

Solutions to *Elements of Set Theory**

yunone.se@gmail.com

January 14, 2011

Contents

1	Introduction	1
2	Axioms and Operations	3
3	Relations and Functions	11
3.1	Ordered Pairs	11
3.2	Relations	12
3.3	n-ary Relations	13
3.4	Functions	14
3.5	Infinite Cartesian Products	20
3.6	Ordering Relations	25
4	Natural Numbers	30
4.1	Inductive Sets	30
4.2	Peano's Postulates	30
4.3	Recursion on ω	31
4.4	Arithmetic	33
4.5	Ordering on ω	36
4.6	Review Exercise	39
5	Construction of the Real Numbers	42
5.1	Integers	42
5.2	Rational Numbers	45

1 Introduction

Exercise 1.1. Which of the following become true when \in is inserted in place of the blank? Which become true when \subseteq is inserted?

(a) $\{\emptyset\}$ ____ $\{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\}$.

*by Herbert Enderton. I make no claim to correctness, as I'm just learning as I write these.

(b) $\{\emptyset\}$ ____ $\{\emptyset, \{\{\emptyset\}\}\}$.

(c) $\{\{\emptyset\}\}$ ____ $\{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\}$.

(d) $\{\{\emptyset\}\}$ ____ $\{\emptyset, \{\{\emptyset\}\}\}$.

(e) $\{\{\emptyset\}\}$ ____ $\{\emptyset, \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\}\}$.

Solution. Choices (a) and (d) become true when \in is inserted in place of the blank. Choices (b) and (c) become true when \subseteq is inserted in place of the blank. Choice (e) is not true in either case. \square

Exercise 1.2. Show that not two of the three sets \emptyset , $\{\emptyset\}$, and $\{\{\emptyset\}\}$ are equal to each other.

Solution. Note that $\{\emptyset\} \not\subseteq \emptyset$, and $\{\{\emptyset\}\} \not\subseteq \emptyset$. Also, $\{\{\emptyset\}\} \not\subseteq \{\emptyset\}$. Hence no two are equal. \square

Exercise 1.3. Show that if $B \subseteq C$, then $\mathcal{P}B \subseteq \mathcal{P}C$.

Solution. Suppose $A \in \mathcal{P}B$. Then $A \subseteq B$, and thus $A \subseteq C$, as containment is transitive. Hence $A \in \mathcal{P}C$. \square

Exercise 1.4. Assume that x and y are members of a set B . Show that $\{\{x\}, \{x, y\}\} \in \mathcal{P}\mathcal{P}B$.

Proof. Since x and y are members of B , it follows that $\{x\} \subseteq B$ and $\{x, y\} \subseteq B$. So $\{x\}$ and $\{x, y\} \in \mathcal{P}B$, and thus $\{\{x\}, \{x, y\}\} \subseteq \mathcal{P}B$, so $\{\{x\}, \{x, y\}\} \in \mathcal{P}\mathcal{P}B$. \square

Exercise 1.5. Define the rank of a set c to be the least α such that $c \subseteq V_\alpha$. Compute the rank of $\{\{\emptyset\}\}$. Compute the rank of $\{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}, \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\}\}$.

Solution. Observe that $V_{\alpha+1} = \mathcal{P}V_\alpha$. Taking $V_0 = A = \emptyset$, it follows that

$$V_1 = \mathcal{P}V_0 = \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\}.$$

Hence the rank of $\{\{\emptyset\}\}$ is 1. Furthermore,

$$V_2 = \mathcal{P}V_1 = \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}, \{\{\emptyset\}\}, \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\}\}.$$

Thus $\{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}, \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\}\}$ has rank 2. \square

Exercise 1.6. We have stated that $V_{\alpha+1} = A \cup \mathcal{P}V_\alpha$. Prove this at least for $\alpha < 3$.

Solution. By definition, for $\alpha = 0$,

$$V_1 = V_0 \cup \mathcal{P}V_0 = A \cup \mathcal{P}V_0.$$

For $\alpha = 1$,

$$V_2 = V_1 \cup \mathcal{P}V_1 = A \cup \mathcal{P}V_0 \cup \mathcal{P}V_1 = A \cup \mathcal{P}V_1.$$

The last equality follows from Exercise 1.3, as $V_0 \subseteq V_1$, and thus $\mathcal{P}V_0 \cup \mathcal{P}V_1 = \mathcal{P}V_1$. The case for $\alpha = 2$ follows similarly. \square

Exercise 1.7. List all the members of V_3 . List all the members of V_4 .

Solution. Without listing them, V_3 has 16 members, and V_4 has 32 members. \square

2 Axioms and Operations

Exercise 2.1. Assume that A is the set of integers divisible by 4. Similarly assume that B and C are the sets of integers divisible by 9 and 10, respectively. What is in $A \cap B \cap C$?

Solution. The set $A \cap B \cap C$ consists precisely of the numbers divisible by the least common multiple of 4, 9 and 10. That is, it is the set of all multiples of 180. \square

Exercise 2.2. Give an example of sets A and B for which $\bigcup A = \bigcup B$ but $A \neq B$.

Solution. Take $A = \{\{a\}, \{b, c\}\}$ and $B = \{\{a\}, \{b\}, \{c\}\}$. \square

Exercise 2.3. Show that every member of a set A is a subset of $\bigcup A$.

Solution. If $A = \emptyset$, then the statement is vacuously true. So suppose A is nonempty, and take some $b \in A$. Again, if b is empty, then the statement holds. So suppose b is nonempty. Then for any $t \in b$, $t \in \bigcup A$ by the Union Axiom. In other words,

$$\forall t(t \in b \Rightarrow t \in \bigcup A).$$

This is precisely the definition that $b \subseteq \bigcup A$. \square

Exercise 2.4. Show that if $A \subseteq B$, then $\bigcup A \subseteq \bigcup B$.

Solution. Recall that $x \in \bigcup A \Leftrightarrow (\exists b \in A) x \in b$. Take $x \in \bigcup A$. So by definition, there exists $b \in A$ such that $x \in b$. Since $A \subseteq B$, $b \in B$ as well. Then by definition, $x \in \bigcup B$. \square

Exercise 2.5. Assume that every member of \mathcal{A} is a subset of B . Show that $\bigcup \mathcal{A} \subseteq B$.

Solution. Take $a \in \bigcup \mathcal{A}$. So by the Union Axiom, there exists $b \in \mathcal{A}$ such that $a \in b$. By assumption, $b \subseteq B$, and thus by definition of subset, $a \in B$. \square

Exercise 2.6. (a) Show that for any set A , $\bigcup \mathcal{P}A = A$.

(b) Show that $A \subseteq \mathcal{P} \bigcup A$. Under what conditions does equality hold?

Solution. For (a), take $x \in \bigcup \mathcal{P}A$. So there exists some $b \in \mathcal{P}A$ such that $x \in b$. Since $b \in \mathcal{P}A$, $b \subseteq A$, and thus $x \in A$. Also, since $A \subseteq A$, by definition of the power set, $A \in \mathcal{P}A$. Then by Exercise 2.3, it follows that $A \subseteq \bigcup \mathcal{P}A$.

For (b), take $x \in A$. Again by Exercise 2.3, $x \subseteq \bigcup A$, so by definition of the power set, $x \in \mathcal{P} \bigcup A$. Equality holds when A has form $\{\emptyset\}$. If $A = \{\emptyset\}$, then $\bigcup A = \emptyset$, and so $\mathcal{P} \bigcup A = \{\emptyset\}$. If $A = \{a, \emptyset\}$ for some $a \in A$, then $\bigcup A = a$, and so $\mathcal{P} \bigcup A = \mathcal{P}a$, which gives all subsets of a , which may not equal A . Note that if $A = \{a, b\}$ for $a, b \in A$ and a, b nonempty, then $\bigcup A = a \cup b$, so $\mathcal{P} \bigcup A$ contains $a \cup b$, and thus equality does not hold in this case. \square

Exercise 2.7. (a) Show that for any sets A and B ,

$$\mathcal{P}A \cap \mathcal{P}B = \mathcal{P}(A \cap B).$$

(b) Show that $\mathcal{P}A \cup \mathcal{P}B \subseteq \mathcal{P}(A \cup B)$. Under what conditions does equality hold?

Solution. Take $x \in \mathcal{P}A \cap \mathcal{P}B$. Then $x \subseteq A$ and $x \subseteq B$, so in either case, $x \subseteq A \cap B$. Hence $x \in \mathcal{P}(A \cap B)$. Take $y \in \mathcal{P}(A \cap B)$. Thus $y \subseteq A \cap B$, and so $y \subseteq A$ and $y \subseteq B$, so $y \in \mathcal{P}A \cap \mathcal{P}B$.

For (b), take $x \in \mathcal{P}A \cup \mathcal{P}B$. Then $x \subseteq A$ or $x \subseteq B$, so in either case, $x \subseteq A \cup B$. Hence $x \in \mathcal{P}(A \cup B)$. Furthermore, equality holds if either A or B is a subset of the other. Without loss of generality, suppose $B \subseteq A$. If $x \subseteq A \cup B$, then $x \subseteq A$ since $A \cup B = A$. The same argument holds if $B \subseteq A$. However, suppose $B \not\subseteq A$. Consider then the case where $B = \{a, b\}$ and $A = \{a, c\}$. Then let $x = \{b, c\}$. Then $x \in \mathcal{P}(A \cup B)$, but $x \notin \mathcal{P}A \cup \mathcal{P}B$. \square

Exercise 2.8. Show that there is no set to which every singleton (that is, every set of the form $\{x\}$) belongs.

Solution. Suppose \mathcal{X} is the set of all singletons. Then $\bigcup \mathcal{X}$ is the set of all sets, which leads to Russell's paradox. \square

Exercise 2.9. Give an example of sets a and B for which $a \in B$ but $\mathcal{P}a \notin \mathcal{P}B$.

Solution. Let $a = \{\emptyset\}$ and $B = \{\{\emptyset\}\}$. Clearly $a \in B$. Then $\mathcal{P}a = \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\}$ and $\mathcal{P}B = \{\emptyset, \{\{\emptyset\}\}\}$, so $\mathcal{P}a \notin \mathcal{P}B$. \square

Exercise 2.10. Show that if $a \in B$, then $\mathcal{P}a \in \mathcal{P}\mathcal{P} \cup B$.

Solution. First, recall from Exercise 2.6 that for any set A , $A \subseteq \mathcal{P} \cup A$. So in this case, $B \subseteq \mathcal{P} \cup B$. Hence if $a \in B$, then $a \in \mathcal{P} \cup B$, that is, $a \subseteq \bigcup B$. Then observe that $\mathcal{P}a \subseteq \mathcal{P} \cup B$, by Exercise 1.3. From $\mathcal{P}a \subseteq \mathcal{P} \cup B$ it follows that $\mathcal{P}a \in \mathcal{P}\mathcal{P} \cup B$. \square

Exercise 2.11. Show that for any sets A and B ,

$$A = (A \cap B) \cup (A - B) \quad \text{and} \quad A \cup (B - A) = A \cup B$$

Solution. $A \subseteq (A \cap B) \cup (A - B)$ is obvious. Now take $x \in (A \cap B) \cup (A - B)$. If $x \in A \cap B$, then $x \in A$. If $x \in A - B$, again $x \in A$.

Since $B - A \subseteq B$, we have $A \cup (B - A) \subseteq A \cup B$ by the monotonicity properties. Take $x \in A \cup B$. If $x \in A$, then clearly $x \in A \cup (B - A)$. If $x \in B$, then by the first part of the exercise, then either $x \in A \cap B$, whence $x \in A$, or $x \in B - A$. \square

Exercise 2.12. Verify the following identity:

$$C - (A \cap B) = (C - A) \cup (C - B).$$

Solution. Take $x \in C - (A \cap B)$. Then $x \in C$, but $x \notin A \cap B$. Note that it is not the case that $x \in A$ and $x \in B$. If $x \in A$ but $x \notin B$, then $x \in C - B$. If $x \notin A$ but $x \in B$, then $x \in C - A$. Finally, if $x \notin A$ and $x \notin B$, then $x \in C - (A \cap B) = (C - A) \cup (C - B)$.

Now take $x \in (C - A) \cup (C - B)$. If $x \in C - A$, then $x \notin A$, and thus $x \notin A \cap B$. Then $x \in C - (A \cap B)$. A similar argument handles the case where $x \in C - B$. \square

Exercise 2.13. Show that if $A \subseteq B$, then $C - B \subseteq C - A$.

Solution. Recall that if $A \subseteq B$, then $-B \subseteq -A$. Take $x \in C - B$. Since $x \notin B$, then $x \in -B$, and so $x \in -A$. It follows that $x \in C - A$. \square

Exercise 2.14. Show by example that for some sets A , B , and C , the set $A - (B - C)$ is different from $(A - B) - C$.

Solution. Let $A = \{a, d, e, f\}$, $B = \{b, d, e, g\}$, and $C = \{c, e, f, g\}$. Then $B - C = \{b, d\}$, so $A - (B - C) = \{a, e, f\}$. But $A - B = \{a, f\}$, so $(A - B) - C = \{a\}$. \square

Exercise 2.15. Define the symmetric difference $A + B$ of sets A and B to be the set $(A - B) \cup (B - A)$.

(a) Show that $A \cap (B + C) = (A \cap B) + (A \cap C)$.

(b) Show that $A + (B + C) = (A + B) + C$.

Solution. First observe that in general, $A \cap (B - C) = (A \cap B) - (A \cap C)$. Hence

$$\begin{aligned} A \cap (B + C) &= A \cap [(B - C) \cup (C - B)] \\ &= [A \cap (B - C)] \cup [A \cap (C - B)] \\ &= [(A \cap B) - (A \cap C)] \cup [(A \cap C) - (A \cap B)] \\ &= (A \cap B) + (A \cap C) \end{aligned}$$

Part (b) can best be shown with a membership table. First observe that

$$\begin{aligned} A + (B + C) &= A + [(B - C) \cup (C - B)] \\ &= [A - [(B - C) \cup (C - B)]] \cup [[(B - C) \cup (C - B)] - A] \end{aligned}$$

and

$$\begin{aligned} (A + B) + C &= [(A - B) \cup (B - A)] + C \\ &= [[(A - B) \cup (B - A)] - C] \cup [C - [(A - B) \cup (B - A)]] \end{aligned}$$

From this it is easy to verify the following membership table.

A	B	C	$A+(B+C)$	$(A+B)+C$
✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
✓	✓			
✓		✓		
	✓	✓		
✓			✓	✓
	✓		✓	✓
		✓	✓	✓

□

Exercise 2.16. *Simplify:*

$$[(A \cup B \cup C) \cap (A \cup B)] - [(A \cup (B - C)) \cap A].$$

Solution. Since $(A \cup B) \subseteq (A \cup B \cup C)$, it follows that $(A \cup B \cup C) \cap (A \cup B) = (A \cup B)$. For the same reason, $(A \cup (B - C)) \cap A = A$. So the expression simplifies to $(A \cup B) - A$, which further simplifies to $B - A$. □

Exercise 2.17. *Show that the following four conditions are equivalent.*

- (a) $A \subseteq B$,
- (b) $A - B = \emptyset$,
- (c) $A \cup B = B$,
- (d) $A \cap B = A$.

Solution. If $A \subseteq B$, then there is no element in A that is not also in B , hence $A - B = \emptyset$. Also, if $A - B = \emptyset$, then if there is any $x \in A$, then $x \in B$ as well. So (a) and (b) are equivalent. Also (a) is clearly equivalent to both (c) and (d). □

Exercise 2.18. *Assume that A and B are subsets of S . List all of the different sets that can be made from these three by use of the binary operations \cup , \cap , and $-$.*

Solution. A few that spring to mind are $A, B, S, A \cup B, A \cap B, A - B, B - A, S - A, S - B, S - (A \cup B), S - (A \cap B), S - (A - B), S - (B - A), S - S = \emptyset$. □

Exercise 2.19. *Is $\mathcal{P}(A - B)$ always equal to $\mathcal{P}A - \mathcal{P}B$? Is it ever equal to $\mathcal{P}A - \mathcal{P}B$?*

Solution. Recall that \emptyset is in the power set of any set. So $\emptyset \in \mathcal{P}(A - B)$, as well as $\mathcal{P}B$. It follows that $\emptyset \notin \mathcal{P}A - \mathcal{P}B$, and thus the two will never be equal. □

Exercise 2.20. *Let A, B , and C be sets such that $A \cup B = A \cup C$ and $A \cap B = A \cap C$. Show that $B = C$.*

Solution. Take $x \in B$. There are two subcases. If $x \in A$, then $x \in A \cap B$, and thus $x \in A \cap C$, so $x \in C$. If $x \notin A$, then $x \in A \cup B$ regardless, so $x \in A \cup C$, from which it follows that $x \in C$. In either case, $x \in C$, so $B \subseteq C$. A symmetric argument shows that $C \subseteq B$, and so $B = C$. \square

Exercise 2.21. Show that $\bigcup(A \cup B) = \bigcup A \cup \bigcup B$.

Solution. Take $x \in \bigcup(A \cup B)$. Hence $\exists y \in (A \cup B)$ such that $x \in y$. Now $y \in A$ or $y \in B$, and so $x \in \bigcup A$ or $x \in \bigcup B$. In either case, $x \in \bigcup A \cup \bigcup B$.

Take $x \in \bigcup A \cup \bigcup B$. If $x \in \bigcup A$, then $\exists y \in A$ such that $x \in y$. Since $y \in A \cup B$, $x \in \bigcup(A \cup B)$ as well. A similar argument handles the case where $x \in \bigcup B$. \square

Exercise 2.22. Show that if A and B are nonempty sets, then $\bigcap(A \cup B) = \bigcap A \cap \bigcap B$.

Solution. Take $x \in \bigcap(A \cup B)$. So for all $y \in A \cup B$, $x \in y$. In particular, for all $a \in A$, $x \in a$, so $x \in \bigcap A$, and for all $b \in B$, $x \in b$, so $x \in \bigcap B$.

Now take $x \in \bigcap A \cap \bigcap B$. So $x \in \bigcap A$ and $x \in \bigcap B$. Then for any $c \in A \cup B$, $c \in A$ or $c \in B$. It follows that $x \in c$. Hence $x \in \bigcap(A \cup B)$. \square

Exercise 2.23. Show that if \mathcal{B} is nonempty, then $A \cup \bigcap \mathcal{B} = \bigcap \{A \cup X \mid X \in \mathcal{B}\}$.

Solution. First observe that for any $X \in \mathcal{B}$, $\bigcap \mathcal{B} \subseteq X$. Hence $A \cup \bigcap \mathcal{B} \subseteq A \cup X$ for all $X \in \mathcal{B}$, and thus $A \cup \bigcap \mathcal{B} \subseteq \bigcap \{A \cup X \mid X \in \mathcal{B}\}$. For the reverse containment, if $x \in \bigcap \{A \cup X \mid X \in \mathcal{B}\}$, then $x \subseteq X$ for all X , and thus $x \subseteq \bigcap \mathcal{B}$. Hence $x \in \mathcal{P} \bigcap \mathcal{B}$.

Now take any $x \in \bigcap \{A \cup X \mid X \in \mathcal{B}\}$. So $x \in A \cup X$ for all $X \in \mathcal{B}$. If $x \in A$, the containment holds. Otherwise, if $x \notin A$, we must have $x \in X$ for all $X \in \mathcal{B}$, that is, $x \in \bigcap \mathcal{B}$, and the equality follows. \square

Exercise 2.24. (a) Show that if \mathcal{A} is nonempty, then $\mathcal{P} \bigcap \mathcal{A} = \bigcap \{\mathcal{P}X \mid X \in \mathcal{A}\}$.

(b) Show that

$$\bigcup \{\mathcal{P}X \mid X \in \mathcal{A}\} \subseteq \mathcal{P} \bigcup \mathcal{A}.$$

Under what conditions does equality hold?

Solution. Take $x \in \mathcal{P} \bigcup \mathcal{A}$. So $x \subseteq \bigcup \mathcal{A}$. But observe that for any $X \in \mathcal{A}$, $\bigcap \mathcal{A} \subseteq X$, and so $x \subseteq X$. That is, $x \in \mathcal{P}X$, so $x \in \bigcap \{\mathcal{P}X \mid X \in \mathcal{A}\}$.

For (b), take $x \in \bigcup \{\mathcal{P}X \mid X \in \mathcal{A}\}$. So $x \in \mathcal{P}X$ for some $X \in \mathcal{A}$. It follows that $x \subseteq X$, but $X \subseteq \bigcup \mathcal{A}$, so $x \subseteq \bigcup \mathcal{A}$, so $x \in \mathcal{P} \bigcup \mathcal{A}$. Now take $x \in \mathcal{P} \bigcup \mathcal{A}$. So $x \subseteq \bigcup \mathcal{A}$. In order for $x \in \bigcup \{\mathcal{P}X \mid X \in \mathcal{A}\}$, one needs $x \subseteq X$. If $\bigcup \mathcal{A} \subseteq X$ for some $X \in \mathcal{A}$, then equality will hold. \square

Exercise 2.25. Is $A \cup \bigcup \mathcal{B}$ always the same as $\bigcup \{A \cup X \mid X \in \mathcal{B}\}$? If not, then under what conditions does equality hold?

Solution. Yes, they are always the same. Take $x \in A \cup \bigcup \mathcal{B}$. If $x \in A$, then $x \in A \cup X$ for all $X \in \mathcal{B}$, so $x \in \bigcup \{A \cup X \mid X \in \mathcal{B}\}$. If $x \in \bigcup \mathcal{B}$, then $x \in X$ for some $X \in \mathcal{B}$, and thus $x \in A \cup X$ for that particular X .

If $x \in \bigcup \{A \cup X \mid X \in \mathcal{B}\}$, then $x \in A \cup X$ for some $X \in \mathcal{B}$. If $x \in A$ we are done. If $x \notin A$, then we must have $x \in X$ for some $X \in \mathcal{B}$, and thus $x \in \bigcup \mathcal{B}$. \square

Exercise 2.26. Consider the following sets: $A = \{3, 4\}$, $B = \{4, 3\} \cup \emptyset$, $C = \{4, 3\} \cup \{\emptyset\}$, $D = \{x \mid x^2 - 7x + 12 = 0\}$, $E = \{\emptyset, 3, 4\}$, $F = \{4, 4, 3\}$, $G = \{4, \emptyset, \emptyset, 3\}$. For each pair of sets specify whether or not the sets are equal.

Solution. First, simplify the sets. We have $A = \{3, 4\}$, $B = \{3, 4\}$, $C = \{3, 4, \emptyset\}$, $D = \{3, 4\}$, $E = \{\emptyset, 3, 4\}$, $F = \{3, 4\}$, $G = \{4, \emptyset, 3\}$. From this, it is clear which sets are equal and which are not. \square

Exercise 2.27. Give an example of sets A and B for which $A \cap B$ is nonempty and

$$\bigcap A \cap \bigcap B \neq \bigcap (A \cap B).$$

Solution. Take $A = \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\}$ and $B = \{\{\emptyset\}\}$. Then $A \cap B = \{\{\emptyset\}\}$. But $\bigcap A = \emptyset$, so $\bigcap A \cap \bigcap B = \emptyset$. However, $\bigcap (A \cap B) = \bigcap \{\{\emptyset\}\} = \{\emptyset\}$. \square

Exercise 2.28. Simplify:

$$\bigcup \{\{3, 4\}, \{\{3\}, \{4\}\}, \{3, \{4\}\}, \{\{3\}, 4\}\}.$$

Solution.

$$\begin{aligned} \bigcup \{\{3, 4\}, \{\{3\}, \{4\}\}, \{3, \{4\}\}, \{\{3\}, 4\}\} &= \{3, 4, \{3\}, \{4\}, 3, \{4\}, \{3\}, 4\} \\ &= \{3, 4, \{3\}, \{4\}\} \end{aligned}$$

\square

Exercise 2.29. Simplify:

$$(a) \bigcap \{\mathcal{P}\mathcal{P}\mathcal{P}\emptyset, \mathcal{P}\mathcal{P}\emptyset, \mathcal{P}\emptyset, \emptyset\}.$$

$$(b) \bigcap \{\mathcal{P}\mathcal{P}\mathcal{P}\{\emptyset\}, \mathcal{P}\mathcal{P}\{\emptyset\}, \mathcal{P}\{\emptyset\}\}.$$

Solution. For (a), since \emptyset is included in the family, any member of the intersection must be a member of \emptyset , which gives $\bigcap \{\mathcal{P}\mathcal{P}\mathcal{P}\emptyset, \mathcal{P}\mathcal{P}\emptyset, \mathcal{P}\emptyset, \emptyset\} = \emptyset$.

For (b), observe that $\mathcal{P}\{\emptyset\}$ is a subset of both $\mathcal{P}\mathcal{P}\mathcal{P}\{\emptyset\}$ and $\mathcal{P}\mathcal{P}\{\emptyset\}$, and hence $\bigcap \{\mathcal{P}\mathcal{P}\mathcal{P}\{\emptyset\}, \mathcal{P}\mathcal{P}\{\emptyset\}, \mathcal{P}\{\emptyset\}\} = \mathcal{P}\{\emptyset\}$. \square

Exercise 2.30. Let A be the set $\{\{\emptyset\}, \{\{\emptyset\}\}\}$. Evaluate the following:

$$(a) \mathcal{P}A,$$

$$(b) \bigcup A,$$

$$(c) \mathcal{P} \bigcup A,$$

$$(d) \bigcup \mathcal{P}A.$$

Solution. Indeed,

$$(a) \mathcal{P}A = \{\emptyset, \{\{\emptyset\}\}, \{\{\{\emptyset\}\}\}, \{\{\emptyset\}, \{\{\emptyset\}\}\}\}.$$

$$(b) \bigcup A = \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\}.$$

$$(c) \mathcal{P} \bigcup A = \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}, \{\{\emptyset\}\}, \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\}\}.$$

(d) Recall that taking a union of the power set of some set essentially returns said set. Hence $\bigcup \mathcal{P}A = A$.

□

Exercise 2.31. Let B be the set $\{\{1, 2\}, \{2, 3\}, \{1, 3\}, \{\emptyset\}\}$. Evaluate the following sets.

$$(a) \bigcup B,$$

$$(b) \bigcap B,$$

$$(c) \bigcap \bigcup B,$$

$$(d) \bigcup \bigcap B.$$

Solution. Indeed,

$$(a) \bigcup B = \{1, 2, 3, \emptyset\},$$

$$(b) \bigcap B = \emptyset,$$

$$(c) \bigcap \bigcup B = \bigcap \{1, 2, 3, \emptyset\} = \{1, 2, 3, \emptyset\},$$

$$(d) \bigcup \bigcap B = \bigcup \emptyset = \emptyset.$$

□

Exercise 2.32. Let S be the set $\{\{a\}, \{a, b\}\}$. Evaluate and simplify:

$$(a) \bigcup \bigcup S,$$

$$(b) \bigcap \bigcap S,$$

$$(c) \bigcap \bigcup S \cup (\bigcup \bigcup S - \bigcup \bigcap S).$$

Solution. First, $\bigcup \bigcup S = \bigcup \{a, b\} = a \cup b$, and $\bigcap \bigcap S = \bigcap \{a\} = a$. For (c), first note $\bigcap \bigcup S = a \cap b$ and $\bigcup \bigcap S = a$. Thus $\bigcap \bigcup S \cup (\bigcup \bigcup S - \bigcup \bigcap S) = (a \cap b) \cup (a \cup b - a) = (a \cap b) \cup (b - a) = b$. □

Exercise 2.33. With S as in the preceding exercise, evaluate $\bigcup(\bigcup S - \bigcap S)$ when $a \neq b$ and when $a = b$.

Solution. Suppose $a \neq b$. Then $\bigcup S = \{a, b\}$ and $\bigcap S = \{a\}$, so

$$\bigcup(\bigcup S - \bigcap S) = \bigcup(\{a, b\} - \{a\}) = \bigcup(\{b\}) = b.$$

If $a = b$, then $S = \{\{a\}\} = \{\{b\}\}$. In either case, $\bigcup S - \bigcap S = \emptyset$, so $\bigcup(\bigcup S - \bigcap S) = \bigcup \emptyset = \emptyset$. \square

Exercise 2.34. Show that $\{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\} \in \mathcal{P}\mathcal{P}\mathcal{P}S$ for every set S .

Solution. Let S be any set. Since $\emptyset \subseteq S$, we have $\emptyset \in \mathcal{P}S$. It follows that $\{\emptyset\} \subseteq \mathcal{P}S$, and since clearly $\emptyset \subseteq \mathcal{P}S$, we have $\emptyset, \{\emptyset\} \in \mathcal{P}\mathcal{P}S$. Hence $\{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\} \subseteq \mathcal{P}\mathcal{P}S$ so $\{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\} \in \mathcal{P}\mathcal{P}\mathcal{P}S$. \square

Exercise 2.35. Assume that $\mathcal{P}A = \mathcal{P}B$. Prove that $A = B$.

Solution. Take $x \in A$. Then $\{x\} \subseteq A$, so $\{x\} \in \mathcal{P}A = \mathcal{P}B$. Thus $\{x\} \subseteq B$ or $x \in B$. So $A \subseteq B$ and a symmetric argument shows $B \subseteq A$, so $A = B$. Note this show that any set has a unique power set. \square

Exercise 2.36. Verify that for all sets the following are correct.

$$(a) A - (A \cap B) = A - B.$$

$$(b) A - (A - B) = A \cap B.$$

Solution. Take $x \in A - (A \cap B)$. Hence $x \in A$ but $x \notin B$, for if $x \in B$, then $x \in A \cap B$, a contradiction. For the other containment, note $A \cap B \subseteq B$, and so $A - (A \cap B) \supseteq A - B$.

For (b), take $x \in A - (A - B)$, so $x \in A$ but $x \notin A - B$, which implies $x \notin A$ or $x \in B$. Since $x \in A$, we must have $x \in B$, so $x \in A \cap B$. For the reverse containment, if $x \in A \cap B$, then $x \in A$, and since $x \in B$, clearly $x \notin A - B$. So $x \in A - (A - B)$. \square

Exercise 2.37. Show that for all sets the following equations hold.

$$(a) (A \cup B) - C = (A - C) \cup (B - C).$$

$$(b) A - (B - C) = (A - B) \cup (A \cap C).$$

$$(c) (A - B) - C = A - (B \cup C).$$

Solution. (a) Take $x \in (A \cup B) - C$. If $x \in A$, then $x \in A - C$. If $x \in B$, then $x \in B - C$. Conversely, if $x \in A - C$, then $x \in (A \cup B) - C$, and similarly for the case if $x \in B - C$.

(b) Take $x \in A - (B - C)$, if $x \notin B - C$, then either $x \notin B$ or $x \in C$. In the first case, $x \in A - B$, in the second, $x \in A \cap C$. Conversely, if $x \in A - B$, then $x \notin B$, so $x \notin B - C$, so $x \in A - (B - C)$. If $x \in A \cap C$, then $x \notin B - C$.

(c) If $x \in (A - B) - C$, then $x \in A$, but $x \notin B$ and $x \notin C$, so $x \notin B \cup C$. Conversely, if $x \in A - (B \cup C)$, then $x \notin B$ and $x \notin C$, so $x \in A - B$ and $x \notin C$. \square

Exercise 2.38. *Prove that for all sets the following are valid.*

$$(a) \ A \subseteq C \vee B \subseteq C \Leftrightarrow A \cup B \subseteq C.$$

$$(b) \ C \subseteq A \vee C \subseteq B \Leftrightarrow C \subseteq A \cap B.$$

Solution. Assuming $A \subseteq C \vee B \subseteq C$, then for any $x \in A \cup B$, $x \in C$ if $x \in A$ or if $x \in B$. Conversely, since both A and B are subsets of $A \cup B$, we have $A \subseteq C$ and $B \subseteq C$.

Now assuming $C \subseteq A \vee C \subseteq B$, for any $x \in C$ one has $x \in A$ and $x \in B$, so $x \in A \cap B$. Conversely, $A \cap B \subseteq A$ and $A \cap B \subseteq B$, and so $C \subseteq A \vee C \subseteq B$. \square

3 Relations and Functions

3.1 Ordered Pairs

Exercise 3.1. *Suppose that we attempted to generalize the Kuratowski definitions of ordered pairs to ordered triples by defining*

$$\langle x, y, z \rangle^* = \{\{x\}, \{x, y\}, \{x, y, z\}\}.$$

Show that this definition is unsuccessful by giving examples of objects u, v, w, x, y, z with $\langle x, y, z \rangle^ = \langle u, v, w \rangle^*$ but with either $y \neq v$ or $z \neq w$ (or both).*

Solution. Take $x = 1, y = 2, z = 1$ and $u = 1, v = 2, w = 2$. Then

$$\langle x, y, z \rangle^* = \{\{1\}, \{1, 2\}, \{1, 2, 1\}\} = \{\{1\}, \{1, 2\}\}$$

and

$$\langle u, v, w \rangle^* = \{\{1\}, \{1, 2\}, \{1, 2, 2\}\} = \{\{1\}, \{1, 2\}\}$$

but $z \neq w$. \square

Exercise 3.2. (a) *Show that $A \times (B \cup C) = (A \times B) \cup (A \times C)$.*

(b) *Show that if $A \times B = A \times C$ and $A \neq \emptyset$, then $B = C$.*

Solution. Take $\langle x, y \rangle \in A \times (B \cup C)$. So $y \in B \cup C$. If $y \in B$, then $\langle x, y \rangle \in A \times B$ and if $y \in C$, then $\langle x, y \rangle \in A \times C$. Conversely, if $\langle x, y \rangle \in A \times B$, then $y \in B \cup C$, so $\langle x, y \rangle \in A \times (B \cup C)$, and similarly for if $y \in C$.

For (b), take $x \in B$, so for some $a \in A$, $\langle a, x \rangle \in A \times B$. Hence $\langle a, x \rangle = \langle a', c \rangle$ for some $a' \in A$ and $c \in C$. By Theorem 3A, $x = c$, so $x \in C$, and thus $B \subseteq C$. A symmetric argument shows $C \subseteq B$. \square

Exercise 3.3. *Show that $A \times \bigcup \mathcal{B} = \bigcup \{A \times X \mid X \in \mathcal{B}\}$.*

Solution. Take $\langle x, y \rangle \in A \times \bigcup \mathcal{B}$. So $y \in \bigcup \mathcal{B}$, and thus there exists some $X \in \mathcal{B}$ such that $y \in X$. Hence $\langle x, y \rangle \in A \times X$, and thus $\langle x, y \rangle \in \bigcup \{A \times X \mid X \in \mathcal{B}\}$. Conversely, if $\langle x, y \rangle \in A \times X$ for some $X \in \mathcal{B}$, then $y \in \bigcup \mathcal{B}$, and so $\langle x, y \rangle \in A \times \bigcup \mathcal{B}$. \square

Exercise 3.4. *Show that there is no set to which every ordered pair belongs.*

Solution. Suppose that such a set exists. So in particular, for every set X , the ordered pair $\langle X, X \rangle = \{\{X\}, \{X, X\}\} = \{\{X\}\}$ is in this set. It follows by a subset axiom that this set contains the set of all singleton sets, which, by Exercise 2.8, has been shown to not exist. Hence we reach a contradiction, so there is no set to which every ordered pair belongs. \square

Exercise 3.5. (a) Assume that A and B are given sets, and show that there exists a set C such that for any y ,

$$y \in C \Leftrightarrow y = \{x\} \times B \quad \text{for some } x \text{ in } A.$$

In other words, show that $\{\{x\} \times B \mid x \in A\}$ is a set.

(b) With A , B , and C as above, show that $A \times B = \bigcup C$.

Solution. First observe that for any $x \in A$, $\{x\} \times B \subseteq A \times B$. It follows that $\{x\} \times B \in \mathcal{P}(A \times B)$. Hence $\{\{x\} \times B \mid x \in A\} \subseteq \mathcal{P}(A \times B)$. Now since $A \times B$ is indeed a set, $\mathcal{P}(A \times B)$ is also a set, and thus by a subset axiom, we can construct

$$\{w \in \mathcal{P}(A \times B) \mid w = \{x\} \times B \text{ for some } x \in A\}.$$

More formally, the following is an axiom,

$$\forall A \forall B \forall D \exists C \forall w (w \in C \Leftrightarrow w \in D \wedge \exists a (a \in A \wedge w = \{a\} \times B)),$$

and we can instantiate with $A = A$, $B = B$, and $D = \mathcal{P}(A \times B)$.

Furthermore, $A \times B = \bigcup C$. For take $y \in A \times B$. So $y = \langle a, b \rangle$ for some $a \in A$ and $b \in B$. In particular, $y \in \{a\} \times B$, so $y \in \bigcup \{\{x\} \times B \mid x \in A\}$. Conversely, take $y \in \bigcup \{\{x\} \times B \mid x \in A\}$. So $y \in \{x\} \times B$ for some $x \in A$. But $\{x\} \times B \subseteq A \times B$, and thus $y \in A \times B$. \square

3.2 Relations

Exercise 3.6. Show that a set A is a relation iff $A \subseteq \text{dom } A \times \text{ran } A$.

Solution. Suppose that A is a relation. So by definition, A is a set of ordered pairs. If A is the empty relation, the containment holds trivially. Otherwise, take $\langle x, y \rangle \in A$. Clearly, there exists y such that $\langle x, y \rangle \in A$ so $x \in \text{dom } A$, and similarly, there exists x such that $\langle x, y \rangle \in A$, so $y \in \text{ran } A$. So $A \subseteq \text{dom } A \times \text{ran } A$.

Conversely, suppose $A \subseteq \text{dom } A \times \text{ran } A$. So A is a set of ordered pairs, and by definition, a relation. \square

Exercise 3.7. Show that if R is a relation, then $\text{fld } R = \bigcup \bigcup R$.

Solution. Take $x \in \text{fld } R$. Recall that $\text{fld } R = \text{dom } R \cup \text{ran } R$, and by Lemma 3D, $\text{dom } R \subseteq \bigcup \bigcup R$ and $\text{ran } R \subseteq \bigcup \bigcup R$, so by Exercise 2.38, $\text{fld } R \subseteq \bigcup \bigcup R$.

Conversely, take $x \in \bigcup \bigcup R$. Hence there exists some $y \in \bigcup R$ such that $x \in y$ and there exists some $z \in R$ such that $y \in z$. Now $z = \langle a, b \rangle$ for $a \in \text{dom } R$ and $b \in \text{ran } R$. If

$y = \{a\}$, then $x = a$, and so $x \in \text{dom } R$, and hence $x \in \text{fld } R$. If $y \in \{a, b\}$, then either $x = a$, whence $x \in \text{dom } R$, and hence $x \in \text{fld } R$, or $x = b$, whence $x \in \text{ran } R$, and hence $x \in \text{fld } R$. \square

Exercise 3.8. Show that for any set \mathcal{A} :

$$\text{dom } \bigcup \mathcal{A} = \bigcup \{\text{dom } R \mid R \in \mathcal{A}\},$$

$$\text{ran } \bigcup \mathcal{A} = \bigcup \{\text{ran } R \mid R \in \mathcal{A}\}.$$

Solution. Take $x \in \text{dom } \bigcup \mathcal{A}$. So $\exists y \langle x, y \rangle \in \bigcup \mathcal{A}$. Since $\langle x, y \rangle \in \bigcup \mathcal{A}$, for some $R \in \mathcal{A}$, $\langle x, y \rangle \in R$, so $x \in \text{dom } R$, and thus $x \in \bigcup \{\text{dom } R \mid R \in \mathcal{A}\}$. For some $R \in \mathcal{A}$, take $x \in \text{dom } R$, so $\exists y \langle x, y \rangle \in R$. Hence $\{\langle x, y \rangle\} \subseteq R$, but $R \subseteq \bigcup \mathcal{A}$, and so $\{\langle x, y \rangle\} \subseteq \bigcup \mathcal{A}$, so $\langle x, y \rangle \in \bigcup \mathcal{A}$, so $x \in \text{dom } \bigcup \mathcal{A}$.

The argument for the range is similar. Take $x \in \text{ran } \bigcup \mathcal{A}$. So $\exists t \langle t, x \rangle \in \bigcup \mathcal{A}$. So for some $R \in \mathcal{A}$, $\langle t, x \rangle \in R$, so $x \in \text{ran } R$. Now for any $R \in \mathcal{A}$, take $x \in R$. Hence $\exists t \langle t, x \rangle \in R$, so by the same reasoning as above, $\{\langle t, x \rangle\} \subseteq R \subseteq \bigcup \mathcal{A}$, and hence $\langle t, x \rangle \in \bigcup \mathcal{A}$, so $x \in \text{ran } \bigcup \mathcal{A}$. \square

Exercise 3.9. Discuss the result of replacing the union operation by the intersection operation in the preceding problem.

Solution. Suppose $x \in \bigcap \mathcal{A}$. So $\exists y \langle x, y \rangle \in \bigcap \mathcal{A}$, that is, $\langle x, y \rangle \in R$ for all $R \in \mathcal{A}$. Hence $x \in \bigcap \{\text{dom } R \mid R \in \mathcal{A}\}$. However, suppose $x \in \bigcap \{\text{dom } R \mid R \in \mathcal{A}\}$. All one may deduce from this is that for each $R \in \mathcal{A}$, there exists some y_R such that $\langle x, y_R \rangle \in R$, but this does not imply that there is some y such that $\langle x, y \rangle \in R$ for all $R \in \mathcal{A}$. Indeed, consider $\mathcal{A} = \{\{\langle 2, 3 \rangle\}, \{\langle 2, 5 \rangle\}\}$. So $2 \in \text{dom } R$ for all $R \in \mathcal{A}$, but there is no single element such that $\langle 2, y \rangle \in R$ for all R . So all we may conclude is that

$$\text{dom } \bigcap \mathcal{A} \subseteq \bigcap \{\text{dom } R \mid R \in \mathcal{A}\}.$$

By similar reasoning, we see that

$$\text{ran } \bigcap \mathcal{A} \subseteq \bigcap \{\text{ran } R \mid R \in \mathcal{A}\}.$$

The reverse containment does not hold, for consider the set $\mathcal{A} = \{\{\langle 2, 3 \rangle\}, \{\langle 5, 3 \rangle\}\}$. Then $3 \in \text{ran } R$ for all $R \in \mathcal{A}$, but there is no such t such that $\langle t, 3 \rangle \in \bigcap \mathcal{A}$. \square

3.3 n-ary Relations

Exercise 3.10. Show that an ordered 4-tuple is also an ordered m -tuple for every positive integer m less than 4.

Solution. First observe that by definition, $\langle x, y, z \rangle = \langle \langle x, y \rangle, z \rangle$ and so

$$\langle x, y, z \rangle = \langle \langle x, y \rangle, z \rangle = \{\{\langle x, y \rangle\}, \{\langle x, y \rangle, z\}\}.$$

So just as $\langle x, y \rangle$ is just a set, so is $\langle x, y, z \rangle$. Hence by definition

$$\langle x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4 \rangle = \langle \langle x_1, x_2, x_3 \rangle, x_4 \rangle,$$

so $\langle x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4 \rangle$ is an ordered pair, with first coordinate $\langle x_1, x_2, x_3 \rangle$ and second coordinate x_4 . Note that it is indeed ordered, since

$$\begin{aligned} \langle \langle x_1, x_2, x_3 \rangle, x_4 \rangle = \langle \langle y_1, y_2, y_3 \rangle, y_4 \rangle &\Leftrightarrow \langle x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4 \rangle = \langle y_1, y_2, y_3, y_4 \rangle \\ &\Leftrightarrow x_1 = y_1, x_2 = y_2, x_3 = y_3, x_4 = y_4 \\ &\Leftrightarrow \langle x_1, x_2, x_3 \rangle = \langle y_1, y_2, y_3 \rangle \text{ and } x_4 = y_4 \end{aligned}$$

Similarly, by definition,

$$\begin{aligned} \langle x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4 \rangle &= \langle \langle \langle x_1, x_2 \rangle, x_3 \rangle, x_4 \rangle \\ &= \langle \langle x_1, x_2 \rangle, x_3, x_4 \rangle, \end{aligned}$$

where we have applied the fact that $\langle x, y, z \rangle = \langle \langle x, y \rangle, z \rangle$, with $x = \langle x_1, x_2 \rangle$, $y = x_3$, and $z = x_4$. It follows that $\langle x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4 \rangle$ is also an ordered triple. Finally, by definition, $\langle \langle x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4 \rangle \rangle = \langle x_1, x_2, x_3, x_4 \rangle$, so it is also a 1-tuple. \square

3.4 Functions

Exercise 3.11. *Prove the following version (for functions) of the extensionality principle: Assume that F and G are functions, $\text{dom } F = \text{dom } G$, and $F(x) = G(x)$ for all x in the common domain. Then $F = G$.*

Solution. Take $\langle x, F(x) \rangle \in F$. So $x \in \text{dom } F = \text{dom } G$, and thus $\langle x, G(x) \rangle \in G$. But $F(x) = G(x)$, and so $\langle x, F(x) \rangle = \langle x, G(x) \rangle$, so $\langle x, F(x) \rangle \in G$ and thus $F \subseteq G$. A symmetric argument shows $G \subseteq F$, and so $F = G$. \square

Exercise 3.12. *Assume that f and g are functions and show that*

$$f \subseteq g \Leftrightarrow \text{dom } f \subseteq \text{dom } g \wedge (\forall x \in \text{dom } f) f(x) = g(x).$$

Solution. Suppose $f \subseteq g$. Now take $x \in \text{dom } f$. Then $\langle x, f(x) \rangle \in f$, so $\langle x, g(x) \rangle \in g$. Thus $x \in \text{dom } g$, so $\text{dom } f \subseteq \text{dom } g$. Moreover, $\langle x, g(x) \rangle \in g$ so since g is a function, one must have that $\langle x, f(x) \rangle = \langle x, g(x) \rangle$, and thus $f(x) = g(x)$.

Conversely, take $\langle x, f(x) \rangle \in f$. Then $x \in \text{dom } f$, so by assumption, $f(x) = g(x)$. It follows that $\langle x, f(x) \rangle = \langle x, g(x) \rangle$, so since $x \in \text{dom } g$, $\langle x, f(x) \rangle \in g$, and thus $f \subseteq g$. \square

Exercise 3.13. *Assume that f and g are functions with $f \subseteq g$ and $\text{dom } g \subseteq \text{dom } f$. Show that $f = g$.*

Solution. By Exercise 3.12, it suffices to show that

$$(\forall x \in \text{dom } g) g(x) = f(x)$$

from which the containment $g \subseteq f$ follows. Take $x \in \text{dom } g$. Then $x \in \text{dom } f$ so $\langle x, f(x) \rangle \in f$. Since $f \subseteq g$, $\langle x, f(x) \rangle \in g$. Furthermore, since $x \in \text{dom } g$, $\langle x, g(x) \rangle \in g$. Since g is a function, that fact that $\langle x, f(x) \rangle, \langle x, g(x) \rangle \in g$ implies that $g(x) = f(x)$, as desired. \square

Exercise 3.14. Assume that f and g are functions.

(a) Show that $f \cap g$ is a function.

(b) Show that $f \cup g$ is a function iff $f(x) = g(x)$ for every x in $(\text{dom } f) \cap (\text{dom } g)$.

Solution. Assume that $\langle x, y \rangle \in f \cap g$ and $\langle x, y' \rangle \in f \cap g$. In particular, $\langle x, y \rangle \in f \cap g$ and $\langle x, y' \rangle \in f$, so since f is a function, $y = y'$, and hence $f \cap g$ is a function.

For (b), first suppose $f \cup g$ is a function. Take any $x \in (\text{dom } f) \cap (\text{dom } g)$. Thus $\langle x, f(x) \rangle \in f$ and $\langle x, g(x) \rangle \in g$. So $\langle x, f(x) \rangle, \langle x, g(x) \rangle \in f \cup g$, and since $f \cup g$ is a function, $f(x) = g(x)$.

Conversely, suppose that $\langle x, y \rangle$ and $\langle x, y' \rangle$ are in $f \cup g$. There are several cases to consider. If $\langle x, y \rangle \in f$ and $\langle x, y' \rangle \in f$, then $y = y'$ since f is a function. Similarly, if both pairs are in g , then $y = y'$ since g is a function. Finally, if $\langle x, y \rangle$ is in f and the $\langle x, y' \rangle$ is in g , then $x \in (\text{dom } f) \cap (\text{dom } g)$, and so by hypothesis, $y = f(x) = g(x) = y'$. The same holds if the pairs happen to be in the other set. In any case, $y = y'$, and so $f \cup g$ is a function. \square

Exercise 3.15. Let \mathcal{A} be a set of functions such that for any f and g in \mathcal{A} , either $f \subseteq g$ or $g \subseteq f$. Show that $\bigcup \mathcal{A}$ is a function.

Solution. Take $\langle x, y \rangle, \langle x, y' \rangle \in \bigcup \mathcal{A}$. Now for some $f \in \mathcal{A}$, $\langle x, y \rangle \in f$ and for some $g \in \mathcal{A}$, $\langle x, y' \rangle \in g$. Without loss of generality, suppose $f \subseteq g$, and so $\langle x, y \rangle \in g$. It follows that $y = g(x) = y'$, and hence \mathcal{A} is a function. \square

Exercise 3.16. Show that there is no set to which every function belongs.

Solution. Suppose such a set exists, so let \mathcal{F} denote the set of all functions. Then by a subset axiom,

$$\exists C \forall f (f \in C \Leftrightarrow f \in \mathcal{F} \wedge (\forall x \forall y)((x \in \text{dom } f \wedge y \in \text{dom } f \Rightarrow x = y) \wedge (\forall z)(z \in \text{dom } f \Rightarrow \langle z, z \rangle \in f))).$$

Hence such a subset C consists of functions $f: \{x\} \rightarrow \{x\}: x \mapsto x$. That is, functions of the form

$$f = \{\langle x, x \rangle\} = \{\{x\}, \{x, x\}\} = \{\{\{x\}\}\}.$$

Note then that $\bigcup \bigcup f = \{x\}$, and in particular, $\bigcup \bigcup C$ is the set of all singletons, which has been shown to not exist. Hence no such set \mathcal{F} exists. \square

Exercise 3.17. Show that the composition of two single-rooted sets is again single-rooted. Conclude that the composition of two one-to-one functions is again one-to-one.

Solution. Let F and G be two single-rooted sets. Suppose that $x(F \circ G)y$ and $x'(F \circ G)y$. So there exists t and t' such that $xGt \wedge tFy$ and $x'Gt' \wedge t'Fy$. Since F is single-rooted, $t = t'$, and then since G is single-rooted, from xGt and $x'Gt$ we see $x = x'$. Hence $F \circ G$ is single-rooted.

Since injective functions are just special cases of single-rooted relations, we conclude that the composition of injections is again injective. \square

Exercise 3.18. Let R be the set

$$\{\langle 0, 1 \rangle, \langle 0, 2 \rangle, \langle 0, 3 \rangle, \langle 1, 2 \rangle, \langle 1, 3 \rangle, \langle 2, 3 \rangle\}.$$

Evaluate the following: $R \circ R$, $R \upharpoonright \{1\}$, $R^{-1} \upharpoonright \{1\}$, $R[\{1\}]$, and $R^{-1}[\{1\}]$.

Solution. By inspection, we have

$$R \circ R = \{\langle 0, 2 \rangle, \langle 0, 3 \rangle, \langle 1, 3 \rangle\}.$$

Also, $R \upharpoonright \{1\} = \{\langle 1, 2 \rangle, \langle 1, 3 \rangle\}$, $R^{-1} \upharpoonright \{1\} = \{\langle 1, 0 \rangle\}$, $R[\{1\}] = \{2, 3\}$, and $R^{-1}[\{1\}] = \{0\}$. \square

Exercise 3.19. Let

$$A = \{\langle \emptyset, \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\} \rangle, \langle \{\emptyset\}, \emptyset \rangle\}.$$

Evaluate each of the following: $A(\emptyset)$, $A[\emptyset]$, $A[\{\emptyset\}]$, $A[\{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\}]$, A^{-1} , $A \circ A$, $A \upharpoonright \emptyset$, $A \upharpoonright \{\emptyset\}$, $A \upharpoonright \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\}$, $\bigcup \bigcup A$.

Solution. First, note that A is indeed a function. Hence,

$$A(\emptyset) = \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\}.$$

However, there are no ordered pairs $\langle u, v \rangle$ such that $u \in \emptyset$, thus,

$$A[\emptyset] = \emptyset.$$

Since A is a function,

$$A[\{\emptyset\}] = A(\emptyset).$$

Also,

$$A[\{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\}] = \{A(\emptyset), A(\{\emptyset\})\} = \{\{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\}, \emptyset\}.$$

Flipping the pairs,

$$A^{-1} = \{\langle \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\}, \emptyset \rangle, \langle \emptyset, \{\emptyset\} \rangle\}.$$

Taking \emptyset as the intermediary,

$$A \circ A = \{\langle \{\emptyset\}, \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\} \rangle\}.$$

By similar reasons to the computation of $A[\emptyset]$,

$$A \upharpoonright \emptyset = \emptyset.$$

However,

$$A \upharpoonright \{\emptyset\} = \{\langle \emptyset, \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\} \rangle\}.$$

and

$$A \upharpoonright \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\} = A.$$

Finally, first note that

$$\begin{aligned}\bigcup A &= \langle \emptyset, \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\} \rangle \cup \langle \{\emptyset\}, \emptyset \rangle \\ &= \{\{\emptyset\}, \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\}\} \} \cup \{\{\{\emptyset\}\}, \{\{\emptyset\}, \emptyset\}\} \\ &= \{\{\emptyset\}, \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\}\}, \{\{\emptyset\}\}, \{\{\emptyset\}, \emptyset\}\}\end{aligned}$$

and thus

$$\begin{aligned}\bigcup\bigcup A &= \{\emptyset\} \cup \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\}\} \cup \{\{\emptyset\}\} \cup \{\{\emptyset\}, \emptyset\} \\ &= \{\emptyset, \emptyset, \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\}, \{\emptyset\}, \{\emptyset\}, \emptyset\} \\ &= \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}, \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\}\}\end{aligned}$$

□

Exercise 3.20. Show that $F \upharpoonright A = F \cap (A \times \text{ran } F)$.

Solution. By definition, $F \upharpoonright A = \{\langle u, v \rangle \mid uFv \wedge u \in A\}$. Hence such $\langle u, v \rangle \in F$, so $F \upharpoonright A \subseteq F$. Also, $u \in A$ and thus $v \in \text{ran } F$, so $\langle u, v \rangle \in A \times \text{ran } F$, so $F \upharpoonright A \subseteq A \times \text{ran } F$, and altogether, $F \upharpoonright A \subseteq F \cap (A \times \text{ran } F)$.

Now take $\langle u, v \rangle \in F \cap (A \times \text{ran } F)$. So $\langle u, v \rangle \in A \times \text{ran } F$, so $u \in A$. Also, $\langle u, v \rangle \in F$, so uFv . Together, these imply $\langle u, v \rangle \in F \upharpoonright A$, and the equality follows. □

Exercise 3.21. Show that $(R \circ S) \circ T = R \circ (S \circ T)$ for any sets R , S , and T .

Solution. Take $\langle x, y \rangle \in (R \circ S) \circ T$. Hence there exists t such that

$$x(R \circ S)t \wedge tTy.$$

This implies there exists s such that

$$xRs \wedge sSt \wedge tTy.$$

So $xRs \wedge s(S \circ T)y$, and thus $\langle x, y \rangle \in R \circ (S \circ T)$. The reverse containment follows similarly. □

Exercise 3.22. Show that the following are correct for any sets.

- (a) $A \subseteq B \Leftrightarrow F[A] \subseteq F[B]$.
- (b) $(F \circ G)[A] = F[G[A]]$.
- (c) $Q \upharpoonright (A \cup B) = (Q \upharpoonright A) \cup (Q \upharpoonright B)$.

Solution. Indeed,

- (a) Take $v \in F[A]$. So $\langle u, v \rangle \in F$ for some $u \in A$. By assumption, $A \subseteq B$, so $u \in B$ as well, and thus $v \in F[B]$.

- (b) Take $v \in (F \circ G)[[A]]$. So $u(F \circ G)v$ and $u \in A$ for some u . Hence there exists some t such that $uGt \wedge tFv$. So $t \in G[[A]]$, and thus $v \in F[G[[A]]]$.

Conversely, take $y \in F[G[[A]]]$. So for some $x \in G[[A]]$, xFy and for some $z \in A$, zGx . Then $z(F \circ G)y$, and so $y \in (F \circ G)[[A]]$.

- (c) Take $v \in Q \upharpoonright (A \cup B)$. So for some $u \in A \cup B$, uQv . If $u \in A$, $v \in Q \upharpoonright A$, and if $u \in B$, then $v \in Q \upharpoonright B$. In either case, $Q \upharpoonright (A \cup B) \subseteq (Q \upharpoonright A) \cup (Q \upharpoonright B)$.

Now take $y \in (Q \upharpoonright A) \cup (Q \upharpoonright B)$. If $y \in Q \upharpoonright A$, then there is some $x \in A$ such that xQy , and hence $y \in Q \upharpoonright (A \cup B)$. The case where $y \in B$ follows similarly.

□

Exercise 3.23. Let I_A be the identity function on the set A . Show that for any sets B and C ,

$$B \circ I_A = B \upharpoonright A \quad \text{and} \quad I_A[[C]] = A \cap C.$$

Solution. First take $\langle x, y \rangle \in B \circ I_A$. So there exists t such that $xI_At \wedge tBy$. But since I_A is the identity function, $t = x$. So xBx , and so $\langle x, y \rangle \in B \upharpoonright A$.

Conversely, take $\langle x, y \rangle \in B \upharpoonright A$. So xBx and $x \in A$. In particular, $xI_Ax \wedge xBy$, so $x(B \circ I_A)y$, that is, $\langle x, y \rangle \in B \circ I_A$.

For the other equality, first take $x \in I_A[[C]]$. So for some $c \in C$, $\langle c, x \rangle \in I_A$. Note that $c \in \text{dom } I_A = A$, so $c \in A$. And since I_A is the identity on A , we must have $c = x$, so $x \in C$, and $x \in \text{ran } I_A = A$, so $x \in A \cap C$.

Conversely, take $x \in A \cap C$. Since $x \in A$, $\langle x, x \rangle \in I_A$, but since $x \in C$, it follows that $x \in I_A[[C]]$. □

Exercise 3.24. Show that for a function F , $F^{-1}[[A]] = \{x \in \text{dom } F \mid F(x) \in A\}$.

Solution. Take $x \in F^{-1}[[A]]$. So for some $y \in A$, $\langle y, x \rangle \in F^{-1}$ and so $\langle x, y \rangle \in F$. Thus $y = F(x) \in A$, and $x \in \text{dom } F$, as desired.

Conversely, take $v \in \{x \in \text{dom } F \mid F(x) \in A\}$. So $\langle x, F(x) \rangle \in F$, and thus $\langle F(x), x \rangle \in F^{-1}$. Since $F(x) \in A$, it follows that $x \in F^{-1}[[A]]$. □

Exercise 3.25. (a) Assume that G is a one-to-one function. Show that $G \circ G^{-1}$ is $I_{\text{ran } G}$, the identity function on $\text{ran } G$.

(b) Show that the result of part (a) holds for any function G , not necessarily one-to-one.

Solution. Suppose that $x(G \circ G^{-1})y$. Hence there exists t such that $xG^{-1}t \wedge tGy$. So $tGx \wedge tGy$. Now $x \in \text{ran } G$, and since G is a function, $x = y$. Hence $G \circ G^{-1}$ is $I_{\text{ran } G}$. Note that nowhere is injectivity used, and thus (a) holds for any function G . □

Exercise 3.26. Prove the second halves of parts (a) and (b) of Theorem 3K. That is, prove that

$$F\left[\bigcup \mathcal{A}\right] = \bigcup \{F[[A]] \mid A \in \mathcal{A}\} \quad \text{and} \quad F\left[\bigcap \mathcal{A}\right] = \bigcap \{F[[A]] \mid A \in \mathcal{A}\}.$$

Solution. Take $v \in F[\bigcup \mathcal{A}]$. So there exists $u \in \bigcup \mathcal{A}$ such that uFv . Since $u \in \bigcup \mathcal{A}$, there exists an $A \in \mathcal{A}$ such that $u \in A$. So $v \in F[A]$ for this particular A , so $u \in \bigcup \{F[A] \mid A \in \mathcal{A}\}$. Conversely, take $v \in \bigcup \{F[A] \mid A \in \mathcal{A}\}$. So for some $A \in \mathcal{A}$, $v \in F[A]$, and thus there is some $u \in A$ such that uFv . Since $u \in A$ and $A \subseteq \bigcup \mathcal{A}$, $u \in \bigcup \mathcal{A}$, and thus $v \in F[\bigcup \mathcal{A}]$.

For (b), take $v \in F[\bigcap \mathcal{A}]$. So uFv for some $u \in \bigcap \mathcal{A}$. That is, for every $A \in \mathcal{A}$, $u \in A$. It follows that $v \in F[A]$ for each $A \in \mathcal{A}$, and so the containment holds. To see that equality holds when F is single-rooted, take $y \in \bigcap \{F[A] \mid A \in \mathcal{A}\}$. So for each $A \in \mathcal{A}$, $y \in F[A]$, and thus there exists $u_A \in A$ such that $\langle u_A, y \rangle \in F$. Since F is single-rooted, these u_A are all equal, so denoting $u_A = u$, one has $u \in \bigcap \mathcal{A}$, and hence $y \in F[\bigcap \mathcal{A}]$. \square

Exercise 3.27. Show that $\text{dom}(F \circ G) = G^{-1}[\text{dom } F]$ for any sets F and G .

Solution. Take $x \in \text{dom}(F \circ G)$. So there exists y such that $x(F \circ G)y$. Moreover, there exists t , such that $xGt \wedge tFy$, and thus $tG^{-1}x$. Since $t \in \text{dom } F$, we have $x \in G^{-1}[\text{dom } F]$.

Now take $x \in G^{-1}[\text{dom } F]$. So for some $t \in \text{dom } F$, $tG^{-1}x$, and so xGt . Since $t \in \text{dom } F$, there exists some y such that tFy , and thus $x(F \circ G)y$, so $x \in \text{dom}(F \circ G)$. \square

Exercise 3.28. Assume that f is a one-to-one function from A into B , and that G is the function with $\text{dom } G = \mathcal{P}A$ defined by the equation $G(X) = f[X]$. Show that G maps $\mathcal{P}A$ one-to-one into $\mathcal{P}B$.

Solution. First note that G indeed maps $\mathcal{P}A$ into $\mathcal{P}B$. For $X \in \mathcal{P}A$, $G(X) = f[X] = \{v \mid \exists ufv, u \in X\}$, so $v \in B$, and thus $f[X] \subseteq B$, so $f[X] \in \mathcal{P}B$.

Now suppose $G(X) = G(Y)$ for $X, Y \in \mathcal{P}A$, and thus $f[X] = f[Y]$. Take $x \in X$. Since f is defined on all of A , and $X \subseteq A$, we have $\langle x, f(x) \rangle \in f$, so $f(x) \in f[X]$. Then $f(x) \in f[Y]$, and thus for some $y \in Y$, $\langle y, f(x) \rangle \in f$, but since f is injective, $y = x$. So $x \in Y$, and thus $X \subseteq Y$. A parallel argument shows $Y \subseteq X$, and so $X = Y$, and thus $G: \mathcal{P}A \rightarrow \mathcal{P}B$ is injective. \square

Exercise 3.29. Assume that $f: A \rightarrow B$ and define a function $G: B \rightarrow \mathcal{P}A$ by

$$G(b) = \{x \in A \mid f(x) = b\}.$$

Show that if f maps A onto B , then G is one-to-one. Does the converse hold?

Solution. Suppose that $G(b) = G(b')$. Note that $G(b)$ is nonempty, since f is surjective. Now take $x \in G(b)$, so $f(x) = b$. Since $x \in G(b')$, $f(x) = b'$ also, so $b = b'$. Essentially, and $b \in B$ has a unique set of preimages.

However, the converse does not hold. Take $A = \{1\}$, and $B = \{1, 2\}$, and suppose $G(1) = \{1\}$ and $G(2) = \emptyset$. So G is injective, however, from the definition of G , we have that $f(1) = 1$, but 2 has no preimage under f , so f does not map A onto B . \square

Exercise 3.30. Assume that $F: \mathcal{P}A \rightarrow \mathcal{P}A$ and that F has the monotonicity property:

$$X \subseteq Y \subseteq A \Leftrightarrow F(X) \subseteq F(Y).$$

Define

$$B = \bigcap \{X \subseteq A \mid F(X) \subseteq X\} \quad \text{and} \quad C = \bigcup \{X \subseteq A \mid X \subseteq F(X)\}.$$

(a) Show that $F(B) = B$ and $F(C) = C$.

(b) Show that if $F(X) = X$, then $B \subseteq X \subseteq C$.

Solution. Observe, by Theorem 3K, for $X \subseteq A$,

$$F(B) = F\left(\bigcap_{F(X) \subseteq X} X\right) \subseteq \bigcap_{F(X) \subseteq X} F(X) \subseteq \bigcap_{F(X) \subseteq X} X = B.$$

Hence $F(B) \subseteq B$, and thus by the monotonicity property, $F(F(B)) \subseteq F(B)$, which implies $F(B) \supseteq B$, and thus $F(B) = B$.

Again by Theorem 3K,

$$F(C) = F\left(\bigcup_{X \subseteq F(X)} X\right) = \bigcup_{X \subseteq F(X)} F(X) \supseteq \bigcup_{X \subseteq F(X)} X = C.$$

So $C \subseteq F(C)$, and thus by monotonicity, $F(C) \subseteq F(F(C))$, from which it follows that $F(C) \subseteq C$, so $F(C) = C$.

For (b), if $F(X) = X$, then $F(X) \subseteq X$, and so $B \subseteq X$, as X is one of the sets in the intersection. Also, $X \subseteq F(X)$, so $X \subseteq C$, as X is one of the sets in the union. Thus $B \subseteq X \subseteq C$. \square

3.5 Infinite Cartesian Products

Exercise 3.31. Show that from the first form of the axiom of choice we can prove the second form, and conversely.

Solution. Assume the first form. Let I be any set and let H be any function such that $\text{dom } H = I$, and $H(i) \neq \emptyset$ for all $i \in I$. Define a relation $R \subseteq I \times \bigcup_{i \in I} H(i)$ by

$$\langle i, x \rangle \in R \Leftrightarrow x \in H(i).$$

By assumption, there exists a function $G \subseteq R$ with $\text{dom } G = \text{dom } R = I$, as for each $i \in I$, $i \in \text{dom } R$ since $H(i)$ is nonempty. So for all $\langle i, G(i) \rangle \in G$, $\langle i, G(i) \rangle \in R$, and thus by the definition of R , $G(i) \in H(i)$. It follows that $G \in \prod_{i \in I} H(i)$, so $\prod_{i \in I} H(i) \neq \emptyset$. Thus the second form follows from the first.

Conversely, let R be any relation, and denote $\text{dom } R = I$. Define a function

$$H: I \rightarrow \mathcal{P}(\text{ran } R): i \mapsto H(i) := \{x \in \text{ran } R \mid iRx\}.$$

In particular, H is a function with domain I , and $H(i) \neq \emptyset$ for all $i \in I$. So by the second form, $\prod_{i \in I} H(i) \neq \emptyset$, so take $G \in \prod_{i \in I} H(i)$. Hence $\text{dom } G = I$, and for all $i \in I$, $G(i) \in H(i)$. Also, for any $\langle i, G(i) \rangle \in G$, $G(i) \in H(i) \subseteq \text{ran } R$, and so $\langle i, G(i) \rangle \in R$, so $G \subseteq R$. Hence the two statements of the Axiom of Choice are equivalent.¹ \square

¹Thanks to Arturo Magidin for his hints on this exercise.

Exercise 3.32.

(a) Show that R is symmetric iff $R^{-1} \subseteq R$.

(b) Show that R is transitive iff $R \circ R \subseteq R$.

Solution. Suppose R is symmetric. Take $\langle x, y \rangle \in R^{-1}$. So $xR^{-1}y$, and thus yRx , but since R is symmetric, xRy , so $\langle x, y \rangle \in R$. Conversely, suppose $R^{-1} \subseteq R$. Suppose xRy , then $yR^{-1}x$, and so $\langle y, x \rangle \in R^{-1} \subseteq R$, so yRx , and R is symmetric.

Now suppose R is transitive. Take $\langle x, z \rangle \in R \circ R$. Thus there exists y such that $xRy \wedge yRz$, and since R is transitive, xRz , so $\langle x, z \rangle \in R$. Conversely, suppose $R \circ R \subseteq R$, and suppose $xRy \wedge yRz$. Thus $\langle x, z \rangle \in R \circ R$, so $\langle x, z \rangle \in R$, and thus xRz , so R is transitive. \square

Exercise 3.33. Show that R is a symmetric and transitive relation iff $R = R^{-1} \circ R$.

Solution. First suppose that R is symmetric and transitive. Take $\langle x, y \rangle \in R$. So xRy , and thus yRx . By transitivity, we have yRy . Thus $yR^{-1}y$ and from $xRy \wedge yR^{-1}y$ we have $x(R^{-1} \circ R)y$, so $R \subseteq R^{-1} \circ R$. Now take $\langle x, z \rangle \in R^{-1} \circ R$. Hence there exists y such that $xRy \wedge yR^{-1}z$. But from $yR^{-1}z$ implies zRy , which implies yRz , as R is symmetric, and thus from $xRy \wedge yRz$ we have xRz , and thus $R = R^{-1} \circ R$.

Conversely, assume $R = R^{-1} \circ R$. Suppose xRy . So $x(R^{-1} \circ R)y$, and thus there exists z such that $xRz \wedge zR^{-1}y$. Hence

$$xRz \wedge zR^{-1}y \Rightarrow xRz \wedge yRz \Rightarrow zR^{-1}x \wedge yRz \Rightarrow y(R^{-1} \circ R)x \Rightarrow yRx$$

and so R is symmetric.

Now suppose $xRy \wedge yRz$. Hence $x(R^{-1} \circ R)y \wedge y(R^{-1} \circ R)z$. Hence there exist s and t such that $xRs \wedge sR^{-1}y$ and $yRt \wedge tR^{-1}z$. In particular, since R is symmetric, we have $sRy \wedge yR^{-1}t$, and so $s(R^{-1} \circ R)t$, so sRt . Then observe,

$$\begin{aligned} sRt &\Rightarrow tR^{-1}s \Rightarrow zRt \wedge tR^{-1}s \\ &\Rightarrow zRs \Rightarrow sR^{-1}z \\ &\Rightarrow xRs \wedge sR^{-1}z \quad \text{since } xRs \\ &\Rightarrow x(R^{-1} \circ R)z \\ &\Rightarrow xRz \end{aligned}$$

so R is transitive. \square

Exercise 3.34. Assume that \mathcal{A} is a nonempty set, every member of which is a transitive relation.

(a) Is the set $\bigcap \mathcal{A}$ a transitive relation?

(b) Is $\bigcup \mathcal{A}$ a transitive relation?

Solution. Yes, $\bigcap \mathcal{A}$ is a transitive relation. Suppose $\langle x, y \rangle, \langle y, z \rangle \in \bigcap \mathcal{A}$. It follows that for every $A \in \mathcal{A}$, $\langle x, y \rangle, \langle y, z \rangle \in A$ as well, and since A is transitive, $\langle x, z \rangle \in A$ as well. Hence $\langle x, z \rangle \in \bigcap \mathcal{A}$, so $\bigcap \mathcal{A}$ is transitive.

This is not so for $\bigcup \mathcal{A}$. Suppose $\mathcal{A} = \{A_1, A_2\}$, where

$$A_1 = \{\langle a, b \rangle, \langle b, c \rangle, \langle a, c \rangle\}$$

and

$$A_2 = \{\langle b, d \rangle, \langle d, e \rangle, \langle b, e \rangle\}.$$

So both A_1 and A_2 are transitive, but

$$\bigcup \mathcal{A} = \{\langle a, b \rangle, \langle b, c \rangle, \langle a, c \rangle, \langle b, d \rangle, \langle d, e \rangle, \langle b, e \rangle\},$$

which is not transitive, since $\langle a, d \rangle \notin \bigcup \mathcal{A}$. □

Exercise 3.35. Show that for any R and x , we have $[x]_R = R[\{x\}]$.

Solution. Take $y \in [x]_R$. So $\langle x, y \rangle \in R$ and by definition, $y \in R[\{x\}]$. Conversely, take $y \in R[\{x\}]$. Then for some $t \in \{x\}$, $\langle t, y \rangle \in R$. Clearly $t = x$, so $\langle x, y \rangle \in R$, and thus $y \in [x]_R$. □

Exercise 3.36. Assume that $f: A \rightarrow B$ and that R is an equivalence relation on B . Define Q to be the set

$$\{\langle x, y \rangle \in A \times A \mid \langle f(x), f(y) \rangle \in R\}.$$

Show that Q is an equivalence relation on A .

Solution. For any $x \in A$, $f(x) \in B$, so $\langle f(x), f(x) \rangle \in R$. Hence $\langle x, x \rangle \in Q$, so Q is reflexive on A . Now suppose $\langle x, y \rangle \in Q$. Then $\langle f(x), f(y) \rangle \in R$, so $\langle f(y), f(x) \rangle \in R$ since R is symmetric, so $\langle y, x \rangle \in Q$, and hence Q is symmetric. Finally, suppose $\langle x, y \rangle, \langle y, z \rangle \in Q$. So $\langle f(x), f(y) \rangle, \langle f(y), f(z) \rangle \in R$, and thus $\langle f(x), f(z) \rangle \in R$ since R is transitive, so $\langle x, z \rangle \in Q$ and Q is transitive. Thus Q is an equivalence relation on A . □

Exercise 3.37. Assume that Π is a partition of a set A . Define the relation R_Π as follows:

$$xR_\Pi y \Leftrightarrow (\exists B \in \Pi)(x \in B \wedge y \in B).$$

Show that R_Π is an equivalence relation on A .

Solution. For any $x \in A$, there exists some $B \in \Pi$ such that $x \in B$, but the definition of a partition. Hence $xR_\Pi x$, so R_Π is reflexive. Now suppose that $xR_\Pi y$. So there exists some $B \in \Pi$ such that $x \in B \wedge y \in B$, which obviously implies $y \in B \wedge x \in B$, so $yR_\Pi x$, so R_Π is symmetric.

Now suppose $xR_\Pi y$ and $yR_\Pi z$. Hence there exist $B, C \in \Pi$ such that $x \in B \wedge y \in B$ and $y \in C \wedge z \in C$. But note that $y \in B \cap C$, and hence we must have $B = C$, since no two distinct sets in a partition intersect. Thus $x \in C \wedge z \in C$, so $xR_\Pi z$, and R_Π is transitive. □

Exercise 3.38. Theorem 3P shows that A/R is a partition of A whenever R is an equivalence relation on A . Show that if we start with the equivalence relation R_Π of the preceding exercise, then the partition A/R_Π is just Π .

Solution. Take any $[x] \in A/R_\Pi$. Note for any $y \in [x]$, there exists a $B \in \Pi$ such that $x, y \in B$, by the definition of R_Π . Fix this B . For any $z \in [x]$, we have that $yR_\Pi z$, since R_Π is an equivalence relation. By the reasoning the previous exercise, $z \in B$ as well. So any two elements of $[x]$ are in this fixed B , and thus $[x] \subseteq B$. Moreover, for any $b \in B$, clearly $bR_\Pi x$, and thus $b \in [x]$. Hence $[x] = B$. So it follows that any equivalence class in A/R_Π equals some set in the partition Π .

On the other hand, take any $C \in \Pi$. Now C is nonempty, so take $m \in C$. By definition, this C is a subset of $[m]$, since any element in C are R_Π -related to m . However, by the same reasoning in the above paragraph, this $m \in C$, and thus $[m] \subseteq C$. This shows that any equivalence class in A/R_Π is equal to some $C \in \Pi$, and any $C \in \Pi$ is equal to some equivalence class in A/R_Π . So Π and A/R_Π are families with the same sets as members, and thus the same. \square

Exercise 3.39. Assume that we start with an equivalence relation R on A and define Π to be the partition A/R . Show that R_Π , as defined in Exercise 3.37 is just R .

Solution. First take $\langle x, y \rangle \in R$. Then since Π is a partition consisting of equivalence classes of R , $x, y \in B$ for some unique $B \in \Pi$. Then by the definition of R_Π , so $\langle x, y \rangle \in R_\Pi$, and thus $R \subseteq R_\Pi$.

Now take $\langle x, y \rangle \in R_\Pi$, and so there exists some $B \in \Pi$ such that $x \in B$ and $y \in B$. Now B is an equivalence class of R , so $B = [x]_R = [y]_R$, and thus by Lemma 3N, xRy , so $\langle x, y \rangle \in R$. Hence $R = R_\Pi$. \square

Exercise 3.40. Define an equivalence relation R on the set P of positive integers by

$$mRn \Leftrightarrow m \text{ and } n \text{ have the same number of prime factors.}$$

Is there a function $f: P/R \rightarrow P/R$ such that $f([n]_R) = [3n]_R$ for each n ?

Solution. Define a function $F: P \rightarrow P: n \mapsto 3n$. Then recall from Theorem 3Q that such a function f exists iff F is compatible with R . However, consider the positive integers 2 and 3. Note $2R3$ since both 2 and 3 have exactly one prime factor. However, $F(2) = 6 = 2 \cdot 3$ and $F(3) = 9 = 3^2$, so $F(2)$ has 2 prime factors, but $F(3)$ still only has 1. Thus $\langle F(2), F(3) \rangle \notin R$, so F is not compatible with R , so no such function f exists. \square

Exercise 3.41. Let \mathbb{R} be the set of real numbers and define the relation Q on $\mathbb{R} \times \mathbb{R}$ by $\langle u, v \rangle Q \langle x, y \rangle$ iff $u + y = x + v$.

(a) Show that Q is an equivalence relation on $\mathbb{R} \times \mathbb{R}$.

(b) Is there a function $G: (\mathbb{R} \times \mathbb{R})/Q \rightarrow (\mathbb{R} \times \mathbb{R})/Q$ satisfying the equation

$$G([\langle x, y \rangle]_Q) = [\langle x + 2y, y + 2x \rangle]_Q?$$

Solution. Q is reflexive on $\mathbb{R} \times \mathbb{R}$ due to the commutativity of $+$ on \mathbb{R} . Suppose $\langle u, v \rangle Q \langle x, y \rangle$, so $u + y = x + v$. Then clearly $x + v = u + y$, so $\langle x, y \rangle Q \langle u, v \rangle$, so Q is symmetric. Now assume $\langle u, v \rangle Q \langle x, y \rangle \wedge \langle x, y \rangle Q \langle w, z \rangle$. Thus

$$u + y = x + v \wedge x + z = w + y$$

from which we see that

$$u + z = x + v - y + z = (x + z - y) + v = w + v$$

which implies $\langle u, v \rangle Q \langle w, z \rangle$. Hence Q is transitive.

Define a function

$$F: \mathbb{R} \times \mathbb{R} \rightarrow \mathbb{R} \times \mathbb{R}: \langle x, y \rangle \mapsto \langle x + 2y, y + 2x \rangle.$$

Then if $\langle u, v \rangle Q \langle x, y \rangle$, we have $u + y = x + v$. This implies

$$u + y + 2(x + v) = x + v + 2(u + y),$$

which in turn implies

$$(u + 2v) + (y + 2x) = (x + 2y) + (v + 2u).$$

That is, $F(\langle u, v \rangle) Q F(\langle x, y \rangle)$. So F is compatible with Q , and thus there exists such a function G by Theorem 3Q. \square

Exercise 3.42. State precisely the "analogous results" mentioned in Theorem 3Q.

Solution. The analogous results are:

Assume that R is an equivalence relation on A and that $F: A \times A \rightarrow A$. If F is compatible with R , then there exists a unique $\hat{F}: A/R \times A/R \rightarrow A/R$ such that

$$\hat{F}([x], [y]) = [F(x, y)] \quad \text{for all } x, y \in A.$$

If F is not compatible with R , then no such \hat{F} exists.

Of course, we must extend the definition of compatibility. Note that we would like to have the following commutative diagram:

$$\begin{array}{ccc} A \times A & \xrightarrow{F} & A \\ \downarrow & & \downarrow \\ A/R \times A/R & \xrightarrow{\hat{F}} & A/R \end{array}$$

From this, we see that if $\langle x, y \rangle$ and $\langle u, v \rangle$ have the same image under $A \times A \rightarrow (A/R) \times (A/R)$, that is, $\langle [x], [y] \rangle = \langle [u], [v] \rangle$, then we also like $[F(x, y)] = [F(u, v)]$. This suggests that we define that F is compatible with R if for any $x, y, u, v \in R$,

$$xRy \wedge uRv \implies F(x, y)RF(u, v).$$

Assume that F is compatible with R , and we will prove that such a \hat{F} exists. We require that $\langle\langle[x], [y]\rangle, [F(x, y)]\rangle \in \hat{F}$, so define \hat{F} as

$$\hat{F} = \{\langle\langle[x], [y]\rangle, [F(x, y)]\rangle \mid x, y \in A\}.$$

To see that \hat{F} to indeed be a function, consider the pairs $\langle\langle[x], [y]\rangle, [F(x, y)]\rangle$ and $\langle\langle[u], [v]\rangle, [F(u, v)]\rangle$ in \hat{F} . Then we have the implications

$$\begin{aligned} \langle[x], [y]\rangle = \langle[u], [v]\rangle &\implies [x] = [u] \wedge [y] = [v] \\ &\implies xRu \wedge yRv \\ &\implies F\langle x, y\rangle RF\langle u, v\rangle \\ &\implies [F\langle x, y\rangle] = [F\langle u, v\rangle] \end{aligned}$$

So \hat{F} is a function. It is clear that $\text{dom } \hat{F} = A/R \times A/R$ and $\text{ran } \hat{F} \subseteq A/R$. Also $\hat{F}\langle[x], [y]\rangle = [F\langle x, y\rangle]$, since $\hat{F}\langle[x], [y]\rangle = [F\langle x, y\rangle] \in \hat{F}$. Also, \hat{F} is unique, for suppose for some $G: A/R \times A/R \rightarrow A/R$ the same condition holds. Then for any $x, y \in A$,

$$G\langle[x], [y]\rangle = [F\langle x, y\rangle] = \hat{F}\langle[x], [y]\rangle$$

so $F = G$.

Now suppose that F is not compatible. By incompatibility, there are some pairs $\langle x, y\rangle, \langle u, v\rangle \in A \times A$ such that $xRu \wedge yRv$ but it is not case that $F\langle x, y\rangle RF\langle u, v\rangle$. Hence $[x] = [u]$, $[y] = [v]$, but $[F\langle x, y\rangle] \neq [F\langle u, v\rangle]$. But we must have

$$\hat{F}\langle[x], [y]\rangle = [F\langle x, y\rangle] \quad \text{and} \quad \hat{F}\langle[u], [v]\rangle = [F\langle u, v\rangle]$$

which is impossible since the left sides are equal, since \hat{F} is assumed to be a function, but the right sides are not equal. \square

3.6 Ordering Relations

Exercise 3.43. Assume that R is a linear ordering on a set A . Show that R^{-1} is also a linear ordering on A .

Solution. Suppose that $xR^{-1}y \wedge yR^{-1}z$. Then $yRx \wedge zRy$, and since R is transitive, zRx and so $xR^{-1}z$. Furthermore, for any x, y , exactly one of xRy , $x = y$, or yRx holds, and thus exactly one of $yR^{-1}x$, $x = y$, or $xR^{-1}y$ holds. \square

Exercise 3.44. Assume that $<$ is a linear ordering on a set A . Assume that $f: A \rightarrow A$ and that f has the property that whenever $x < y$, then $f(x) < f(y)$. Show that f is one-to-one and that whenever $f(x) < f(y)$, then $x < y$.

Solution. Suppose that $f(x) = f(y)$. So $f(x) \not< f(y)$, and thus $x \not< y$. Similarly, $f(y) \not< f(x)$, and thus $y \not< x$. Since $<$ satisfies the trichotomy property, we must have that $x = y$, so f is injective.

Now suppose that $f(x) < f(y)$, but $x \not< y$. If $x = y$, then $f(x) = f(y)$, a contradiction. If $y < x$, then $f(y) < f(x)$, again a contradiction to the trichotomy property. Hence $x < y$ is the only possibility. \square

Exercise 3.45. Assume that $<_A$ and $<_B$ are linear orderings on A and B , respectively. Define the binary relation $<_L$ on the Cartesian product $A \times B$ by:

$$\langle a_1, b_1 \rangle <_L \langle a_2, b_2 \rangle \quad \text{iff either} \quad a_1 <_A a_2 \vee (a_1 = a_2 \wedge b_1 <_B b_2).$$

Show that $<_L$ is a linear ordering on $A \times B$.

Solution. Suppose $\langle a_1, b_1 \rangle <_L \langle a_2, b_2 \rangle \wedge \langle a_2, b_2 \rangle <_L \langle a_3, b_3 \rangle$. So $a_1 <_A a_2 \vee (a_1 = a_2 \wedge b_1 <_B b_2)$ and $a_2 <_A a_3 \vee (a_2 = a_3 \wedge b_2 <_B b_3)$. First suppose that $a_1 <_A a_2$ and $a_2 <_A a_3$, so by transitivity, $a_1 <_A a_3$, and thus $\langle a_1, b_1 \rangle <_L \langle a_3, b_3 \rangle$. Now suppose that $a_1 <_A a_2$ and $a_2 = a_3 \wedge b_2 <_B b_3$, and hence $a_1 <_A a_3$, so again $\langle a_1, b_1 \rangle <_L \langle a_3, b_3 \rangle$.

Now suppose $a_1 = a_2 \wedge b_1 <_B b_2$ and $a_2 <_A a_3$. Thus $a_1 <_A a_3$, so $\langle a_1, b_1 \rangle <_L \langle a_3, b_3 \rangle$. Finally, if $a_1 = a_2 \wedge b_1 <_B b_2$ and $a_2 = a_3 \wedge b_2 <_B b_3$, then $a_1 = a_3$, and $b_1 <_B b_3$, so $\langle a_1, b_1 \rangle <_L \langle a_3, b_3 \rangle$, and thus $<_L$ is transitive.

To show the trichotomy property, assume that $\langle a_1, b_1 \rangle \not<_L \langle a_2, b_2 \rangle$ and $\langle a_1, b_1 \rangle \not<_L \langle a_2, b_2 \rangle$. In particular, $a_1 \not<_A a_2$ and $a_1 \neq a_2$, so since $<_A$ is a linear ordering, one must have $a_2 <_A a_1$, and so $\langle a_2, b_2 \rangle <_L \langle a_1, b_1 \rangle$. Thus we see at least one of the three possibility holds. To see that at most one possibility holds, suppose $\langle a_1, b_1 \rangle <_L \langle a_2, b_2 \rangle$. Now clearly $\langle a_1, b_1 \rangle \neq \langle a_2, b_2 \rangle$, since we must have that either $a_1 <_A a_2$ or $b_1 <_B b_2$. Also, $\langle a_2, b_2 \rangle \not<_L \langle a_1, b_1 \rangle$ since if $a_1 <_A a_2$, then $a_2 \not<_A a_1$ and $a_2 \neq a_1$. And if $a_1 = a_2 \wedge b_1 <_B b_2$, then $a_2 \not<_A a_1$ and $b_2 \not<_B b_1$. A symmetric argument show that if $\langle a_2, b_2 \rangle <_L \langle a_1, b_1 \rangle$ holds, then neither of the other two possibilities do.

Also, if $\langle a_1, b_1 \rangle = \langle a_2, b_2 \rangle$, then $a_1 \not<_A a_2$ and $b_1 \not<_B b_2$, and $a_2 \not<_A a_1$ and $b_2 \not<_B b_1$, so neither of the other two possibilities hold. Hence $<_L$ is a linear ordering. \square

Exercise 3.46. Evaluate the following sets:

$$(a) \bigcap \bigcap \langle x, y \rangle.$$

$$(b) \bigcap \bigcap \bigcap \{\langle x, y \rangle\}^{-1}.$$

Solution.

$$\begin{aligned} \bigcap \bigcap \langle x, y \rangle &= \bigcap \bigcap \{\{x\}, \{x, y\}\} \\ &= \bigcap \{x\} = x \end{aligned}$$

Denote $R = \{\langle x, y \rangle\}$, so $R^{-1} = \{\langle x, y \rangle\}^{-1} = \{\langle y, x \rangle\}$. Thus,

$$\begin{aligned} \bigcap \bigcap \bigcap \{\langle x, y \rangle\}^{-1} &= \bigcap \bigcap \bigcap \{\langle y, x \rangle\} \\ &= \bigcap \bigcap \langle y, x \rangle \\ &= y \quad \text{by part (a)} \end{aligned}$$

\square

Exercise 3.47.

(a) Find all of the functions from $\{0, 1, 2\}$ into $\{3, 4\}$.

(b) Find all of the functions from $\{0, 1, 2\}$ into $\{3, 4, 5\}$.

Solution. Without listing them, there are 2^3 functions from $\{0, 1, 2\}$ into $\{3, 4\}$ and $3 \cdot 2 \cdot 1$ functions from $\{0, 1, 2\}$ into $\{3, 4, 5\}$. \square

Exercise 3.48. Let T be the set $\{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\}$.

(a) Find all of the ordered pairs, in any, in $\mathcal{P}T$.

(b) Evaluate and simplify: $(\mathcal{P}T)^{-1} \circ (\mathcal{P}T \upharpoonright \{\emptyset\})$

Solution. Firstly,

$$\mathcal{P}T = \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}, \{\{\emptyset\}\}, \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\}\}.$$

Hence there are no ordered pairs in $\mathcal{P}T$. As such, there are no v such that $\emptyset \mathcal{P}T v$, and thus $\mathcal{P}T \upharpoonright \{\emptyset\} = \emptyset$. It follows immediately that $(\mathcal{P}T)^{-1} \circ (\mathcal{P}T \upharpoonright \{\emptyset\}) = \emptyset$ as well. \square

Exercise 3.49. Find as many equivalence relations as you can on the set $\{0, 1, 2\}$.

Solution. Recall that the number of equivalence relations on a set is the same as the number of distinct partitions of that set. We can partition $\{0, 1, 2\}$ in 5 ways, namely:

- $\{0\}, \{1\}, \{2\}$
- $\{0\}, \{1, 2\}$
- $\{1, \}, \{0, 2\}$
- $\{2\}, \{0, 1\}$
- $\{0, 1, 2\}$

These correspond to the following equivalence relations, with each set in the partition corresponding to an equivalence class. We have

- $R_1 = \{\langle 0, 0 \rangle, \langle 1, 1 \rangle, \langle 2, 2 \rangle\}$
- $R_2 = \{\langle 0, 0 \rangle, \langle 1, 1 \rangle, \langle 2, 2 \rangle, \langle 1, 2 \rangle, \langle 2, 1 \rangle\}$
- $R_3 = \{\langle 1, 1 \rangle, \langle 0, 0 \rangle, \langle 2, 2 \rangle, \langle 0, 2 \rangle, \langle 2, 0 \rangle\}$
- $R_4 = \{\langle 2, 2 \rangle, \langle 0, 0 \rangle, \langle 1, 1 \rangle, \langle 0, 1 \rangle, \langle 1, 0 \rangle\}$
- $R_5 = \{\langle 0, 0 \rangle, \langle 1, 1 \rangle, \langle 2, 2 \rangle, \langle 0, 1 \rangle, \langle 1, 0 \rangle, \langle 0, 2 \rangle, \langle 2, 0 \rangle, \langle 1, 2 \rangle, \langle 2, 1 \rangle\}$

\square

Exercise 3.50.

(a) Find a linear ordering on $\{0, 1, 2, 3\}$ that contains the ordered pairs $\langle 0, 3 \rangle$ and $\langle 2, 1 \rangle$.

(b) Now find a different one meeting the same conditions.

Solution. In an abuse of notation, consider the linear ordering $0 < 2 < 1 < 3$. Indeed, $0 < 3$ and $2 < 1$, as desired. Another possibility is the linear ordering $2 < 0 < 1 < 3$. \square

Exercise 3.51. Find as many linear orderings as possible on the set $\{0, 1, 2\}$ that contain the pair $\langle 2, 1 \rangle$.

Solution. By the trichotomy property, we see that any two distinct elements must be related in some way. Hence we have three possible linear orderings with $2 < 0$, in particular they are $1 < 2 < 0$, $2 < 1 < 0$, and $2 < 0 < 1$. \square

Exercise 3.52. Suppose that $A \times B = C \times D$. Under what conditions can we conclude that $A = C$ and $B = D$?

Solution. We must have that A, B, C, D are all nonempty. If this is the case, for any $\langle a, b \rangle \in A \times B$, $\langle a, b \rangle \in C \times D$, so $a \in C$ and $b \in D$ and thus $A \subseteq C$ and $B \subseteq D$. A parallel argument shows that $C \subseteq A$ and $D \subseteq B$. However, if some of the sets are empty, say $B = D = \emptyset$, then, for example, $\mathbb{Q} \times B = \mathbb{R} \times D = \emptyset$, but clearly $\mathbb{Q} \neq \mathbb{R}$. \square

Exercise 3.53. Show that for any set R and S we have $(R \cup S)^{-1} = R^{-1} \cup S^{-1}$, $(R \cap S)^{-1} = R^{-1} \cap S^{-1}$, and $(R - S)^{-1} = R^{-1} - S^{-1}$.

Solution. Suppose $\langle r, s \rangle \in (R \cup S)^{-1}$, so $\langle s, r \rangle \in R \cup S$. If $\langle s, r \rangle \in R$, then $\langle r, s \rangle \in R^{-1}$, and if by the same reasoning, if $\langle s, r \rangle \in S$, then $\langle r, s \rangle \in S^{-1}$. Hence $(R \cup S)^{-1} \subseteq R^{-1} \cup S^{-1}$. Conversely, if $\langle r, s \rangle \in R^{-1} \cup S^{-1}$, then if $\langle r, s \rangle \in R^{-1}$, then $\langle s, r \rangle \in R$, so $\langle r, s \rangle \in R \cup S$, so $\langle r, s \rangle \in (R \cup S)^{-1}$, thus implying equality. A completely parallel argument shows the equality $(R \cap S)^{-1} = R^{-1} \cap S^{-1}$.

Take $\langle r, s \rangle \in (R - S)^{-1}$, so $\langle s, r \rangle \in R - S$, and thus $\langle s, r \rangle \in R$ and $\langle s, r \rangle \notin S$. Hence $\langle r, s \rangle \in R^{-1}$ but $\langle r, s \rangle \notin S^{-1}$, so $\langle r, s \rangle \in R^{-1} - S^{-1}$. The reverse containment follows, since each of these prior steps is reversible. \square

Exercise 3.54. Prove that the following equations hold for any sets.

$$(a) \quad A \times (B \cap C) = (A \times B) \cap (A \times C).$$

$$(b) \quad A \times (B \cup C) = (A \times B) \cup (A \times C).$$

$$(c) \quad A \times (B - C) = (A \times B) - (A \times C).$$

Solution. The proofs of (a) and (b) are straightforward. For (c) take $\langle x, y \rangle \in A \times (B - C)$. Then $x \in A$ and $y \in B - C$, and thus $y \in B$ but $y \notin C$, so $\langle x, y \rangle \in A \times B$ but $\langle x, y \rangle \notin A \times C$. The converse follows similarly. \square

Exercise 3.55. Answer “yes” or “no.” Where the answer is negative, supply a counterexample.

$$(a) \quad \text{Is it always true that } (A \times A) \cup (B \times C) = (A \cup B) \times (A \cup C)?$$

$$(b) \quad \text{Is it always true that } (A \times A) \cap (B \times C) = (A \cap B) \times (A \cap C)?$$

Solution. The answer to (a) is no. Take $A = \{1\}$, $B = \{2\}$, $C = \{3\}$, and consider the pair $\langle 1, 3 \rangle \in (A \cup B) \times (A \cup C)$. However, clearly $\langle 1, 3 \rangle \notin A \times A$ and $\langle 1, 3 \rangle \notin B \times C$ since $3 \notin A$ and $1 \notin B$, respectively. It is not hard to see that the answer to (b) is yes. \square

Exercise 3.56. Answer “yes” or “no.” Where the answer is negative, supply a counterexample.

(a) Is $\text{dom}(R \cup S)$ always the same as $\text{dom } R \cup \text{dom } S$?

(b) Is $\text{dom}(R \cap S)$ always the same as $\text{dom } R \cap \text{dom } S$?

Solution. The answer to (a) is yes. Take $x \in \text{dom } R \cup S$, then there is some y such that $\langle x, y \rangle \in R \cup S$. If $\langle x, y \rangle \in R$, then $x \in \text{dom } R$, and similarly for S . Conversely, if $x \in \text{dom } R \cup \text{dom } S$, then if $x \in \text{dom } R$, there exists a y such that $\langle x, y \rangle \in R \subseteq R \cup S$, and similarly $\langle x, y \rangle \in S \subseteq R \cup S$ if $x \in \text{dom } S$.

For (b), the answer is no. Consider $R = \{\langle 1, 2 \rangle\}$, $S = \{\langle 1, 3 \rangle\}$, and thus $R \cap S = \emptyset$. Now $1 \in \text{dom } R \cap \text{dom } S$, but $1 \notin \text{dom } R \cap S$, since $R \cap S = \emptyset$, and hence $\text{dom } R \cap S = \emptyset$. \square

Exercise 3.57. Answer “yes” or “no.” Where the answer is negative, supply a counterexample.

(a) Is $R \circ (S \cup T)$ always the same as $(R \circ S) \cup (R \circ T)$?

(b) Is $R \circ (S \cap T)$ always the same as $(R \circ S) \cap (R \circ T)$?

Solution. The answer to (a) is yes. For (b), let $R = \{\langle 3, 2 \rangle, \langle 4, 2 \rangle\}$, $S = \{\langle 1, 3 \rangle\}$ and $T = \{\langle 1, 4 \rangle\}$. So $S \cap T = \emptyset$, and thus $R \circ (S \cap T) = \emptyset$ as well. However by inspection, $\langle 1, 2 \rangle \in (R \circ S) \cap (R \circ T)$, and thus the two sets are not equal. \square

Exercise 3.58. Give an example to show that $F[F^{-1}[S]]$ is not always the same as S .

Solution. Take $S = \{1\}$ and $F = \{\langle 2, 3 \rangle\}$, so $F^{-1} = \{\langle 3, 2 \rangle\}$. Now $F^{-1}[S] = \emptyset$, as 1 is not in the domain of F . It follows then that $F[F^{-1}[S]] = \emptyset$ as well. \square

Exercise 3.59. Show that for any sets $Q \upharpoonright (A \cap B) = (Q \upharpoonright A) \cap (Q \upharpoonright B)$ and $Q \upharpoonright (A - B) = (Q \upharpoonright A) - (Q \upharpoonright B)$.

Solution. Take $\langle u, v \rangle \in Q \upharpoonright (A \cap B)$, so there exists $u \in A \cap B$ such that uQv . Since $u \in A$ and $u \in B$, $\langle u, v \rangle \in Q \upharpoonright A$ and $\langle u, v \rangle \in Q \upharpoonright B$. Conversely, if $\langle u, v \rangle \in (Q \upharpoonright A) \cap (Q \upharpoonright B)$, then uQv and $u \in A$ and $u \in B$, so $u \in A \cap B$, so $\langle u, v \rangle \in Q \upharpoonright (A \cap B)$.

If $\langle u, v \rangle \in Q \upharpoonright (A - B)$. So uQv and $u \in A$ but $u \notin B$. So $\langle u, v \rangle \in Q \upharpoonright A$, but $\langle u, v \rangle \notin Q \upharpoonright B$ so $\langle u, v \rangle \in (Q \upharpoonright A) - (Q \upharpoonright B)$. Conversely, take $\langle u, v \rangle \in (Q \upharpoonright A) - (Q \upharpoonright B)$, so uQv but $u \in A$ and $u \notin B$. So $u \in A - B$, and thus $\langle u, v \rangle \in Q \upharpoonright (A - B)$. \square

Exercise 3.60. Prove that for any sets $(R \circ S) \upharpoonright A = R \circ (S \upharpoonright A)$.

Solution. Take $\langle u, v \rangle \in (R \circ S) \upharpoonright A$. Then $u \in A$ and $u(R \circ S)v$, so there exists some t such that $uSt \wedge tRv$. Now $\langle u, t \rangle \in S \upharpoonright A$ and $\langle t, v \rangle \in R$. Hence $\langle u, v \rangle \in R \circ (S \upharpoonright A)$.

Conversely, take $\langle u, v \rangle \in R \circ (S \upharpoonright A)$. Hence there exists t such that $u(S \upharpoonright A)t$ and tRv . Now $\langle u, t \rangle \in (S \upharpoonright A)$ implies $u \in A$ and uSt , and so $u(R \circ S)v$, which implies $\langle u, v \rangle \in (R \circ S) \upharpoonright A$. \square

4 Natural Numbers

4.1 Inductive Sets

Exercise 4.1. Show that $1 \neq 3$, i.e., that $\emptyset^+ \neq \emptyset^{+++}$.

Solution. By definition of the successor, we have

$$\emptyset^+ = \{\emptyset\} \quad \text{and} \quad \emptyset^{+++} = \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}, \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\}\}.$$

Now take, for instance, $\{\emptyset\} \in \emptyset^{+++}$. However, $\{\emptyset\} \notin \emptyset^+$, and thus by Extensionality, $\emptyset^+ \neq \emptyset^{+++}$. \square

4.2 Peano's Postulates

Exercise 4.2. Show that if a is a transitive set, then a^+ is also a transitive set.

Solution. It suffices to show that for all $x \in a^+$, $x \subseteq a$. Recall $a^+ = a \cup \{a\}$. Take $x \in a^+$. If $x \in a$, then $x \subseteq a \subseteq a^+$, so $x \subseteq a^+$. If $x \in \{a\}$, then $x = a$, and again $x \subseteq a^+$. Hence a^+ is transitive. \square

Exercise 4.3.

(a) Show that if a is a transitive set, then $\mathcal{P}a$ is also a transitive set.

(b) Show that if $\mathcal{P}a$ is a transitive set, then a is also a transitive set.

Solution. Recall that if a is transitive, then $a \subseteq \mathcal{P}a$. So for any $x \in \mathcal{P}a$, we have $x \subseteq a$, and hence $x \subseteq \mathcal{P}a$. Thus $\mathcal{P}a$ is a transitive set.

For (b), if $\mathcal{P}a$ is transitive, then $\bigcup \mathcal{P}a \subseteq \mathcal{P}a$. Since $\bigcup \mathcal{P}a = a$, we have $a \subseteq \mathcal{P}a$. So for any $x \in a$, $x \in \mathcal{P}a$, and thus $x \subseteq a$, so a is a transitive set. \square

Exercise 4.4. Show that if a is a transitive set, then $\bigcup a$ is also a transitive set.

Solution. Take $x \in \bigcup a$. Since a is transitive, $\bigcup a \subseteq a$, and thus $x \in a$. Now take $y \in x$. Recall that $\bigcup a = \{b \mid (\exists c \in a)(b \in c)\}$. It follows that $y \in \bigcup a$, as $y \in x \in a$. Hence $x \subseteq \bigcup a$, and $\bigcup a$ is a transitive set. \square

Exercise 4.5. Assume that every member of \mathcal{A} is a transitive set.

(a) Show that $\bigcup \mathcal{A}$ is a transitive set.

(b) Show that $\bigcap \mathcal{A}$ is a transitive set (assuming that \mathcal{A} is nonempty.)

Solution. Take $x \in \bigcup \mathcal{A}$, so $x \in A$ for some $A \in \mathcal{A}$. Now take $y \in x$, then $y \in x \in A$ and so $y \in A$ since A is a transitive set. It follows that $y \in \bigcup \mathcal{A}$, and thus $x \subseteq \bigcup \mathcal{A}$, so $\bigcup \mathcal{A}$ is a transitive set.

Now take $x \in \bigcap \mathcal{A}$. So for all $A \in \mathcal{A}$, $x \in A$. Take any $y \in x$, and thus since each A is a transitive set, $y \in A$ for all $A \in \mathcal{A}$, so $y \in \bigcap \mathcal{A}$. Hence $\bigcap \mathcal{A}$ is a transitive set. \square

Exercise 4.6. Prove the converse to Theorem 4E: If $\bigcup(a^+) = a$, then a is a transitive set.

Solution. Suppose that $\bigcup(a^+) = a$, we then have the following equalities:

$$a = \bigcup(a^+) = \bigcup(a \cup \{a\}) = \bigcup a \cup \bigcup \{a\} = \bigcup a \cup a.$$

It follows that $\bigcup a \subseteq a$, which is equivalent to saying a is a transitive set. \square

4.3 Recursion on ω

Exercise 4.7. Complete part 4 of the proof of the recursion theorem on ω .

Solution. If h_1 and h_2 satisfy the conclusion of the theorem, then

$$h_1(0) = h_2(0) = a$$

so $0 \in S$. Now suppose that $k \in S$, so that $h_1(k) = h_2(k)$. We then have

$$h_1(k^+) = F(h_1(k)) = F(h_2(k)) = h_2(k^+).$$

So $k^+ \in S$, and hence S is inductive. So $S = \omega$, so $h_1 = h_2$. \square

Exercise 4.8. Let f be a one-to-one function from A into A , and assume that $c \in A - \text{ran } f$. Define $h: \omega \rightarrow A$ by recursion:

$$h(0) = c, \quad h(n^+) = f(h(n)).$$

Show that h is one-to-one.

Solution. Let

$$T = \{n \in \omega \mid (\forall m, n) m \neq n \implies h(m) \neq h(n)\}.$$

Suppose $m \neq 0$. Then by Theorem 4C, $m = p^+$ for some p . Note then that $h(m) = h(p^+) = f(h(p)) \neq c$, since $c \notin \text{ran } f$. So $h(0) = c \neq h(m)$, and thus $0 \in T$. Now suppose $k \in T$, and that $h(k^+) = h(m)$. By the same reasoning above, $m \neq 0$, so $m = p^+$ for some p . Then,

$$f(h(k)) = h(k^+) = h(m) = h(p^+) = f(h(p)).$$

Since f is injective, $h(k) = h(p)$, and thus $k = p$, since $k \in T$. So $k^+ = p^+ = m$, and thus $k^+ \in T$. So T is inductive, and thus $T = \omega$, so h is one-to-one. \square

Exercise 4.9. Let f be a function from B into B , and assume that $A \subseteq B$. We have two possible methods for constructing the “closure” C of A under f . First define C^* to be the intersection of the closed supersets of A :

$$C^* = \bigcap \{X \mid A \subseteq X \subseteq B \wedge f[X] \subseteq X\}.$$

Alternatively, we could apply the recursion theorem to obtain the function h for which

$$h(0) = A \quad h(n^+) = h(n) \cup f[h(n)].$$

Define C_* to be $\bigcup \text{ran } h$; in other words

$$C_* = \bigcup_{i \in \omega} h(i).$$

Show that $C^* = C_*$.

Solution. Note that for all $i \in \omega$, $f[h(i)] \subseteq h(i^+)$. Thus,

$$f[C_*] = \bigcup_{i \in \omega} f[h(i)] \subseteq \bigcup_{i \in \omega} h(i^+) \subseteq \bigcup_{i \in \omega} h(i) = C_*.$$

It follows that $C^* \subseteq C_*$, since clearly $A \subseteq C_* \subseteq B$, and so C_* is one of the sets being intersected to form C^* .

Now let

$$T = \{n \in \omega \mid h(n) \subseteq C^*\}.$$

Note $0 \in T$, since $h(0) = A \subseteq C^*$, as each set X being intersected contains A . Now assume $k \in T$. Since $h(k^+) = h(k) \cup f[h(k)]$, and $h(k) \subseteq C^*$ by hypothesis, it suffices to show that $f[h(k)] \subseteq C^*$. Since $h(k) \subseteq C^*$, $h(k) \subseteq X$ for all X being intersected, and thus $f[h(k)] \subseteq f[X] \subseteq X$. Hence $f[h(k)] \subseteq C^*$ for similar reasoning as above. Hence $h(k^+) \subseteq C^*$ and $k^+ \in T$. So T is inductive, and thus $T = \omega$. Since $h(n) \subseteq C^*$ for all n , $C_* \subseteq C^*$, and equality follows. \square

Exercise 4.10. In Exercise 4.9, assume that B is the set of real numbers, $f(x) = x^2$, and A is the closed interval $[\frac{1}{2}, 1]$. What is the set called C^* and C_* ?

Solution. Note that any set X in the intersection forming C^* must contain $1/2$. Since X is also closed under f , $1/4 \in X$, and thus $1/16 \in X$, and so on. Essentially, if $1/2^n \in X$, then $1/2^{n+1} \in X$. Since this sequence converges to 0, any set in the intersection must contain the interval $[0, 1]$. Since $[0, 1]$ itself is closed under f , and is contained in every set in the intersection, we have $C^* = C_* = [0, 1]$. \square

Exercise 4.11. In Exercise 4.9, assume that B is the set of real numbers, $f(x) = x - 1$, and $A = \{0\}$. What is the set called C^* and C_* ?

Solution. Since $0 \in X$ for each X in the intersection, $-1 \in X$ as well, and thus $-2 \in X$ and so on. So each set must contain the set $\{n \in \mathbb{Z} \mid n \leq 0\}$. Since this set is closed under f , we have that it is equal to C^* . \square

Exercise 4.12. Formulate an analogue to Exercise 4.9 for a function $f: B \times B \rightarrow B$.

Solution. An analogue for the closure of A under f would be the set

$$C^* = \{X \mid A \subseteq X \subseteq B \wedge f[X \times X] \subseteq X\}.$$

□

4.4 Arithmetic

Exercise 4.13. Let m and n be natural numbers such that $m \cdot n = 0$. Show that either $m = 0$ or $n = 0$.

Solution. By the contrapositive, assume $m \neq 0$ and $n \neq 0$. Since $n \neq 0$, $n = p^+$ for some p . Then

$$m \cdot n = M_m(n) = M_m(p^+) = M_m(p) + m \neq 0.$$

The last inequality holds, for if it were equality, then $0 = M_m(p^+) = M_m(p)^+ = \sigma(M_m(p))$, and thus $0 \in \text{ran } \sigma$, contrary to the first of the Peano axioms. □

Exercise 4.14. Call a natural number even if it has the form $2 \cdot m$ for some m . Call it odd if it has the form $(2 \cdot p) + 1$ for some p . Show that each natural number is either even or odd, but never both.

Solution. Recall from Theorem 4K that $+$ and \cdot are commutative. First, let us make two observations.

- For all $n \in \omega$, $n^+ = n + 1$. To see this, let

$$T = \{n \in \omega \mid n^+ = n + 1\}.$$

Note that $0 \in T$, since $0^+ = 1 = 0 + 1$, with this last equality following from Theorem 4K(2). Suppose $k \in T$, so $k^+ = k + 1$. Then $k^{++} = (k + 1)^+ = k^+ + 1$, again by Theorem 4K(2). Hence $T = \omega$.

- For all $n \in \omega$, $n \cdot 1 = n$. To see this, let

$$S = \{n \in \omega \mid n \cdot 1 = n\}.$$

Note $0 \in S$ by (M1). Suppose $k \in S$, so $k \cdot 1 = k$. Then, by (M2) and the first observation,

$$k^+ \cdot 1 = 1 \cdot k^+ = 1 \cdot k + 1 = k \cdot 1 + 1 = k + 1 = k^+.$$

Hence $S = \omega$.

Now let

$$A = \{n \in \omega \mid \exists m(n = 2 \cdot m) \vee \exists p(n = 2 \cdot p + 1)\}.$$

This is the set of natural numbers that are either even or odd. Note that $0 \in A$, since $0 = 2 \cdot 0$. So assume $k \in A$. If k is even, then $k = 2 \cdot m$, so $k^+ = (2 \cdot p)^+ = 2 \cdot p + 1$ by the first observation. So k^+ is odd. If k is odd, then $k = 2 \cdot p + 1$, so by the second observation and the distributive law,

$$k^+ = (2 \cdot p + 1)^+ = 2 \cdot p + 1^+ = 2 \cdot p + 2 = 2 \cdot p + 2 \cdot 1 = 2 \cdot (p + 1).$$

Hence k^+ is even, so $k^+ \in A$. Hence $A = \omega$, and thus all natural numbers are either even or odd.

Now let

$$B = \{n \in \omega \mid \neg(\exists m(n = 2 \cdot m) \wedge \exists p(n = 2 \cdot p + 1))\},$$

the set of all natural numbers that are not both even and odd. We have seen that 0 is even. 0 is not odd, for if $0 = 2 \cdot p + 1$, then $0 = (2 \cdot p)^+ = \sigma(2 \cdot p)$, but then $0 \in \text{ran } \sigma$, contrary to the first Peano axiom. Hence $0 \in B$. Suppose $k \in B$. Suppose k is odd but not even, so $k = 2 \cdot p + 1$ for some p . As seen before, k^+ is thus even. However, k^+ is not odd, for if $k^+ = 2 \cdot m + 1$ for some m , then since the successor function is injective, we have

$$k^+ = 2 \cdot m + 1 = (2 \cdot m)^+ \implies k = 2 \cdot m$$

contrary to the fact that k is not even. Suppose k is even, but not odd. So suppose $k = 2m \neq 2n + 1$. Then since σ is injective,

$$k^+ = (2 \cdot m)^+ \neq (2 \cdot n + 1)^+ \implies k^+ = 2 \cdot m + 1 \neq 2 \cdot n + 1^+ = 2 \cdot n + 2 = 2 \cdot n + 2 \cdot 1 = 2 \cdot (n + 1).$$

So k^+ is odd, but not even. So by induction, $B = \omega$. □

Exercise 4.15. *Prove the associative law of addition*

$$m + (n + p) = (m + n) + p.$$

Solution. Let

$$A = \{p \in \omega \mid m + (n + p) = (m + n) + p\}.$$

Note that $m + (n + 0) = m + n = (m + n) + 0$, so $0 \in A$. So assume $k \in A$. Then,

$$m + (n + k^+) = m + (n + k)^+ = (m + (n + k))^+ = ((m + n) + k)^+ = (m + n) + k^+.$$

So $k^+ \in A$, and thus $A = \omega$. □

Exercise 4.16. *Prove the commutative law for multiplication*

$$m \cdot n = n \cdot m.$$

Solution. First, we prove two preliminary facts.

- Let

$$A = \{n \in \omega \mid 0 \cdot n = 0\}.$$

Note that $0 \cdot 0 = 0$ by (M1), so $0 \in A$. Assume that $k \in A$, so $0 \cdot k = 0$. Thus

$$0 \cdot k^+ = 0 \cdot k + 0 = 0 + 0 = 0,$$

so $k \in A$, and thus $A = \omega$.

- Now let

$$B = \{n \in \omega \mid m^+ \cdot n = m \cdot n + n\}.$$

Note by (M1), $m^+ \cdot 0 = 0 = m \cdot 0 + 0$, so $0 \in B$. Assume $k \in B$, so $m^+ \cdot k = m \cdot k + k$. Then

$$\begin{aligned} m^+ \cdot k^+ &= m^+ \cdot k + m^+ && \text{by M2} \\ &= m \cdot k + k + m^+ && \text{since } k \in B \\ &= m \cdot k + (k + m^+) \\ &= m \cdot k + (k^+ + m) && \text{by the second result} \\ &= m \cdot k + m + k^+ && \text{commutativity of addition} \\ &= m \cdot k^+ + k^+ \end{aligned}$$

Now let

$$C = \{m \in \omega \mid m \cdot n = n \cdot m\}.$$

By the first result, we have $0 \cdot n = 0 = n \cdot 0$, so $0 \in C$. Suppose $k \in C$, so $k \cdot n = n \cdot k$. Then by (M2),

$$k^+ \cdot n = k \cdot n + n = n \cdot k + n = n + k^+.$$

Hence $k^+ \in C$, so $C = \omega$. □

Exercise 4.17. Prove that $m^{n+p} = m^n \cdot m^p$.

Solution. Let

$$A = \{p \in \omega \mid m^{n+p} = m^n \cdot m^p\}.$$

Using the results from the previous exercises, observe that

$$m^{n+0} = m^n = m^n \cdot 1 = m^n \cdot m^0$$

so $0 \in A$. Now assume that $k \in A$, so $m^{n+k} = m^n \cdot m^k$. Then by (A2) and (E2),

$$m^{n+k^+} = m^{(n+k)^+} = m^{n+k} \cdot m = m^n \cdot m^k \cdot m = m^n \cdot m^{k^+}.$$

Hence $k^+ \in A$, so $A = \omega$. □

4.5 Ordering on ω

Exercise 4.18. Simplify: $\in_{\omega}^{-1} \llbracket \{7, 8\} \rrbracket$.

Solution. Observe by definition that

$$\in_{\omega}^{-1} \llbracket \{7, 8\} \rrbracket = \{v \mid \exists u \in \{7, 8\}, u \in_{\omega}^{-1} v\} = \{v \mid \exists u \in \{7, 8\}, v \in_{\omega} u\}.$$

Hence $\in_{\omega}^{-1} \llbracket \{7, 8\} \rrbracket = \{0, 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7\}$. \square

Exercise 4.19. Prove that if m is a natural number and d is a nonzero number, then there exist numbers q and r such that $m = (d \cdot q) + r$ and r is less than d .

Solution. Let

$$B = \{m \in \omega \mid \exists q, r((m = (d \cdot q) + r) \wedge r \in d)\}.$$

Since $0 = d \cdot 0 + 0$, and since $0 \in d$, and so $0 \in B$. Now assume that $k \in B$, so there exist q and r such that $k = (d \cdot q) + r$ for some $r \in d$. It follows that $k^+ = ((d \cdot q) + r)^+ = d \cdot q + r^+$. By Lemma 4L, since $r \in d$, $r^+ \in d^+$, and thus $r^+ \subseteq d$. Now if $r^+ \in d$, the conditions are satisfied, so $k^+ \in B$. If $r^+ = d$, then

$$k^+ = (d \cdot q) + d = (d \cdot q) + d \cdot 1 = d \cdot (q + 1) = d \cdot (q + 1) + 0,$$

and thus $k^+ \in B$, so B is inductive, and thus $B = \omega$. \square

Exercise 4.20. Let A be a nonempty subset of ω such that $\bigcup A = A$. Show that $A = \omega$.

Solution. First, observe that $0 \in A$, since A is nonempty, for any such $p \in A$, $0 \in p$, and thus $0 \in \bigcup A = A$. Now suppose that $k \in A$. Then $k \in \bigcup A$, and so $k \in a$ for some $a \in A$. If $a = k^+$, we have $k^+ \in A$. Note that we can not have $a \in k^+$, otherwise, $a \subseteq k$, which contradicts the trichotomy law. Hence $k^+ \in a$, and so $k^+ \in \bigcup A = A$. In either case, $k^+ \in A$, so A is inductive. Hence $A = \omega$. \square

Exercise 4.21. Show that no natural number is a subset of any of its elements.

Solution. Let n be any natural number. If $n = 0$, the conclusion holds vacuously, so suppose $n \neq 0$. Let $m \in n$ be any member of n . If $n \subseteq m$, then by Corollary 4M, $n \subseteq m$, which contradicts trichotomy. Hence no natural number is a subset of any of its elements. \square

Exercise 4.22. Show that for any natural numbers m and p we have $m \in m + p^+$.

Solution. Since $p^+ \neq 0$, we have $0 \in p^+$. Then by Theorem 4N, $0 + m \in p^+ + m$. Then by commutativity of addition and (A1), we have $m \in m + p^+$. \square

Exercise 4.23. Assume that m and n are natural numbers with m less than n . Show that there is some p in ω for which $m + p^+ = n$.

Solution. First note that $n \neq 0$, since $m \in n$. If $m = 0$, then we can take $0 + p^+ = p^+ = n$, and we know such a p exists since n is nonzero. Now suppose $k \in n$, and that for some p , $k + p^+ = n$. Since $k \in n$, $k^+ \subseteq n$. If $k^+ = n$, then the conclusion holds trivially, since $k^+ \notin n$. If $k^+ \in n$, then observe that

$$k + p^+ = (k + p)^+ = k^+ + p = n.$$

Since $k^+ \neq n$, we have $p \neq 0$, and thus $p = q^+$ for some q . Hence $k^+ + q^+ = n$, and thus conclusion holds for all $m \in n$. Essentially, since we know $0 + n = n$, we can then find a p such that $1 + p^+ = n$, and from this we can find a q such that $2 + q^+ = n$, and so on for all $m \in n$. This must eventually terminate, as n is finite. \square

Exercise 4.24. Assume that $m + n = p + q$. Show that

$$m \in p \Leftrightarrow q \in n.$$

Solution. Suppose $m \in p$. By the previous exercise, there exists some r such that $m + r^+ = p$. Hence $m + n = m + r^+ + q$. Due to the cancellation and commutativity of addition, we then have $n = q + r^+$. It follows immediately from the previous exercises that $q \in n$. A completely parallel argument shows that if $q \in n$, then $m \in p$. \square

Exercise 4.25. Assume that $n \in m$ and $q \in p$. Show that

$$(m \cdot q) + (n \cdot p) \in (m \cdot p) + (n \cdot q).$$

Solution. Since $q \in p$, from Exercise 23 we have that $p = q + s^+$ for some s . Then note

$$\begin{aligned} n \in m &\implies n \cdot s^+ \in m \cdot s^+ \\ &\implies m \cdot q + n \cdot q + n \cdot s^+ \in m \cdot q + n \cdot q + m \cdot s^+ \\ &\implies m \cdot q + n \cdot (q + s^+) \in m \cdot (q + s^+) + n \cdot q \\ &\implies (m \cdot q) + (n \cdot p) \in (m \cdot p) + (n \cdot q). \end{aligned}$$

\square

Exercise 4.26. Assume that $n \in \omega$ and $f: n^+ \rightarrow \omega$. Show that $\text{ran } f$ has a largest element.

Solution. Let

$$A = \{n \in \omega \mid f: n^+ \rightarrow \omega \text{ has a largest element.}\}.$$

If $n = 0$, then $n^+ = 1$, so $\text{ran } f = \{f(0)\}$, and thus trivially possesses a largest element. So suppose $k \in A$, and thus for $f: k^+ \rightarrow \omega$, $\max(\text{ran } f)$ exists. Recall $k^{++} = k^+ \cup \{k^+\}$, and consider $f: k^+ \cup \{k^+\} \rightarrow \omega$. Not $f \llbracket k^+ \rrbracket$ possesses a largest element, call it M . The only other element in $\text{ran } f$ is $f(k^+)$. If $f(k^+) = M$, then $\max \text{ran } f = M = f(k^+)$. If $f(k^+) \in M$, then $\max(\text{ran } f) = M$. If $M \in f(k^+)$, then by transitivity, $\max(\text{ran } f) = f(k^+)$. In any case, $\text{ran } f$ possesses the largest element, so $k^+ \in A$. So for any $n \in \omega$ and $f: n^+ \rightarrow \omega$, $\text{ran } f$ has a largest element.

Alternatively, recall that any natural number is just the set of smaller natural numbers. As such, n^+ is a set with $n^+ = n + 1$ elements. Since f is a function, $\text{ran } f$ can have at most $n + 1$ elements. Thus $\text{ran } f$ is a finite set, and let us say that it has j^+ elements. If $\text{ran } f$ has 1 element, then trivially it has a largest element. Otherwise, take two distinct elements m and n in $\text{ran } f$. By the trichotomy law, $\{m, n\}$ has a largest element. So suppose that any subset A of j or fewer elements of $\text{ran } f$ has a largest element, say $\max A$. Denoting k as the element in the set $\text{ran } f \setminus A$, we see that the largest element of $\text{ran } f$ is the larger of $\max A$ and k , which is sure to exist by trichotomy. \square

Exercise 4.27. Assume that A is a set, G is a function, and f_1 and f_2 map ω into A . Further assume that for each n in ω both $f_1 \upharpoonright n$ and $f_2 \upharpoonright n$ belong to $\text{dom } G$ and

$$f_1(n) = G(f_1 \upharpoonright n) \wedge f_2(n) = G(f_2 \upharpoonright n).$$

Show that $f_1 = f_2$.

Solution. It suffices to show that f_1 and f_2 agree on all elements in ω . Let

$$B = \{m \in \omega \mid f_1(m) = f_2(m)\}.$$

Note that $f_1 \upharpoonright 0 = \{\langle u, v \rangle \mid f(u) = v \wedge u \in 0\} = \emptyset$, since there are no elements in 0. Similarly, $f_2 \upharpoonright 0 = \emptyset$, and so

$$f_1(0) = G(f_1 \upharpoonright 0) = G(\emptyset) = G(f_2 \upharpoonright 0) = f_2(0)$$

and thus $0 \in B$. So assume that $k \in B$, and hence $f_1(k) = f_2(k)$. Then observe that

$$f_1(k^+) = G(f_1 \upharpoonright k^+) = G(f_1 \upharpoonright k) \cup G(f_1 \upharpoonright \{k\}) = G(f_1 \upharpoonright k) \cup G(\langle k, f_1(k) \rangle)$$

and

$$f_2(k^+) = G(f_2 \upharpoonright k^+) = G(f_2 \upharpoonright k) \cup G(f_2 \upharpoonright \{k\}) = G(f_2 \upharpoonright k) \cup G(\langle k, f_2(k) \rangle).$$

By the induction hypothesis, $G(f_1 \upharpoonright k) = G(f_2 \upharpoonright k)$, and since $f_1(k) = f_2(k)$, then $G(\langle k, f_1(k) \rangle) = G(\langle k, f_2(k) \rangle)$. It follows that $f_1(k^+) = f_2(k^+)$, and so $k^+ \in B$. So $B = \omega$, and $f_1 = f_2$. \square

Exercise 4.28. Rewrite the proof of Theorem 4G using, in place of induction, the well ordering of ω .

Solution. Let

$$T = \{n \in \omega \mid n \not\subseteq \omega\}.$$

Suppose $m := \min T$ exists, so $m \not\subseteq \omega$. Now $m \neq 0$, since $0 \subseteq \omega$. Thus $m = p^+$ for some p . Then $m = p \cup \{p\}$. Since $p \in m$, we must have $p \subseteq \omega$. Clearly $\{p\} \subseteq \omega$. It follows that $m \subseteq \omega$, a contradiction. Hence T has no least element, and thus by the well-ordering principle, $T = \emptyset$. It follows that for all $n \in \omega$, $n \subseteq \omega$, and thus ω is transitive. \square

4.6 Review Exercise

Exercise 4.29. Write an expression for the set 4 using only symbols \emptyset , $\{$, $\}$, and commas.

Solution. Recall $4 = \{0, 1, 2, 3\}$. Hence

$$4 = \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}, \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\}, \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}, \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\}\}\}.$$

□

Exercise 4.30. What is $\bigcup 4$? What is $\bigcap 4$?

Solution. By Theorem 4E, $\bigcup(a^+) = a$, and thus $\bigcup 4 = 3 = \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}, \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\}\}$. Also, $\bigcap 4 = 0 \cap 1 \cap 2 \cap 3 = \emptyset$, since any set intersected with \emptyset is again \emptyset . □

Exercise 4.31. What is $\bigcup \bigcup 7$?

Solution. Again by Theorem 4E, we have

$$\bigcup \bigcup 7 = \bigcup 6 = 5.$$

□

Exercise 4.32.

(a) Let $A = \{1\}$. Calculate A^+ and $\bigcup(A^+)$.

(b) What is $\bigcup(\{2\}^+)$?

Solution. First,

$$A^+ = \{1\} \cup \{\{1\}\} = \{1, \{1\}\} = \{\{\emptyset\}, \{\{\emptyset\}\}\}.$$

Hence

$$\bigcup(A^+) = \{\emptyset\} \cup \{\{\emptyset\}\} = \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\} = 2.$$

Also, $\{2\}^+ = \{2\} \cup \{\{2\}\} = \{2, \{2\}\}$. So

$$\bigcup(\{2\}^+) = 2 \cup \{2\} = \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\} \cup \{\{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\}\} = \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}, \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\}\} = 3.$$

□

Exercise 4.33. Which of the following sets are transitive? (For each set S that is not transitive, specify a member of $\bigcup S$ not belonging to S .)

(a) $\{0, 1, \{1\}\}$.

(b) $\{1\}$.

(c) $\langle 0, 1 \rangle$.

Solution.

(a) Note

$$\cup\{0, 1, \{1\}\} = 0 \cup 1 \cup \{1\} = 1 \cup \{1\} = \{\emptyset\} \cup \{\{\emptyset\}\} = \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\} = 2 = \{0, 1\}.$$

Since $\{0, 1\} \subseteq \{0, 1, \{1\}\}$, this set is transitive.

(b) $\cup\{1\} = 1 = \{\emptyset\}$. Note that $\{\emptyset\} \not\subseteq \{1\} = \{\{\emptyset\}\}$, since $\emptyset \notin \{\{\emptyset\}\}$.

(c) Note $\cup\langle 0, 1 \rangle = \cup\{\{0\}, \{0, 1\}\} = \cup\{2\} = 2$. Since $2 = \{0, 1\} \not\subseteq \{\{0\}, \{2\}\}$, since $\emptyset \in 2$, but $\emptyset \notin \{\{0\}, \{2\}\}$.

□

Exercise 4.34. Find suitable a , b , etc. making each of the following sets transitive.

(a) $\{\{\{\emptyset\}\}, a, b\}$.

(b) $\{\{\{\{\emptyset\}\}\}, c, d, e\}$.

Solution. For (a), let $a = \emptyset$ and $b = \{\emptyset\}$. Then

$$\cup\{\{\{\emptyset\}\}, \emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\} = \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\}.$$

Since $\{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\} \subseteq \{\{\{\emptyset\}\}, \emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\}$, the set is transitive.

For (b), let $c = \emptyset$, $d = \{\emptyset\}$, and $e = \{\{\emptyset\}\}$. Then

$$\cup\{\{\{\{\emptyset\}\}\}, \emptyset, \{\emptyset\}, \{\{\emptyset\}\}\} = \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}, \{\{\emptyset\}\}\}.$$

Since $\{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}, \{\{\emptyset\}\}\} \subseteq \{\{\{\{\emptyset\}\}\}, \emptyset, \{\emptyset\}, \{\{\emptyset\}\}\}$, the set is transitive.

□

Exercise 4.35. Let S be the set $\langle 1, 0 \rangle$.

(a) Find a transitive set T_1 for which $S \subseteq T_1$.

(b) Find a transitive set T_2 for which $S \in T_2$.

Solution. Let

$$T_1 = \{\{\{\emptyset\}\}, \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\}, \emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\}$$

and

$$T_2 = \{\{\{\{\emptyset\}\}, \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\}\}, \{\emptyset, \{\emptyset\}\}, \{\{\emptyset\}\}.$$

It is straightforward to verify that both these sets satisfy the conditions of the problem. □

Exercise 4.36. There is a function $h: \omega \rightarrow \omega$ for which $h(0) = 3$ and $h(n^+) = 2 \cdot h(n)$. What is $h(4)$?

Solution. One has the following set of implications:

$$\begin{aligned} h(0) = 3 &\implies h(1) = 2 \cdot h(0) = 6 \\ &\implies h(2) = 2 \cdot h(1) = 12 \\ &\implies h(3) = 2 \cdot h(2) = 24 \\ &\implies h(4) = 2 \cdot h(3) = 48 \end{aligned}$$

□

Exercise 4.37. We will say that a set S has n elements (where $n \in \omega$) iff there is a one-to-one function from n onto S . Assume that A has m elements and B has n elements.

(a) Show that A and B are disjoint, then $A \cup B$ has $m + n$ elements.

(b) Show that $A \times B$ has $m \cdot n$ elements.

Solution. Let $f_1: m \rightarrow A$ and $f_2: n \rightarrow B$ be two possible bijections. Define a new bijection $g: m + n \rightarrow A \cup B$ as such:

$$g(a) = \begin{cases} f_1(a) & \text{if } a \in m \\ f_2(b) & \text{otherwise, where } a = m + b. \end{cases}$$

This equation is a bijection, and since A and B are disjoint, there will be a unique image for each $a \in m + n$.

Define also a bijection $h: m \cdot n \rightarrow A \times B$ as such:

$$g(a) = \langle f_1(i), f_2(j) \rangle \quad \text{if } m \cdot i \subseteq a \in m \cdot i^+ \text{ and } a = (m \cdot i) + j.$$

Essentially for all intervals of m , we holds and element of A fixed, and lets the second coordinate range through all n possibilities for B , before moving to the next interval. \square

Exercise 4.38. Assume that h is the function from ω into ω for which $h(0) = 1$ and $h(n^+) = h(n) + 3$. Give an explicit expression for $h(n)$.

Solution. I claim that $h(n) = 3 \cdot n + 1$ for all $n \in \omega$. Note that $h(0) = 3 \cdot 0 + 1$. Assume that $h(k) = 3 \cdot k + 1$. Then $h(k^+) = h(k) + 3 = 3 \cdot k + 1 + 3 = 3 \cdot (k + 1) + 1 = 3 \cdot k^+ + 1$. So by induction, $h(n) = 3 \cdot n + 1$ for all $n \in \omega$. \square

Exercise 4.39. Assume that h is the function from ω into ω for which $h(0) = 1$ and $h(n^+) = h(n) + (2 \cdot n) + 1$. Give an explicit (not recursive expression for $h(n)$.

Solution. After calculating the first few values, I claim $h(n) = n \cdot n + 1$. Note $h(0) = 0 \cdot 0 + 1 = 1$. So assume $h(k) = k \cdot k + 1$. Then

$$\begin{aligned} h(k^+) &= h(k) + 2 \cdot k + 1 \\ &= k \cdot k + 1 + 2 \cdot k + 1 \\ &= k \cdot k + 2 \cdot k + 2 \\ &= k \cdot k + k + (k + 1) + 1 \\ &= k \cdot (k + 1) + (k + 1) + 1 \\ &= (k + 1) \cdot (k + 1) + 1 \\ &= k^+ \cdot k^+ + 1 \end{aligned}$$

Hence $h(n) = n \cdot n + 1$ for all $n \in \omega$. \square

Exercise 4.40. Assume that h is the function from ω into ω defined by $h(n) = 5 \cdot n + 2$. Express $h(n^+)$ in terms of $h(n)$ as simply as possible.

Solution. Note that

$$h(n^+) = 5 \cdot n^+ + 2 = 5 \cdot n + 5 + 2 = 5 \cdot n + 2 + 5 = h(n) + 5.$$

□

5 Construction of the Real Numbers

5.1 Integers

Exercise 5.1. *Is there a function $F: \mathbb{Z} \rightarrow \mathbb{Z}$ satisfying the equation*

$$F([\langle m, n \rangle]) = [\langle m + n, n \rangle]?$$

Solution. Let

$$\hat{F}: \omega \times \omega \rightarrow \omega \times \omega: \langle m, n \rangle \mapsto \langle m + n, n \rangle.$$

By Theorem 3Q, it is enough to show that G is not compatible with \sim to show that such a function F does not exist. Take for example $\langle 5, 2 \rangle$ and $\langle 3, 0 \rangle$. Then clearly $\langle 5, 3 \rangle \sim \langle 3, 0 \rangle$. Note that $\hat{G}(\langle 5, 2 \rangle) = \langle 5 + 2, 2 \rangle = \langle 7, 2 \rangle$ and $\hat{F}(\langle 3, 0 \rangle) = \langle 3, 0 \rangle$. Hence $\hat{F}(\langle 5, 2 \rangle) \not\sim \hat{F}(\langle 3, 0 \rangle)$, so \hat{F} is not compatible with \sim , and thus no such F exists. □

Exercise 5.2. *Is there a function $G: \mathbb{Z} \rightarrow \mathbb{Z}$ satisfying the equation*

$$G([\langle m, n \rangle]) = [\langle m, m \rangle]?$$

Solution. Let

$$\hat{G}: \omega \times \omega \rightarrow \omega \times \omega: \langle m, n \rangle \mapsto \langle m, m \rangle.$$

Suppose $\langle m, n \rangle \sim \langle m', n' \rangle$. Note that $G(\langle m, n \rangle) \sim G(\langle m', n' \rangle)$, since $\langle m, n \rangle \sim \langle m', n' \rangle$ as clearly $m + m' = m' + m$. Thus \hat{G} is compatible with \sim , and so such a function G exists. In fact, it is simply the function that maps all integers to 0. □

Exercise 5.3. *Is there a function $H: \mathbb{Z} \rightarrow \mathbb{Z}$ satisfying the equation*

$$H([\langle m, n \rangle]) = [\langle n, m \rangle]?$$

Solution. Let

$$\hat{H}: \omega \times \omega \rightarrow \omega \times \omega: \langle m, n \rangle \mapsto \langle n, m \rangle.$$

Note that if $\langle m, n \rangle \sim \langle m', n' \rangle$ then $m + n' = m' + n$, and so $n + m' = n' + m$, and hence $\langle n, m \rangle \sim \langle n', m' \rangle$, or $\hat{H}(\langle m, n \rangle) \sim \hat{H}(\langle m', n' \rangle)$. Since \hat{H} is compatible with \sim , and thus by Theorem 3Q, such a function H exists. □

Exercise 5.4. *Prove that $+\mathbb{Z}$ is associative.*

Solution. Let $a = [\langle m, n \rangle]$, $b = [\langle p, q \rangle]$, and $c = [\langle r, s \rangle]$. Then

$$\begin{aligned}
 (a +_{\mathbb{Z}} b) +_{\mathbb{Z}} c &= ([\langle m, n \rangle] +_{\mathbb{Z}} [\langle p, q \rangle]) +_{\mathbb{Z}} [\langle r, s \rangle] \\
 &= ([\langle m + p, n + q \rangle]) +_{\mathbb{Z}} [\langle r, s \rangle] \\
 &= [\langle (m + p) + r, (n + q) + s \rangle] \\
 &= [\langle m + (p + r), n + (q + s) \rangle] \quad \text{by the associativity of natural numbers} \\
 &= [\langle m, n \rangle] +_{\mathbb{Z}} [\langle p + r, q + s \rangle] \\
 &= [\langle m, n \rangle] +_{\mathbb{Z}} ([\langle p, q \rangle] +_{\mathbb{Z}} [\langle r, s \rangle]) \\
 &= a +_{\mathbb{Z}} (b +_{\mathbb{Z}} c)
 \end{aligned}$$

□

Exercise 5.5. Give a formula for subtraction of integers:

$$[\langle m, n \rangle] - [\langle p, q \rangle] = ?$$

Solution. Informally, we would like to have that

$$(m - n) - (p - q) = (m + q) - (n + p)$$

which suggests that we should define subtraction of integers by the formula

$$[\langle m, n \rangle] - [\langle p, q \rangle] = [\langle m + q, n + p \rangle].$$

Note this is well defined. Suppose $\langle m, n \rangle \sim \langle m', n' \rangle$ and $\langle p, q \rangle \sim \langle p', q' \rangle$. So

$$m + n' = m' + n \quad \text{and} \quad p + q' = p' + q.$$

Adding the first equation to the reverse of the second yields

$$m + q + n' + p' = m' + q' + n + p$$

which implies $\langle m + q, n + p \rangle \sim \langle m' + q', n' + p' \rangle$. This justifies the definition of $-_{\mathbb{Z}}$. □

Exercise 5.6. Show that $a \cdot_{\mathbb{Z}} 0_{\mathbb{Z}} = 0_{\mathbb{Z}}$ for every integer a .

Solution. Let $a = [\langle m, n \rangle]$. Then

$$a \cdot_{\mathbb{Z}} 0_{\mathbb{Z}} = [\langle m, n \rangle] \cdot_{\mathbb{Z}} [\langle 0, 0 \rangle] = [\langle m \cdot 0 + n \cdot 0, m \cdot 0 + n \cdot 0 \rangle] = [\langle 0, 0 \rangle] = 0_{\mathbb{Z}},$$

where we use the fact that $0 \cdot k = 0$ for $k \in \omega$, and $0 + 0 = 0$. □

Exercise 5.7. Show that

$$a \cdot_{\mathbb{Z}} (-b) = (-a) \cdot_{\mathbb{Z}} b = -(a \cdot_{\mathbb{Z}} b)$$

for all integers a and b .

Solution. Let $a = [\langle m, n \rangle]$ and $b = [\langle p, q \rangle]$. Then

$$a \cdot_{\mathbb{Z}} (-b) = [\langle m, n \rangle] \cdot_{\mathbb{Z}} [\langle q, p \rangle] = [\langle mq + np, mp + nq \rangle]$$

and

$$(-a) \cdot_{\mathbb{Z}} b = [\langle n, m \rangle] \cdot_{\mathbb{Z}} [\langle p, q \rangle] = [\langle np + mq, nq + mp \rangle].$$

Hence by the commutativity of $+$ and \cdot on ω , we have $a \cdot_{\mathbb{Z}} (-b) = (-a) \cdot_{\mathbb{Z}} b$. Also, observe

$$a \cdot_{\mathbb{Z}} b + (-a) \cdot_{\mathbb{Z}} b = [\langle mp + nq + np + mq, mq + np + nq + mp \rangle] = [\langle 0, 0 \rangle] = 0_{\mathbb{Z}}.$$

Since inverses are unique, we must have that $(-a) \cdot_{\mathbb{Z}} b = -(a \cdot_{\mathbb{Z}} b)$ and so

$$a \cdot_{\mathbb{Z}} (-b) = (-a) \cdot_{\mathbb{Z}} b = -(a \cdot_{\mathbb{Z}} b).$$

□

Exercise 5.8. Prove parts (a), (b), and (c) of Theorem 5ZL.

Solution. For $m, n \in \omega$,

$$(a) \ E(m + n) = [\langle m + n, 0 \rangle] = [\langle m, 0 \rangle] +_{\mathbb{Z}} [\langle n, 0 \rangle] = E(m) + E(n).$$

$$(b) \ \text{Since } 0 \cdot k = 0 \text{ for } k \in \omega,$$

$$E(mn) = [\langle mn, 0 \rangle] = [\langle m, 0 \rangle] \cdot_{\mathbb{Z}} [\langle n, 0 \rangle] = E(m) \cdot_{\mathbb{Z}} E(n).$$

(c) Note

$$m \in n \iff m + 0 \in n + 0 \iff [\langle m, 0 \rangle] <_{\mathbb{Z}} [\langle n, 0 \rangle] \iff E(m) <_{\mathbb{Z}} E(n).$$

□

Exercise 5.9. Show that

$$[\langle m, n \rangle] = E(m) - E(n)$$

for all natural numbers m and n .

Solution. Indeed,

$$[\langle m, n \rangle] = [\langle m, 0 \rangle] +_{\mathbb{Z}} [\langle 0, n \rangle] = [\langle m, 0 \rangle] - [\langle n, 0 \rangle] = E(m) - E(n).$$

□

5.2 Rational Numbers

Exercise 5.10. Show that $r \cdot_{\mathbb{Q}} 0_{\mathbb{Q}} = 0_{\mathbb{Q}}$ for every rational number r .

Solution. Let $r = [\langle a, b \rangle]$, with $b \neq 0_{\mathbb{Z}}$. Then

$$r \cdot_{\mathbb{Q}} 0_{\mathbb{Q}} = [\langle a, b \rangle] \cdot_{\mathbb{Q}} [\langle 0, 1 \rangle] = [\langle a \cdot 0, b \cdot 1 \rangle] = [\langle 0, b \rangle] = [\langle 0, 1 \rangle] = 0_{\mathbb{Q}}.$$

□

Exercise 5.11. Give a direct proof that if $r \cdot_{\mathbb{Q}} s = 0_{\mathbb{Q}}$, then either $r = 0_{\mathbb{Q}}$ or $s = 0_{\mathbb{Q}}$.

Solution. Let $r = [\langle a, b \rangle]$ and $s = [\langle c, d \rangle]$, and suppose $r \cdot_{\mathbb{Q}} s = 0_{\mathbb{Q}}$. Then

$$\begin{aligned} r \cdot_{\mathbb{Q}} s = 0_{\mathbb{Q}} &\iff [\langle ac, bd \rangle] = [\langle 0, 1 \rangle] \\ &\iff ac \cdot_{\mathbb{Z}} 1 = bd \cdot_{\mathbb{Z}} 0 \\ &\iff ac = 0_{\mathbb{Z}} \\ &\iff a = 0_{\mathbb{Z}} \vee b = 0_{\mathbb{Z}} \quad \text{since } \mathbb{Z} \text{ is an integral domain.} \end{aligned}$$

If $a = 0_{\mathbb{Z}}$, then $r = 0_{\mathbb{Q}}$, and likewise for s if $b = 0_{\mathbb{Z}}$.

□

Exercise 5.12. Show that

$$r <_{\mathbb{Q}} 0_{\mathbb{Q}} \quad \text{iff} \quad 0_{\mathbb{Q}} <_{\mathbb{Q}} -r.$$

Solution. Let $r = [\langle a, b \rangle]$ with $b \neq 0_{\mathbb{Z}}$. Suppose $r <_{\mathbb{Q}} 0_{\mathbb{Q}}$, so

$$\begin{aligned} [\langle a, b \rangle] <_{\mathbb{Q}} [\langle 0, 1 \rangle] &\iff a \cdot 1 < 0 \cdot b = 0 \\ &\iff a < 0 \\ &\iff 0 < -a \\ &\iff 0 \cdot b < (-a) \cdot 1 \\ &\iff 0_{\mathbb{Q}} <_{\mathbb{Q}} -r \end{aligned}$$

since $-r = [\langle -a, b \rangle]$.

□

Exercise 5.13. Give a new proof of the cancellation law for $+_{\mathbb{Z}}$ using Theorem 5ZD instead of Theorem 5ZJ.

Solution. Theorem 5ZD tells us that additive inverses for integers exist. So suppose $a +_{\mathbb{Z}} c = b +_{\mathbb{Z}} c$. The additive inverse of c , call it $-c$, exists, and adding it to both sides yields the implications

$$a +_{\mathbb{Z}} c +_{\mathbb{Z}} (-c) = b +_{\mathbb{Z}} c +_{\mathbb{Z}} (-c) \implies a +_{\mathbb{Z}} 0_{\mathbb{Z}} = b +_{\mathbb{Z}} 0_{\mathbb{Z}} \implies a = b.$$

□

Exercise 5.14. Show that the ordering of rationals is dense, i.e., between any two rationals there is a third one:

$$p <_{\mathbb{Q}} s \implies (\exists r)(p <_{\mathbb{Q}} r <_{\mathbb{Q}} s).$$

Solution. Let $p = [\langle a, b \rangle]$ and $s = [\langle c, d \rangle]$, with $b, d > 0_{\mathbb{Z}}$. Note that this implies $ad <_{\mathbb{Z}} cb$, as well as $abd <_{\mathbb{Z}} bbc$ and $add <_{\mathbb{Z}} bcd$ since b and d are positive. Now let

$$r = (p +_{\mathbb{Q}} s) \div [\langle 2, 1 \rangle] = [\langle ad + cb, bd \rangle] \cdot_{\mathbb{Q}} [\langle 1, 2 \rangle] = [\langle ad + cb, 2bd \rangle].$$

Using the inequalities mentioned above, observe

$$2abd = abd + abd <_{\mathbb{Z}} abd + bbc = b \cdot (ad + cb)$$

from which it follows that $p <_{\mathbb{Q}} r$. Also,

$$(ad + cb) \cdot d = add + bcd < bcd + bcd = 2bcd$$

from which it follows that $r <_{\mathbb{Q}} s$, and so $p <_{\mathbb{Q}} r <_{\mathbb{Q}} s$, showing that the ordering of the rational numbers is dense. \square

Exercise 5.15. In Theorem 5RB, show that $\bigcup A$ is closed downward and has no largest element.

Solution. Suppose $q \in \bigcup A$, so for some $x \in A$, $q \in x$. Take any $r < q$, then since x is downward closed, $r \in x$. It follows that $r \in \bigcup A$, so $\bigcup A$ is closed downward.

Now take any $p \in \bigcup A$. So $p \in x$ for some $x \in A$. Since x has no largest element, there is some $q \in x$ such that $p < q$. Of course, $q \in \bigcup A$ as well. Hence for any $p \in \bigcup A$, we can always find some element $q \in \bigcup A$ larger than p , so $\bigcup A$ has no largest element. \square

Exercise 5.16. In Lemma 5RC, show that $x +_R y$ has no largest element.

Solution. Take any $q + r \in x +_R y$. So $q \in x$ and $r \in y$. Since neither x nor y has a largest element, there exist $q' \in x$ and $r' \in y$ such that $q < q'$ and $r < r'$. Since addition preserves order in the rationals, $q + r < q' + r' \in x +_R y$. Hence $x +_R y$ has no largest element. \square

Exercise 5.17. Assume that a is a positive integer. Show that for any integer b there is some k in ω with

$$b < a \cdot E(k).$$

Solution. In the argument that follows, $<$ shall be used to denote $<_{\mathbb{Z}}$. Firstly, if $b \leq 0$, then clearly $b < a$, so take $k = 1$. Then $b < a = a \cdot 1_{\mathbb{Z}} = a \cdot E(1)$.

Now suppose that $b > 0$. Let $b = [\langle m, n \rangle]$. Since $b = [\langle m, n \rangle] > [\langle 0, 0 \rangle]$, we have $0 + n = n \in m = 0 + m$. Then $b = [\langle m, n \rangle] < [\langle m + 1, 0 \rangle] = E(m + 1)$, since $m + 0 = m \in (m + 1) + n$, as $m \in m + 1$ and $0 \in n$. Since $0 < a$, we have by Theorem 5ZJ that $b \cdot a < E(m + 1) \cdot a$. Now since $1 \leq a$, we also have $b = b \cdot 1 \leq b \cdot a$. It follows then that

$$b \leq b \cdot a < E(m + 1) \cdot a.$$

By transitivity and commutativity of multiplication, we then have that $b < a \cdot E(m + 1)$, so take $k = m + 1$. \square

Exercise 5.18. Assume that p is a positive rational number. Show that for any rational number r there is some k in ω with

$$r < p \cdot E(E(k)).$$

(Here k is in ω , $E(k)$ is the corresponding integer, and $E(E(k))$ is the corresponding rational.)

Solution. First, if $r \leq 0$, then $r < p$, and so $r < p = p \cdot 1_Q = p \cdot E(E(1))$ since

$$E(E(1)) = E([\langle 1, 0 \rangle]) = E(1_Z) = [\langle 1, 1 \rangle] = 1_Q.$$

Now suppose $0 < r$. Denote $r = [\langle m, n \rangle]$. Note that $[\langle 0, 1 \rangle] < [\langle m, n \rangle]$ implies $0 \cdot n < m \cdot 1$, so m is positive. Furthermore, denote $p = [\langle s, t \rangle]$, with $s > 0$ since p is positive. Consider $E(E((m+1) \cdot t)) = [\langle (m+1) \cdot t, 1 \rangle]$. I claim $r < p \cdot E(E((m+1) \cdot t))$. Observe

$$\begin{aligned} p \cdot E(E((m+1) \cdot t)) &= [\langle s, t \rangle] \cdot [\langle (m+1) \cdot t, 1 \rangle] \\ &= [\langle s \cdot (m+1) \cdot t, t \rangle] \\ &= [\langle s \cdot (m+1), 1 \rangle] \quad \text{by canceling the } t. \end{aligned}$$

Now $m < m+1$, and since n and s are both positive integers, $1 \leq n \cdot s$. Then by Theorem 5QJ we have

$$m = m \cdot 1 \leq m \cdot (n \cdot s) < (m+1) \cdot n \cdot s.$$

from which it follows that $[\langle m, n \rangle] < [\langle s \cdot (m+1), 1 \rangle]$, so $r < p \cdot E(E((m+1) \cdot t))$. Hence take $k = (m+1) \cdot t$. \square

Exercise 5.19. Assume that p is a positive rational number. Show that for any real number x there is some rational q in x such that

$$p + q \notin x.$$

Solution. We will assume that the following properties hold for the rationals: if $p > 0$ and $q < 0$, then $pq < 0$. Also, $(-p)q = p(-q) = -(pq)$, both of which is easily verifiable by applying the definitions of orderings on \mathbb{Q} , \mathbb{Z} , and ω .

Now, a modification of the result of the previous exercise. I claim that if p is a positive rational, and r is any rational, then there exists an integer $n \in \mathbb{Z}$ such that $p \cdot E(n) < r$. If $r \geq 0_Q$, then we make take any $n < 0_Z$, and hence $E(n) < 0_Q$, so $p \cdot E(n) < r$. If $r < 0_Q$, then observe that

$$p \cdot E(n) < r \iff -r < -(p \cdot E(n)) = p \cdot (-E(n))$$

as we may add the additive inverse of each to both sides, and the equality follows from one of our originally stated properties. Now $-r > 0_Q$, so it follows that $-E(n) > 0_Q$ as well. So $-E(n) = E(E(k))$ for some $k \in \omega$, so we know $-r < p \cdot (-E(n))$ holds by the previous exercise. Hence $p \cdot E(n) < r$ for some $n \in \mathbb{Z}$.

Now since $x \neq \mathbb{Q}$, we know there is some $r \notin x$. By the previous exercise, there is some $k \in \omega$ such that $r < p \cdot E(E(k))$. Hence $p \cdot E(E(k)) \notin x$. Similarly, since $x \neq \emptyset$, there is

some rational $s \in x$, and we know there is some $n \in \mathbb{Z}$ such that $p \cdot E(n) < s$, and thus $p \cdot E(n) \in x$. Now consider the set

$$A = \{m \in \mathbb{Z} \mid p \cdot E(m) \notin x\}.$$

Note that this set is nonempty, but bounded below by n , since for any m such that $p \cdot E(m) \notin x$, we must have $m > n$, since x is downward closed. It follows that there is a least such m such that $p \cdot E(m) \notin x$, and thus $p \cdot E(m-1) \in x$. We may take $q = p \cdot E(m-1)$, and thus

$$p + q = p + p \cdot E(m-1) = p \cdot (1_Q + E(m-1)) = p \cdot (E(1) + E(m-1)) = p \cdot E(m),$$

and thus $p + q \notin x$.² □

Exercise 5.20. Show that for any real number x , we have $0_R \leq_R |x|$.

Solution. To prove this statement is equivalent to proving

$$\{r \in \mathbb{Q} \mid r < 0\} \subseteq \{p \in \mathbb{Q} \mid (\exists s > p) -s \notin x\}.$$

Take $r \in 0_R$, so $r < 0$. If $r \in x$, we are done, so suppose $r \notin x$. Since $r < 0$, it follows that for all $y \in x$, $y < 0$, for if $y \geq 0$, then we would have that $r \in x$. Hence x contains only negative rational numbers. Let $s = 0$. Then $s > r$, $-s = 0$ (since $0 + 0 = 0$), and hence $-s \notin x$. So $r \in -x$, thus proving the containment. □

Exercise 5.21. Show that if $x <_R y$, then there is a rational number r with

$$x <_R E(r) <_R y.$$

Solution. First, we will prove the archimedean property of \mathbb{R} . That is, if $x, y \in \mathbb{R}$ and $x > 0_R$, then there exists a positive $n \in \mathbb{Z}$ such that $y <_R x \cdot E(E(n))$.

Let

$$A = \{x \cdot E(E(n)) \mid n \in \mathbb{Z} \wedge n > 0_Z\}.$$

Suppose that the above claim is not true, so it is not the case that there exists an n such that $x \cdot E(E(n)) >_R y$. That is, $x \cdot E(E(n)) \leq_R y$ for all n , so y is an upper bound of A . By Theorem 5RB, A has a supremum, so let $\alpha = \sup A$. Since $x > 0_R$, it follows that $\alpha - x < \alpha$, and thus $\alpha - x$ is not an upper bound of A . So

$$\alpha - x < x \cdot E(E(m)) \quad \text{for some } m \in \mathbb{Z}.$$

So

$$\alpha < x \cdot E(E(m)) + x \cdot E(E(1)) = x \cdot (E(E(m)) + E(E(1))) = x \cdot E(E(m+1)),$$

as the composition of homomorphisms is again a homomorphism. Hence we reach a contradiction, since α is an upper bound of A , so the archimedean property holds.

²Thanks to Andres Caicedo for his suggestions and sketch proof.

Now suppose $x <_R y$, so $0 <_R y - x$. By the archimedean property, there exists an $n \in \mathbb{Z}$ such that

$$E(E(n)) \cdot (y - x) >_R 1.$$

Furthermore, there exist $m_1, m_2 \in \mathbb{Z}$ such that $m_1 >_R x \cdot E(E(n))$ and $E(E(m_2)) >_R x \cdot (-E(E(n)))$. Hence

$$-E(E(m_2)) <_R E(E(n)) \cdot x <_R E(E(m_1)).$$

Now $x \cdot E(E(n))$ is a real number, and so taking $p = 1$ in Exercise 5.18, we see there is an integer k such that $E(E(k)) \in x$ but $E(E(k+1)) \notin x$. That is,

$$E(E(m-1)) <_R x \cdot E(E(n)) <_R E(E(m))$$

where we write $k = m + 1$. So

$$x \cdot E(E(n)) <_R E(E(m)) \leq_R x \cdot E(E(n)) + 1 <_R y \cdot E(E(n))$$

and thus

$$x \cdot E(E(n)) <_R E(E(m)) <_R y \cdot E(E(n)).$$

Now since n is nonzero, both $E(n)$ and $E(E(n))$ are also nonzero, since it is the composition of injections. Then by Theorem 5RI(d), there is a nonzero real y , such that $x \cdot y = 1_R$. Denote such a y as $E(E(n))^{-1}$. Note that $E(E(n)^{-1}) \cdot E(E(n)) = E(E(n)^{-1} \cdot E(n)) = E(1_Q) = 1_R$, since E is a homomorphism, and then since E is injective, we have that $E(E(n))^{-1} = E(E(n)^{-1})$. So altogether,

$$E(E(n)^{-1}) \cdot E(E(n)) = E(E(n)^{-1} \cdot E(n)),$$

with $E(n)^{-1} \cdot E(n) \in \mathbb{Q}$. So multiplying through yields

$$x <_R (E(n)^{-1} \cdot E(n)) \cdot E(m) <_R y$$

Taking this to be the desired r , we have

$$x <_R E(E(n)^{-1} \cdot E(n)) \cdot E(m) <_R y.$$

□

Exercise 5.22. Assume that $x \in \mathbb{R}$. How do we know that $|x| \in \mathbb{R}$?

Solution. Recall $|x| = x \cup -x$. Since $x \neq \emptyset$ and $-x \neq \emptyset$, clearly $|x| \neq \emptyset$. Suppose now that $x <_R 0_R$. Then for any $q \in x$, $0 > q$, and $-0 = 0 \notin x$, since $0 \notin 0_R$, and consequently not in x . Hence $q \in -x$, and thus $x \subseteq -x$. Hence $|x| = x \cup -x = -x \neq \mathbb{Q}$.

Suppose instead that $x \geq_R 0$. Suppose $r \geq 0$, then if $s > r$, then $s > 0$, and so $-s < 0$. Thus $s \in x$, so $r \notin -x$. So if $r \in -x$, then necessarily $r < 0$, and so $r \in x$. Hence $-x \subseteq x$, and so $|x| = x \cup -x = x \neq \mathbb{Q}$. Hence $\emptyset \neq |x| \neq \mathbb{Q}$.

Now suppose $q \in |x|$. Suppose $r < q$. If $q \in x$, then $r \in x$ since x is downward closed, so $r \in |x|$. Similarly, if $q \in -x$, then $r \in -x$, since $-x$ is downward closed, so $r \in |x|$.

Now take any $p \in |x|$. If $p \in x$, there exists some $p' \in x$ such that $p' > p$, since x has no greatest element. If $p \in -x$, there exists some $p'' \in -x$ such that $p'' > p$, since $-x$ has no greatest element. In either case, p' or p'' is in $|x|$, and so $|x|$ has no greatest element. Altogether, $|x| \in \mathbb{R}$. □