

# Math 521 HW 7

Morgan Gribbins

**Exercise 2.4.7.** Let  $(a_n)$  be a bounded sequence.

**2.4.7.a.** Prove that the sequence defined by  $y_n = \sup\{a_k : k \geq n\}$ .

Each  $y_n$  has the property that  $y_n \geq a_k$  for  $k \geq n$ . Additionally, for all  $k \in \mathbb{N}$ ,  $|a_n| \leq M$  for some  $M$ . All  $|y_n|$  are then less than or equal to  $M$ , so this sequence is also bounded. For this sequence to converge by the Monotonous Convergence Theorem, it must then be monotonous. We would like to show that  $y_n \geq y_{n+1}$  i.e.  $\sup\{a_k : k \geq n\} \geq \sup\{a_k : k \geq n+1\}$ .  $y_n$  is greater than all  $a_k$ ,  $k \geq n$ , and  $y_{n+1}$  is greater than all  $a_k$ ,  $k \geq n+1$ , yet  $y_n$  is greater than or equal to all elements that  $y_{n+1}$  is greater than or equal to, so  $y_n \geq y_{n+1}$ . Because this sequence is bounded and monotone,  $\lim y_n$  exists.

**2.4.7.b.** The limit superior of  $(a_n)$ , or  $\limsup a_n$  is defined by

$$\limsup a_n = \lim y_n,$$

where  $y_n$  is the sequence from part (a) of this exercise. Provide a reasonable definition for  $\liminf a_n$  and briefly explain why it always exists for any bounded sequence.

Define  $x_n = \inf\{a_k : k \geq n\}$ . The limit inferior of  $(a_n)$  is then defined by

$$\liminf a_n = \lim x_n.$$

For a bounded sequence,  $x_n$  is then also bounded as every  $|x_n| \leq |a_k| \leq M$  (for some  $M$ ) for all  $n$  and  $k \geq n$ . This sequence is also increasing (and necessarily convergent) as  $\forall n \in \mathbb{N}$ ,  $x_n \leq x_{n+1}$ , as  $x_n = \inf\{a_k : k \geq n\} \leq \inf\{a_k : k \geq n+1\} = x_{n+1}$ . Therefore this sequence is convergent.

**2.4.7.c.** Prove that  $\liminf a_n \leq \limsup a_n$ , for every bounded sequence, and give an example of a sequence for which the inequality is strict.

For a bounded set, the limit superior and limit inferior both converge. To prove that the limit inferior is less than or equal to the limit superior, we will take an arbitrary  $n$  and compare  $y_n = \sup\{a_k : k \geq n\}$  and  $x_n = \inf\{a_k : k \geq n\}$ . As  $y_n \geq a_k \geq x_n$  for all  $k \geq n$ , then for all  $n$ ,  $y_n \geq x_n$ , so by the Order Limit Theorem,  $\liminf a_n \leq \limsup a_n$ .

This inequality is strict in the case where  $a_n = (-1)^n$ , as  $\liminf a_n = -1 < \limsup a_n = 1$ .

**2.4.7.d.** Show that  $\liminf a_n = \limsup a_n$  if and only if  $\lim a_n$  exists. In this case, all three share the same value.

Proof of ( $\implies$ ). Assume that  $\lim a_n = a$  exists. This implies that  $a_n$  is bounded, and as such,  $\liminf a_n = b$  and  $\limsup a_n = c$  exist. Due to the convergence of  $\lim a_n$ , we have given  $\epsilon > 0$ , there exists  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  such that  $k \geq n$  implies

$$|a_k - a| < \epsilon.$$

As  $\inf\{a_n : n \geq k\} \leq a_k$ , we have

$$|\inf\{a_n : n \geq k\} - a| < \epsilon,$$

so  $\liminf a_n = \lim a_n$ . Using the earlier inequality, we have

$$\begin{aligned} |a_k - a| &= |a_k - \sup\{a_n : n \geq k\} + \sup\{a_n : n \geq k\} - a| \\ &\leq |a_k - \sup\{a_n : n \geq k\}| + |\sup\{a_n : n \geq k\} - a|. \end{aligned}$$

As a result of being a supremum, we have  $\exists s \in \mathbb{R}$  such that  $\sup\{a_n : n \geq k\} - s < a_k \implies \sup\{a_n : n \geq k\} - a_k < s$ , so this expression is less than  $s + |\sup\{a_n : n \geq k\} - a| < \epsilon$ , so this converges for correct choice of  $\epsilon$ , so  $\limsup a_n = \lim a_n = \liminf a_n$ .

Proof of ( $\impliedby$ ). Assume that  $\liminf a_n = \limsup a_n$ . As  $x_n \leq a_n \leq y_n$  for all  $n$ , and  $\lim x_n = \lim y_n$ ,  $\lim a_n$  exists and is equal to the other two limits by the squeeze theorem.

**Exercise 2.4.8.** For each series, find an explicit formula for the sequence of partial sums and determine if the series converges.

**2.4.8.b.**  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} 1/n(n+1).$

$$s_k = \sum_{n=1}^k 1/n(n+1) \implies s_1 = 1/2, s_2 = 2/3, s_3 = 3/4, \dots, s_k = k/k + 1.$$

The sequence  $k/k + 1$  is increasing and bounded, so this series converges.

**2.4.8.c.**  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \log\left(\frac{n+1}{n}\right).$

$$s_k = \sum_{n=1}^k \log\left(\frac{n+1}{n}\right) \implies s_1 = \log 2, s_2 = \log 3, s_3 = \log 4, \dots, s_k = \log k + 1.$$

This sequence is unbounded, so it is not convergent. The series does not converge.

**Exercise 2.5.1.** Give an example of each of the following, or argue that such a request is impossible.

**2.5.1.a.** A sequence that has a subsequence that is bounded but contains no subsequence that converges.

This is not possible, as the Bolzano-Weierstrass Theorem states that all bounded sequences have a convergent subsequence. This bounded subsequence thus has a convergent subsequence. This convergent subsequence must be a subsequence of the original sequence, so the original sequence must have a convergent subsequence.

**2.5.1.b.** A sequence that does not contain 0 or 1 as a term but contains subsequences converging to each of these values.

The subsequence  $a_n = 1/(n+1)$  (if  $n$  odd),  $1 + 1/n$  (if  $n$  even) has subsequences converging to both of these values (the even and odd subsequences) but contains neither.

**2.5.1.c.** A sequence that contains subsequences converging to every point in the infinite set  $\{1, 1/2, 1/3, 1/4, 1/5, \dots\}$ .

The sequence  $a_n = \{1, 1/2, 1, 1/2, 1/3, 1, 1/2, 1/3, 1/4, 1, \dots\}$  contains convergent subsequences to each of these elements.

**2.5.1.d.** A sequence that contains subsequences converging to every point in the infinite set  $\{1, 1/2, 1/3, 1/4, 1/5, \dots\}$ , and no subsequences converging to points outside of this set.

This is not possible, as a set with a sequence converging to  $1/n$  for all  $n$  must also converge to 0, which is not in said set.

**Exercise 2.5.6.** Use a similar strategy to the one in Example 2.5.3 to show that  $\lim b^{1/n}$  exists for all  $b \geq 0$  and find the value of the limit.

We will break this into two cases,  $b < 1$  and  $b > 1$ .

Sidenote:  $b = 0$  implies that all  $b^{1/n} = 0^{1/n} = 0$ , so this converges to 0.

Case 1,  $b < 1$ .  $b \leq b^{1/2} \leq b^{1/3} \leq \dots \leq 1$ , so this sequence is bounded and increasing, and as such, convergent. We will say that  $\lim b^{1/n} = l$ . The limit of the subsequence  $b^{1/2n} = l$ , as subsequences of convergent sequences converge to the same limit. By the Algebraic Limit Theorem, we also have  $\lim b^{1/2n} = l = \sqrt{l}$ , so  $l = 0$  or  $l = 1$ . However, as it is increasing it cannot converge to 0. Therefore,  $\lim b^{1/n} = 1$ .

Case 2,  $b > 1$ .  $b \geq b^{1/2} \geq b^{1/3} \geq \dots \geq 1$ , so this sequence is bounded and decreasing, and as such, convergent. We will say that  $\lim b^{1/n} = l$ . The limit of the subsequence  $b^{1/2n} = l$ , as subsequences of convergent sequences converge to the same limit. By the Algebraic Limit

Theorem, we also have  $\lim b^{1/2n} = l = \sqrt{l}$ , so  $l = 0$  or  $l = 1$ . However, as it is bounded below by 1, it cannot converge to 0. Therefore,  $\lim b^{1/n} = 1$ .

**HW7.1:** Let  $a_n$  be bounded and let

$$S = \{s \in \mathbb{R} : \exists \text{ a subsequence } (a_{n_k}) \text{ converging to } s\}.$$

This is called the set of subsequential limits. Bolzano-Weierstrass Theorem implies that there is at least one convergent subsequence, so  $S \neq \emptyset$ . Show  $S$  is bounded and  $\limsup a_n = \sup(S)$ .

Because  $(a_n)$  is a bounded sequence, there exists some  $M \in \mathbb{R}$  such that  $|a_n| \leq M$  for all  $n$ . If  $S$  is unbounded, then there is some  $(a_{n_k})$  such that it converges to a limit greater than all  $m \in \mathbb{R}$ , and as such cannot converge to some  $s$ . Therefore,  $S$  must be bounded. Take some arbitrary subsequence  $(a_{n_k})$ .  $\limsup a_n$  is then the limit of the sequence  $y_n = \sup\{a_k : k \geq n\}$ . Each individual  $y_n$ , (as  $n \leq n_k$ , as shown in lecture) is greater than or equal to all  $a_{n_k}$ , so by the Order Limit Theorem,  $\limsup a_n \geq \lim a_{n_k}$  for arbitrary  $(a_{n_k})$ , so  $\limsup a_n = \sup(S)$ .