

Please Note

- You have to be an **English Native Speaker**.
- You must complete the examples correctly to submit the HIT.
- You have to complete the ratings for all sentences. **All fields are required**.
- Some of the tasks are control samples! Please read the instructions carefully. We reserve the right to reject the HIT if these are not completed correctly.

Informed Consent

This study is being conducted by researchers at the School of Informatics, University of Edinburgh. If you have any questions about this study, feel free to contact us (tom.hosking@ed.ac.uk). Participation in this research is voluntary. You have the right to withdraw from the experiment at any time. The collected data will be used for research purposes only. All output data will be anonymised and we will not collect or store any information that could be used to identify who you are. A full Participant Information Sheet is available [here](#).

☒ I understand the participant information and consent to participate in this study.

If you do not consent, please return this HIT.

Instructions

In this task you will read roughly thirty examples of sentences and two paraphrases created by a computer program. The program aims to rewrite the sentence so that it means the same thing, but using different words and/or different word order.

**Please read all the sentences carefully**, this should take you about 20 minutes (if you do the task very quickly your HIT will be rejected).

You will be asked to choose which system performs better, for three aspects of the paraphrases:

1. Which system output is the most **fluent and grammatical**?
2. To what extent is the **meaning** expressed in the original sentence **preserved** in the rewritten version, with no additional information added?
3. Does the rewritten version use **different words or phrasing** to the original? You should choose the system that uses the **most** different words or word order.

Remember that you are being asked to **rate the system**, not the original.

Some of the sentences only have small differences! Be careful to choose the one that is **most different** for the dissimilarity category. If the control samples are not answered correctly then we will assume that you have answered at random and reject the HIT.

A small number of samples may have two choices that are *\*exactly\** the same - in these cases please pick an answer at random, this will not cause the HIT to be rejected.

Examples

First, complete these example tasks correctly:

Original: **Who is the President of America?**

System A: **"The Head of State of the USA is is whom?"**

System B: **"Who is Captain America?"**

Most grammatical

A

B

Closest in meaning

A

B

More dissimilar phrasing

A

B

Fluency: System A has repeated a word, but System B is grammatically correct, so click 'B'.

Meaning: System A is closer to the original meaning than System B, so click 'A'.

Dissimilarity: System A also uses more different words/phrasing than System B, so click 'A'.

Original: **Who is the President of America?**

Most grammatical

Closest in meaning

More dissimilar words/phrasing

file:///C:/Users/Craig/Downloads/mturk\_hrqvae (1).htm

1/9

System A: "Who the President of America America?"

System B: "Vice President of the USA is whom?"

A

B

A

B

A

B

Fluency: Both outputs have grammar errors, but System B is closer to being correct, so click 'B'.

Meaning: System A means the same thing as the original, but System B doesn't, so click 'A'.

Dissimilarity: System B uses more different words/phrasing than System A, so click 'B'.

Tasks

Original: "\${input0}"

System A: "\${outputa0}"

System B: "\${outputb0}"

Most fluent

Closest in meaning

More dissimilar words/phrasing

A

B

A

B

A

B

Original: "\${input1}"

System A: "\${outputa1}"

System B: "\${outputb1}"

Most fluent

Closest in meaning

More dissimilar words/phrasing

A

B

A

B

A

B

Original: "\${input2}"

System A: "\${outputa2}"

System B: "\${outputb2}"

Most fluent

Closest in meaning

More dissimilar words/phrasing

A

B

A

B

A

B

Original: "\${input3}"

	Most fluent	Closest in meaning	More dissimilar words/phrasing
System A: "\${outputa3}"	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>
System B: "\${outputb3}"	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>

Original: "\${input4}"			
	Most fluent	Closest in meaning	More dissimilar words/phrasing
System A: "\${outputa4}"	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>
System B: "\${outputb4}"	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>

Original: "\${input5}"			
	Most fluent	Closest in meaning	More dissimilar words/phrasing
System A: "\${outputa5}"	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>
System B: "\${outputb5}"	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>

Original: "\${input6}"			
	Most fluent	Closest in meaning	More dissimilar words/phrasing
System A: "\${outputa6}"	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>
System B: "\${outputb6}"	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>

Original: "\${input7}"			
	Most fluent	Closest in meaning	More dissimilar words/phrasing
System A: "\${outputa7}"	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>
System B: "\${outputb7}"	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>

Original: "\${input8}"

	Most fluent	Closest in meaning	More dissimilar words/phrasing
System A: "\${outputa8}"	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>
System B: "\${outputb8}"	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>

Original: "\${input9}"

	Most fluent	Closest in meaning	More dissimilar words/phrasing
System A: "\${outputa9}"	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>
System B: "\${outputb9}"	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>

Original: "\${input10}"

	Most fluent	Closest in meaning	More dissimilar words/phrasing
System A: "\${outputa10}"	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>
System B: "\${outputb10}"	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>

Original: "\${input11}"

	Most fluent	Closest in meaning	More dissimilar words/phrasing
System A: "\${outputa11}"	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>
System B: "\${outputb11}"	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>

Original: "\${input12}"

	Most fluent	Closest in meaning	More dissimilar words/phrasing
System A: "\${outputa12}"	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>
System B: "\${outputb12}"	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>

Original: "\${input13}"

	Most fluent	Closest in meaning	More dissimilar words/phrasing
System A: "\${outputa13}"	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>
System B: "\${outputb13}"	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>

Original: "\${input14}"

	Most fluent	Closest in meaning	More dissimilar words/phrasing
System A: "\${outputa14}"	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>
System B: "\${outputb14}"	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>

Original: "\${input15}"

	Most fluent	Closest in meaning	More dissimilar words/phrasing
System A: "\${outputa15}"	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>
System B: "\${outputb15}"	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>

Original: "\${input16}"

	Most fluent	Closest in meaning	More dissimilar words/phrasing
System A: "\${outputa16}"	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>
System B: "\${outputb16}"	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>

Original: "\${input17}"

	Most fluent	Closest in meaning	More dissimilar words/phrasing
System A: "\${outputa17}"	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>
System B: "\${outputb17}"	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>

Original: "\${input18}"			
	Most fluent	Closest in meaning	More dissimilar words/phrasing
System A: "\${outputa18}"	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>
System B: "\${outputb18}"	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>

Original: "\${input19}"			
	Most fluent	Closest in meaning	More dissimilar words/phrasing
System A: "\${outputa19}"	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>
System B: "\${outputb19}"	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>

Original: "\${input20}"			
	Most fluent	Closest in meaning	More dissimilar words/phrasing
System A: "\${outputa20}"	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>
System B: "\${outputb20}"	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>

Original: "\${input21}"			
	Most fluent	Closest in meaning	More dissimilar words/phrasing
System A: "\${outputa21}"	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>
System B: "\${outputb21}"	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>

Original: "\${input22}"

System A: "\${outputa22}"

System B: "\${outputb22}"

Most fluent

A

B

Closest in meaning

A

B

More dissimilar words/phrasing

A

B

Original: "\${input23}"

System A: "\${outputa23}"

System B: "\${outputb23}"

Most fluent

A

B

Closest in meaning

A

B

More dissimilar words/phrasing

A

B

Original: "\${input24}"

System A: "\${outputa24}"

System B: "\${outputb24}"

Most fluent

A

B

Closest in meaning

A

B

More dissimilar words/phrasing

A

B

Original: "\${input25}"

System A: "\${outputa25}"

System B: "\${outputb25}"

Most fluent

A

B

Closest in meaning

A

B

More dissimilar words/phrasing

A

B

Original: "\${input26}"

System A: "\${outputa26}"

System B: "\${outputb26}"

Most fluent

A

B

Closest in meaning

A

B

More dissimilar words/phrasing

A

B

Original: "\${input27}"

	Most fluent	Closest in meaning	More dissimilar words/phrasing
System A: "\${outputa27}"	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>
System B: "\${outputb27}"	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>

Original: "\${input28}"

	Most fluent	Closest in meaning	More dissimilar words/phrasing
System A: "\${outputa28}"	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>
System B: "\${outputb28}"	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>

Original: "\${input29}"

	Most fluent	Closest in meaning	More dissimilar words/phrasing
System A: "\${outputa29}"	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>
System B: "\${outputb29}"	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>

Original: "\${input30}"

	Most fluent	Closest in meaning	More dissimilar words/phrasing
System A: "\${outputa30}"	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>	<div>A</div>
System B: "\${outputb30}"	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>	<div>B</div>

Original: "\${input31}"



	Most fluent	Closest in meaning	More dissimilar words/phrasing
System A: "\${outputa31}"	A	A	A
System B: "\${outputb31}"	B	B	B