

Machine Learning Techniques Homework #2

tags: mlt , ntu , course , homework

Cheng-Shih Wong, R04945028, mob5566@gmail.com (mailto:mob5566@gmail.com)

1.

For

$$F(A, B) = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{n=1}^N \ln(1 + \exp(-y_n (A \cdot (\mathbf{w}_{\text{SVM}}^T \phi(\mathbf{x}_n) + b_{\text{SVM}}) + B)))$$

Let $z_n = \mathbf{w}_{\text{SVM}}^T \phi(\mathbf{x}_n) + b_{\text{SVM}}$, $s_n = Az_n + B$, and $p_n = \theta(-y_n s_n)$

where $\theta(s) = \frac{\exp(s)}{1 + \exp(s)}$

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\partial F(A, B)}{\partial A} &= \frac{1}{N} \sum_{n=1}^N \frac{\partial}{\partial A} \ln(1 + e^{-y_n s_n}) \\ &= \frac{1}{N} \sum_{n=1}^N \frac{1}{(1 + e^{-y_n s_n})} \frac{\partial}{\partial A} (1 + e^{-y_n s_n}) \\ &= \frac{1}{N} \sum_{n=1}^N \frac{1}{(1 + e^{-y_n s_n})} \frac{\partial}{\partial A} e^{-y_n s_n} \\ &= \frac{1}{N} \sum_{n=1}^N \frac{e^{-y_n s_n}}{(1 + e^{-y_n s_n})} \frac{\partial}{\partial A} (-y_n (Az_n + B)) \\ &= \frac{1}{N} \sum_{n=1}^N \theta(-y_n s_n) (-y_n z_n) \\ &= -\frac{1}{N} \sum_{n=1}^N y_n z_n p_n \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
\frac{\partial F(A, B)}{\partial B} &= \frac{1}{N} \sum_{n=1}^N \frac{\partial}{\partial B} \ln(1 + e^{-y_n s_n}) \\
&= \frac{1}{N} \sum_{n=1}^N \frac{1}{(1 + e^{-y_n s_n})} \frac{\partial}{\partial B} (1 + e^{-y_n s_n}) \\
&= \frac{1}{N} \sum_{n=1}^N \frac{1}{(1 + e^{-y_n s_n})} \frac{\partial}{\partial B} e^{-y_n s_n} \\
&= \frac{1}{N} \sum_{n=1}^N \frac{e^{-y_n s_n}}{(1 + e^{-y_n s_n})} \frac{\partial}{\partial B} (-y_n (Az_n + B)) \\
&= \frac{1}{N} \sum_{n=1}^N \theta(-y_n s_n) (-y_n) \\
&= -\frac{1}{N} \sum_{n=1}^N y_n p_n \\
\nabla F(A, B) &= \begin{bmatrix} \frac{\partial F(A, B)}{\partial A} \\ \frac{\partial F(A, B)}{\partial B} \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} -\frac{1}{N} \sum_{n=1}^N y_n z_n p_n \\ -\frac{1}{N} \sum_{n=1}^N y_n p_n \end{bmatrix}
\end{aligned}$$

2.

$$\begin{aligned}
\frac{\partial^2 F(A, B)}{\partial A^2} &= -\frac{1}{N} \sum_{n=1}^N y_n z_n \frac{\partial p_n}{\partial A} \\
&\because \frac{d\theta(s)}{ds} = \theta(s) (1 - \theta(s)) \\
&= -\frac{1}{N} \sum_{n=1}^N y_n z_n p_n (1 - p_n) \frac{\partial}{\partial A} (-y_n (Az_n + B)) \\
&= -\frac{1}{N} \sum_{n=1}^N y_n z_n p_n (1 - p_n) (-y_n z_n) \\
&= \frac{1}{N} \sum_{n=1}^N y_n^2 z_n^2 p_n (1 - p_n) \tag{2}
\end{aligned}$$

Similar to (2)

$$\begin{aligned}
\frac{\partial^2 F(A, B)}{\partial A \partial B} &= \frac{\partial^2 F(A, B)}{\partial B \partial A} = \frac{1}{N} \sum_{n=1}^N y_n^2 z_n p_n (1 - p_n) \\
\frac{\partial^2 F(A, B)}{\partial B^2} &= \frac{1}{N} \sum_{n=1}^N y_n^2 p_n (1 - p_n) \\
H(F) &= \begin{bmatrix} \frac{\partial^2 F(A, B)}{\partial A^2} & \frac{\partial^2 F(A, B)}{\partial A \partial B} \\ \frac{\partial^2 F(A, B)}{\partial B \partial A} & \frac{\partial^2 F(A, B)}{\partial B^2} \end{bmatrix} \\
&= \begin{bmatrix} \frac{1}{N} \sum_{n=1}^N y_n^2 z_n^2 p_n (1 - p_n) & \frac{1}{N} \sum_{n=1}^N y_n^2 z_n p_n (1 - p_n) \\ \frac{1}{N} \sum_{n=1}^N y_n^2 z_n p_n (1 - p_n) & \frac{1}{N} \sum_{n=1}^N y_n^2 p_n (1 - p_n) \end{bmatrix}
\end{aligned}$$

3.

\because all \mathbf{x}_i are different

$$\therefore \|\mathbf{x}_i - \mathbf{x}_j\|^2 = \begin{cases} 0, & \text{if } i = j \\ \|\mathbf{x}_i - \mathbf{x}_j\|^2 > 0, & \text{else} \end{cases}$$

$$\therefore \text{Gaussian kernel } K(\mathbf{x}_i, \mathbf{x}_j) = \begin{cases} \exp(-\gamma * 0) = 1, & \text{if } i = j \\ \exp(-\gamma \|\mathbf{x}_i - \mathbf{x}_j\|^2), & \text{else} \end{cases}$$

$$\therefore \lim_{\gamma \rightarrow \infty} \exp(-\gamma \|\mathbf{x}_i, \mathbf{x}_j\|^2) = \begin{cases} \exp(-\gamma * 0) = 1, & \text{if } i = j \\ \exp(-\infty) = \frac{1}{\infty} = 0, & \text{else} \end{cases}$$

$$\text{The kernel matrix } \mathbf{K} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & \dots & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & \dots & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & \ddots & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & \dots & 1 \end{bmatrix} \text{ is an identity matrix}$$

From course slide **Support Vector Regression** page 4

The analytic solution of kernel ridge regression

$$\begin{aligned} \beta &= (\lambda \mathbf{I} + \mathbf{K})^{-1} \mathbf{y} \\ &= ((\lambda + 1) \mathbf{I})^{-1} \mathbf{y} \\ &= \left(\frac{1}{\lambda + 1} \mathbf{I} \right) \mathbf{y} \\ &= \frac{\mathbf{y}}{\lambda + 1} \end{aligned}$$

4.

$$\because \lim_{\gamma \rightarrow 0} \exp(-\gamma \|\mathbf{x}_i, \mathbf{x}_j\|^2) = \exp(0) = 1$$

$$\therefore \text{The kernel matrix } \mathbf{K} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & \dots & 1 \\ \vdots & \ddots & \vdots \\ 1 & \dots & 1 \end{bmatrix}$$

As in **Q.3**

The analytic solution of kernel ridge regression

$$\begin{aligned} \beta &= (\lambda \mathbf{I} + \mathbf{K})^{-1} \mathbf{y} \\ &= \left(\begin{bmatrix} \lambda + 1 & 1 & \dots & 1 \\ 1 & \lambda + 1 & \ddots & 1 \\ 1 & 1 & \ddots & \vdots \\ 1 & 1 & \dots & \lambda + 1 \end{bmatrix} \right)^{-1} \mathbf{y} \end{aligned}$$



5.

$$(P_2) \quad \min_{b, \mathbf{w}, \xi^\vee, \xi^\wedge} \quad \frac{1}{2} \mathbf{w}^T \mathbf{w} + C \sum_{n=1}^N ((\xi_n^\vee)^2 + (\xi_n^\wedge)^2)$$

$$\text{s.t.} \quad -\epsilon - \xi_n^\vee \leq y_n - \mathbf{w}^T \phi(\mathbf{x}_n) - b \leq \epsilon + \xi_n^\wedge$$

The constraint can be write as the absolute value form

$$\min_{b, \mathbf{w}, \xi} \quad \frac{1}{2} \mathbf{w}^T \mathbf{w} + C \sum_{n=1}^N (\xi_n)^2$$

$$\text{s.t.} \quad |y_n - \mathbf{w}^T \phi(\mathbf{x}_n) - b| \leq \epsilon + \xi_n$$

where the ξ_n is the **tube violation**

$$\xi_n = \max(0, |\mathbf{w}^T \phi(\mathbf{x}_n) + b - y_n| - \epsilon)$$

That is the equivalent unconstrained form of (P_2) is

$$\min_{b, \mathbf{w}} \quad \frac{1}{2} \mathbf{w}^T \mathbf{w} + C \sum_{n=1}^N (\max(0, |\mathbf{w}^T \phi(\mathbf{x}_n) + b - y_n| - \epsilon))^2 \quad (5)$$

6.

Substitute optimal \mathbf{w}_* into (5)

$$\min_{b, \boldsymbol{\beta}} F(b, \boldsymbol{\beta}) = \frac{1}{2} \sum_{m=1}^N \sum_{n=1}^N \beta_n \beta_m K(\mathbf{x}_n, \mathbf{x}_m) + C \sum_{n=1}^N \left(\max \left(0, \left| \sum_{m=1}^N \beta_m K(\mathbf{x}_n, \mathbf{x}_m) + b - y_n \right| - \epsilon \right) \right)^2$$

$$\text{Let } s_n = \sum_{m=1}^N \beta_m K(\mathbf{x}_n, \mathbf{x}_m) + b$$

$$\min_{b, \boldsymbol{\beta}} F(b, \boldsymbol{\beta}) = \frac{1}{2} \sum_{m=1}^N \sum_{n=1}^N \beta_n \beta_m K(\mathbf{x}_n, \mathbf{x}_m) + C \sum_{n=1}^N (\max(0, |s_n - y_n| - \epsilon))^2$$

To obtain $\frac{\partial F(b, \boldsymbol{\beta})}{\partial \beta_m}$

The partial derivative of **regularizer term** of $F(b, \boldsymbol{\beta})$ is

$$\frac{\partial \left(\frac{1}{2} \sum_{m=1}^N \sum_{n=1}^N \beta_n \beta_m K(\mathbf{x}_n, \mathbf{x}_m) \right)}{\partial \beta_m} = \sum_{n=1}^N \beta_n K(\mathbf{x}_m, \mathbf{x}_n)$$

For the **regression error term** of $F(b, \boldsymbol{\beta})$

Let

$$D_n = \frac{\partial (\max(0, |s_n - y_n| - \epsilon))^2}{\partial \beta_m}$$

and

$$\frac{\partial s_n}{\partial \beta_m} = K(\mathbf{x}_n, \mathbf{x}_m)$$

We should discuss three conditions $s_n - y_n < -\epsilon$, $-\epsilon \leq s_n - y_n \leq \epsilon$, $\epsilon < s_n - y_n$

If $-\epsilon \leq s_n - y_n \leq \epsilon$

$$\begin{aligned} D_n &= \frac{\partial(0)^2}{\partial\beta_m} \\ &= 0 \end{aligned}$$

If $s_n - y_n < -\epsilon$

$$\begin{aligned} D_n &= \frac{\partial(y_n - s_n - \epsilon)^2}{\partial\beta_m} \\ &= 2(y_n - s_n - \epsilon) \frac{\partial(y_n - s_n - \epsilon)}{\partial\beta_m} \\ &= 2(y_n - s_n - \epsilon) \frac{\partial - s_n}{\partial\beta_m} \\ &= -2(y_n - s_n - \epsilon)K(\mathbf{x}_n, \mathbf{x}_m) \end{aligned}$$

If $\epsilon < s_n - y_n$

$$\begin{aligned} D_n &= \frac{\partial(s_n - y_n - \epsilon)^2}{\partial\beta_m} \\ &= 2(s_n - y_n - \epsilon) \frac{\partial(s_n - y_n - \epsilon)}{\partial\beta_m} \\ &= 2(s_n - y_n - \epsilon) \frac{\partial s_n}{\partial\beta_m} \\ &= 2(s_n - y_n - \epsilon)K(\mathbf{x}_n, \mathbf{x}_m) \end{aligned}$$

Finally

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{\partial F(b, \boldsymbol{\beta})}{\partial\beta_m} &= \sum_{n=1}^N \beta_n K(\mathbf{x}_m, \mathbf{x}_n) + C \sum_{n=1}^N D_n \\ \text{where } D_n &= \begin{cases} -2(y_n - s_n - \epsilon)K(\mathbf{x}_n, \mathbf{x}_m) & , \text{ if } s_n - y_n < -\epsilon \\ 0 & , \text{ if } -\epsilon \leq s_n - y_n \leq \epsilon \\ 2(s_n - y_n - \epsilon)K(\mathbf{x}_n, \mathbf{x}_m) & , \text{ if } \epsilon < s_n - y_n \end{cases} \end{aligned}$$

7.

Denote x_1, x_2 are the values we sample from random variable $X \stackrel{\text{i.i.d}}{\sim} U(0, 1)$

Given any two points on 2D space, we can always obtain a **straight line** passing through both point to minimize the mean squared error by the linear regression hypothesis $h(x) = w_1x + w_0$.

$$w_1x_1 + w_0 = x_1^2 \quad (7.1)$$

$$w_1x_2 + w_0 = x_2^2 \quad (7.2)$$

$$\begin{aligned} (7.1) - (7.2) &\Rightarrow w_1(x_1 - x_2) = (x_1^2 - x_2^2) = (x_1 - x_2)(x_1 + x_2) \\ &\Rightarrow w_1 = x_1 + x_2 \end{aligned} \quad (7.3)$$

$$\text{Substitute (7.3) into (7.1)} \Rightarrow (x_1 + x_2)x_1 + w_0 = x_1^2$$

$$\Rightarrow w_0 = -x_1x_2$$

\therefore For any two independent x_1, x_2

We can construct a line $h(x) = (x_1 + x_2)x - x_1x_2$

and

$$\mathcal{E}[X] = \frac{0+1}{2} = 0.5$$

$$\therefore \bar{g}(x) = (0.5 + 0.5)x - 0.5 * 0.5 = x - 0.25$$

8.

For any \tilde{y}_n in $\{\tilde{y}_n\}_{n=1}^{\tilde{N}}$

Let

$$h_0(\mathbf{x}) = 0, \text{ for any } \mathbf{x}$$

and

$$h_n(\mathbf{x}) = \begin{cases} 1, & \text{if } \mathbf{x} = \tilde{\mathbf{x}}_n \\ 0, & \text{else} \end{cases}$$

We can obtain

$$\begin{aligned} r_z &= \text{RMSE}(h_0) \\ &= \sqrt{\frac{1}{\tilde{N}} \sum_{m=1}^{\tilde{N}} (\tilde{y}_m - h_0(\tilde{\mathbf{x}}_m))^2} \\ &= \sqrt{\frac{1}{\tilde{N}} \sum_{m=1}^{\tilde{N}} \tilde{y}_m^2} \end{aligned} \tag{8.1}$$

and

$$\begin{aligned} r_n &= \text{RMSE}(h_n) \\ &= \sqrt{\frac{1}{\tilde{N}} \sum_{m=1}^{\tilde{N}} (\tilde{y}_m - h_n(\tilde{\mathbf{x}}_m))^2} \\ &= \sqrt{\frac{1}{\tilde{N}} \sum_{m \neq n} \tilde{y}_m^2 + (\tilde{y}_n - 1)^2} \\ &= \sqrt{\frac{1}{\tilde{N}} \sum_{m=1}^{\tilde{N}} \tilde{y}_m^2 - 2\tilde{y}_n + 1} \end{aligned}$$

Then we can subtract r_z^2 by r_n^2 to obtain

$$\begin{aligned} r_z^2 - r_n^2 &= \frac{1}{\tilde{N}} \left(\sum_{m=1}^{\tilde{N}} \tilde{y}_m^2 - \left(\sum_{m=1}^{\tilde{N}} \tilde{y}_m^2 - 2\tilde{y}_n + 1 \right) \right) \\ &= \frac{1}{\tilde{N}} (2\tilde{y}_n - 1) \end{aligned}$$

After that

$$\tilde{y}_n = \frac{\tilde{N}(r_z^2 - r_n^2) + 1}{2} \tag{8.2}$$

Therefore, if we have r_z and $\{r_n\}_{n=1}^{\tilde{N}}$, we can obtain all \tilde{y}_n by (8.2).

As a consequence, if $T = \tilde{N} + 1$, we can construct a

$$g(\mathbf{x}) = \begin{cases} \tilde{y}_n, & \text{if } \mathbf{x} = \tilde{\mathbf{x}}_n \\ \text{something}, & \text{else} \end{cases}$$

with $\text{RMSE}(g) = 0$

9.

Given any hypothesis g

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbf{g} &= (g(\tilde{\mathbf{x}}_1), g(\tilde{\mathbf{x}}_2), \dots, g(\tilde{\mathbf{x}}_{\tilde{N}})) \\ \tilde{\mathbf{y}} &= (\tilde{y}_1, \tilde{y}_2, \dots, \tilde{y}_{\tilde{N}}) \end{aligned}$$

Denote

$$\begin{aligned} r_g &= \text{RMSE}(g) \\ &= \sqrt{\frac{1}{\tilde{N}} \sum_{n=1}^{\tilde{N}} (\tilde{y}_n - g(\tilde{\mathbf{x}}_n))^2} \\ &= \sqrt{\frac{1}{\tilde{N}} \sum_{n=1}^{\tilde{N}} (\tilde{y}_n^2 - 2\tilde{y}_n g(\tilde{\mathbf{x}}_n) + g(\tilde{\mathbf{x}}_n)^2)} \\ &= \sqrt{\frac{1}{\tilde{N}} \left(\sum_{n=1}^{\tilde{N}} \tilde{y}_n^2 - 2 \sum_{n=1}^{\tilde{N}} \tilde{y}_n g(\tilde{\mathbf{x}}_n) + \sum_{n=1}^{\tilde{N}} g(\tilde{\mathbf{x}}_n)^2 \right)} \\ &= \sqrt{\frac{1}{\tilde{N}} \left(\sum_{n=1}^{\tilde{N}} \tilde{y}_n^2 - 2\mathbf{g}^T \tilde{\mathbf{y}} + \mathbf{g}^T \mathbf{g} \right)} \\ &\quad \text{By (8.2), } \sum_{n=1}^{\tilde{N}} \tilde{y}_n^2 = \tilde{N} r_z^2 \\ &= \sqrt{\frac{1}{\tilde{N}} (\tilde{N} r_z^2 - 2\mathbf{g}^T \tilde{\mathbf{y}} + \mathbf{g}^T \mathbf{g})} \end{aligned}$$

Then, we can obtain

$$\mathbf{g}^T \tilde{\mathbf{y}} = \frac{\tilde{N}(r_z^2 - r_g^2) + \mathbf{g}^T \mathbf{g}}{2}$$

Therefore, we only need $\text{RMSE}(h_0)$ and $\text{RMSE}(g)$ to calculate $\mathbf{g}^T \tilde{\mathbf{y}}$, i.e. we only need 2 queries.

10.

Denote that

$$\begin{aligned} \boldsymbol{\alpha} &= [\alpha_1 \quad \alpha_2 \quad \dots \quad \alpha_K]^T \\ G &= \begin{bmatrix} g_1(\tilde{\mathbf{x}}_1) & g_2(\tilde{\mathbf{x}}_1) & \dots & g_K(\tilde{\mathbf{x}}_1) \\ g_1(\tilde{\mathbf{x}}_2) & g_2(\tilde{\mathbf{x}}_2) & \dots & g_K(\tilde{\mathbf{x}}_2) \\ \vdots & \vdots & \vdots & \vdots \\ g_1(\tilde{\mathbf{x}}_{\tilde{N}}) & g_2(\tilde{\mathbf{x}}_{\tilde{N}}) & \dots & g_K(\tilde{\mathbf{x}}_{\tilde{N}}) \end{bmatrix}_{\tilde{N} \times K} \end{aligned}$$

The goal is to

$$\begin{aligned}
\min_{\boldsymbol{\alpha}} \text{RMSE} \left(\sum_{k=1}^K \alpha_k g_k \right) &= \min_{\boldsymbol{\alpha}} \sqrt{\frac{1}{\tilde{N}} \sum_{n=1}^{\tilde{N}} \left(\tilde{y}_n - \sum_{k=1}^K \alpha_k g_k(\tilde{\mathbf{x}}_n) \right)^2} \\
&= \min_{\boldsymbol{\alpha}} \sum_{n=1}^{\tilde{N}} \left(\tilde{y}_n - \sum_{k=1}^K \alpha_k g_k(\tilde{\mathbf{x}}_n) \right)^2 \\
&= \min_{\boldsymbol{\alpha}} \sum_{n=1}^{\tilde{N}} \left(\tilde{y}_n^2 - 2\tilde{y}_n \sum_{k=1}^K \alpha_k g_k(\tilde{\mathbf{x}}_n) + \left(\sum_{k=1}^K \alpha_k g_k(\tilde{\mathbf{x}}_n) \right)^2 \right) \\
&= \min_{\boldsymbol{\alpha}} \sum_{n=1}^{\tilde{N}} \tilde{y}_n^2 - 2 \sum_{n=1}^{\tilde{N}} \tilde{y}_n \sum_{k=1}^K \alpha_k g_k(\tilde{\mathbf{x}}_n) + \sum_{n=1}^{\tilde{N}} \left(\sum_{k=1}^K \alpha_k g_k(\tilde{\mathbf{x}}_n) \right)^2 \\
&= \min_{\boldsymbol{\alpha}} \tilde{N} r_z^2 - 2 \tilde{\mathbf{y}}^T G \boldsymbol{\alpha} + \boldsymbol{\alpha}^T G^T G \boldsymbol{\alpha}
\end{aligned}$$

Let

$$\begin{aligned}
E(\boldsymbol{\alpha}) &= \tilde{N} r_z^2 - 2 \tilde{\mathbf{y}}^T G \boldsymbol{\alpha} + \boldsymbol{\alpha}^T G^T G \boldsymbol{\alpha} \\
\nabla E(\boldsymbol{\alpha}) &= 2 (G^T G \boldsymbol{\alpha} - \tilde{\mathbf{y}}^T G)
\end{aligned}$$

We want $\nabla E(\boldsymbol{\alpha}) = 0$

$$\boldsymbol{\alpha} = (G^T G)^{-1} \tilde{\mathbf{y}}^T G$$

that minimize $E(\boldsymbol{\alpha})$

and

$$\tilde{\mathbf{y}}^T G = \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{g}_1^T \tilde{\mathbf{y}} \\ \mathbf{g}_2^T \tilde{\mathbf{y}} \\ \vdots \\ \mathbf{g}_K^T \tilde{\mathbf{y}} \end{bmatrix}$$

For each $\{\mathbf{g}_k^T \tilde{\mathbf{y}}\}_{k=1}^K$, we need $\text{RMSE}(h_0)$ and $\text{RMSE}(\mathbf{g}_k)$ as **Q.9**.

Therefore, we need $K + 1$ queries to solve $\boldsymbol{\alpha}$.

11.

E_{in}

$\gamma \setminus \lambda$	0.001	1	1000
32	0	0	0
2	0	0	0
0.125	0	0.03	0.2425

The minimum $E_{\text{in}}(g)$ is 0, and occurred at $\gamma = 32$, $\gamma = 2$, and $\gamma = 0.125 \wedge \lambda = 0.001$.



12.

E_{out}

$\gamma \setminus \lambda$	0.001	1	1000
32	0.45	0.45	0.45
2	0.44	0.44	0.44
0.125	0.46	0.45	0.39

The minimum $E_{\text{out}}(g)$ is 0.39, and occurred at $\gamma = 0.125 \wedge \lambda = 1000$.

13.

In Q.13 and Q.14, I use `sklearn.svm.SVR` to train support vector regression model.

E_{in}

$\gamma \setminus C$	0.001	1	1000
32	0.4	0	0
2	0.4	0	0
0.125	0.4	0.035	0

The minimum $E_{\text{in}}(g)$ is 0, and occurred at $C = 1000$, and $C = 1 \wedge (\gamma = 32 \vee \gamma = 2)$.

14.

E_{out}

$\gamma \setminus C$	0.001	1	1000
32	0.48	0.48	0.48
2	0.48	0.48	0.48
0.125	0.48	0.42	0.47

The minimum $E_{\text{out}}(g)$ is 0.42, and occurred at $\gamma = 0.125 \wedge C = 1$.

15.

I iterate 300 times for bagging.

E_{in}

λ	0.01	0.1	1	10	100
E_{in}	0.32	0.3175	0.3175	0.315	0.31

The minimum $E_{\text{in}}(g)$ is 0.31, and occurred at $\lambda = 100$.



16.

E_{out}

λ	0.01	0.1	1	10	100
E_{out}	0.36	0.36	0.36	0.36	0.4

The minimum $E_{\text{out}}(g)$ is 0.36, and occurred at $\lambda = 0.01 \vee 0.1 \vee 1 \vee 10$.