
MODULE *Sailfish*

Specification of the *Sailfish* consensus algorithm at a high level of abstraction.

EXTENDS *DomainModel*, *TLC*

CONSTANT

GST the first synchronous round (all later rounds are synchronous)

```

--algorithm Sailfish{
  variables
     $vs = \{\}$ , the vertices of the DAG
     $es = \{\}$ , the edges of the DAG
     $no\_vote = [n \in N \mapsto \{\}]$ ;  $no\_vote$  messages sent by each node
  define {
     $LeaderVertice(r) \triangleq \langle Leader(r), r \rangle$ 
     $VerticeQuorums(r) \triangleq$ 
      {  $VQ \in \text{SUBSET } vs :$ 
         $\wedge \forall v \in VQ : Round(v) = r$ 
         $\wedge \{Node(v) : v \in VQ\} \in Quorum$ 
      }
  }
  process (  $correctNode \in N \setminus F$  )
    variables  $round = 0$ ; current round
  {
l0:   while ( TRUE )
      either with (  $v = \langle self, round \rangle$  ) {
        add a new vertex to the DAG and go to the next round
         $vs := vs \cup \{v\}$ ;
        if (  $round > 0$  )
          with (  $vg \in VerticeQuorums(round - 1)$  ) {
            from  $GST$  onwards, each node receives all correct vertices of the previous round:
            when  $round \geq GST \Rightarrow (N \setminus F) \subseteq \{Node(v2) : v2 \in vg\}$ ;
            if (  $Leader(round) = self$  ) {
              we must either include the previous leader vertice,
              or a quorum of  $no\_vote$  messages.
              when
                 $\vee LeaderVertice(round - 1) \in vg$ 
                 $\vee \exists Q \in Quorum : \forall n \in Q \setminus \{self\} : LeaderVertice(round - 1) \in no\_vote[n]$ ;
              } ;
             $es := es \cup \{\langle v, pv \rangle : pv \in vg\}$ ; add the edges
            if (  $LeaderVertice(round - 1) \notin vg$  ) send  $no\_vote$  if previous leader vertice not included
               $no\_vote[self] := no\_vote[self] \cup \{LeaderVertice(round - 1)\}$ 
            } ;
             $round := round + 1$ 
          }
        }
      or with (  $r \in \{r \in R : r > round\}$  ) {

```

```

    go to a higher round
  when  $r \leq GST$ ; from  $GST$  onwards, correct nodes do not skip rounds
   $round := r$ 
}

```

Next comes our model of *Byzantine* nodes. Because the real protocol disseminates *DAG* vertices using reliable broadcast, *Byzantine* nodes cannot equivocate and cannot deviate much from the protocol (lest their messages be ignored). Also note that creating a round- r vertex commutes to the left of actions of rounds greater than r and to the right of actions of rounds smaller than R , so we can, without loss of generality, schedule *Byzantine* nodes in the same “round-by-round” manner as other nodes.

```

process (  $byzantineNode \in F$  )
  variables  $round\_ = 0$ ;
  {
l0: while ( TRUE ) {
    maybe add a vertices to the DAG:
    either with (  $v = \langle self, round\_ \rangle$  ) {
       $vs := vs \cup \{v\}$ ;
      if (  $round\_ > 0$  )
        with (  $vq \in VertexQuorums(round\_ - 1)$  ) {
           $es := es \cup \{\langle v, pv \rangle : pv \in vq\}$ 
        }
      } or skip;
      maybe send a no_vote messages:
      if (  $round\_ > 0$  )
        either
           $no\_vote[self] := no\_vote[self] \cup \{LeaderVertice(round\_ - 1)\}$ 
        or skip;
      go to the next round:
       $round\_ := round\_ + 1$ 
    }
  }
}

```

Next we define the safety and liveness properties

$$\begin{aligned}
 Committed(v) &\triangleq \\
 &\wedge v \in vs \\
 &\wedge Node(v) = Leader(Round(v)) \\
 &\wedge \exists Q \in Quorum : Q \subseteq \{Node(pv) : pv \in Parents(v, es)\} \\
 &\wedge \vee Round(v) = 0 \\
 &\quad \vee LeaderVertice(Round(v) - 1) \in Children(v, es) \\
 &\quad \vee \exists Q \in Quorum : \forall n \in Q : \\
 &\quad \quad LeaderVertice(Round(v) - 1) \in no_vote[n] \\
 Safety &\triangleq \forall v1, v2 \in vs : \\
 &\wedge Committed(v1) \\
 &\wedge Committed(v2)
 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & \wedge \text{Round}(v1) \leq \text{Round}(v2) \\ & \Rightarrow \text{Reachable}(v2, v1, es) \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \text{Liveness} & \triangleq \forall r \in R : \\ & \wedge r \geq \text{GST} \\ & \wedge \text{Leader}(r) \notin F \\ & \quad \text{all correct } \text{round} - (r + 1) \text{ vertices are created:} \\ & \wedge \forall n \in N \setminus F : \text{round}[n] > r + 1 \\ & \Rightarrow \text{Committed}(\text{LeaderVertice}(r)) \end{aligned}$$

Finally we make a few auxiliary definitions used for model-checking with *TLC*

$$\begin{aligned} \text{Quorum1} & \triangleq \{Q \in \text{SUBSET } N : \text{Cardinality}(Q) \geq \text{Cardinality}(N) - \text{Cardinality}(F)\} \\ \text{Blocking1} & \triangleq \{Q \in \text{SUBSET } N : \text{Cardinality}(Q) > \text{Cardinality}(F)\} \end{aligned}$$

The round of a node, whether *Byzantine* or not

$$\text{Round}_-(n) \triangleq \text{IF } n \in F \text{ THEN } \text{round}_-[n] \text{ ELSE } \text{round}[n]$$

Basic typing invariant:

$$\begin{aligned} \text{TypeOK} & \triangleq \\ & \wedge \forall v \in vs : \text{Node}(v) \in N \wedge \text{Round}(v) \in \text{Nat} \\ & \wedge \forall e \in es : \\ & \quad \wedge e = \langle e[1], e[2] \rangle \\ & \quad \wedge \{e[1], e[2]\} \subseteq vs \\ & \quad \wedge \text{Round}(e[1]) > \text{Round}(e[2]) \\ & \wedge \forall n \in N : \\ & \quad \wedge \text{Round}_-(n) \in \text{Nat} \\ & \quad \wedge \text{no_vote}[n] \subseteq \{\langle \text{Leader}(r), r \rangle : r \in R\} \end{aligned}$$

Sequentialization constraints, which enforce a particular ordering of the actions. Because of how actions commute, the set of reachable states remains unchanged. Essentially, we schedule all nodes “round-by-round” and in lock-steps, with the leader last. This speeds up model-checking a lot.

Note that we must always schedule the leader last because, due to its use of *no_vote* messages of other nodes, its action does not commute to the left of the actions of other nodes.

$$\begin{aligned} \text{SeqConstraints}(n) & \triangleq \\ & \quad \text{wait for all nodes to finish previous rounds:} \\ & \wedge (\text{Round}_-(n) > 0 \Rightarrow \forall n2 \in N : \text{Round}_-(n2) \geq \text{Round}_-(n)) \\ & \quad \text{wait for all nodes with lower index to leave the round (leader index is always last):} \\ & \wedge \forall n2 \in N : \text{NodeIndexLeaderLast}(n2, \text{Round}_-(n)) < \text{NodeIndexLeaderLast}(n, \text{Round}_-(n)) \Rightarrow \text{Round}_-(n) > \text{Round}_-(n2) \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \text{SeqNext} & \triangleq (\exists \text{self} \in N \setminus F : \text{SeqConstraints}(\text{self}) \wedge \text{correctNode}(\text{self})) \\ & \quad \vee (\exists \text{self} \in F : \text{SeqConstraints}(\text{self}) \wedge \text{byzantineNode}(\text{self})) \\ \text{SeqSpec} & \triangleq \text{Init} \wedge \Box[\text{SeqNext}]_{\text{vars}} \end{aligned}$$

Example assignment of leaders to rounds:

$$\text{ModLeader}(r) \triangleq \text{NodeSeq}[(r \% \text{Cardinality}(N)) + 1]$$

Constraint to stop the model checker:

$$\begin{aligned} \text{StateConstraint} &\triangleq \\ \text{LET } \text{Max}(S) &\triangleq \text{CHOOSE } x \in S : \forall y \in S : y \leq x \text{ IN} \\ &\forall n \in N : \text{Round_}(n) \in 0 \dots (\text{Max}(R) + 1) \end{aligned}$$

Some properties we expect to be violated:

$$\begin{aligned} \text{Falsy1} &\triangleq \neg(\\ &\quad \wedge \text{Committed}(\langle \text{Leader}(1), 1 \rangle) \\ &) \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \text{Falsy2} &\triangleq \neg(\\ &\quad \wedge \text{Committed}(\langle \text{Leader}(0), 0 \rangle) \\ &\quad \wedge \neg \text{Committed}(\langle \text{Leader}(1), 1 \rangle) \\ &\quad \wedge \neg \text{Committed}(\langle \text{Leader}(2), 2 \rangle) \\ &\quad \wedge \text{Committed}(\langle \text{Leader}(3), 3 \rangle) \\ &) \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \text{Falsy3} &\triangleq \neg(\\ &\quad \wedge \text{Committed}(\text{LeaderVertice}(0)) \\ &\quad \wedge \exists Q \in \text{Quorum} : \forall n \in Q : \text{LeaderVertice}(0) \in \text{no_vote}[n] \\ &\quad \wedge \text{round}[\text{Leader}(1)] > 1 \\ &\quad \wedge \langle \text{LeaderVertice}(1), \text{LeaderVertice}(0) \rangle \notin \text{es} \\ &) \end{aligned}$$
