



## **DECISION**

**Complaint No.** : POS/379/2025/Adv-H

**Name and address of the complainant** : Mst. Iram Shahbaz, R/o. Plot No.GR-1-1-A-101, Upper Gizri, Defence, Karachi.

**Name of the Agency Complained against** : Board of Intermediate Education, Karachi.

**Name & Designation of Investigating Officer** : Rehana Ghulam Ali Memon,  
Advisor (H)

**Vetted by** :

**Subject** :

**COMPLAINT REGARDING ALLEGED  
MALPRACTICES OF THE BOARD AUTHORITIES  
AND AWARD OF LESS MARKS TO  
DAUGHTERS OF THE COMPLAINANT BESIDE NON-  
ACCEPTANCE OF SCRUTINY FORMS.**

### **COMPLAINT**

Mst. Irum Shahbaz filed a complaint on 27.01.2025, leveling allegations against the officials of the Board of Intermediate Education, Karachi (BIEK) about demanding illegal gratification for correction of first year (Pre-Medical) 2023 results of her daughters namely Eliya Fatima Zehra and Aliya Mehdi. On receiving no positive response, her daughters had again appeared in Examination Session of 2024 for Part-I & II. However, the results remained the same as they did not clear all the subjects. The complainant informed that she approached the Board authorities including Chairman of the Board, time and again for correction of the results but did not receive any positive response. She, therefore, sought intervention of this Institution and requested to direct the Board to issue correct marks sheets of both her daughters and instead of being declared absent in Urdu Normal, her daughters namely Eliya Fatima Zehra and Aliya Mehdi, may be declared pass as both appeared in Sindhi Normal instead of Urdu Normal.

### **PROCEEDINGS**

2. The complaint was admitted on 27.01.2025 under Section 10 of the Establishment of Office of the Ombudsman Sindh for the Province of Sindh Act, 1991 (amended up to date), by condoning delay under Section 10(3) of the Act, subject to submission of Affidavit on Form 'A'.

3. The matter was taken up with the Board. Notices dated 21.02.2025 issued to the parties. Multiple hearings were held on 27.02.2025, 14.03.2025, 18.03.2025 and 25.03.2025. The Deputy Director (Legal), Board of Intermediate Education, Karachi, appeared and submitted a report on 27.02.2025, denying the allegations leveled by the complainant and contended that in fact the complainant lady was demanding undue favour for her daughters. Both the daughters of the complainant appeared in the exams of first year held in 2023 and cleared only three papers with aggregate marks and were declared fail in three papers namely Chemistry, Physics and Biology, even after getting the grace marks and appeared in examinations 2024 as indicated in para-1, hence the result of 2023 of Part-I has become invalid.

4. Both the daughters of the complainant lady had attempted the Sindhi paper HSC Part-II, disregarding the written guidelines and criteria mentioned on the examination forms duly filled by them. On the basis of their admit cards they were required to appear in Urdu Normal. The representative of the Board further clarified that the system automatically picks up the papers, following the schemes of 1<sup>st</sup> year papers. He clarified that Sindhi paper

is offered to those students who have passed their SSC (Matric) Examination with combination of Urdu Easy and Sindhi Normal. In the instant case both the girls took Urdu Normal and Sindhi Salees in SSC Examinations. Thus, the complainant's daughters were required to attempt Urdu Normal. Hence, they have no option but to appear in upcoming examination of 2025 for clearing HSC Part-II. It was informed by the Board's Focal Person that the papers in which the sisters failed, were rechecked by independent Senior Professors who did not find any discrepancy in earlier results. He showed the assessment of professors attached with the papers.

5. It was inquired from both the candidates as to why they choose to attempt Sindhi Normal in lieu of Urdu Normal, as per scheme of papers / studies while disregarding of their earlier selection in SSC Examinations, they replied that they were pursued by the Principal to appear in Sindhi and get rectified the scheme of paper later on from the Board.

6. Clarification was sought from the Principal who denied that both the girls had ever approached her. She informed that both the students were known to her due to their extra curricular activities and she never found them good in studies. She added that Admit Cards are usually received two days prior to exams and if the candidates had approached her, she would have guided them properly.

7. During the hearing held on 18.03.2025, original answer sheets of the candidates were shown to the complainant as well as to her daughters. It was observed that both the candidates did not secure the passing marks. The complainant's daughter Ms. Eliya Fatima Zehra was not satisfied with marking of English Paper-I and pointed out alleged mistake of one mark in totaling of the marks in Physics Part-II, whereupon, the focal person informed that as per scrutiny rules, the scrutiny does not mean reassessment of answer(s) and is confined to ascertain whether any answer has been left unmarked. In this case, they had not applied for scrutiny therefore nothing can be done at this belated stage. The daughters of the complainant desired to see all the papers, which was immediately declined by the Focal Person of the Board, arguing that according to the ruling passed by the Honourable Supreme Court of Pakistan in Constitutional Petitions, Answer Sheets are not liable to be shown to the candidates. He furnished the copies of reported judgments. The Board did however show the Answer Sheets assessed by the Senior Professors for satisfaction of the candidates. Moreover, it also surfaced that the candidates have not requested for scrutiny of papers of Part-II, rather they approached this forum belatedly.

8. Clarifying the question as to how the candidates were allowed to appear in Sindhi paper against the admit card issued for Urdu Normal, the representative of the Board replied that it was the responsibility of the Superintendent of Examination Centre to check all such details and handle the situation.

## FINDINGS

9. Arguments heard. Documents perused. On thorough examination of all of the relevant documents I conclude as follows:

- (i) It is the prime responsibility of the students to keep himself / herself aware about the scheme of papers / studies and follow the Board's Policy and examination rules, as constantly outlined in the examination forms and Admit Cards.
- (ii) If a candidate selected a scheme of papers / studies in SSC (Matric) examinations, he has to follow such compulsory papers in first and second year of HSC. In HSC examinations, one is at liberty to opt for any optional papers but can not deviate from major subjects i.e. the compulsory papers as per scheme by the Board.

(03)

Case No.POS/379/2025/Adv-H

- (iii) The papers in which student is required to appear in 2<sup>nd</sup> year examination of HSC, is continuation of the scheme of papers in which one had appeared in previous year i.e. first year. Both the daughters of the complainant failed to appear for the Urdu Normal exam, as per scheme of papers and Admit Cards, and were, therefore lawfully declared absent.
- (iv) A candidate can not be permitted or allowed to appear in a paper on his own will or advice of any person, in disregard of subject, referred in admit cards. One can rectify any error in respect of his name and relevant credentials, but it does not enlarge any scope in respect of changing in selected papers.

### DECISION

10. In view of the above and in exercise of powers vested in me under Section-11 of Establishment of Office of the Ombudsman for the Province of Sindh Act, 1991 (amended upto date), I hereby dispose of the complaint, as the findings indicate no maladministration on the part of the agency.

*Given under my hand and seal of office.*

Sd /-  
Muhammad Sohail Rajput  
Sitara-e-Imtiaz, PAS  
Ombudsman Sindh

Karachi, dated 14<sup>th</sup> April, 2025

