Data Race Report

Yulei Sui and Peng Di

May 13th 2014

1 Thread API

1.1 Thread Management

The following APIs create/destroy/join/detach a thread

1.1.1 Create and Terminating a Thread:

- pthread_create(thread, attr, start_routine, arg)
 A thread (including main) spawns a new thread to call a *start_routine* with an argument *arq*
- pthread_exit (status) A thread returns normally from its starting rountine, or call pthread_exit to early terminte itself.
- exec() or exit() The entire process is terminated

1.1.2 Hard to be statically modeled:

The following APIs are hard to model due to its

- pthread_cancel(thread)

 One thread is terminated by other thread.
- pthread_join(threadid, status)
 - Blocks the calling thread until the specified *threadid* thread (must be created joinable) terminates. Clean up any resources associated with the thread.
- pthread_detach(threadid) The thread are never going to join with the spawner thread again This allows the pthread library to know whether it can immediately dispose of the thread resources once the thread exits (the detached case) or whether it must keep them around because it may later call pthread_join on the spawner thread.

Multiple pthread_detach calls on the same target thread causes an error

1.2 Mutexes 1 THREAD API

1.2 Mutexes

1.2.1 Creating and Destroying Mutexes

A mutex variable and its attributes need to be initialized and destroyed when they are not used.

• pthread_mutex_init (mutex,attr)

A mutex variable must be initialized before they can be used

pthread_mutex_destroy (mutex)

If a mutex variable is destroyed, then it can not be used later

• pthread_mutexattr_init (attr)

A mutex variable attribute must be initialized before they can be used

• pthread_mutexattr_destroyed (attr)

If a mutex attribute is destroyed, then it can not be used later

1.2.2 Locking and Unlocking Mutexes

Locking and unlocking a mutex variable is used to protect the code segments to avoid data race.

pthread_mutex_lock (mutex)

Acquire a lock on a mutex variable by a thread, if the mutex is already locked by another thread, the call will be blocked until the mutex variable is released.

- pthread_mutex_trylock (mutex) Attempt to lock a mutex variable, if the mutex is already locked, return a "busy" to prevent deadlock
- pthread_mutex_unlock (mutex) Release a mutex by the owning thread. An error occur if (1) mutex was already unlocked (2) the mutex is owned by another thread.

1.3 Condition Variables

1.3.1 Creating and Destroying Condition Variables

Similar as mutex variables, conditional variables must be initialized first and destroyed when they are not used any more.

• pthread_cond_init (condition, attr)
Create a condition variable

- pthread_cond_destroy (condition, attr)

 Destroy a condition variable
- pthread_cond_init (attr)
 Initialize a condition variable attribute
- pthread_cond_destroy (attr)

 Destroy a condition variable attribute

1.3.2 Waiting and Signaling

Condition variable provide another way for threads to synchronize. It synchronize based on actual values of data instead of controlling thread access to data

• pthread_cond_wait (condition,mutex)

Block the calling thread until the *condition* is signalled. It automatically and atomically releases mutex and wait for the signal. After signal is received the mutex will be automatically and atomically locked

• pthread_cond_signal (condition)

Signal (weak up) another thread which is waiting on the condition variable. It should be called after *mutex* is locked and unlock *mutex* in order for pthread_cond_wait to complete

• pthread_cond_broadcast (condition)

Broadcast signal to weak up more than one thread

2 Statistic From Existing Tools

3 Dynamic Data Race Detection

This section introduces dynamic data race algorithm implemented in Thread-Sanitizer (TSan).

$$[\text{FORK}] \qquad \frac{fork(i \triangleright j)}{C_i := inc_i(C_i) \quad C_j := C_i \sqcup C_j}$$

$$[\text{JOIN}] \qquad \frac{join(i \triangleleft j)}{C_i := C_i \sqcup C_j \quad C_j := inc_j(C_j)}$$

$$[\text{ACQUIRE}] \qquad \frac{acquire(i,l)}{C_i := C_i \sqcup C_l}$$

$$[\text{RELEASE}] \qquad \frac{acquire(i,l)}{C_i := inc_i(C_i) \quad C_l := C_i}$$

$$[\text{LOAD}] \qquad \frac{i : p = *q \quad E_w(\sigma(*q)) \sqsubseteq C_i}{\sigma(*q) := [i,load,addr(*q),C_i]}$$

$$[\text{STORE}] \qquad \frac{i : *p = q \quad E_r(\sigma(*p)) \sqsubseteq C_i \quad E_w(\sigma(*p)) \sqsubseteq C_i}{\sigma(*p) := [i,store,addr(*p),C_i]}$$

	Create	Join	Lock	Trylock	Unlock	Cancel	Exit	Detach
parsec.blackscholes.res	1	1	0	0	0	0	0	0
parsec.bodytrack.res	1	1	1	1	1	0	0	0
parsec.ferret.res	1	1	3	0	4	1	0	0
parsec.fluidanimate.res	1	1	6	2	10	0	0	0
parsec.raytrace.res	2	0	24	0	30	0	0	0
parsec.swaptions.res	1	1	0	0	0	0	0	0
parsec.vips.res	14	14	56	14	70	0	14	0
parsec.x264.res	2	4	4	0	4	0	0	0
parsec.canneal.res	1	1	1	0	1	0	0	0
parsec.dedup.res	5	5	6	0	7	0	0	0
parsec.streamcluster.res	1	1	4	2	8	0	0	0
parsec.glib.res	43	43	0	43	0	0	43	0
parsec.libxml2.res	2	2	132	0	165	0	0	0
parsec.zlib.res	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
parsec.tools.yasm.res	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
splash.res	16	16	133	0	148	0	0	0
splash2.barnes.res	1	1	12	0	12	0	0	0
splash2.fmm.res	1	1	41	0	41	0	0	0
splash2.ocean_cp.res	1	1	24	0	24	0	0	0
splash2.ocean_ncp.res	1	1	23	0	23	0	0	0
splash2.radiosity.res	3	3	38	0	50	0	0	0
splash2.raytrace.res	1	1	13	0	16	0	0	0
splash2.volrend.res	1	1	23	0	23	0	0	0
splash2.water_nsquared.res	1	1	18	0	18	0	0	0
splash2.water_spatial.res	1	1	19	0	19	0	0	0
splash2.cholesky.res	1	1	11	0	11	0	0	0
splash2.fft.res	1	1	8	0	8	0	0	0
splash2.lu_cb.res	1	1	6	0	6	0	0	0
splash2.lu_ncb.res	1	1	6	0	6	0	0	0
splash2.radix.res	1	1	13	0	13	0	0	0
splash2x.barnes.res	1	1	14	0	14	0	0	0
splash2x.fmm.res	1	1	46	0	46	0	0	0
splash2x.ocean_cp.res	1	1	24	0	24	0	0	0
splash2x.ocean_ncp.res	1	1	23	0	23	0	0	0
splash2x.radiosity.res	3	3	74	0	103	0	0	0
splash2x.raytrace.res	1	1	15	0	20	0	0	0
splash2x.volrend.res	1	1	22	0	23	0	0	0
splash2x.water_nsquared.res	1	1	20	0	20	0	0	0
splash2x.water_spatial.res	1	1	20	0	20	0	0	0
splash2x.cholesky.res	1	1	12	0	13	0	0	0
splash2x.fft.res	1	1	8	0	8	0	0	0
splash2x.lu_cb.res	1	1	7	0	7	0	0	0
splash2x.lu_ncb.res	1	1_	7	0	7	0	0	0
splash2x.radix.res	1	1^5	13	0	13	0	0	0

Table 1: Pthread API methods invocations on LLVM IR of Parsec/Splash2

Program	Reads Count	Writes Count	Ignored Reads Count
parsec.blackscholes	236	120	25
parsec.bodytrack	16993	14265	803
parsec.canneal	1669	1364	94
parsec.dedup	2301	1440	1576
parsec.ferret	10763	4110	791
parsec.fluidanimate	1567	601	132
parsec.raytrace	669	561	19
parsec.streamcluster	1142	456	82
parsec.swaptions	1342	607	162
parsec.vips	87803	36611	8976
parsec.x264	48405	16675	2849
splash2.barnes	2188	1222	395
splash2.cholesky	7086	2530	930
splash2.fft	1048	387	88
splash2.fmm	3868	1447	237
splash2.lu_cb	1097	408	81
splash2.lu_ncb	840	303	73
splash2.ocean_cp	9531	2301	410
splash2.ocean_ncp	5465	1381	301
splash2.radiosity	5250	1917	269
splash2.radix	777	354	120
splash2.raytrace	6049	2368	359
splash2.volrend	8739	3723	1009
splash2.water_nsquared	2188	703	181
splash2.water_spatial	2437	833	211

Table 2: TSan Instrumentation Statistics (under compiler option -flto -O0)

Program	Warnings Count	Time (Sec)
parsec.blackscholes	0	63.77
parsec.bodytrack	59	366.35
parsec.canneal	41934	464.28
parsec.dedup	0	1985.48
parsec.fluidanimate	1	593.70
parsec.streamcluster	1294	5341.89
parsec.swaptions	0	20.47

Table 3: Valgrind data race report for parsec benchmarks using simulation inputs with 16 threads (under compiler option -flto -00)

Program	Race warnings	Total Time
parsec.blackscholes	0	1 m 2.924 s
parsec.bodytrack	63	4m55.364s
parsec.canneal	42041	7 m 36.824 s
parsec.dedup	0	27 m 16.520 s
parsec.ferret	0	0
parsec.fluidanimate	0	10 m 8.280 s
parsec.streamcluster	1316	84m12.944s
parsec.swaptions	0	4 m 6.676 s
parsec.vips	10384	19m54.096s
parsec.x264	920146	32m39.956s
splash2.barnes	0	0 m 1.480 s
splash2.cholesky	0	0 m 0.784 s
splash2.fft	0	0 m 0.768 s
splash2.fmm	0	0 m 0.840 s
splash2.lu_cb	0	0 m 0.856 s
splash2.lu_ncb	0	0 m 0.876 s
splash2.ocean_cp	0	0 m 0.960 s
splash2.ocean_ncp	0	0 m 0.904 s
splash2.radiosity	0	$0 \mathrm{m} 3.780 \mathrm{s}$
splash2.radix	0	0 m 0.828 s
splash2.raytrace	0	0 m 0.864 s
splash2.volrend	0	0 m 0.776 s
splash2.water_nsquared	0	0 m 0.952 s
splash2.water_spatial	0	0 m 0.944 s

Table 4: Valgrind data race report for parsec benchmarks using simulation inputs with 16 threads (under compiler option -flto -O0)

		I		I		I	
	Reads	Writes	Same thread	Another thread	Thread created	Lock	Unlock
parsec.blackscholes	718341129	555240430	1272271821	69348414	5	0	0
parsec.bodytrack	18803218920	10620341322	45096163095	1108277571	6	27774	27774
parsec.dedup	3012014550	3449596370	6703978198	239550770	15	548504	548504
*parsec.ferret							
parsec.fluidanimate	15499239043	9004451244	34626646787	871973803	5	4402100	4402100
parsec.raytrace	37407156989	27428638310	75372855802	414	5	22	22
parsec.streamcluster	55483706359	8344088145	62201163149	7896765779	9	115704	115704
parsec.swaptions	21020223624	4565945891	36573840102	940035163	5	0	0
parsec.vips	22140584399	8850071396	46078131202	2399680437	7	25655	25655
parsec.x264	136435977201	42430536547	234983597568	631911254	256	17200	17200
splash2.barnes	1492825769	1009970816	2822122316	177324320	4	68979	68979
splash2.fft	37433910	13593099	72139263	824858	4	53	53
splash2.fmm	185527433	6644797	208207974	2312613	4	1112	1112
splash2.lu_cb	426484609	114526095	595486936	21304096	4	473	473
splash2.lu_ncb	416255595	111823474	595648821	19638964	4	473	473
splash2.ocean_cp	615112705	104846529	937666585	19155012	4	7132	7132
splash2.ocean_ncp	840380414	103749891	1113302578	158979926	4	6922	6922
splash2.radiosity	8181232624	3709922702	16578904682	609993639	4	1312971	1312971
splash2.radix	30107430	19796004	63532201	2285498	4	113	113
splash2.raytrace	205607190	57687515	271999733	18773175	4	76740	76740
splash2.volrend	29783924	11014570	39628364	7711532	4	2440	2440
splash2.water_nsquared	504756939	107400563	667540204	72817240	4	6353	6353
splash2.water_spatial	425754990	94789606	634509203	78060332	4	218	218

Table 5: TSan stats with sim inputs of 4 threads (-fl to -O0) $\,$

	D . 1.	XX7 *4	C 41 1	A 41 41 1	(T) 1 1 1	т 1	TT 1 1
	Reads	Writes	Same thread	Another thread	Thread created	LOCK	Unlock
parsec.blackscholes	718346583	555243070	1232918874	167399503	17	0	0
parsec.bodytrack	18803361154	10620441669	44782600945	1277852605	18	30899	30899
parsec.dedup	3018304143	3451449822	6787565705	241635211	51	544447	544447
*parsec.ferret							
parsec.fluidanimate	15669557555	9037159698	35197084050	1628354229	17	14019836	14019836
parsec.raytrace	37407159075	27428639477	75372861710	957	17	58	58
parsec.streamcluster	66308089986	12096654115	80994784283	19631825712	33	636218	636218
parsec.swaptions	21020224056	4565946035	36568179789	954109112	17	0	0
parsec.vips	22140170982	8850230085	45939795987	2735925812	19	33436	33436
parsec.x264	135883526982	42252542277	232953230265	704000171	256	18820	18820
splash2.barnes	1687036207	1009982147	2906344087	434664545	16	69561	69561
splash2.fft	37578522	13653835	72036880	1176114	16	233	233
splash2.fmm	3145819	1108617	5171891	103893	16	122	122
splash2.lu_cb	428918065	115429803	574877592	71354298	16	2093	2093
splash2.lu_ncb	418564179	112595794	573463588	72797425	16	2093	2093
splash2.ocean_cp	626006740	108123775	942764602	40415870	16	31228	31228
splash2.ocean_ncp	842713849	104698138	1052225655	313167816	16	30298	30298
splash2.radiosity	8269300550	3739673019	15928772052	1314727824	16	1404503	1404503
splash2.radix	32011402	20306228	65360322	3826822	16	517	517
splash2.raytrace	208180416	58212811	270190700	40510280	16	76788	76788
splash2.volrend	31756753	11113044	38902946	15724634	16	3438	3438
splash2.water_nsquared	508451427	108307475	658687685	139604442	16	19325	19325
splash2.water_spatial	425766066	94792780	629825838	89572231	16	926	926

Table 6: TSan stats with sim inputs of 16 threads (-fl to -O0) $\,$

Program	Race warnings	Total Time	Race warnings	Total Time
	(4 threads)	(4 threads)	(16 threads)	(16 threads)
parsec.blackscholes	0	4m20.216s	0	4m42.536s
parsec.bodytrack	9	125 m17.432 s	11	131m42.692s
*parsec.canneal	0	17m47.992s	0	18m22.012s
parsec.dedup	0	24m28.212s	0	26m54.492s
*parsec.ferret	0	0 m 10.064 s	0	0 m 9.940 s
parsec.fluidanimate	1	111m34.208s	1	123 m 2.620 s
parsec.raytrace	2	382 m 34.544 s	2	391 m 49.096 s
parsec.streamcluster	17	224 m 54.612 s	20	362 m 38.612 s
parsec.swaptions	0	92m42.964s	0	97 m 28.616 s
parsec.vips	1	127m7.076s	2	135 m 23.380 s
parsec.x264	77	777 m 6.396 s	67	808 m 52.088 s
splash2.barnes	118	8m31.340s	100	10 m 58.704 s
*splash2.cholesky	0	0 m 10.404 s	0	0 m 9.640 s
splash2.fft	0	0 m 10.832 s	0	0 m 11.408 s
splash2.fmm	145	1 m 14.956 s	21	0 m1.288 s
splash2.lu_cb	0	1 m 37.004 s	0	1 m 44.392 s
splash2.lu_ncb	0	1 m 34.784 s	0	1 m 42.596 s
splash2.ocean_cp	1	2m33.472s	1	2m50.624s
splash2.ocean_ncp	2	3m25.632s	2	4m12.296s
splash2.radiosity	373	47m27.576s	0	50 m 51.992 s
splash2.radix	0	0 m 10.756 s	0	0 m11.964 s
splash2.raytrace	2	0 m 48.836 s	3	0 m 53.248 s
splash2.volrend	26	0 m 14.008 s	37	0 m 25.092 s
splash2.water_nsquared	0	1 m 51.428 s	0	2m4.100s
splash2.water_spatial	0	1 m 40.940 s	0	1 m 47.492 s

Table 7: TSan race report using sim inputs with 4/16 threads (-flto -O0) on CORG-TESLA Note that parsec.canneal, splash2.cholesky can not run after TSan intrumentation.

D	4 Th	reads	16 T	hreads
Program	Native	TSan	Native	TSan
parsec.blackscholes	0 m 2.276 s	0 m 18.464 s	0 m 2.360 s	0 m 22.624 s
parsec.bodytrack	0 m 15.060 s	8m35.412s	0 m 15.528 s	9m28.368s
*parsec.canneal	0 m 10.080 s	1 m 43.604 s	0 m 10.008 s	1 m 50.628 s
parsec.dedup	0 m 25.124 s	2m24.392s	0 m 32.548 s	3m25.516s
*parsec.ferret	0 m 10.040 s	0 m 9.952 s	0 m 10.060 s	0 m 10.016 s
parsec.fluidanimate	0 m 12.200 s	8m39.848s	0 m 13.240 s	10 m 31.972 s
parsec.raytrace	0 m 52.356 s	27 m 59.244 s	0 m 53.312 s	28m36.068s
parsec.streamcluster	0 m 20.380 s	19m14.276s	1 m 11.008 s	119 m 6.380 s
parsec.swaptions	0 m 14.528 s	6 m 19.440 s	0 m 15.260 s	6m39.444s
parsec.vips	0 m 13.648 s	8m13.408s	0 m 14.336 s	9m13.280s
parsec.x264	1 m 30.504 s	52m34.376s	1 m 33.928 s	54m45.052s
splash2.barnes	0 m1.604 s	0 m 41.480 s	0 m 2.664 s	1 m 8.288 s
*splash2.cholesky	0 m 0.044 s	0 m 0.672 s	0 m 2.028 s	0 m 0.632 s
splash2.fft	0 m 0.044 s	0 m 0.720 s	0 m 0.064 s	0 m 0.768 s
splash2.fmm	0 m 0.008 s	0 m 15.560 s	0 m 0.004 s	0 m 0.360 s
splash2.lu_cb	0 m 0.340 s	0 m 6.788 s	0 m 0.412 s	0 m 7.428 s
splash2.lu_ncb	0 m 0.356 s	$0 \mathrm{m} 6.760 \mathrm{s}$	0 m 0.432 s	0 m 7.344 s
splash2.ocean_cp	0 m 0.404 s	0 m 10.104 s	0 m 0.672 s	0 m 14.968 s
splash2.ocean_ncp	0 m 0.576 s	0 m 13.584 s	0 m 0.740 s	0 m 42.112 s
splash2.radiosity	0 m 5.508 s	3m35.504s	0 m 8.364 s	4m32.364s
splash2.radix	0 m 0.072 s	0 m 0.788 s	0 m 0.092 s	0 m 0.996 s
splash2.raytrace	0 m 0.168 s	0 m 4.192 s	0 m 0.204 s	0 m 4.796 s
splash2.volrend	0 m 0.036 s	0 m 5.892 s	0 m 1.776 s	0 m 23.596 s
splash2.water_nsquared	0 m 0.296 s	$0 \mathrm{m} 8.024 \mathrm{s}$	0 m 0.356 s	0 m 10.432 s
splash2.water_spatial	0 m 0.256 s	0 m 7.080 s	0 m 0.352 s	0 m 8.648 s

Table 8: Runtime comparison between native run and TSan under two configurations on ${\rm CORG\text{-}TESLA}$

Program	Race warnings	Total Time	Race warnings	Total Time
	(4 threads)	(4 threads)	(16 threads)	(16 threads)
parsec.blackscholes	0	0 m 16.970 s	0	0m18.110s
parsec.bodytrack	9	7 m 26.560 s	9	7 m 30.460 s
*parsec.canneal	0	1 m 33.010 s	0	1 m 33.500 s
parsec.dedup	0	1 m 59.380 s	0	5m33.010s
*parsec.ferret	0	0 m 10.160 s	0	0 m 10.370 s
parsec.fluidanimate	1	7 m 38.060 s	1	8m15.010s
parsec.raytrace	2	24 m 1.880 s	2	24m5.150s
parsec.streamcluster	17	14m46.680s	21	54m7.370s
parsec.swaptions	0	5m13.560s	0	5m16.480s
parsec.vips	0	0 m 0.010 s	0	0 m 0.010 s
parsec.x264	72	44m49.580s	62	44m46.310s
splash2.barnes	122	0 m 33.630 s	123	0 m 46.010 s
*splash2.cholesky	0	0 m 0.570 s	0	0 m 0.530 s
splash2.fft	0	0 m 0.570 s	0	0 m 0.590 s
splash2.fmm	151	0 m 3.340 s	21	0 m 0.220 s
splash2.lu_cb	0	0 m 5.440 s	0	0 m 5.480 s
splash2.lu_ncb	0	$0 \mathrm{m} 5.420 \mathrm{s}$	0	0 m 5.490 s
splash2.ocean_cp	1	$0 \mathrm{m} 8.770 \mathrm{s}$	1	0 m 10.010 s
splash2.ocean_ncp	2	0 m12.310 s	2	0 m13.300 s
splash2.radiosity	0	3 m 10.270 s	536	3m23.740s
splash2.radix	0	$0 \mathrm{m} 0.600 \mathrm{s}$	0	0 m 0.670 s
splash2.raytrace	1	0 m 3.520 s	1	0 m 3.710 s
splash2.volrend	21	0 m 2.640 s	29	0 m 7.140 s
splash2.water_nsquared	0	0 m 6.670 s	0	0 m 7.170 s
splash2.water_spatial	0	0 m 5.980 s	0	0 m 6.100 s

Table 9: TSan race report using sim inputs with 4/16 threads (-flto -O0) Note that parsec.canneal, splash2.cholesky can not run after TSan intrumentation on JINGLE

D	4 Th	reads	16 T	hreads
Program	Native	TSan	Native	TSan
parsec.blackscholes	0 m 2.970 s	0 m 16.970 s	0 m 2.910 s	0 m 18.110 s
parsec.bodytrack	0 m 13.860 s	7 m 26.560 s	0 m13.850 s	7 m 30.460 s
parsec.canneal	0 m 10.780 s	1 m 33.010 s	0 m 10.760 s	1 m 33.500 s
parsec.dedup	0 m 20.300 s	1 m 59.380 s	0 m 21.370 s	5m33.010s
parsec.ferret	0 m 10.100 s	0 m 10.160 s	0 m 10.180 s	0 m 10.370 s
parsec.fluidanimate	0 m 10.690 s	$7\mathrm{m}38.060\mathrm{s}$	0 m11.360 s	8 m 15.010 s
parsec.raytrace	0 m 53.320 s	24 m 1.880 s	0 m 53.310 s	24 m 5.150 s
parsec.streamcluster	0 m 18.390 s	14m46.680s	0 m 56.820 s	54 m 7.370 s
parsec.swaptions	0 m 15.180 s	5m13.560s	0 m 15.140 s	5m16.480s
parsec.vips	0 m 0.000 s	0 m 0.010 s	0 m 0.000 s	0 m 0.010 s
parsec.x264	1 m 15.690 s	44m49.580s	1 m 15.620 s	44m46.310s
splash2.barnes	0 m 1.410 s	0 m 33.630 s	0 m 2.890 s	0 m 46.010 s
splash2.cholesky	0 m 0.240 s	0 m 0.570 s	0 m 1.520 s	0 m 0.530 s
splash2.fft	0 m 0.030 s	0 m 0.570 s	0 m 0.030 s	0 m 0.590 s
splash2.fmm	0 m 0.010 s	0 m 3.340 s	0 m 0.000 s	0 m 0.220 s
splash2.lu_cb	0 m 0.190 s	0 m 5.440 s	0 m 0.190 s	0 m 5.480 s
splash2.lu_ncb	0 m 0.240 s	0 m 5.420 s	0 m 0.230 s	0 m 5.490 s
splash2.ocean_cp	0 m 0.280 s	0 m 8.770 s	0 m 0.330 s	0 m 10.010 s
splash2.ocean_ncp	0 m 0.410 s	0 m 12.310 s	0 m 0.430 s	0 m 13.300 s
splash2.radiosity	0 m 4.720 s	3 m 10.270 s	0 m 8.230 s	3m23.740s
splash2.radix	0 m 0.040 s	0 m 0.600 s	0 m 0.050 s	0 m 0.670 s
splash2.raytrace	0 m 0.150 s	$0 \mathrm{m} 3.520 \mathrm{s}$	0 m 0.140 s	0 m 3.710 s
splash2.volrend	0 m 0.000 s	0 m 2.640 s	0 m 1.540 s	0 m 7.140 s
splash2.water_nsquared	0 m 0.260 s	$0 \mathrm{m} 6.670 \mathrm{s}$	0 m 0.280 s	0 m 7.170 s
splash2.water_spatial	0 m 0.210 s	$0 \mathrm{m} 5.980 \mathrm{s}$	0 m 0.220 s	$0 \mathrm{m} 6.100 \mathrm{s}$

Table 10: Runtime comparison between native run and TS an under two configurations on ${\tt JINGLE}$