Summary: This is a well-elaborated report. The authors compared the performance of different classification methods using different feature extraction methods. They discovered that the performance of random walk methods seems abnormal compared to other classification methods and gave a reasonable explanation. They also tested feature extraction and classification models on Raphael dataset, for example, scattering net combined with a fully connected network, geometric tight frame combined with neural network. The strength of this report is that the experiments are comprehensive. For the Raphael part, maybe they can explain more about how a “similar” CNN to scattering net looks like.

Clarity and Quality: 5

Evaluation on technical quality: 5

I really like the analysis of the random walk part with a supporting experiment to the explanation.

Overall rating: 5

Confidence of my assessment: 2