Discussant Comments, "Look at What You Made Me Do: How Police Shape Politics"

Mike Sances, Temple University

MPSA
April 5, 2025

Ardoin, "Rooting Out the Enemy"

- Didn't know/remember of role of police in other countries vs US
    - Perhaps a cautionary tale of why not to centralize police
- Probably have a few papers here. Can pick apart each, so want to take 1-2 or go deeper, guard against alt explanations
- Obs data, so want to know: How are opp areas different?
    - Biggest alt expl: crime control. Murders doesn't really get at this. Maybe requests for service?
    - Maybe also look at complaints about brutality as outcome?
    - Best way to get around is to get measures pre/post election

Gelvez, "Politics of Crime Prevention"

- Again, fascinating to see as an outsider from US
    - Maybe cite Levitt (replicated 2x)?
    - Congrats on FOI appeal
- What is crime prevention? Was wondering about this until it was explained, then still after
    - I.e. not clear it's less visible than infrast as you claim; then it turns out it includes infrast
    - Maybe re-frame to be about FONSECON?
    - Surprised police is so low in Figure 1

Gelvez, "Politics of Crime Prevention"

- Love the DD plot
  - Can you get a prior period to test trends?
  - Not sure why genetic matching is needed; why not muni FE?
- Alt explanations
  - So is it support by voters, or elites making a deal to mobilize? Does it matter?
  - What is with the discontinuity in Figure 2? Why would elites target at cutoff? Seats?

Romero et al., "Police Response to Prosecutors"

- Great embedding of pros into pol sci lit on bureaucracy/CJ
  - Suggest also cite me; Goldstein on "toplash"
- Completely agree – prosecutors are *not* all powerful!
- Amazing data; desperately need to look at these interactions
  - But would like to see additional study
  - Small sample, many comparisons; some odd results (coop -> less supp of reform)
  - Diff btwn signif and insignif – is it signif?
- Experimental design
  - Is reform actually held constant? Coop could influence perception of content. E.g. how to get "buy-in"?
  - Unclear if unilateral treatment really is unilateral; just left unsaid