

Mathematical Programming Homework 5

Michael Nelson

November 1, 2021

Problem 1

Exercise 1. Reformulate the following linear program into Standard Form (SF).

$$\begin{aligned} \text{maximize} \quad & z = x_1 - x_2 + 2x_3 \\ \text{s.t.} \quad & 2x_1 + 3x_2 \leq 4 \\ & x_1 - x_3 \geq 2 \\ & x_1 + 2x_2 = 1 \\ & x_1 \text{ and } x_2 \text{ free, } x_3 \geq 0 \end{aligned}$$

For full credit, introduce as few new variables as possible and present the data of the final LP in the form:

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbf{x} &= \\ \mathbf{c} &= \\ \mathbf{A} &= \\ \mathbf{b} &= \end{aligned}$$

Solution 1. To convert to a minimization problem, we multiply the objective function by -1 :

$$\text{minimize } \hat{z} = -x_1 + x_2 - 2x_3.$$

Suppose $\mathbf{x} = (x_1, x_2, x_3)$ is a feasible solution to this linear program. Observe that since $x_3 \geq 0$ and $x_1 - x_3 \geq 2$, we see that $x_1 \geq 2$. Furthermore, since $x_2 = (1 - x_1)/2$, we see that $x_2 \leq -1/2$. With this in mind, we make the following linear change of coordinates:

$$\begin{aligned} x'_1 &= x_1 - 2 \\ x'_2 &= x_2 + 1/2 \\ x'_3 &= x_3 \end{aligned}$$

With these substitutions, the linear program becomes

$$\begin{aligned} \text{minimize} \quad & \hat{z} = x'_1 - x'_2 + 2x'_3 + 3/2 \\ \text{s.t.} \quad & 2x'_1 + 3x'_2 \leq 3/2 \\ & x'_3 - x'_1 \leq 0 \\ & x'_1 + 2x'_2 = 0 \\ & \mathbf{x}' \geq 0 \end{aligned}$$

We also want to remove the constant function in the objective function, so we set $z' = \hat{z} + 3/2$. Next we introduce slack variables $s_1, s_2 \geq 0$ to convert the inequalities to equalities:

$$\begin{aligned} 2x'_1 + 3x'_2 + s_1 &= 3/2 \\ x'_3 - x'_1 + s_2 &= 0 \end{aligned}$$

The linear program becomes

$$\begin{aligned} \text{minimize} \quad & z' = x'_1 - x'_2 + 2x'_3 \\ \text{s.t.} \quad & 2x'_1 + 3x'_2 + s_1 = 3/2 \\ & x'_3 - x'_1 + s_2 = 0 \\ & x'_1 + 2x'_2 = 0 \\ & \mathbf{x}', s_1, s_2 \geq 0 \end{aligned}$$

Finally we set

$$A = \begin{pmatrix} 2 & 3 & 0 & 1 & 0 \\ -1 & 0 & 1 & 0 & 1 \\ 1 & 2 & 0 & 0 & 0 \end{pmatrix}, \quad \mathbf{b} = \begin{pmatrix} 3/2 \\ 0 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix}, \quad \text{and} \quad \mathbf{c} = \begin{pmatrix} 1 \\ -1 \\ 2 \end{pmatrix}$$

and we clean our notation a bit and write $\mathbf{x} = (x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4, x_5) = (x'_1, x'_2, x'_3, s_1, s_2)$ and $z = z'$. With these notational changes, the linear program becomes

$$\begin{aligned} \text{minimize} \quad & z = \mathbf{c}^\top \mathbf{x} \\ \text{s.t.} \quad & A\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{b} \\ & \mathbf{x} \geq 0 \end{aligned}$$

which is in standard form.

Problem 2

Consider the following polyhedral set

$$X = \{\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^2 \mid -2x_1 + x_2 \leq 5, x_1/2 - x_2 \leq 2, x_1, x_2 \geq 0\}$$

Problem 2.a

Exercise 2. Use a method of your choice to find the set of all extreme points (EPs) in X .

Solution 2. Let $s_1, s_2 \geq 0$ and let

$$A = \begin{pmatrix} -2 & 1 & 1 & 0 \\ 1/2 & -1 & 0 & 1 \end{pmatrix} \quad \text{and} \quad \mathbf{b} = \begin{pmatrix} 5 \\ 2 \end{pmatrix}.$$

Then every extreme point of X corresponds to a basic feasible solution to

$$\begin{aligned} A\hat{\mathbf{x}} &= \mathbf{b} \\ \hat{\mathbf{x}} &\geq 0 \end{aligned}$$

where $\hat{\mathbf{x}} = (\mathbf{x}, \mathbf{s})^\top = (x_1, x_2, s_1, s_2)^\top$. We find all basic solutions and determine if they are feasible or not below:

1. The basis $\{x_1, x_2\}$ produces the basic solution $(-14/3, -13/3, 0, 0)^\top$, which is infeasible.
2. The basis $\{x_1, s_1\}$ produces the basic feasible solution $(4, 0, 13, 0)^\top$. It corresponds to the point $\mathbf{x}^1 = (4, 0)^\top$.
3. The basis $\{x_1, s_2\}$ produces the basic solution $(-5/2, 0, 0, 13/4)^\top$, which is infeasible.
4. The basis $\{x_2, s_1\}$ produces the basic solution $(-2, 0, 7, 0)^\top$, which is infeasible.
5. The basis $\{x_2, s_2\}$ produces the basic feasible solution $(0, 5, 0, 7)^\top$. It corresponds to the point $\mathbf{x}^2 = (0, 5)^\top$.
6. The basis $\{s_1, s_2\}$ produces the basic feasible solution $(0, 0, 5, 2)^\top$. It corresponds to the point $\mathbf{x}^3 = (0, 0)^\top$.

After considering all possibilities, we find that the extreme points are $\mathbf{x}^1 = (4, 0)^\top$, $\mathbf{x}^2 = (0, 5)^\top$, and $\mathbf{x}^3 = (0, 0)^\top$.

Problem 2.b

Exercise 3. Use an appropriate algebraic derivation and find the set of all recession directions in X .

Solution 3. A direction of unboundness $\hat{\mathbf{d}} = (\mathbf{d}, s)^\top = (d_1, d_2, s_1, s_2)^\top$ must satisfy

$$\begin{aligned} A\hat{\mathbf{d}} &= 0 \\ \hat{\mathbf{d}} &\geq 0 \\ \hat{\mathbf{d}} &\neq 0 \end{aligned} \tag{1}$$

Two such solutions are given by $\hat{\mathbf{d}}^1 = (2, 4, 0, 3)^\top$ and $\hat{\mathbf{d}}^2 = (2, 1, 3, 0)^\top$ corresponding to the directions $\mathbf{d}^1 = (2, 4)$ and $\mathbf{d}^2 = (2, 1)$ respectively. Note that since A has full rank, the dimension of its null space is 2, and since $\{\hat{\mathbf{d}}^1, \hat{\mathbf{d}}^2\}$ is linearly independent, we see that every $\hat{\mathbf{d}} \in \mathbb{R}^4$ which satisfies $A\hat{\mathbf{d}} = 0$ has the form

$$\hat{\mathbf{d}} = t_1 \hat{\mathbf{d}}^1 + t_2 \hat{\mathbf{d}}^2$$

for some $t_1, t_2 \in \mathbb{R}$. If in addition we want $\hat{\mathbf{d}} \geq 0$, then it's easy to see that we need $t_1, t_2 \geq 0$. Also if we want $\hat{\mathbf{d}} \neq 0$, then we need at least one of t_1 or t_2 to be nonzero.

Problem 2.c

Exercise 4. What recession directions that you found in part b are extreme? Explain.

Solution 4. Let D be the set of all $\hat{\mathbf{d}} \in \mathbb{R}^4$ which satisfy (1). Notice that D cannot have any extreme points. Indeed, if $\hat{\mathbf{d}}$ is a direction of unboundness, then so too is $\hat{\mathbf{d}}/2$, and since $\hat{\mathbf{d}} = \hat{\mathbf{d}}/2 + \hat{\mathbf{d}}/2$, we see that $\hat{\mathbf{d}}$ cannot be an extreme point of D . To rectify this issue, we set $D_1 = \{\hat{\mathbf{d}} \in D \mid \|\hat{\mathbf{d}}\| = 1\}$. Now it is easy to see that $\frac{1}{\sqrt{29}}\hat{\mathbf{d}}^1$ and $\frac{1}{\sqrt{13}}\hat{\mathbf{d}}^2$ are the extreme points of this set.

Problem 2.d

Exercise 5. Apply the Representation Theorem and find a representation for the point $\mathbf{x} = (4, 6)^\top \in X$.

Solution 5. We have

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbf{x} &= \begin{pmatrix} 4 \\ 6 \end{pmatrix} \\ &= 2 \begin{pmatrix} 2 \\ 1 \end{pmatrix} + \frac{4}{5} \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 5 \end{pmatrix} + \frac{1}{5} \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix} \\ &= 2\mathbf{d}^2 + \frac{4}{5}\mathbf{x}^2 + \frac{1}{5}\mathbf{x}^3 \end{aligned}$$

which shows that \mathbf{x} is a convex combination of the extreme points plus a direction of unboundness.

Problem 2.c

Exercise 6. Is your representation unique? Explain.

Solution 6. No because \mathbf{x} doesn't belong to the convex hull of \mathbf{x}^1 , \mathbf{x}^2 , and \mathbf{x}^3 . For instance, another representation of \mathbf{x} is given by

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbf{x} &= \begin{pmatrix} 4 \\ 6 \end{pmatrix} \\ &= \begin{pmatrix} 2 \\ 4 \end{pmatrix} + \frac{5}{10} \begin{pmatrix} 4 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix} + \frac{4}{10} \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 5 \end{pmatrix} + \frac{1}{10} \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix} \\ &= \mathbf{d}^1 + \frac{5}{10}\mathbf{x}^1 + \frac{4}{10}\mathbf{x}^2 + \frac{1}{10}\mathbf{x}^3 \end{aligned}$$

Problem 3

Exercise 7. Consider the linear program (LP) in \mathbb{R}^2 :

$$\begin{aligned} \min \quad & \mathbf{c}^\top \mathbf{x} \\ \text{s.t.} \quad & \mathbf{x} \in X \end{aligned}$$

where X is defined as in question 2 above. Apply a method for solving LP in \mathbb{R}^2 and find the set of all optimal solutions to this LP for each cost vectors below. Write each set in an appropriate form.

1. Let $\mathbf{a} = (1, 1)^\top$
2. Let $\mathbf{b} = (2, -1)^\top$
3. Let $\mathbf{c} = (0, 1)^\top$

Solution 7. Recall that the extreme points of X are $\mathbf{x}^1 = (4, 0)^\top$, $\mathbf{x}^2 = (0, 5)^\top$, and $\mathbf{x}^3 = (0, 0)^\top$, and recall that the extreme directions of unboundedness of X are $\mathbf{d}^1 = (2, 4)^\top$ and $\mathbf{d}^2 = (2, 1)^\top$.

1. We first find the optimal solution for the cost vector $\mathbf{a} = (1, 1)^\top$. Observe that $\mathbf{a}^\top \mathbf{d}^1 = 6 \geq 0$ and $\mathbf{a}^\top \mathbf{d}^2 = 3 \geq 0$. Therefore for any direction of unboundedness \mathbf{d} , we will have $\mathbf{a}^\top \mathbf{d} \geq 0$. It follows that the optimal solution will occur at one of the extreme points (or perhaps on an adjacent edge connecting two extreme points). A simple calculation shows

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbf{a}^\top \mathbf{x}^1 &= 4 \\ \mathbf{a}^\top \mathbf{x}^2 &= 5 \\ \mathbf{a}^\top \mathbf{x}^3 &= 0. \end{aligned}$$

It follows that the optimal solution for the cost vector \mathbf{a} is \mathbf{x}^3 with optimal value given by $\mathbf{a}^\top \mathbf{x}^3 = 0$.

2. Now we find the optimal solution for the cost vector $\mathbf{b} = (2, -1)^\top$. Observe that $\mathbf{b}^\top \mathbf{d}^1 = 0 \geq 0$ and $\mathbf{b}^\top \mathbf{d}^2 = 3 \geq 0$. Therefore for any direction of unboundedness \mathbf{d} , we will have $\mathbf{b}^\top \mathbf{d} \geq 0$. It follows that the optimal solution will occur at one of the extreme points (or perhaps on an adjacent edge connecting two extreme points). A simple calculation shows

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbf{b}^\top \mathbf{x}^1 &= 8 \\ \mathbf{b}^\top \mathbf{x}^2 &= -5 \\ \mathbf{b}^\top \mathbf{x}^3 &= 0. \end{aligned}$$

It follows that the optimal solution for the cost vector \mathbf{b} is \mathbf{x}^2 with optimal value given by $\mathbf{b}^\top \mathbf{x}^2 = -5$.

3. Finally we find the optimal solution for the cost vector $\mathbf{c} = (0, 1)^\top$. Observe that $\mathbf{c}^\top \mathbf{d}^1 = 4 \geq 0$ and $\mathbf{c}^\top \mathbf{d}^2 = 1 \geq 0$. Therefore for any direction of unboundedness \mathbf{d} , we will have $\mathbf{c}^\top \mathbf{d} \geq 0$. It follows that the optimal solution will occur at one of the extreme points (or perhaps on an adjacent edge connecting two extreme points). A simple calculation shows

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbf{c}^\top \mathbf{x}^1 &= 0 \\ \mathbf{c}^\top \mathbf{x}^2 &= 5 \\ \mathbf{c}^\top \mathbf{x}^3 &= 0. \end{aligned}$$

It follows that the optimal solutions for the cost vector \mathbf{c} occurs on the adjacent edge connecting \mathbf{x}^1 with \mathbf{x}^3 , so they have the form $t_1 \mathbf{x}^1 + t_2 \mathbf{x}^3$ where $t_1, t_2 \geq 0$ satisfy $t_1 + t_2 = 1$. The optimal value at these optimal points is given by $\mathbf{c}^\top (t_1 \mathbf{x}^1 + t_2 \mathbf{x}^3) = 0$.

Problem 4

Exercise 8. Apply the Simplex Algorithm and find an optimal solution to the linear program. In every iteration, select the most negative reduced cost.

$$\begin{aligned} \min \quad & -6x_1 - 14x_2 - 13x_3 \\ \text{s.t.} \quad & x_1 + 4x_2 + 2x_3 \leq 48 \\ & x_1 + 2x_2 + 4x_3 \leq 60 \\ & \mathbf{x} \geq 0 \end{aligned}$$

Solution 8. We introduce slack variables $x_4, x_5 \geq 0$ to convert the inequality constraints to equality constraints:

$$\begin{aligned} \min \quad & -6x_1 - 14x_2 - 13x_3 \\ \text{s.t.} \quad & x_1 + 4x_2 + 2x_3 + x_4 = 48 \\ & x_1 + 2x_2 + 4x_3 + x_5 = 60 \\ & \mathbf{x} \geq 0 \end{aligned}$$

where now $\mathbf{x} = (x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4, x_5)^\top$. Let

$$A = \begin{pmatrix} 2 & 4 & 2 & 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 2 & 4 & 0 & 1 \end{pmatrix}, \quad \mathbf{b} = \begin{pmatrix} 48 \\ 60 \end{pmatrix}, \quad \mathbf{c} = \begin{pmatrix} -6 \\ -14 \\ -13 \\ 0 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix}$$

Then in standard form, our linear program looks like:

$$\begin{aligned} \text{minimize} \quad & z = \mathbf{c}^\top \mathbf{x} \\ \text{s.t.} \quad & A\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{b} \\ & \mathbf{x} \geq 0 \end{aligned}$$

We now perform the simplex algorithm as follows

First iteration of the simplex algorithm: We begin by using the slack variables as the initial basis. Let

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbf{x}_B &= (x_4, x_5)^\top & \mathbf{x}_N &= (x_1, x_2, x_3)^\top \\ \mathbf{c}_B &= (0, 0)^\top & \mathbf{c}_N &= (-6, -14, -13)^\top \\ B &= \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{pmatrix} & N &= \begin{pmatrix} 2 & 4 & 2 \\ 1 & 2 & 4 \end{pmatrix} \\ B^{-1} &= \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{pmatrix} & B^{-1}N &= \begin{pmatrix} 2 & 4 & 2 \\ 1 & 2 & 4 \end{pmatrix} \end{aligned}$$

Our current basic solution and our current objective value are given by

$$\begin{aligned} \hat{\mathbf{b}} &= B^{-1}\mathbf{b} & \hat{z} &= \mathbf{c}_B^\top \hat{\mathbf{b}} \\ &= \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 48 \\ 60 \end{pmatrix} & &= (0, 0)^\top \begin{pmatrix} 48 \\ 60 \end{pmatrix} \\ &= (48, 60)^\top & &= 0 \end{aligned}$$

To determine whether or not this is optimal, we calculate the reduced cost vector:

$$\begin{aligned} \hat{\mathbf{c}}_N^\top &= (\mathbf{c}_N^\top - \mathbf{c}_B^\top B^{-1}N) \\ &= (-6, -14, -13) - (0, 0) \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 2 & 4 & 2 \\ 1 & 2 & 4 \end{pmatrix} \\ &= (-6, -14, -13). \end{aligned}$$

The components of \hat{c}_N are negative, so the basis is not optimal. Since $(\hat{c}_N)_2$ is the more negative component, we select x_2 (the second nonbasic variable) as the entering variable. To find the leaving variable, we first calculate

$$\begin{aligned}\hat{A}_2 &= B^{-1}A_2 \\ &= \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 4 \\ 2 \end{pmatrix} \\ &= \begin{pmatrix} 4 \\ 2 \end{pmatrix}\end{aligned}$$

where A_2 is the second column of the matrix A . Letting $\hat{a}_{i,2}$ denote the i th entry in \hat{A}_2 , we then calculate

$$\begin{aligned}\bar{x}_2 &= \min_{1 \leq i \leq 2} \left\{ \frac{\hat{b}_i}{\hat{a}_{i,2}} \mid \hat{a}_{i,2} > 0 \right\} \\ &= \min \left\{ \frac{48}{4}, \frac{60}{2} \right\} \\ &= 12.\end{aligned}$$

Thus the leaving variable is x_4 (the first basic variable) corresponding to the minimum of $\{\hat{b}_i/\hat{a}_{i,2} \mid \hat{a}_{i,2} > 0\}$. This completes the first iteration of the simplex algorithm.

Second iteration of the simplex algorithm: We replace x_4 with x_2 in our basis, so let

$$\begin{aligned}\mathbf{x}_B &= (x_2, x_5)^\top & \mathbf{x}_N &= (x_1, x_4, x_3)^\top \\ \mathbf{c}_B &= (-14, 0)^\top & \mathbf{c}_N &= (-6, 0, -13)^\top \\ B &= \begin{pmatrix} 4 & 0 \\ 2 & 1 \end{pmatrix} & N &= \begin{pmatrix} 2 & 1 & 2 \\ 1 & 0 & 4 \end{pmatrix} \\ B^{-1} &= \begin{pmatrix} 1/4 & 0 \\ -1/2 & 1 \end{pmatrix} & B^{-1}N &= \begin{pmatrix} 1/2 & 1/4 & 1/2 \\ 0 & -1/2 & 3 \end{pmatrix}\end{aligned}$$

Our current basic solution and our current objective value are given by

$$\begin{aligned}\hat{\mathbf{b}} &= B^{-1}\mathbf{b} & \hat{\mathbf{z}} &= \mathbf{c}_B^\top \hat{\mathbf{b}} \\ &= \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 48 \\ 60 \end{pmatrix} & &= (-14, 0)^\top \begin{pmatrix} 12 \\ 36 \end{pmatrix} \\ &= (12, 36)^\top & &= -168\end{aligned}$$

To determine whether or not this is optimal, we calculate the reduced cost vector:

$$\begin{aligned}\hat{\mathbf{c}}_N^\top &= (\mathbf{c}_N^\top - \mathbf{c}_B^\top B^{-1}N) \\ &= (-6, 0, -13) - (-14, 0) \begin{pmatrix} 1/2 & 1/4 & 1/2 \\ 0 & -1/2 & 3 \end{pmatrix} \\ &= (1, 7/2, -6).\end{aligned}$$

The third component of $\hat{\mathbf{c}}_N$ is negative, so the basis is not optimal. Since this is the only negative component, we select x_3 (the third nonbasic variable) as the entering variable. To find the leaving variable, we first calculate

$$\begin{aligned}\hat{A}_3 &= B^{-1}A_3 \\ &= \begin{pmatrix} 1/4 & 0 \\ -1/2 & 1 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 2 \\ 4 \end{pmatrix} \\ &= \begin{pmatrix} 1/2 \\ 3 \end{pmatrix}\end{aligned}$$

where A_3 is the second column of the matrix A . Letting $\hat{a}_{i,3}$ denote the i th entry in \hat{A}_3 , we then calculate

$$\begin{aligned}\bar{x}_3 &= \min_{1 \leq i \leq 2} \left\{ \frac{\hat{b}_i}{\hat{a}_{i,3}} \mid \hat{a}_{i,3} > 0 \right\} \\ &= \min \left\{ \frac{12}{1/2}, \frac{36}{3} \right\} \\ &= 12.\end{aligned}$$

Thus the leaving variable is x_5 (the second basic variable). This completes the second iteration of the simplex algorithm.

Third iteration of the simplex algorithm: We replace x_3 with x_5 in our basis, so let

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbf{x}_B &= (x_2, x_3)^\top & \mathbf{x}_N &= (x_1, x_4, x_5)^\top \\ \mathbf{c}_B &= (-14, -13)^\top & \mathbf{c}_N &= (-6, 0, 0)^\top \\ B &= \begin{pmatrix} 4 & 2 \\ 2 & 4 \end{pmatrix} & N &= \begin{pmatrix} 2 & 1 & 0 \\ 1 & 0 & 1 \end{pmatrix} \\ B^{-1} &= \begin{pmatrix} 1/3 & -1/6 \\ -1/6 & 1/3 \end{pmatrix} & B^{-1}N &= \begin{pmatrix} 1/2 & 1/3 & -1/6 \\ 0 & -1/6 & 1/3 \end{pmatrix} \end{aligned}$$

Our current basic solution and our current objective value are given by

$$\begin{aligned} \hat{\mathbf{b}} &= B^{-1}\mathbf{b} & \hat{\mathbf{z}} &= \mathbf{c}_B^\top \hat{\mathbf{b}} \\ &= \begin{pmatrix} 1/3 & -1/6 \\ -1/6 & 1/3 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 48 \\ 60 \end{pmatrix} & &= (-14, -13)^\top \begin{pmatrix} 6 \\ 12 \end{pmatrix} \\ &= (6, 12)^\top & &= -240 \end{aligned}$$

To determine whether or not this is optimal, we calculate the reduced cost vector:

$$\begin{aligned} \hat{\mathbf{c}}_N^\top &= (\mathbf{c}_N^\top - \mathbf{c}_B^\top B^{-1}N) \\ &= (-6, 0, 0) - (-14, -13) \begin{pmatrix} 1/2 & 1/3 & -1/6 \\ 0 & -1/6 & 1/3 \end{pmatrix} \\ &= (1, 5/2, 2). \end{aligned}$$

The cost vector consists of strictly positive entries. This means that the objective function will *increase* no matter which direction we choose: we have found a local minimum at $\mathbf{x}^* = (0, 6, 12)$ with objective value given by $\mathbf{z}^* = -240$. In fact, this is a global minimum since linear programming problems are convex optimization problems.

Problem 5

Problem 5.a

Exercise 9. Let \mathbf{x} be a feasible solution but not a basic feasible solution for $A\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{b}$, $\mathbf{x} \geq 0$. Prove that the columns of A corresponding to the nonzero entries of \mathbf{x} are linearly dependent.

Solution 9. According to the book, a point \mathbf{x} is a **basic solution** if

1. \mathbf{x} satisfies the equality constraints of the linear program
2. the columns of the constraint matrix corresponding to the nonzero components of \mathbf{x} are linearly independent.

So by definition (according to the book), the columns of A corresponding to the nonzero entries of \mathbf{x} are linearly dependent. To complete this problem though, I'll prove the following instead:

Proposition 0.1. Let A be an $m \times n$ matrix with $m < n$ and let $\mathbf{x} \in \mathbb{R}^n$ such that $A\mathbf{x} = 0$, $\mathbf{x} \geq 0$. Furthermore, suppose that \mathbf{x} has k nonzero entries where $m < k \leq n$. Then the columns corresponding to the nonzero entries of \mathbf{x} are linearly dependent.

Proof. This follows from the fact that $\text{rank } A \leq m$. Thus the maximum size of a set of linearly independent columns of A must be less than or equal to m as well. \square

Problem 5.b

Exercise 10. Let x be a feasible point of $X = \{x \in \mathbb{R}^n \mid Ax = b, x \geq 0\}$ that is not an extreme point. Prove that there exists a nonzero vector $p \in \mathbb{R}^n$ such that

1. $Ap = 0$ and,
2. $p_i = 0$ if $x_i = 0$.

(Hint: use the result from part a).

Solution 10. Note that x is not a basic feasible solution since it is not an extreme point. Therefore the columns of A corresponding to the nonzero entries of x are linearly dependent and we can find a feasible direction p (where $p \neq 0$) satisfying 1 and 2 above. For instance, suppose the first k entries of x are nonzero and the remaining $n - k$ entries are zero where $m < k \leq n$. Then the set of columns $\{A_1, \dots, A_k\}$ is linearly dependent, say

$$a_1 A_1 + \dots + a_k A_k = 0$$

for some $a_1, \dots, a_k \in \mathbb{R}$ not all zero. By scaling the a_i if necessary, we can assume that $|a_i| < x_i$ for all $1 \leq i \leq k$. Then we can set $p = (a_1, \dots, a_k, 0, \dots, 0)$, and p will satisfy 1 and 2 above (it will also be a feasible direction, meaning $x + p$ is feasible).