



India's Myanmar Raid Won't Deter Pakistani Terrorism



June 23, 2015 *Topic:* Security *Region:* Asia *Tags:* Pakistan, India, Myanmar

India won't be able to deter terrorists from Pakistan—who want to attack India no matter what—because no militant group is fully controlled by Pakistan.

by David J. Karl

By using this website, you agree to our use of cookies. This use includes personalization of content and ads, and traffic analytics.



Consider the complexity of South Asia's security dynamics: the other day India conducts a well-publicized commando assault on ethno-nationalist separatists sheltering in its eastern neighbor of Myanmar. But the deterrent signal the Indian government wants to send is really directed westward, at Pakistan and the religiously-inspired militants who have taken root there.

The Myanmar raid has sparked a lively debate inside India over Prime Minister Narendra Modi's approach to national security and his more muscular posture on cross-border terrorism. But left unaddressed in the debate is the most important question: Is the deterrent signal New Delhi wants Islamabad to absorb all that relevant to the gravest terrorist threats India faces from that direction?

The action in Myanmar is hardly the first time the Indian army has undertaken cross-border raids into neighboring countries. But consonant with the hard line Modi has adopted toward Pakistan, his government is trying to extract maximum deterrence value. Rajyavardhan Singh Rathore, a retired army colonel who now serves as India's junior information minister, has been at the forefront of this effort. Immediately after the raid, he stated in a television interview that the strike "is undoubtedly a message to all nations that harbor any intentions—be it the west or the specific country we went into right now. Even if there are groups within countries that harbor terror intentions, we will choose the time and the place of hitting them."

Speaking to the print media, Rathore elaborated that "We will not tolerate any strikes on India or Indians. We'll always wield the initiative on either being friendly or engaging in aggressive action. We will strike at a place and at a time of our choosing." He added that "This is a message for all countries, including Pakistan, and groups harboring terror intent towards India. A terrorist is a terrorist and has no other identity. We will strike when we want to."

Although Rathore has been criticized for jingoistic boasting, the message he delivered was one the Modi government wanted to articulate. Indeed, Minister of Defense Manohar Parrikar was beating the same drum. He declared that the commando mission signaled a decisive turn in how New Delhi responds to cross-border terrorism, adding in a gibe at Pakistan that “Those who fear India’s new posture have started reacting.” The *Times of India* reported that “the government made it clear that [the Myanmar action] was not a one-off operation but symbolized its decision not to be constrained by borders and to be preemptive in dealing with terror threats.”

The raid has generated a great deal of debate about the propriety of such chest-beating and its utility to the specific challenge of jihadi attacks emanating from Pakistani soil. Some criticize the Modi government for seeking domestic political gain while embarrassing the regime in Myanmar which clearly wants to keep its anti-militancy cooperation under wraps. Others question the wisdom of highlighting operational details about an instrument of state power that should properly remain in the shadows. And still others doubt whether a similar special-forces mission can even be undertaken against Pakistan-based targets.

Related



Billions Could Die If India and Pakistan Start a Nuclear War



India's Mighty Nuclear Arsenal Could Kill Millions of People in a War



Did India's Special Forces Just Send 'A Message' to China and Pakistan?

Unexamined in the discussion, however, is the critical question of whether the deterrence signals India is transmitting are even applicable to the threats emanating from Pakistan. The bombastic attitude in New Delhi these days fails to differentiate between jihadi groups over which Pakistan has some control and uses to its own strategic purposes as opposed to the large number of outfits that operate in defiance of the Pakistani state and see triggering unintended conflict between New Delhi and Islamabad as a way to advance their own interests. This is a challenge that can be summed up as the “Sorcerer’s Apprentice problem,” from Goethe’s classic tale about the dangers of conjuring up proxies one cannot ultimately handle. And it is something that U.S. Defense Secretary Robert Gates warned about more than five years ago.

The premier example of this problem may be the near-war crisis between India and Pakistan following the brazen December 2001 jihadi attack on the Indian parliament. The possibility of nuclear weapons use appeared so ominous during the prolonged military standoff which ensued that in June 2002 Washington and London actually evacuated their embassies in New Delhi. Yet it is possible the attack was not sanctioned by the Pakistani leadership but rather was a jihadi effort to divert Pakistani military attention away from the Afghan border precisely when Osama bin Laden and hundreds of Al Qaeda and Taliban fighters were fleeing out of Afghanistan following the Taliban regime’s demise in late 2001. One expert on Pakistani terrorist groups underscores this possibility by noting that the significant signals traffic in the immediate aftermath of the parliament strike between Pakistan’s chief intelligence agency and the jihadis responsible for it indicates anger on the part of the Pakistani military leadership.

87 Comments

The National Interest

 Login Recommend Tweet Share

Sort by Newest



Join the discussion...

LOG IN WITH

OR SIGN UP WITH DISQUS **Syed Ataur Rahman** • 3 years ago

I already asked you, if you'll have the guts to cross Pakistan borders by even an inch, do so. Then see the fireworks. Don't delay.

It is people like Ajay who will see the destruction of their country.

Syed Ataur Rahman

  • Reply • Share**Syed Ataur Rahman** • 3 years ago

I saw some Arun make a comment about who were the perpetrators of the Samjhota Express bombing. He has completely distorted the facts. Look what the Indian media says about the incident, which I quote:

"A Hindu extremist leader has confessed that he was involved in several bombings incidents. He claimed to have been a part of the India-Pakistan

Samjhauta Express train bombing in 2007 in which 68 Pakistani nationals were killed, said a media report released on Friday.

Swami Aseemanand is said to be a leader of Rashtriya Swayamsevak Sangh, a Hindu group that shares close ties with India's main opposition Bharatiya Janata Party. It was reported that he had been arrested by authorities in November.

According to latest issue of Tehelka weekly magazine, Aseemanand confessed before a judicial magistrate and said he and his fellow RSS activists were involved in blasts on Samjhauta Express; at mosques in Malegaon in Maharashtra state and Andhra Pradesh's state capital, Hyderabad; and a Muslim shrine in Ajmer in Rajasthan.

Aseemanand in his confession reportedly said that the bombings were in retaliation to Muslim militants attacking Hindu temples. "I told everyone that

[see more](#)  • Reply • Share**ToreBraaten** • 3 years ago

Indians are so obsessed with Pakistan. Indian portrays Pakistan like they want to see Pakistan, but the world don't become like you want.

Indian state terrorism in many Indian states, killing minorities all over India, false democracy. You should have courage to call it extremist Hindu republic of India, cause India is no secular country. Ask minorities, Its extremist country with Modi in command.

  • Reply • Share

**dita** • 3 years ago

Yes ,it's good to have strong commando action by Indian army in neighboring Myanmar ,because of the Jihadist Islamic terrorists are increasing in numbers there and hiding and hurting innocent Buddhists and Indian population.Pakistan is the only neighboring country to India, where there president ,Mr. Sharif is afraid of their own army and a few govt. officials. I think Mr Sharif might need help of very brave Indian army commandos to rescue him from terrorists ,who are multiplying in pakistan like snakes in any country backyard.India is fearless wants to end terrorism on the face of earth ,doing correct things for all his neighbor country and China and Pakistan also knows that.

^ | v • Reply • Share ›

**Syed Ataur Rahman** • 3 years ago

I think the world is coming to realize who the actual terrorists are in the sub-continent. They brow beat Bhutan, Sikkim and Bangladesh. They try to do the same against another fellow Hindu nation Nepal, but that small nation stands up bravely and protects its sovereignty. They dare not eye Sri Lanka where they were badly mauled and lost huge numbers, which they never talk about. The latest casualty of their aggression has been Myanmar, who are cursing them.

You were the cause of Samjhota Express. Your intelligence carried out the so called 26/11. Mr Kasab, it is well known is a Hindu who must be moving around with another identity. You are grossly involved in Baluchistan and FATA. Now you have been exposed by BBC of your involvement in destabilizing Karachi. The world needs no other proof of your aggression and clandestine operations. So all your propaganda is backfiring on you, much to your discomfort.

Now they say it is the turn of Pakistan. Pakistan waits Indian incursion even on an inch of its territory. They will get a befitting response where all their matas combined will not know what hit them. Indians please don't keep threatening, Just come and witness the results if you are still alive. This will be the final war. Be prepared. We are.....

Syed Ataur Rahman

^ | v • Reply • Share ›

**Royale India** → Syed Ataur Rahman • 3 years ago

We dont want just baluchistan or gilgit. We want entire pakistan and we will take it. And you cant do a thing about it.

^ | v • Reply • Share ›

**Arun** → Syed Ataur Rahman • 3 years ago

So we have US intelligence implicating the Lashkar-e-Taiba - Arif Qasmani and Daood Gilani a.k.a. David Headley in the Samjhota Express blasts -- absolutely nothing to do with India, RAW, etc. (details in my other comment - <http://nationalinterest.org...>)

I look forward to your explanation, Mr. Syed Ataur Rahman!

1 ^ | v • Reply • Share ›

**Arun** → Syed Ataur Rahman • 3 years ago

The Samjhauta Express bombing – curiously, the US declared Arif Qasmani of the Lashkar-e-Taiba as an international terrorist because of the attack on the train. Here is the UN notice on Arif Qasmani, dated

June 20, 2000:

JUNE 29, 2009:

<http://www.un.org/sc/commit...>

“Arif Qasmani has also provided financial and other support to Al-Qaida (QDe.004). As of late 2006, Qasmani provided funding to Al-Qaida members and facilitated the return of foreign fighters to their respective countries. Between 2004 and 2005, Qasmani provided Al-Qaida with supplies and weapons and facilitated the movement of Al-Qaida leaders in and out of Afghanistan. In return for Qasmani’s support, Al-Qaida provided him with operatives to support the July 2006 train bombing in Mumbai, India, and the February 2007 Samjota Express bombing in Panipat, India.”

[see more](#)

1 ^ | v • Reply • Share ›

**sullu2004** • 3 years ago

i gurantee you india will never take action in Pakistan like Myanmar due to two reasons

- 1) India has agreement with Myanmar for this kind of action
- 2) India know the response very fast and Pakistan is NOT myanmar.

^ | v • Reply • Share ›



Avatar

This comment was deleted.

**Arun** ➔ Guest • 3 years agoAam Admi, <http://www.usip.org/events/...>

This is a link to an event held by the US Institute of Peace. "The USIP study by University of Maryland Assistant Professor Madiha Afzal found that Pakistan’s education system, rather than preparing students to participate in a pluralistic and democratic society, often propagates intolerant attitudes and radicalism. The concern is not limited to private seminaries known as madrassas, which have attracted the greatest share of concern from international policymakers, but also extends to the public school system, where most Pakistanis are educated."

Around minute 1:13:20 of the video, we are told that 85% of Pakistanis aged 15 and 16 are not in school.

^ | v • Reply • Share ›

**Burhan Tariq** • 3 years ago

Indians tried this kind of adventure in 2002 but didn't dare because you need balls.

^ | v • Reply • Share ›

**Sobia** • 3 years ago

Pakistan never harbored terrorists. It was USA that created these terrorists groups to destabilize Pakistan. People of North Waziristan are peace loving and had been living peacefully. Now hiding behind the shield of USA the coward vegetarians think they can make preemptive strikes but they

forget that Pakistan is not Myanmar.

^ | v • Reply • Share ›



kaimaal38 • 3 years ago

The LET has carried out all the attacks on India..and it is definitely a lackey of the Pak Military& the ISI. the LET has been actively carrying out strikes in India & also participating as a viable component of the Al Qaeda-Taliban offensive in Afghanistan since end 2012.

The author has either failed to research his work appropriately enough or he has a vested agenda in projecting a distorted version of Pak involvement/support to terror group. Pakistani policy of hunting with the hounds and running with the hares is incidentally, the single largest reason why the US & ISAF have not been able to eliminate the AQ-taliban threat....and why Afghanistan continues to be unstable even today.

This is evidently a planted piece of writing...Rubbish!!

^ | v • Reply • Share ›



nasim raza • 3 years ago

Pakistan do not feel any thing bad by this Indian illegal act rather GOP has proved that RAW is involved in creating trouble against Pakistan. Paks got all the rights to hit RAW offices around the world particularly in Afghanistan, Iran and in Middle East.

^ | v • Reply • Share ›



Hindu Soldier in Kashmir • 3 years ago

1971 - Free Bangladesh
2022 - Free Balochistan
2030 - Free Sindhudesh

Gaand mein jor ho toh rok ke dikha do. Open Challenge. Direct Threat.

^ | v • Reply • Share ›



Atif Khan • 3 years ago

I read all the comments,Its all senseless. You guys should go back to 1940's, when the agreement was made before referendum. That's the reason these two countries fought 3 wars.

Actually there was no terrorism and interference in to other country before 1970's.It was started when India directly interfere in to the than East Pakistan by supporting mukhti bhani. Current Indian PM has accepted their involvement in 1971, for which these two countries fought another war (Bangladesh liberation War).Now there is no need to cry, for what Indian's have stated.

Muslims and Hindus used to leave together for so many years with love and respect. Why shouldn't we all leave together with love and respect.Indian's should accept their mistakes.

Love is more important.

Think about it with cool mind.

^ | v • Reply • Share ›



MeraAbhipraye • 3 years ago

This article is devoid of common sense logic and absurd in the sympathetic view it takes on the innocence of Pakistani establishment . If these attacks were conducted by renegade terrorist outfits without the involvement of Pakistani establishments, specifically its military, why did it fail to take any action on those rogue elements? The master minds of these attacks are roaming freely in Pakistan . Bringing these rogue elements to justice is one thing the establishment is blatantly

in Pakistan. Bringing these rogue elements to justice is one thing, the establishment is blatantly protecting the terrorists targeting India. All proofs in the Mumbai attack lead back to the freed culprit and the clandestine involvement of Pakistani military and its intelligence wing.

^ | v • Reply • Share ›



Ahmar Mustikhan • 3 years ago

Pakistan ISI, army have made the country extremely dangerous. Balkanization of Pakistan will make the world secure and we hope premier Narendra Modi will put this issue on his foreign policy agenda.

2 ^ | v • Reply • Share ›



Hindu Soldier in Kashmir → Ahmar Mustikhan • 3 years ago

Ahmar my friend, Azad Balochistan Zindabad.

let ur guns blaze like mukti bahini at these fascist Punjabis in Islamabad. Drive them away from your lands. Don't let them settle Chinese in Gwadar. when the iron gets hot, modi will strike.

1971 - Bangladesh

2022 - Free Balochistan

2030 - Free Sindhudesh

1 ^ | v • Reply • Share ›



Burhan Tariq → Hindu Soldier in Kashmir • 3 years ago

USSR also saw that dream now USSR dose'nt exist similarly India will not exist sooner or later. Muslims have ruled over India for 1000 years we will take it back.

2 ^ | v • Reply • Share ›



Rajiv Mitra → Burhan Tariq • 3 years ago

If you had read history I won't had to write all these here. England and during 1786 free United States has the same spine, master of conspiracy theories.. They always tried to fool stupid people like us. They couldn't fool Americans (On American land) during 1776, they couldn't fool Chinese, on Hong Kong issue... they couldn't fool Germans on their reunion on 1990... They never wanted nations like India and new born Pakistan and Bangladesh will go for Russian ally.. Thus they created militancy in Afghanistan called Taliban. They provided money food weapons, and everything you name it... You will never understand greedy British and Americans. It would have been better if Russians succeed to establish peace in Afghanistan. Things would have been different now. Secondly, no muslims ruled India for 1000 years. lol you don't know about your own prophecies ? Babur invaded Kabul in 1504 and Aurangazeb died on 1707. Meanwhile Portuguese, French and British entered in Indian sub continent as businessmen.. So, dude you can count from 1504 to 1707, merely 203 years and during these two centuries they tried to convert the most stupid coward and greedy Hindus like you in to islam and see you did it, ask your forefathers if they are still alive.. My request go back to a good school. (skip madarsas)

^ | v • Reply • Share ›



Hindu Soldier in Kashmir → Burhan Tariq • 3 years ago



blah blah blah....come and take it. readily awaiting you. what more invitation do you need? why indulge in proxy wars anymore?

lets fight like real men, lets fight face to face, man to man, bullet to bullet.

step right up and fire the first shot across international border and we will show you your place. entire indian subcontinent will be clean of muslims like it was , islam will return to deserts of Arabia and india will return to akhand bharat. the 10,000 year old home of hindus.

start the war and we will show u , ur asli aukaat.

^ | v • Reply • Share ›



sullu2004 → Hindu Soldier in Kashmir • 3 years ago

you wanna fight like man go on chines border??? hahahaha

^ | v • Reply • Share ›



Avatar This comment was deleted.



sullu2004 → Guest • 3 years ago

you are so coward u creat trouble and fight with small nabourgh and create trouble there, like in siri lanka, pakistan, nephal & buthan.

common china captured large part of land you calimed to be yours and u tried to take in back in 1962 and then hahahhahahahaha, you NEFA was opend by chines and you never tried again. cowrd only pick up on week and sumbmit in front of strogn like you Hindus.

^ | v • Reply • Share ›



Avatar This comment was deleted.



sullu2004 → Guest • 3 years ago

heheheh liar hindu low cast achoot living in fantasy

^ | v • Reply • Share ›



BDD • 3 years ago

Never read more dumb article with baseless claims than this !

If Pakistani government does not have any control over the Jihadi elements launching attacks in India, then Pakistan should welcome India to conduct strikes on these Jihadi fighters.

This looks like paid article from Saudi/Pakistani lobby that supports Jihad all over the globe.

^ | v • Reply • Share ›



balasrinivasan • 3 years ago

unfortunately simply accepting the Paki state's failure to controle both their border&the Jihadists does not absolve them or let them off the hook.Either they clean up the mess or allow others to.

^ | v • Reply • Share ›



Anil Kumar • 3 years ago

India is Terrorist sate suppressing killing its own people and spreading terror cross border .. just

because we have business relation with India it does not mean all they do is right. PM Modi during time of minister of state Gujarat killed 1000's innocent minority Muslims. RAPE, Killing, burning of its citizens are norm in India. Like India had right for freedom in 1947 from British, Others have same right.

1 ^ | v • Reply • Share ›



Iqbal • 3 years ago

Actually it is the other way around.

Terrorists are sent into Pakistan through Afghanistan into Baluchistan by India to destabilize Pakistan.

The Indian RAW intelligence agency trains and funds these terrorists through about a dozen consulates that India has along the Afghanistan, Pakistan border.

I wonder why Mr. Karl never looked into that?

1 ^ | v • Reply • Share ›



Hindu Soldier in Kashmir → Iqbal • 3 years ago

what is porki army doing then ? what is ISI doing? eating pork chops?

1 ^ | v • Reply • Share ›



MeraAbhipraye → Iqbal • 3 years ago

Because you are just imagining India's role in training Baluchistan fighters. India simply does not have the type of reach that ISI has in creating troubles within India.

1 ^ | v • Reply • Share ›



c_centina • 3 years ago

Pakistan is big country of population of 200 million people with nuclear power and high tech defense system, it would be nuclear war between these two countries who play proxy war in each other countries since their creation

^ | v • Reply • Share ›



Andrew Miller • 3 years ago

Indian Myanmar attacks are basically slapping a weak poor child who did nothing wrong, and is only suffering because he is poor and weak. India is habitual of bothering its innocent neighbors.

6 ^ | v • Reply • Share ›



sullu2004 → Andrew Miller • 3 years ago

India can take on weaker neighbours, how about China???

^ | v • Reply • Share ›



kaimaal38 → Andrew Miller • 3 years ago

Get ur facts right , Buddy.

Or r u on weed?

1 ^ | v • Reply • Share ›



Hindu Soldier in Kashmir → Andrew Miller • 3 years ago

yeah, poor "innocent" neighbors.

1 ^ | v • Reply • Share ›



MeraAbhipraye → Andrew Miller • 3 years ago

Militants/terrorists are terrorists. Which country will take killing of its 20 soldiers lightly? In fact, Myanmar should be appreciated for cooperating with India in dealing with terrorists. It showed much better resolve in dealing with terrorists than Pakistan who is blatantly sheltering terrorists targeting India.

2 ^ | v • Reply • Share ›



Arun → Andrew Miller • 3 years ago

India & Myanmar have a cooperation agreement on these matters. Myanmar has its militant rebels, too. This kind of cross border raid has happened before. Also, Myanmar has at times coerced quiescent militant groups in its territory to move to where it is more difficult for them to cross into India.

This time round some publicity was attached to send a message to Pakistan. The agitation shown by Pakistanis - civilian government, military and regular people - clearly demonstrates that a message has been received. You notice Nepal, Bhutan, Bangladesh are not bothered in the least, because they don't sponsor terrorism against India.

6 ^ | v • Reply • Share ›



Andrew Miller • 3 years ago

How can we ignore 99.9% of terrorism that India exports to Pakistan through Afghanistan as well as through a long wahga border.

3 ^ | v • Reply • Share ›



kaimaal38 → Andrew Miller • 3 years ago

Hilarious stuff, really.

^ | v • Reply • Share ›



Hindu Soldier in Kashmir → Andrew Miller • 3 years ago

you can ignore it by putting ur head to the ground and gand to the sky during namaz.

2 ^ | v • Reply • Share ›



MeraAbhipraye → Andrew Miller • 3 years ago

Looks like your military or ISI is very weak to allow India to create all sorts of issues in Pakistan. Tomorrow you may say that that presence of Al Qaeda in Pakistan is supported by India. You will also say that OBL, Mullah Omar, Jawahiri are or were RAW moles. What is next? JeM, LeT are also RAW funded? It looks like Pakistani military may also be funded by India. You have excellent denial view of your own homegrown problems and finding easy scapegoat in India's hands at everything evil in Pakistan.

1 ^ | v • Reply • Share ›



Avatar

This comment was deleted.

© Copyright 2018 Center for the National Interest All Rights Reserved