Comment 13

In paper 13, the project is about an identification of 35 digital sketches of Raphael or forgeries provided by Prof. Yang Wang from HKUST. In order to distinguish whether 7 disputed sketches belong to Raphael, the author used several algorithms to solve this problem. In the end, the author measured their performance using MSE, and gave the corresponding prediction of sketches.

Based on features extracted by using ResNet-18 and ScatNet, the author used Logistic Regression, SVM, LDA and Random Forest to further classify the data. Result showed that ScatNet+Logistic Regression has the best performance on this problem. Eventually, probabilities of whether each of the disputed paintings belongs to Raphael were calculated using an ensembled classifier.

Strength: The author proposed several algorithms, thus it’s easier to make comparison and pick the best one. The graphs and charts vividly depict the performance as well as explaining the algorithms.

Weakness: According to the graphs, the features are not well-grouped after PCA, thus, the result could be less convincing.

Evaluation on quality of writing: 4. Pictures and charts in this paper are concise and explicit.

Evaluation on presentation: 5.

Evaluation on creativity: 3.

Confidence on your assessment: 2.