

Theorem: The  $k$ -network flow update problem where every edge is used by at most three flow pairs is NP-hard for  $k=10$ .

Proof. by reduction from 4-SAT

Reduction:

Given a 4CNF formula  $C$  with  $n$  variables  $x_1, \dots, x_n$  and  $m$  clauses  $C_1, \dots, C_m$ , we construct the corresponding 40-network flow update flow network  $G$  as follows.

First, we introduce a variable gadget for each variable and a clause gadget for each clause in a way that is independent of  $C$ . Then, we connect the variable and clause gadgets in a way that is particular to  $C$ . Finally, we introduce vertices  $s, t$  and ensure that  $G$  is indeed a 10nilli instance.

Variable gadgets

~~Then~~ The variable gadgets will be used by flow pairs  $X, \bar{X}$ , and  $B$ .

Clause gadgets

Start with binary tree description and that a particular update for  $v^i$  can only occur if at least one of  $u_1^i, u_2^i, u_3^i, u_4^i$  have been updated w.r.t. a particular flow before.

For each clause  $C_i$ , we introduce two vertices  $u^i, v^i$  and the edge  $(u^i, v^i)$ . This edge is used by three flow pairs  $L, R$ , and  $B$ . The idea is to guarantee that clause  $C_i$  is satisfied iff for vertex  $u^i$ , flow pair  $L$  is updated before  $R$  or  $R$  is updated before  $B$ , that is,  $B$  cannot be updated unless at least one of  $L, R$  have been updated before. Moreover, the rest of the clause gadget will be such that if  $L$  has been (R) has been updated before  $B$ , then at least one of the first two literals (last) (right) (the left ones) evaluate to true. To accomplish this, we introduce four pairs of vertices  $u_{12}^i, u_{12}^i, v_{12}^i, v_{12}^i$  corresponding to the four literals in  $C_i$ . These vertices can be thought of the leaves of a binary tree rooted at  $u^i$ , where an update of the root will imply at least one update of its children.<sup>\*</sup>

We proceed with the detailed description of the clause gadget for clause  $C_i$ .

Root level. We introduce two vertices  $u^i, v^i$  and add the edge  $(u^i, v^i)$  to flows  $L^\circ, R^\circ, B^\circ$ .

Intermediate level. We introduce flow pairs  $\tilde{L}, \tilde{R}, \tilde{B}$  similarly to  $L, R, B$  in the root level.

Moreover, we introduce vertices  $\tilde{u}_{12}^i, \tilde{v}_{12}^i, \tilde{u}_{34}^i, \tilde{v}_{34}^i, u_{12}^i, v_{12}^i, u_{34}^i, v_{34}^i$  and add edges

-  $(\tilde{u}_{12}^i, \tilde{v}_{12}^i)$  to  $\tilde{L}^\circ$  and  $\tilde{B}^\circ$

-  $(\tilde{u}_{34}^i, \tilde{v}_{34}^i)$  to  $\tilde{R}^\circ$  and  $\tilde{B}^\circ$

-  $(u_{12}^i, v_{12}^i)$  to  $L^\circ, R^\circ, B^\circ$

-  $(u_{34}^i, v_{34}^i)$  to leaf level. We introduce vertices  $u_1^i, v_1^i, u_2^i, v_2^i, u_3^i, v_3^i, u_4^i, v_4^i$  and add edges

\* which then yields that if the clause vertex  $u^i$  has been updated, then at least one of the literal vertices  $u_1^i, u_2^i, u_3^i, u_4^i$  have been updated.

-  $(u_1^i, v_1^i), (u_3^i, v_3^i)$  to  $\tilde{L}^u$

-  $(u_2^i, v_2^i), (u_4^i, v_4^i)$  to  $\tilde{R}^u$

Finally, we add the following edges to connect the clause gadget:

-  $(u_1^i, \tilde{u}_{12}^i), (\tilde{v}_{12}^i, v_1^i)$  to  $\tilde{L}^u$

-  $(u_1^i, \tilde{u}_{24}^i), (\tilde{v}_{24}^i, v_1^i)$  to  $\tilde{R}^u$

-  $(\tilde{u}_{12}^i, \tilde{u}_{34}^i)$  to both  $\tilde{B}^o$  and  $\tilde{B}^u$

-  $(\tilde{u}_{12}^i, u_{12}^i), (v_{12}^i, v_{12}^i), (\tilde{u}_{34}^i, u_{34}^i), (\tilde{v}_{34}^i, v_{34}^i)$  to  $B^u$

-  $(v_{12}^i, u_{34}^i)$  to  $\tilde{L}^u, \tilde{L}^o, \tilde{R}^o, \tilde{R}^u$

-  $(u_{12}^i, u_{12}^i), (u_{34}^i, u_{34}^i)$  to  $\tilde{L}^u, (v_1^i, v_{12}^i), (v_3^i, v_{34}^i)$  to  $\tilde{L}^u$

-  $(u_{12}^i, u_{12}^i), (u_{34}^i, u_{34}^i)$  to  $\tilde{R}^u, (v_2^i, v_{12}^i), (v_4^i, v_{34}^i)$  to  $\tilde{R}^u$

### Variable gadgets

For each variable  $x_i^i$ , we introduce a variable vertex  $x_i^i$  which is paired by flow pairs  $X, \bar{X}$ , and  $B$  such that if  $X$  is updated before  $B$ , then variable  $x_i^i$  is assigned 1 and if  $\bar{X}$  is updated before  $B$ , then variable  $x_i^i$  is assigned 0 and not both  $X$  and  $\bar{X}$  can be updated before  $B$ . Notice that, so far, the only flow pair used in both the clause and variable gadgets. Indeed, the update flow network will be such that  $B$  blocks the update of any variable vertex  $x_i^i$  before until all clause vertices  $u^i$  have been updated.

We proceed with the detailed description of the variable gadget for variable  $x_i^i$ .

We introduce two vertices  $x_i^i, y_i^i$  and add the edge  $(x_i^i, y_i^i)$  to  $X^u, \bar{X}^u$ , and  $B^o$ . Moreover, we introduce

flow pairs  $B_{0+}$  and  $B_{0-}$ , where  $B_{0+}$  will connect each variable gadget to every clause gadget corresponding to clause  $(;$  such that variable  $x_i^i$  occurs negatively (positively) in  $(;$ . Furthermore, we introduce vertices  $x_0^i, y_0^i, x_1^i, y_1^i$  and add edges

-  $(x_0^i, y_0^i)$  to  $\bar{X}^o$  and  $B_{0+}^u$

-  $(x_1^i, y_1^i)$  to  $X^o$  and  $B_{0-}^u$

To connect the variable gadget, we add the following edges:

-  $(x_0^i, x_0^i), (y_0^i, y_0^i)$  to  $\bar{X}^o$

-  $(x_1^i, x_1^i), (y_1^i, y_1^i)$  to  $X^o$

### Connecting variable gadgets to and clause gadgets

We now connect every variable gadget to all clause gadgets corresponding to clause  $(;$  such that  $x_i^i$  occurs in  $(;).$  Let  $P_i = \{p_1^i, \dots, p_{t_i}^i\}$  be the set of indices of the clauses containing the literal  $x_i^i$  and

Proof (cont.)

$P_i = \{\bar{p}_1^i, \dots, \bar{p}_{k_i}^i\}$  be the set of indices of the clauses containing the literal  $\bar{x}_i$ . W.l.o.g., let  $t_i^i, t_i^0 > 0$  (otherwise variable  $x_i$  can be assigned true if  $t_i^i = 0$  and false if  $t_i^0 = 0$  and all clauses containing my variable  $x_i$  are satisfied and may be removed). Moreover, let  $\pi(i, j)$  denote the position of literal  $x_j$  in clause  $i$ ; and  $\bar{\pi}(i, j)$  denote the position of literal  $\bar{x}_j$  in clause  $i$ .

As indicated above, flow pair  $B_0 (B_1)$  connects vertex  $x_0^i$  to all literals vertices corresponding to literal  $\bar{x}_i (x_i)$  as follows: via flow pair  $B_0 (B_1)$  by adding the following edges:

- $(x_0^i, u_{\pi(p_i^i, i)})$ ,  $(x_0^i, u_{\pi(p_i^0, i)})$  to  $(u_{\pi(p_i^i, i)}, v_{\pi(p_i^i, i)})$ ,  $(v_{\pi(p_i^i, i)}, u_{\pi(p_i^0, i)})$  to  $(u_{\pi(p_i^0, i)}, y_0^i)$  to  $B_0^i$
- ...

Ensuring feasibility

Finally, we add vertices  $s, t$ , and create  $s, t$ -paths for all flow pairs, by adding the following edges:

- $(s, x_0^i)$ ,  $(y_0^i, x_0^{i+1})$ ,  $(y_0^i, t)$  to  $X, \bar{X}, X^u, \bar{X}^u$ , and  $B^u$
- $(s, x_0^i)$ ,  $(y_0^i, x_0^{i+1})$ ,  $(y_0^i, t)$  to  $B_0^i$  and  $B_1^i$
- $(s, x_1^i)$ ,  $(y_1^i, x_1^{i+1})$ ,  $(y_1^i, t)$  to  $B_0^i$  and  $B_1^i$
- $(s, u^i)$ ,  $(v^i, u^{i+1})$ ,  $(v^i, t)$  to  $L^i, L^u, R^i, R^u, B^u$
- $(s, \tilde{u}_{2i}^i)$ ,  $(\tilde{v}_{2i}^i, \tilde{u}_{2i}^{i+1})$ ,  $(\tilde{v}_{2i}^i, t)$  to  $\tilde{B}^i, \tilde{B}^u$
- $(s, u_{2i}^i)$ ,  $(v_{2i}^i, u_{2i}^{i+1})$ ,  $(v_{2i}^i, t)$  to  $\tilde{L}^i, \tilde{L}^u, \tilde{R}^i, \tilde{R}^u$

We now have ten flow pairs  $X, \bar{X}, L, \bar{L}, R, \bar{R}, B, \bar{B}, B_0, B_1, \tilde{B}$ , all with demand set to 1. It remains to specify the edge capacities:

- We set the capacity of edges  $(x_0^i, y_0^i), (u^i, v^i), (u_{2i}^i, v_{2i}^i), (u_{2i}^i, v_{2i}^i)$  to 2.
- $(x_0^i, y_0^i), (x_1^i, y_1^i), (\tilde{u}_{2i}^i, \tilde{v}_{2i}^i), (\tilde{u}_{2i}^i, \tilde{v}_{2i}^i), (u_1^i, v_1^i), (u_2^i, v_2^i), (u_3^i, v_3^i), (u_4^i, v_4^i)$  to 1.
- All remaining edge capacities are set to 10, that is, the number of flows. Hence they cannot violate any capacity constraints.

To DO Verify feasibility.

\*<sup>2</sup> We remark that vertices  $x_0^i, y_0^i, x_1^i, y_1^i$  as well as flow pairs  $B_0, B_1$  are unnecessary for this reduction (we could instead just use  $X, \bar{X}$  to connect the variable and clause gadgets). They are necessary, however, for the reduction used to prove Theorem ~.

We now show that there is a satisfying assignment  $\sigma$  for  $C$  iff there is a feasible update sequence  $R$  for  $b$ . We will choose  $s, R$  such that  $\sigma$  assigns 1 to variable  $x_i$  iff  $R(x_i^+, \bar{X}) > R(s, B)$ . ?

$\Rightarrow$ "

Let  $\sigma$  be a satisfying assignment for  $C$ . We construct a feasible block sequence, which induces a feasible update sequence.

$\{s, t\}$

For every flow pair  $P$ , we determine  $V(P^o \cap P^u)$ , which induces the set of blocks:

TODD

Specify all blocks in a table.

- $V(X^o \cap X^u) - \{s, t\} = \{x_i^+, y_i^+\};$
- $V(\bar{X}^o \cap \bar{X}^u) - \{s, t\} = \{x_i^-, y_i^-\};$
- $V(B^o \cap B^u) - \{s, t\} = \{\};$
- $V(B_o^o \cap B_o^u) - \{s, t\} = \{x_o^+, y_o^+\};$
- $V(B_1^o \cap B_1^u) - \{s, t\} = \{x_1^+, y_1^+\};$
- $V(L^o \cap L^u) - \{s, t\} = \{u^i, v^i\};$
- $V(R^o \cap R^u) - \{s, t\} = \{u^i, v^i\};$
- $\tilde{L}: \{u_{12}^i, v_{12}^i, u_{34}^i, v_{34}^i\};$
- $\tilde{R}: \{u_{12}^i, v_{12}^i, u_{34}^i, v_{34}^i\};$
- $\tilde{B}: \{\tilde{u}_{12}^i, \tilde{v}_{12}^i, \tilde{u}_{34}^i, \tilde{v}_{34}^i\};$

We define our block sequence  $B = \{b_1, \dots, b_m\}$  as follows:

- $b_{1, \infty}$ : For every variable  $x_i$ , if  $\sigma(x_i) = 1$ , then add block  $b(x_i^+, X)$ , otherwise add  $b(x_i^+, \bar{X})$ .
- $b_2$ : For every variable  $x_i$ , if  $\sigma(x_i) = 1$ , then add block  $b(x_i^+, B_1)$ , otherwise add  $b(x_i^+, B_0)$ .
- $b_3$ : For every clause  $(_i = (l_1 \vee l_2 \vee l_3 \vee l_4))$ ,
  - if  $\sigma(l_1) = 1$ , then add  $b(u_{12}^i, \tilde{L})$ ,
  - if  $\sigma(l_2) = 1$ , then add  $b(u_{12}^i, \tilde{R})$ ,
  - $b(l_3)$   $b(u_{34}^i, \tilde{L})$ ,
  - $b(l_4)$   $b(u_{34}^i, \tilde{R})$
- $b_4$ : For every clause  $(_i = (l_1 \vee l_2 \vee l_3 \vee l_4))$ , if  $\sigma(l_1) = 1$  or  $\sigma(l_2) = 1$ , then add  $b(\tilde{u}_{12}^i, \tilde{B})$ , otherwise if  $\sigma(l_3) = 1$  or  $\sigma(l_4) = 1$ , then add  $b(\tilde{u}_{12}^i, B)$ .
- $b_5$ : For every clause  $(_i = (l_1 \vee l_2 \vee l_3 \vee l_4))$ , if  $\sigma(l_1) = 1$  or  $\sigma(l_2) = 1$ , then add  $b(u^i, L)$ , if  $\sigma(l_3) = 1$  or  $\sigma(l_4) = 1$ , then add  $b(u^i, R)$
- $b_6 = \{b(s, B)\}$

Proof (d.l.)

The sets of blocks  $b_7, b_8, b_9, b_{10}, b_{11}$  are mirror of  $b_1, b_2, b_3, b_4, b_5$ , respectively, that is, for example,  $b_7$  contains all blocks  $b(x^i, X), b(\bar{x}^i, \bar{X})$ , that is, all  $X$ - and  $\bar{X}$ -blocks, that were not added to  $b_1$ .

Observe that all other blocks, that is, blocks not contained in  $b_i$  for  $i=1, \dots, 11$ , do not induce any updates that activate or deactivate any edges and may thus then be added to any  $b_i$ .

We now show that block sequence  $B$  is indeed feasible by verifying that inequality  $\sim$  is satisfied for every  $i \in [11]$ , and every edge with capacity less than 10.

-  $b_1$  activates edges  $(x^i, y^i)$ : For every  $i \in [11]$ , it suffices to consider the edges that were activated by  $b_1$ ; the capacity constraints for all other edges cannot be violated if the capacity constraint for another edge is violated for  $i$ , then so is it for  $i-1$ , where the case for  $i=1$  follows because instance  $b$  is feasible.

~~-  $b_1$  activates edges  $(x^i, y^i)$  for  $X$  if  $\sigma(x_i)=1$  and  $\bar{X}$  for every  $i$ .~~

~~$c(x^i, y^i) = 3 \Rightarrow$  Before  $b_1$ , edge  $(x^i, y^i)$  is used only by flow pair  $B$ . After  $b_1$ ,  $(x^i, y^i)$  is used by  $X$  if  $\sigma(x_i)=1$  and  $\bar{X}$  otherwise. Hence it is used by exactly 2 flow pairs.  $\therefore c(x^i, y^i) = 2$  also~~

-  $(x^i, y^i)$ : In  $b$ , edge  $(x^i, y^i)$  is active only for flow pair  $B$ . After  $b_1$

- In  $b_1$ , edge  $(x^i, y^i)$  is active only for flow pair  $B$ .

- After  $b_1$ ,  $b_1$  activates  $(x^i, y^i)$  for  $X$  if  $\sigma(x_i)=1$  and  $\bar{X}$  otherwise.

- The flow pair using  $(x^i, y^i)$  remains unchanged until  $b_6$ , which deactivates  $(x^i, y^i)$  for  $B$ .

-  $b_7$  activates  $(x^i, y^i)$  for  $\bar{X}$  if  $\sigma(x_i)=1$  and  $X$  otherwise.

-  $(x^i, y^i)$ :

- In  $b$ ,

$t_0$	$t_1$	$t_2$	$t_3$	$t_4$	$t_5$	$t_6$	$t_7$	$t_8$	$t_9$	$t_{10}$	$t_{11}$
$(x_i^i, y_i^i)$	$B$	$B$	$X$	$X$	$X$	$X$	$X$	$X$	$X$	$X$	$X$
$(x_{0i}^i, y_{0i}^i)$	$X$	$X$	$X$	$X$	$X$	$X$	$X$	$X$	$X$	$X$	$X$
$(x_{1i}^i, y_{1i}^i)$	$X$	$X$	$B$	$B$	$B$	$B$	$B$	$B$	$B$	$B$	$B$
$(x_{2i}^i, y_{2i}^i)$	$X$	$X$	$X$	$X$	$X$	$X$	$X$	$X$	$X$	$X$	$X$
$(x_{3i}^i, y_{3i}^i)$	$L$	$R$	$R$	$R$	$R$	$R$	$R$	$R$	$R$	$R$	$R$
$(u_i^i, v_i^i)$	$R$	$R$	$R$	$R$	$R$	$R$	$R$	$R$	$R$	$R$	$R$
$(u_{12}^i, v_{12}^i)$	$R$	$R$	$R$	$R$	$R$	$R$	$R$	$R$	$R$	$R$	$R$
$(u_{34}^i, v_{34}^i)$	$R$	$R$	$R$	$R$	$R$	$R$	$R$	$R$	$R$	$R$	$R$
$(\tilde{u}_{12}^i, \tilde{v}_{12}^i)$	$B$	$B$	$B$	$B$	$B$	$B$	$B$	$B$	$B$	$B$	$B$
$(\tilde{u}_{34}^i, \tilde{v}_{34}^i)$	$B$	$B$	$B$	$B$	$B$	$B$	$B$	$B$	$B$	$B$	$B$
$(u_{11}^i, v_{11}^i)$	$B_0$	$t_1$ neg	$B_0$	$t_1$	$B_0$	$t_1$	$B_0$	$t_1$	$B_0$	$t_1$	$B_0$
	$B_1$	$t_1$ pos	$B_1$	$t_1$	$B_1$	$t_1$	$B_1$	$t_1$	$B_1$	$t_1$	$B_1$
$(u_{21}^i, v_{21}^i)$	$B_0$	$t_2$ neg	$B_0$	$t_2$	$B_0$	$t_2$	$B_0$	$t_2$	$B_0$	$t_2$	$B_0$
	$B_1$	$t_2$ pos	$B_1$	$t_2$	$B_1$	$t_2$	$B_1$	$t_2$	$B_1$	$t_2$	$B_1$
$(u_{31}^i, v_{31}^i)$	$B_0$	$t_3$ neg	$B_0$	$t_3$	$B_0$	$t_3$	$B_0$	$t_3$	$B_0$	$t_3$	$B_0$
	$B_1$	$t_3$ pos	$B_1$	$t_3$	$B_1$	$t_3$	$B_1$	$t_3$	$B_1$	$t_3$	$B_1$
$(u_{41}^i, v_{41}^i)$	$B_0$	$t_4$ neg	$B_0$	$t_4$	$B_0$	$t_4$	$B_0$	$t_4$	$B_0$	$t_4$	$B_0$
	$B_1$	$t_4$ pos	$B_1$	$t_4$	$B_1$	$t_4$	$B_1$	$t_4$	$B_1$	$t_4$	$B_1$
$(u_{13}^i, v_{13}^i)$	$B$	$t_5$	$B$	$t_5$	$B$	$t_5$	$B$	$t_5$	$B$	$t_5$	$B$
	$B$	$t_6$	$B$	$t_6$	$B$	$t_6$	$B$	$t_6$	$B$	$t_6$	$B$
$(u_{23}^i, v_{23}^i)$	$B$	$t_7$	$B$	$t_7$	$B$	$t_7$	$B$	$t_7$	$B$	$t_7$	$B$
	$B$	$t_8$	$B$	$t_8$	$B$	$t_8$	$B$	$t_8$	$B$	$t_8$	$B$
$(u_{33}^i, v_{33}^i)$	$B$	$t_9$	$B$	$t_9$	$B$	$t_9$	$B$	$t_9$	$B$	$t_9$	$B$
	$B$	$t_{10}$	$B$	$t_{10}$	$B$	$t_{10}$	$B$	$t_{10}$	$B$	$t_{10}$	$B$
$(u_{43}^i, v_{43}^i)$	$B$	$t_{11}$	$B$	$t_{11}$	$B$	$t_{11}$	$B$	$t_{11}$	$B$	$t_{11}$	$B$
	$B$	$t_{12}$	$B$	$t_{12}$	$B$	$t_{12}$	$B$	$t_{12}$	$B$	$t_{12}$	$B$

$$B_0 t_1 = 1 \vee B_1$$

$$L_0 t_3 = 1 \vee L_1$$

$$R_0 t_3 = 1 \vee R_1$$

$$R_0 t_2 = 1 \vee R_1$$

$$L_0 t_3 = 1 \vee L_1$$