | 1,997,102              | 973,138              | 1,023,964              | 1,732,479              | 864,836             | 867,643             |
| FE: Day-by-Month-by-Year         | X                      | X                    | X                      | X                      | X                   | X                   |
| FE: District                     | X                      | X                    | X                      | X                      | X                   | X                   |
| FE: Call-Type                    | X                      | X                    | X                      | X                      | X                   | X                   |
| FE: Hour-of-Day                  | X                      | X                    | X                      | X                      | X                   | X                   |

*Note:*

\* p < 0.1, \*\* p < 0.05, \*\*\* p < 0.01

Standard errors are clustered by district. Number SST Dispatches refers to the number of ShotSpotter dispatches that occur within a district-day. All coefficient estimates are in seconds. Panel A reports results for Call-to-Dispatch while Panel B reports results for Call-to-On-Scene. Call-to-Dispatch is the amount of time from a 911 call to when a police officer is dispatched to the scene of the crime. Call-to-On-Scene is the time from a 911 call to the time a police officer arrives on-scene. In Column 1, the controls of officer hours and number of 911 dispatches are not included. Column 2 shows the preferred specification, while Columns 3 and 4 split the sample by median number of officer hours within districts to show that response times are driven by resource-constrained time periods. Observations for Call-to-On-Scene do not exactly match Call-to-Dispatch since there is one district-day that is missing information for Call-to-On-Scene.

Table 4: Effect of ShotSpotter Enactment on Arrest Probability (OLS)

|                            | All                  | Most Frequent Arrest Types |                      |                      |                             |
|----------------------------|----------------------|----------------------------|----------------------|----------------------|-----------------------------|
|                            |                      | Gun-Related                | Non-Gun-Related      | Domestic Disturbance | Domestic Battery    Robbery |
|                            | (1)                  | (2)                        | (3)                  | (4)                  | (5)    (6)                  |
| ShotSpotter Activated      | -0.002***<br>(0.001) | -0.002<br>(0.002)          | -0.002***<br>(0.001) | -0.008***<br>(0.002) | -0.003**<br>(0.001)         |
| Mean of Dependent Variable | 0.024                | 0.034                      | 0.024                | 0.061                | 0.020                       |
| Observations               | 3,582,560            | 317,937                    | 3,264,623            | 224,022              | 675,025                     |
| FE: Day-by-Month-by-Year   | X                    | X                          | X                    | X                    | X                           |
| FE: District               | X                    | X                          | X                    | X                    | X                           |
| FE: Call-Type              | X                    | X                          | X                    | X                    | X                           |
| FE: Hour-of-Day            | X                    | X                          | X                    | X                    | X                           |

*Note:*

\*  $p < 0.1$ , \*\*  $p < 0.05$ , \*\*\*  $p < 0.01$

Standard errors are clustered by district. Panel A shows Arrest Rate defined as the number of arrests made divided by the number of dispatches, while Panel B shows Injury defined as the number of injury-related dispatches divided by the number of dispatches that are time-sensitive (see Appendix Figure BLANK). Columns 2 and 3 subset Column 1 by gun-related and non-gun-related arrest rates and injury rates. Gun-related crimes for Arrest Rate are those corresponding to a person with a gun, shots fired, or a person shot. Gun-related crimes to Injury Rate corresponds to person with gun or shots fired. Columns 3-5 report the top 3 most frequent calls that end in arrests: Domestic Battery, Domestic Disturbance, and Battery. Observations are not consistent across each call type since not every type of call occurs on every district-day. Controls of officer hours and number of dispatches are included in all specifications.

Table 5: Effect of ShotSpotter Implementation on Victim Injury (OLS)

|                            | Probability of Victim Injury |                   |                  |
|----------------------------|------------------------------|-------------------|------------------|
|                            | Full Sample                  | Gun Dispatch      | Non-Gun Dispatch |
|                            | (1)                          | (2)               | (3)              |
| ShotSpotter Activated      | -0.001*<br>(0.000)           | -0.003<br>(0.002) | 0.000<br>(0.000) |
| Mean of Dependent Variable | 0.014                        | 0.024             | 0.012            |
| Observations               | 2,434,526                    | 304,544           | 2,129,982        |
| FE: Day-by-Month-by-Year   | X                            | X                 | X                |
| FE: District               | X                            | X                 | X                |
| FE: Call-Type              | X                            | X                 | X                |
| FE: Hour-of-Day            | X                            | X                 | X                |

*Note:*

\*  $p < 0.1$ , \*\*  $p < 0.05$ , \*\*\*  $p < 0.01$

Standard errors are clustered by district. The main outcome variable is the probability of a victim being injured. The sample here is restricted to only Priority 1 dispatches that are time-sensitive and have the possibility of an injury. For instance, a dispatch for a person shot is not time sensitive since the injury has already been realized. On the other hand, a dispatch for a person with a knife is considered time-sensitive as an injury has not yet occurred, but may occur if an officer arrives slower. Gun Dispatch is restricted to only time-sensitive gun dispatches including 'Person with a Gun' and 'Shots Fired'. Non-Gun Dispatch are all other time-sensitive dispatches. .