# PAŢICCASAMUPPĀDA

# From the Pāli Suttas

Translated and commented

by

Minowani

# Contents

	Preface	2
Ι	Paṭiccasamuppāda	3
1	SN12.1 Dependent-Co-Arising	4
2	SN12.2 Division	6
3	SN12.3 The Way	9
4	SN12.4 Vipassī	10
5	SN12.12 Moliyaphagguna	15
6	SN12.37 Not of You	18
7	SN12.52 Grasping	19
II	References	21
1	SN12.11 Food	22
2	SN12.43 Suffering	24
3	SN22.79 Consumed	27
4	SN22.121 Graspable	34
5	AN2.11.8-9	35
6	AN3.47-48	36

## Preface

The discourses in the Paticcasamuppāda Part are about:

- SN12.1 Dependent-Co-Arising & SN12.2 Division. Just as when a child learns what some things are, f.i. houses, and then keeps asking, while pointing at things, 'is that a house? and is that a house? and that?', just like that here some occurrences pointed out first.
- SN12.3 The Way. While pointed out we might loose sight what it is for, so that is emphasized here.
- SN12.4 Vipassī. On how to find these occurrences by ourselves.
- SN12.12 Moliyaphagguna. Even when using for the right reasons, there could still be a wrong way of looking at things.
- SN12.37 Not of You. Perhaps the previous discourses already made it clear; here is explicit stated what dependent-co-arising is.
- SN12.52 Grasping. And the last discourse is about how to practically build suffering down, instead of up.

With these six points we got a nice base, foundation, to fallback on.

Minowani, Tuesday 12<sup>th</sup> January, 2021.

# Part I Paṭiccasamuppāda

# SN12.1 Dependent-Co-Arising

Thus I learned. One time the Exalted One dwells<sup>1</sup> in Jetavane, Anāthapiṇḍika's park at Sāvatthi. Now then the Exalted One addressed the monks:

"Monks."

Those monks replied to the Exalted One:

"Venerable."

The Exalted One said this:

"I shall point out to you, monks, dependent<sup>2</sup>-co-arising. So listen and pay attention thoroughly<sup>3</sup>, I shall speak."

Then those monks replied to the Exalted One:

"Yes, venerable."

The Exalted One said this:

"And which<sup>4</sup>, monks, dependent-co-arising?

With support<sup>5</sup> of not-knowing, monks, inclinations. With support of inclinations, conscious. With support of conscious, name-&form. With support of name-&-form, hexad-base<sup>6</sup>. With support of hexad-base, contact. With support of contact, feeling. With support of feeling, longing. With support of longing, grasping. With support of grasping, existence. With support of existence, birth. With support of birth, decay-&-death, grief, lamentation, suffering, melancholy, unrest arise. In this way this is the rise of the entire mass of suffering. This is called, monks, dependent-coarising.

 $<sup>^{1} \</sup>Rightarrow \text{Narrative present}.$ 

 $<sup>^2 \</sup>Rightarrow Paticcas a mupp \bar{a} da$ , a descriptive compound; paticca (ger.) used as adj. (cp. ahicca).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Listen (to another) and (proper) attent, the supports for Right View (see AN2.11.8-9).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Pointed out are some *general occurrences* (universals; see SN12.11 Food for some others).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Here is explained how that depending is; as falling back on, support.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Saļāyatana (nt.) [ṣaḍ° ordinarily chal°: see cha]; ṣaḍ reminds of hextad (hĕk´säd´). The general occurrences are of the same order. For contact it is thus base, not bases. Hexad is used for grammatical reasons; sixtet -, sixfold base or base of six can do just fine. Mixing generals with particulars however (which is not about plural vs singular) is a mix-up. For cha (six) & āyatana see SN12.12 Moļiyaphagguna.

Thus of course<sup>7</sup>, with the complete fading away and cessation of not-knowing, cessation of inclinations. With cessation of inclinations, cessation of conscious. With cessation of conscious, cessation of name-&-form. With cessation of name-&-form, cessation of hexad-base. With cessation of hexad-base, cessation of contact. With cessation of contact, cessation of feeling. With cessation of feeling, cessation of longing. With cessation of longing, cessation of grasping. With cessation of grasping, cessation of existence. With cessation of existence, cessation of birth. With cessation of birth, decay-&-death, grief, lamentation, suffering, melancholy, unrest cease. In this way this is the cessation of the entire mass of suffering."

So spoke the Exalted One.

Those monks, gladdened by the Exalted One's word, rejoiced.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Earlier we saw which *universals* arise together with their support, thus of course, if you remove that support... And that is what dependent-co-arising is about (see SN12.3 The Way). On how to remove that support see SN12.52 Grasping.

# SN12.2 Division

At Sāvatthi.

"I shall point out and divide<sup>1</sup> to you, monks, dependent-co-arising. So listen and pay attention thoroughly, I shall speak."

Then those monks replied to the Exalted One:

"Yes, venerable."

The Exalted One said this:

"And which<sup>2</sup>, monks, dependent-co-arising?

With support of not-knowing, monks, inclinations. With support of inclinations, conscious. With support of conscious, name-&-form. With support of name-&-form, hexad-base. With support of hexad-base, contact. With support of contact, feeling. With support of feeling, longing. With support of longing, grasping. With support of grasping, existence. With support of existence, birth. With support of birth, decay-&-death, grief, lamentation, suffering, melancholy, unrest arise. In this way this is the rise of the entire mass of suffering. This is called, monks, dependent-coarising.

And which<sup>3</sup>, monks, decay-&-death?

Whatever decay, state of decay, brokenness of teeth, greyness of hair<sup>4</sup>, wrinkling of skin, decrease of vitality, collapse of faculties of these or those beings, in this or that group of beings, this is called decay. Whatever passing away, shifting out of existence, breaking down, disappearance, death and gone, dying, breaking down of masses, laying down the carcass, cutting off the life faculty of these or those beings, in this or that group of beings, this is called death. Thus this decay and this death, this is called, monks, decay-&death.

And which, monks, birth?

Whatever birth, being born, descent, forthcoming, becoming, appearance of masses, obtainment of base of these or those beings, in this or that group of beings, this is called, monks, birth.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Pointed out and divided are some general occurrences in particulars.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Which generals.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Which particulars (idem for the further questions).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Thus, brokenness of teeth and greyness of hair are particulars of decay, etc.

And which, monks, existence?

These three, monks, existences: sensuous-existence, material-existence, immaterial-existence; this is called, monks, existence.

And which, monks, grasping?

These four, monks, graspings: grasping for the sensuous, grasping for views, grasping for rites and rituals, grasping for theories about Self; this is called, monks, grasping.

And which, monks, longing?

These six, monks, types of longing: longing for forms, longing for sounds, longing for scents, longing for tastes, longing for touches and longing for things; this is called, monks, longing.

And which, monks, feeling?

These six, monks, types of feeling: feeling born with eye<sup>5</sup>-contact, feeling born with ear<sup>6</sup>-contact, feeling born with nose-contact, feeling born with tongue-contact, feeling born with body-contact, feeling born with mind-contact; this is called, monks, feeling.

And which, monks, contact?<sup>7</sup>

These six, monks, types of contact: eye-contact, ear-contact, nose-contact, tongue-contact, body-contact, mind-contact; this is called, monks, contact.

And which, monks, hexad-base?

Eye-base, ear-base, nose-base, tongue-base, body-base, mind-base; this is called, monks, hexad-base.

And which, monks, name-&-form?

Feeling, perception, intention, contact, attention; this is called name. The four great entities and of the four great entities the taking up as form; this is called, monks, form<sup>8</sup>. Thus this name and this form; this is called, monks, name-&-form.

And which, monks, conscious?

These six, monks, types of conscious: eye-conscious, ear-conscious, nose-conscious, tongue-conscious, body-conscious,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> This is not the eye (akkhi) as organ, but relates to its function.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> And ear is *kanna*.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> As for *what* contact is see f.i. SN12.43 Suffering

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> On why it is called 'form' see SN22.79 Consumed; idem for feeling, perception, inclinations and conscious.

mind-conscious; this is called, monks, conscious.

And which, monks, inclinations?

These three, monks, inclinations: body inclination, speech inclination, mind inclination; these are called, monks, inclinations.

And which, monks, not-knowing?

Now whatever, monks, ignorance to suffering, ignorance to the arising of suffering, ignorance to the cessation suffering, ignorance to the way leading to the cessation suffering; this is called, monks, not-knowing.

Thus now, monks, with support of not-knowing, monks, inclinations. With support of inclinations, conscious. With support of conscious, name-&-form. With support of name-&-form, hexadbase. With support of hexad-base, contact. With support of contact, feeling. With support of feeling, longing. With support of longing, grasping. With support of grasping, existence. With support of existence, birth. With support of birth, decay-&-death, grief, lamentation, suffering, melancholy, unrest arise. In this way this is the rise of the entire mass of suffering.

Thus of course, with the complete fading away and cessation of not-knowing, cessation of inclinations. With cessation of inclinations, cessation of conscious. With cessation of conscious, cessation of name-&-form. With cessation of name-&-form, cessation of hexad-base. With cessation of hexad-base, cessation of contact. With cessation of contact, cessation of feeling. With cessation of feeling, cessation of longing. With cessation of longing, cessation of grasping. With cessation of grasping, cessation of existence. With cessation of existence, cessation of birth. With cessation of birth, decay-&-death, grief, lamentation, suffering, melancholy, unrest cease. In this way this is the cessation of the entire mass of suffering."

# SN12.3 The Way

At Sāvatthi.

"I shall point out to you, monks, the wrong way and the right way. So listen and pay attention thoroughly, I shall speak."

Then those monks replied to the Exalted One:

"Yes, venerable."

The Exalted One said this:

"And which, monks, is the wrong way?

With with support of not-knowing, monks, inclinations. With support of inclinations, conscious. With support of conscious, name-&-form. With support of name-&-form, hexad-base. With support of hexad-base, contact. With support of contact, feeling. With support of feeling, longing. With support of longing, grasping. With support of grasping, existence. With support of existence, birth. With support of birth, decay-&-death, grief, lamentation, suffering, melancholy, unrest arise. In this way this is the rise of the entire mass of suffering. This is called, monks, the wrong way.

And which, monks, is the right way<sup>1</sup>?

Thus of course, with the complete fading away and cessation of not-knowing, cessation of inclinations. With cessation of inclinations, cessation of conscious. With cessation of conscious, cessation of name-&-form. With cessation of name-&-form, cessation of hexad-base. With cessation of hexad-base, cessation of contact. With cessation of contact, cessation of feeling. With cessation of feeling, cessation of longing. With cessation of longing, cessation of grasping. With cessation of grasping, cessation of existence. With cessation of existence, cessation of birth. With cessation of birth, decay-&-death, grief, lamentation, suffering, melancholy, unrest cease. In this way this is the cessation of the entire mass of suffering. This is called, monks, the right way."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> What makes it the right way is because it is about the fading away and cessation of suffering. How suffering rises is a means to this end.

# SN12.4 Vipassī

#### At Sāvatthi.

"To Vipassī<sup>1</sup>, monks, the Exalted One, Worthy One, Rightful Awakened One, while being even an aspirant for enlightenment, so before enlightenment, not having fully awakened, it was like this:

'Alas! miserable is the world; the meeting with and to be born, and to decay, and to die, and to pass on, and to arise. And yet, to this yo-yoing of decay-&-death, of suffering, an escape is not find out. O! when will it be known, the escape of this decay-&-death, of suffering?'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant for enlightenment, it was like this: 'Now then there being what, decay-&-death is? With support of what, decay-&-death?'<sup>2</sup>

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant for enlightenment, with proper attention, with wisdom, was the clear understanding: 'Now, there being birth, decay-&-death is. With support of birth, decay-&-death.'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant for enlightenment, it was like this: 'Now then there being what, birth is? With support of what, birth?'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant for enlightenment, with proper attention, with wisdom, was the clear understanding: 'Now there being existence, birth is. With support of existence, birth.'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant for enlightenment, it was like this: 'Now then there being what, existence is? With support of what, existence?'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant of enlightenment, with proper attention, with wisdom, was the clear understanding: 'Now there being grasping, existence is. With support of grasping, existence.'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant for enlightenment, it was like this: 'Now then there being what, grasping is? With support of what, grasping?'

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> SN12 contains discourses like this for each of the last seven Rightful Awakened One's.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The proper investigation: not as conditionality but as dependent-co-arising.

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant of enlightenment, with proper attention, with wisdom, was the clear understanding: 'Now there being longing, grasping is. With support of longing, grasping.'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant for enlightenment, it was like this: 'Now then there being what, longing is? With support of what, longing?'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant of enlightenment, with proper attention, with wisdom, was the clear understanding: 'Now there being feeling, longing is. With support of feeling, longing.'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant for enlightenment, it was like this: 'Now then there being what, feeling is? With support of what, feeling?'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant of enlightenment, with proper attention, with wisdom, was the clear understanding: 'Now there being contact, feeling is. With support of contact, feeling.'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant for enlightenment, it was like this: 'Now then there being what, contact is? With support of what, contact?'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant of enlightenment, with proper attention, with wisdom, was the clear understanding: 'Now there being hexad-base, contact is. With support of hexad-base, contact.'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant for enlightenment, it was like this: 'Now then there being what, hexad-base is? With support of what, hexad-base?'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant of enlightenment, with proper attention, with wisdom, was the clear understanding: 'Now there being name-&-form, hexad-base is. With support of name-&-form, hexad-base.'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant for enlightenment, it was like this: 'Now then there being what, name-&-form is? With support of what, name-&-form?'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant of enlightenment, with proper attention, with wisdom, was the clear understanding: 'Now there being conscious, name-&-form is. With support of conscious, name-&-form.'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant for enlightenment, it was like this: 'Now then there being what, conscious is? With support

of what, conscious?'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant of enlightenment, with proper attention, with wisdom, was the clear understanding: 'Now there being inclinations, conscious is. With support of inclinations, conscious.'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant for enlightenment, it was like this: 'Now then there being what, inclinations are? With support of what, inclinations?'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant of enlightenment, with proper attention, with wisdom, was the clear understanding:

'Now there being not-knowing, inclinations are. With support of not-knowing, inclinations.

Thus indeed so: with support of not-knowing, inclinations. With support of inclinations, conscious. With support of conscious, name-&-form. With support of name-&-form, hexad-base. With support of hexad-base, contact. With support of contact, feeling. With support of feeling, longing. With support of longing, grasping. With support of grasping, existence. With support of existence, birth. With support of birth, decay-&-death, grief, lamentation, suffering, melancholy, unrest arise. In this way this is the rise of the entire mass of suffering. Rise! Rise!'

Then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant for enlightenment, the sight arose into things unheard of before. Insight arose, wisdom arose, knowing arose, vision arose.

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant for enlightenment, it was like this: 'Now then there not being what, decay-&-death is not? With cessation of what, cessation of decay-&-death?'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant of enlightenment, with proper attention, with wisdom, was the clear understanding: 'Now, there not being birth, decay-&-death is not. With cessation of birth, cessation of decay-&-death.'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant for enlightenment, it was like this: 'Now then there not being what, birth is not? With cessation of what, cessation of birth?'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant of enlightenment, with proper attention, with wisdom, was the clear understanding: 'Now, there not being existence, birth is not. With cessation of existence, cessation of birth.

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant for enlightenment, it was like this: 'Now then there not being what, existence is not? With cessation of what, cessation of existence?'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant of enlightenment, with proper attention, with wisdom, was the clear understanding: 'Now, there not being grasping, existence is not. With cessation of grasping, cessation of existence.'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant for enlightenment, it was like this: 'Now then there not being what, grasping is not? With cessation of what, cessation of grasping?'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant of enlightenment, with proper attention, with wisdom, was the clear understanding: 'Now, there not being longing, grasping is not. With cessation of longing, cessation of grasping.'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant for enlightenment, it was like this: 'Now then there not being what, longing is not? With cessation of what, cessation of longing?'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant of enlightenment, with proper attention, with wisdom, was the clear understanding: 'Now, there not being feeling, longing is not. With cessation of feeling, cessation of longing.'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant for enlightenment, it was like this: 'Now then there not being what, feeling is not? With cessation of what, cessation of feeling?'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant of enlightenment, with proper attention, with wisdom, was the clear understanding: 'Now, there not being contact, feeling is not. With cessation of contact, cessation of feeling.'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant for enlightenment, it was like this: 'Now then there not being what, contact is not? With cessation of what, cessation of contact?'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant of enlightenment, with proper attention, with wisdom, was the clear understanding: 'Now, there not being hexad-base, contact is not. With cessation of hexad-base, cessation of contact.'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant for enlightenment, it was like this: 'Now then there not being what, hexad-base is not? With cessation of what, cessation of hexad-base?'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant of enlightenment, with proper attention, with wisdom, was the clear understanding: 'Now, there not being name-&-form, hexad-base is not. With cessation of name-&-form, cessation of hexad-base.'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant for enlightenment, it was like this: 'Now then there not being what, name-&-form is not? With cessation of what, cessation of name-&-form?'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant of enlightenment, with proper attention, with wisdom, was the clear understanding: 'Now, there not being conscious, name-&-form is not. With cessation of conscious, cessation of name-&-form.'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant for enlightenment, it was like this: 'Now then there not being what, conscious is not? With cessation of what, cessation of conscious?'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant of enlightenment, with proper attention, with wisdom, was the clear understanding: 'Now, there not being inclinations, conscious is not. With cessation of inclinations, cessation of conscious.'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant for enlightenment, it was like this: 'Now then there not being what, inclinations are not? With cessation of what, cessation of inclinations?'

And then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant of enlightenment, with proper attention, with wisdom, was the clear understanding: 'Now, there not being not-knowing, inclinations are not. With cessation of not-knowing, cessation of inclinations.'

Thus indeed so: with cessation of not-knowing, cessation of inclinations. With cessation of inclinations, cessation of conscious. With cessation of conscious, cessation of name-&-form. With cessation of name-&-form, cessation of hexad-base. With cessation of hexad-base, cessation of contact. With cessation of contact, cessation of feeling. With cessation of feeling, cessation of longing. With cessation of longing, cessation of grasping. With cessation of grasping, cessation of existence. With cessation of existence, cessation of birth. With cessation of birth, decay-&-death, grief, lamentation, suffering, melancholy, unrest cease. In this way this is the cessation of the entire mass of suffering. Cessation! Cessation!

Then, monks, to Vipassī, aspirant for enlightenment, sight arose into things unheard of before. Insight arose, wisdom arose, knowing arose, vision arose."

# SN12.12 Moliyaphagguna

### At Sāvatthi.

"These four, monks, are foods to creatures; either for the keeping up for those grown or for the taking up for those seeking to appear. Which four?

Sustenance either gross or subtle, contact as second, willpower<sup>1</sup> as third and conscious fourth. Now these, monks, are foods to creatures; either for the keeping up for those grown or for the taking up for those seeking to appear."

Thus said, the venerable Moliyaphagguna said this to the Exalted One:

'Who now then, venerable, feeds on the food conscious?'

## The Exalted One said:

"Not a sound question. I do not say thus: 'feeds on'. If I would have said thus: 'feeds on', there the question 'who now then, venerable, feeds on?' is sound. But I do not say so.

Not saying so, what one should ask me is thus: 'Why now then, venerable, food of conscious?' This is a sound question. There the explanation is sound. Food of conscious is the support for the extension of becoming into renewed existence.<sup>2</sup> At that grown, there being hexad-base. With support of hexad-base, contact."

'Who now then, venerable, touches?'

### The Exalted One said:

"Not a sound question I do not say thus: 'touches'. If I would have said thus: 'touches', there the question 'who now then, venerable, touches?' is sound. But I do not say so.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Manosañcetanā: 'Mind-together-intention'. Food for thought, mental stimulation, mental nourishment, will to live, etc. All these could be understood as willpower: the motivation to exercise choice (note that will is related to longing).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> With 'four foods to creatures' (arising, growth) the context is set. It is thus not about 'feeds on' (which comes from a notion of conditional relationship) but about the arising and staying with food (dependent-co-arising); it is food because it supports existence (the taking up or keeping up). This contextually sound answer justifies a question's soundness. And the answer is sound because it is about the end of suffering.

Not saying so, what one should ask me is thus: 'With support of what, now then venerable, contact?' This is a sound question. There the explanation is sound. With support of hexad-base, contact. With support of contact, feeling."

'Who now then, venerable, feels?'

### The Exalted One said:

"Not a sound question I do not say thus: 'feels'. If I would have said thus: 'feels', there the question 'who now then, venerable, feels?' is sound. But I do not say so.

Not saying so, what one should ask me is thus: 'With support of what, now then venerable, feeling?' This is a sound question. There the explanation is sound. With support of contact, feeling. With support of feeling, longing."

'Who now then, venerable, longs?'

## The Exalted One said:

"Not a sound question I do not say thus: 'longs'. If I would have said thus: 'longs', there the question 'who now then, venerable, longs?' is sound. But I do not say so.

Not saying so, what one should ask me is thus: 'With support of what, now then venerable, longing?' This is a sound question. There the explanation is sound. With support of feeling, longing. With support of longing, grasping."

'Who now then, venerable, grasps?'

## The Exalted One said:

"Not a sound question I do not say thus: 'grasps'. If I would have said thus: 'grasps', there the question 'who now then, venerable, grasps?' is sound. But I do not say so.

Not saying so, what one should ask me is thus: 'With support of what, now then venerable, grasping?' This is a sound question. There the explanation is sound. With support of longing, grasping. With support of grasping, existence. With support of existence, birth. With support of birth, decay-&-death, grief, lamentation, suffering, melancholy, unrest appear. In this way this is the coarising of the entire mass of suffering.

Thus of course, Phagguna, with the complete fading away and cessation of the six's<sup>3</sup> base for contact, cessation of contact. With cessation of contact, cessation of feeling. With cessation of feeling, cessation of longing. With cessation of longing, cessation of Grasping. With cessation of existence. With cessation of existence, cessation of birth. In this way this is cessation of the entire mass of suffering."

 $<sup>\</sup>overline{}^3 \Rightarrow Channa\dot{m}$ , gen. of cha - the number six.

## SN12.37 Not of You

### At Sāvatthi.

"This body, monks, is not of you nor of others. It, monks, is to be seen as this former action, arranged, intended, felt. Now then, monks, the learned noble disciple thoroughly pays proper attention to dependent-co-arising itself:<sup>1</sup>

Thus, there being this, this is. With the arising of this, this arises. There not being this, this is not. With cessation of this, this ceases.

That is<sup>2</sup>, with support of not-knowing, monks, inclinations. With support of inclinations, conscious. With support of conscious, name-&-form. With support of name-&-form, hexad-base. With support of hexad-base, contact. With support of contact, feeling. With support of feeling, longing. With support of longing, grasping. With support of grasping, existence. With support of existence, birth. With support of birth, decay-&-death, grief, lamentation, suffering, melancholy, unrest arise. In this way this is the rise of the entire mass of suffering.

Thus of course, with the complete fading away and cessation of not-knowing, cessation of inclinations. With cessation of inclinations, cessation of conscious. With cessation of conscious, cessation of name-&-form. With cessation of name-&-form, cessation of hexad-base. With cessation of hexad-base, cessation of contact. With cessation of contact, cessation of feeling. With cessation of feeling, cessation of longing. With cessation of longing, cessation of grasping. With cessation of grasping, cessation of existence. With cessation of existence, cessation of birth. With cessation of birth, decay-&-death, grief, lamentation, suffering, melancholy, unrest cease. In this way this is the cessation of the entire mass of suffering."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Here we see *what* dependent-co-arising is.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> And here some general *occurrences* with that nature.

# SN12.52 Grasping

### At Sāvatthi.

"From dwelling, monks, on considering<sup>1</sup> the sweetness in graspable things<sup>2</sup>, longing grows. With support of longing, grasping. With support of grasping, existence. With support of existence, birth. With support of birth, decay-&-death, grief, lamentation, suffering, melancholy, unrest arise. In this way this is the rise of the entire mass of suffering.

Just like, monks, a great mass of fire were to burn from ten carloads of wood or twenty carloads of wood or thirty carloads of wood or forty carloads of wood. Then a man would throw from time to time dried up grass as well as dried up dung and dried up wood. Thus as for that, monks, that food and that grasping, the great mass of fire would burn for a long time, a very long time.

Now even so, monks, from dwelling on considering the sweetness in graspable things, longing grows. With support of longing, grasping. With support of grasping, existence. With support of existence, birth. With support of birth, decay-&-death, grief, lamentation, suffering, melancholy, unrest arise. In this way this is the rise of the entire mass of suffering.

From dwelling, monks, on considering the wretchedness in graspable things<sup>3</sup>, longing ceases. With cessation of longing, cessation of grasping. With cessation of grasping, cessation of existence. With cessation of existence, cessation of birth. With cessation of birth, decay-&-death, grief, lamentation, suffering, melancholy, unrest cease. In this way this is the cessation of the entire mass of suffering.

Just like, monks, a great mass of fire were to burn from ten carloads of wood or twenty carloads of wood or thirty carloads of wood or forty carloads of wood. Then a man would not throw from time to time dried up grass, would not throw dried up dung, would not

Anupassin. Observing, might emphasize a bare watching aspect and with focusing we tend to over-focus. Considering (shall I?, is it worth it?, etc.) dwells on the 'worthiness' of something, a way of presorting (for engagement to happen). Of course, when you consider you are also stepping back, focusing, etc.; it is just a matter of emphasis.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> See: SN22.121 Graspable.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> For which we do need to learn a bit about the dhamma else we would often just have the information "I want this, I don't want that" to consider.

throw dried up wood. Thus as for that, monks, the great mass of fire, from completely taking up the former and of not bringing another for grasping, without food, would extinguish.

Now even so, monks, from dwelling on considering the wretchedness in graspable things, longing ceases. With cessation of longing, cessation of grasping. With cessation of grasping, cessation of existence. With cessation of existence, cessation of birth. With cessation of birth, decay-&-death, grief, lamentation, suffering, melancholy, unrest cease. In this way this is the cessation of the entire mass of suffering."

Part II

References

## SN12.11 Food

Thus I learned. One time the Exalted One dwells in Jetavane, Anāthapiṇḍika's park at Sāvatthi. Now then the Exalted One addressed the monks:

"Monks."

Those monks replied to the Exalted One:

"Venerable."

The Exalted One said this:

"Now these, monks, four are foods to creatures; either for the keeping up for those grown or for the taking up for those seeking to arise. Which four?

Sustenance either gross or subtle, contact as second, willpower as third and conscious fourth. Now these, monks, four are foods to creatures; either for the keeping up for those grown or for the taking up for those seeking to arise.

Now these, monks, four foods are tied with what? Rise with what? Descend with what? Manifest with what?<sup>1</sup>

These four foods are tied with longing, rise with longing, descend with longing, manifest with longing.

And this longing, monks, is tied with what? Rise with what? Descend with what? Manifest with what? Longing is tied with feeling, rise with feeling, descend with feeling, manifest with feeling.

And this feeling, monks, is tied with what? Rise with what? Descend with what? Manifest with what? Feeling is tied with contact, rise with contact, descend with contact, manifest with contact.

And this contact, monks, is tied with what? Rise with what? Descend with what? Manifest with what? Contact is tied with hexad-base, rise with hexad-base, descend with hexad-base, manifest with hexad-base.

And this hexad-base, monks, is tied with what? Rise with what? Descend with what? Manifest with what? hexad-base is tied with

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> A variant with some other universals.

References SN12.11 Food

name-&-form, rise with name-&-form, descend with name-&-form, manifest with name-&-form.

And this name-&-form, monks, is tied with what? Rise with what? Descend with what? Manifest with what? name-&-form is tied with conscious, rise with conscious, descend with conscious, manifest with conscious.

And this conscious, monks, is tied with what? Rise with what? Descend with what? Manifest with what? Conscious is tied with inclinations, rise with inclinations, descend with inclinations, manifest with inclinations.

And these inclinations, monks, are tied with what? Rise with what? Descend with what? Manifest with what? Inclinations are tied with not-knowing, rise with not-knowing, descend with not-knowing, manifest with not-knowing.

Thus now, monks, with support of not-knowing, monks, inclinations. With support of inclinations, conscious. With support of conscious, name-&-form. With support of name-&-form, hexadbase. With support of hexad-base, contact. With support of contact, feeling. With support of feeling, longing. With support of longing, grasping. With support of grasping, existence. With support of existence, birth. With support of birth, decay-&-death, grief, lamentation, suffering, melancholy, unrest arise. In this way this is the rise of the entire mass of suffering.

Thus of course, with the complete fading away and cessation of not-knowing, cessation of inclinations. With cessation of inclinations, cessation of conscious. With cessation of conscious, cessation of name-&-form. With cessation of name-&-form, cessation of hexad-base. With cessation of hexad-base, cessation of contact. With cessation of contact, cessation of feeling. With cessation of feeling, cessation of longing. With cessation of longing, cessation of grasping. With cessation of grasping, cessation of existence. With cessation of existence, cessation of birth. With cessation of birth, decay-&-death, grief, lamentation, suffering, melancholy, unrest cease. In this way this is the cessation of the entire mass of suffering."

# SN12.43 Suffering

At Sāvatthi.

"Of suffering, monks, I shall point out the rise and disappearance. So listen and pay attention thoroughly, I shall speak."

Then those monks replied to the Exalted One:

"Yes, venerable."

The Exalted One said this:

"And which<sup>1</sup>, monks, rise of suffering?

Depending<sup>2</sup> on eye and forms, eye-conscious arises. The combination of the three is contact. With support of contact, feeling. With support of feeling, longing. This now, monks, is the rise of suffering.

Depending on ear and sounds, ear-conscious arises. The combination of the three is contact. With support of contact, feeling. With support of feeling, longing. This now, monks, is the rise of suffering.

Depending on nose and scents, nose-conscious arises. The combination of the three is contact. With support of contact, feeling. With support of feeling, longing. This now, monks, is the rise of suffering.

Depending on tongue and tastes, tongue-conscious arises. The combination of the three is contact. With support of contact, feeling. With support of feeling, longing. This now, monks, is the rise of suffering.

Depending on body and to be touched<sup>3</sup>, body-conscious arises. The combination of the three is contact. With support of contact, feeling. With support of feeling, longing. This now, monks, is the rise of suffering.

Depending on mind and things, mind-conscious arises. The combination of the three is contact. With support of contact, feeling.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Which particulars of this universal.

 $<sup>^2 \</sup>Rightarrow Paticca$ , a gerund.

 $<sup>^3 \</sup>Rightarrow Photthabba$ , a gerundive.

With support of feeling, longing. This now, monks, is the rise of suffering.

And which, monks, disappearance of suffering?

Depending on eye and the forms, eye-conscious arises. The combination of the three is contact. With support of contact, feeling. With support of feeling, longing. With complete fading away and cessation of just this longing, cessation of grasping. With cessation of grasping, cessation of existence. With cessation of existence, cessation of birth. With cessation of birth, decay-&-death, grief, lamentation, suffering, melancholy, unrest cease. In this way this is the cessation of the entire mass of suffering. Now this, monks, is of suffering the disappearance.

Depending on ear and sounds, ear-conscious arises. The combination of the three is contact. With support of contact, feeling. With support of feeling, longing. With complete fading away and cessation of just this longing, cessation of grasping. With cessation of grasping, cessation of existence. With cessation of existence, cessation of birth. With cessation of birth, decay-&-death, grief, lamentation, suffering, melancholy, unrest cease. In this way this is the cessation of the entire mass of suffering. Now this, monks, is of suffering the disappearance.

Depending on nose and scents, nose-conscious arises. The combination of the three is contact. With support of contact, feeling. With support of feeling, longing. With complete fading away and cessation of just this longing, cessation of grasping. With cessation of grasping, cessation of existence. With cessation of existence, cessation of birth. With cessation of birth, decay-&-death, grief, lamentation, suffering, melancholy, unrest cease. In this way this is the cessation of the entire mass of suffering. Now this, monks, is of suffering the disappearance.

Depending on tongue and tastes, tongue-conscious arises. The combination of the three is contact. With support of contact, feeling. With support of feeling, longing. With complete fading away and cessation of just this longing, cessation of grasping. With cessation of grasping, cessation of existence. With cessation of existence, cessation of birth. With cessation of birth, decay-&death, grief, lamentation, suffering, melancholy, unrest cease. In this way this is the cessation of the entire mass of suffering. Now this, monks, is of suffering the disappearance.

Depending on body and to be touched, body-conscious arises. The combination of the three is contact. With support of contact,

feeling. With support of feeling, longing. With complete fading away and cessation of just this longing, cessation of grasping. With cessation of grasping, cessation of existence. With cessation of existence, cessation of birth. With cessation of birth, decay-&death, grief, lamentation, suffering, melancholy, unrest cease. In this way this is the cessation of the entire mass of suffering. Now this, monks, is of suffering the disappearance.

Depending on mind and things, mind-conscious arises. The combination of the three is contact. With support of contact, feeling. With support of feeling, longing. With complete fading away and cessation of just this longing, cessation of grasping. With cessation of grasping, cessation of existence. With cessation of existence, cessation of birth. With cessation of birth, decay-&-death, grief, lamentation, suffering, melancholy, unrest cease. In this way this is the cessation of the entire mass of suffering. Now this, monks, is of suffering the disappearance."

## SN22.79 Consumed

#### At Sāvatthi.

"As for anyone, monks, recluses or ascetics, who remember after a manifold former dwelling, they remember all those five groups-ofgrasping together or they remember some.

Which five?

'In times gone by I was of such form' thus, monks, as for remembrance he remembers just form. Or 'in times gone by I was of such feeling' thus, monks, as for remembrance he remembers just feeling. Or 'in times gone by I was of such perception' thus, monks, as for remembrance he remembers just perception. Or 'in times gone by I was of such inclinations' thus, monks, as for remembrance he remembers just inclinations. Or 'in times gone by I was of such conscious' thus, monks, as for remembrance he remembers just conscious.

And what, monks, causes to say<sup>1</sup> form?

It 'deforms', monks, now therefor it is called 'form'. Deforms with what? Deforms with cold, deforms with heat, deforms with hunger, deforms with thirst, deforms with gadfly, mosquito, wind, sun, contact with the creeping. It 'deforms', monks, now therefore it is called 'form'.

And what, monks, causes to say feeling?

It 'feels', monks, now therefor it is called 'feeling'. And what feels it? Happiness it feels, suffering it feels, neither suffering nor happiness it feels. It 'feels', monks, now therefor it is called 'feeling'.

And what, monks, causes to say perception?

It 'perceives', monks, now therefor it is called 'perception'. And what perceives it? Dark it perceives, yellow it perceives, red it perceives, light it perceives.<sup>2</sup> It 'perceives', monks, now therefor it is called 'perception'.

 $<sup>\</sup>overline{}^1 \Rightarrow vadetha$ , here taken as causative of vadati (to speak, say, tell).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> It is  $n\bar{\imath}lam$  (dark), not  $n\bar{\imath}laka$  (as with  $p\bar{\imath}taka$ : yellow, golden and lohitaka: red). Likewise it is  $od\bar{\imath}tam$  and not  $od\bar{\imath}taka$  (clean, white). Thus we got the two pairs: dark & light (saturation) and yellow & red (colour). Yellow (golden) follows after red in the colour spectrum, and since it is mentioned here first we can take this to imply the whole (possible) spectrum. And as whole (all wavelengths, frequencies) it thus implies all possible spectra.

And what, monks, causes to say inclinations?

They 'incline the inclined'<sup>3</sup>, monks, now therefor it is called 'inclinations'. And what is the inclined they incline? Form as form, is the inclined they incline; feeling as feeling, is the inclined they incline; perception as perception, is the inclined they incline; inclinations as inclinations, is the inclined they incline; conscious as conscious, is the inclined they incline. They 'incline the inclined', monks, now therefor it is called 'inclinations'.

And what, monks, causes to say conscious?

It 'knows', monks, now therefor it is called 'conscious'. And what knows it? Sour it knows, bitter it knows, sharp it knows, sweet it knows, soapy it knows, not-soapy it knows, salty it knows and bland it knows.<sup>4</sup> It 'knows', monks, now therefor it is called 'conscious'.

There, monks, the learned noble disciple reflects thus:

'Now, at present, I am consumed with form. In the past I was consumed with form just so, just as at present I am consumed with present form. Now moreover, if I even in the future should find pleasure in future form, I would be consumed with form just so, just as at present I am consumed with present form.'

Thus, with reflection on past form he is without concern not welcoming future form and is reaching for disenchantment, fading away, cessation, of present form.

'Now, at present, I am consumed with feeling. In the past I was consumed with feeling just so, just as at

All that is grasped on as 'this I am' (etc.) which doesn't fall into the other four categories of grasping fall into the one of the inclinations (sankhārā). When we say one is 'wired' in such a way, one is of such or so character, we are talking about particulars of this category. 'They incline the inclined' concerns a building up (abhisankharoti), where the emphasis lies on this specific characteristic of inclinations (see AN3.47-48 on its recursive nature). The prefix abhi can mean towards, against, on to, at; which can indicate that these inclinations are going, building up, a certain way (not a mere movement). That direction is based on ignorance.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> The usage of taste may emphasise a more circumstantial and direct discrimination. We all know of situations were taste can be a bit off (f.i. when having a cold). And with taste we may 'directly' know whether it is salt or sweet. With colors, though exactly the same, such an acceptance can seem to be a tad lower ('no! that is not brown, it is blue!').

present I am consumed with present feeling. Now moreover, if I even in the future should find pleasure in future feeling, I would be consumed with feeling just so, just as at present I am consumed with present feeling.'

Thus, with reflection on past feeling he is without concern not welcoming future feeling and is reaching for disenchantment, fading away, cessation, of present feeling.

'Now, at present, I am consumed with perception. In the past I was consumed with perception just so, just as at present I am consumed with present perception. Now moreover, if I even in the future should find pleasure in future perception, I would be consumed with perception just so, just as at present I am consumed with present perception.'

Thus, with reflection on past perception he is without concern not welcoming future perception and is reaching for disenchantment, fading away, cessation, of present perception.

'Now, at present, I am consumed with inclinations. In the past I was consumed with inclinations just so, just as at present I am consumed with present inclinations. Now moreover, if I even in the future should find pleasure in future inclinations, I would be consumed with inclinations just so, just as at present I am consumed with present inclinations.'

Thus, with reflection on past inclinations he is without concern not welcoming future inclinations and is reaching for disenchantment, fading away, cessation, of present inclinations.

'Now, at present, I am consumed with conscious. In the past I was consumed with conscious just so, just as at present I am consumed with present conscious. Now moreover, if I even in the future should find pleasure in future conscious, I would be consumed with conscious just so, just as at present I am consumed with present conscious.'

Thus, with reflection on past conscious he is without concern not welcoming future conscious and is reaching for disenchantment, fading away, cessation, of present conscious.

So what do you think, monks, is form permanent or impermanent?"

"Impermanent, venerable."

"Whatever indeed is impermanent, is this suffering or happiness?"

"Suffering, venerable."

"Whatever then is impermanent, suffering, a thing changing for the worse, is it then now sound to regard thus: 'this is mine, this I am, this to me<sup>5</sup> is self'?"

"No indeed not, venerable."

"So what do you think, monks, is feeling permanent or impermanent?"

"Impermanent, venerable."

"Whatever indeed is impermanent, is this suffering or happiness?"

"Suffering, venerable."

"Whatever then is impermanent, suffering, a thing changing for the worse, is it then now sound to regard thus: 'this is mine, this I am, this to me is self'?"

"No indeed not, venerable."

"So what do you think, monks, is perception permanent or impermanent?"

"Impermanent, venerable."

"Whatever indeed is impermanent, is this suffering or happiness?"

"Suffering, venerable."

"Whatever then is impermanent, suffering, a thing changing for the worse, is it then now sound to regard thus: 'this is mine, this I am, this to me is self'?"

"No indeed not, venerable."

"So what do you think, monks, are inclinations permanent or impermanent?"

"Impermanent, venerable."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> ⇒ eso me: this + (Dat/Gen/Ins-sing.) of amha (I) = (to, for / of / by, with) me. Since we already got 'I am' and the genetive 'mine' I opted for the dative. We then got three different angles ('me', 'of me' and 'to me'). For the instrumental ('this by/with me is self') one of the others would have to be taken up first.

"Whatever indeed is impermanent, is this suffering or happiness?" "Suffering, venerable."

"Whatever then is impermanent, suffering, a thing changing for the worse, is it then now sound to regard thus: 'this is mine, this I am, this to me is self'?"

"No indeed not, venerable."

"So what do you think, monks, is conscious permanent or impermanent?"

"Impermanent, venerable."

"Whatever indeed is impermanent, is this suffering or happiness?"

"Suffering, venerable."

"Whatever then is impermanent, suffering, a thing changing for the worse, is it then now sound to regard thus: 'this is mine, this I am, this to me is self?"

"No indeed not, venerable."

Now therefor, monks, whatsoever any form, past, future, present, internal or external, gross or subtle, low or high, far or near, every form is in essence with right wisdom similarly to be regarded as 'not this is mine, not this I am, not to me this is self.'

Whatsoever any feeling, past, future, present, internal or external, gross or subtle, low or high, far or near, every feeling is in essence with right wisdom similarly to be regarded as 'not this is mine, not this I am, not to me this is self.'

Whatsoever any perception, past, future, present, internal or external, gross or subtle, low or high, far or near, every perception is in essence with right wisdom similarly to be regarded as 'not this is mine, not this I am, not to me this is self.'

Whatsoever any inclinations, past, future, present, internal or external, gross or subtle, low or high, far or near, every inclinations are in essence with right wisdom similarly to be regarded as 'not this is mine, not this I am, not to me this is self.'

Whatsoever any conscious, past, future, present, internal or external, gross or subtle, low or high, far or near, every conscious is in essence with right wisdom similarly to be regarded as 'not this is mine, not this I am, not to me this is self.'

This is called, monks, the noble disciple who is to diminish, not to increase; to renounce, not to grasp; to turn from, not to turn to; to disperse, not to congregate.

And what is to diminish, not to increase? Form is to diminish, not to increase; feeling is to diminish, not to increase; perception is to diminish, not to increase; inclinations are to diminish, not to increase; conscious is to diminish, not to increase.

And what is to renounce, not to grasp? Form is to renounce, not to grasp; feeling is to renounce, not to grasp; perception is to renounce, not to grasp; inclinations are to renounce, not to grasp; conscious is to renounce, not to grasp.

And what is to turn from, not to turn to? Form is to turn from, not to turn to; feeling is to turn from, not to turn to; perception is to turn from, not to turn to; inclinations are to turn from, not to turn to; conscious is to turn from, not to turn to.

And what is to disperse, not to congregate? Form is to disperse, not to congregate; feeling is to disperse, not to congregate; perception is to disperse, not to congregate; inclinations are to disperse, not to congregate; conscious is to disperse, not to congregate.

Thus seeing, monks, the noble disciple having learned to get fed up on form, to get fed up on feeling, to get fed up on perception, to get fed up on inclinations, to get fed up on conscious. Fed up, he lacks interest; by the absence of desire he is to be emancipated. Upon emancipation is the knowledge: 'I am emancipated'. He understands 'birth is gone, the holy life fulfilled, done what ought to be done, no more further state of becoming'. This is called, monks, a monk who is neither to increase nor to diminish.

Having diminished, the standing is: neither to renounce nor to grasp. Having renounced, the standing is: neither to turn from nor to turn to. Having turned from, the standing is: neither to disperse, nor to congregate. Having dispersed *is* the standing.

And what is neither to increase nor to diminish?

Having diminished, the standing is: form is neither to increase nor to diminish. Having diminished, the standing is: feeling is neither to increase nor to diminish. Having diminished, the standing is: perception is neither to increase nor to diminish. Having diminished, the standing is inclinations: are neither to increase nor to diminish. Having diminished, the standing is: conscious is neither to increase nor to diminish. Having diminished *is* the standing.

And what is neither to renounce nor to grasp?

Having renounced the standing is: form is neither to renounce nor to grasp. Having renounced the standing is: feeling is neither to renounce nor to grasp. Having renounced the standing is: perception is neither to renounce nor to grasp. Having renounced the standing is: inclinations are neither to renounce nor to grasp. Having renounced the standing is: conscious is neither to renounce nor to grasp. Having renounced is the standing.

And what is neither to turn from, not to turn to?

Having turned from, the standing is: matter is neither to turn from nor to turn to. Having turned from, the standing is: feeling is neither to turn from nor to turn to. Having turned from, the standing is: perception is neither to turn from nor to turn to. Having turned from, the standing is: inclinations are neither to turn from nor to turn to. Having turned from, the standing is: conscious is neither to turn from nor to turn to. Having turned from is the standing.

And what is neither to disperse, nor to congregate?

Having dispersed, the standing is: form is neither to disperse, nor to congregate. Having dispersed, the standing is: feeling is neither to disperse, nor to congregate. Having dispersed, the standing is: perception is neither to disperse, nor to congregate. Having dispersed, the standing is: inclinations are neither to disperse, nor to congregate. Having dispersed, the standing is: conscious is neither to disperse, nor to congregate. Having dispersed is the standing.

Now, in this way the mind emancipated, monks, the gods with Indra's retinue, with Brahma's retinue, with Pajāpati's retinue, even from afar, they homage the monk:

'Homage to you, O thoroughbred man!

Homage to you, O highest man!

Of you we don't know

even which the founding is,

of what you radiate<sup>6</sup>' "

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> It reminds me of (the type of) flame and fuel (burning, consuming).

# SN22.121 Graspable

## At Sāvatthi.

"I shall point out, monks, and the graspable things, and grasping. So listen.

And which, monks, graspable things and which grasping?

Form, monks, the graspable thing; whatever the desire and lust there, then there the grasping. Perception, monks, the graspable thing; whatever the desire and lust there, then there the grasping. Inclinations, monks, the graspable thing; whatever the desire and lust there, then there the grasping. Conscious, monks, the graspable thing; whatever the desire and lust there, then there the grasping.

These are called, monks, the graspable things, these the graspings."

# AN2.11.8-9

## 2.11.8

These two, monks, are the supports for the arising of wrong view. Which two? Another's utterance and improper attention. Now these, monks, are the two supports for the arising of wrong view.

## 2.11.9

These two, monks, are the supports for the arising of right view. Which two? Another's utterance and proper attention. Now these, monks, are the two supports for the arising of right view.

## AN3.47-48

3.47

These three, monks, are the inclined characteristics of the inclined.<sup>1</sup> Which three? 'Appearance is seen', 'decay is seen', 'change while standing is seen'.<sup>2</sup> Now these, monks, are three inclined characteristics of the inclined.

3.48

These three, monks, are the uninclined characteristics of the uninclined. Which three? Not 'appearance is seen', not 'decay is seen', not 'change while standing is seen'. Now these, monks, are three uninclined characteristics of the uninclined.

Thus, each characteristic *itself* has these three characteristics; etc., etc., etc.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> A common order e.g.: arising, ceasing and 'the middle' (it reminds me of a strategy for doing jigsaw puzzles, or coloring coloring pages: first setting up the boundaries, then addressing the middle) or past, future and present, etc.