

# COMP 424 A4 Solution

Question 1. (POS tagging).

(a) Let C = "conjunction", N = "noun", V = "verb", A = "adjective".  
then the smoothed initial probability would be:

$$\pi = \begin{pmatrix} \pi_C \\ \pi_N \\ \pi_V \\ \pi_A \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} 2+1/4+4 \\ 0+1/4+4 \\ 2+1/4+4 \\ 0+1/4+4 \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} 3/8 \\ 1/8 \\ 3/8 \\ 1/8 \end{pmatrix}$$

The smoothed transition matrix:

$$A = \begin{pmatrix} a_{cc} & a_{cN} & a_{cv} & a_{cj} \\ a_{nc} & a_{NN} & a_{nv} & a_{nj} \\ a_{vc} & a_{vN} & a_{vv} & a_{vj} \\ a_{jc} & a_{jN} & a_{sv} & a_{jj} \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} \frac{0+1}{2+4} & \frac{2+1}{2+4} & \frac{0+1}{2+4} & \frac{0+1}{2+4} \\ \frac{0+1}{5+4} & \frac{1+1}{5+4} & \frac{3+1}{5+4} & \frac{1+1}{5+4} \\ \frac{0+1}{6+4} & \frac{3+1}{6+4} & \frac{3+1}{6+4} & \frac{0+1}{6+4} \\ \frac{0+1}{0+4} & \frac{0+1}{0+4} & \frac{0+1}{0+4} & \frac{0+1}{0+4} \end{pmatrix}$$

$$= \begin{pmatrix} \frac{1}{6} & \frac{1}{2} & \frac{1}{6} & \frac{1}{6} \\ \frac{1}{9} & \frac{2}{9} & \frac{4}{9} & \frac{2}{9} \\ \frac{1}{10} & \frac{2}{5} & \frac{2}{5} & \frac{1}{10} \\ \frac{1}{4} & \frac{1}{4} & \frac{1}{4} & \frac{1}{4} \end{pmatrix}$$

The smoothed emission matrix:

$$B = \begin{pmatrix} b_{\text{that}}^c & b_{\text{is}}^c & b_{\text{not}}^c & b_{\text{it}}^c & b_{\text{good}}^c \\ b_{\text{that}}^N & b_{\text{is}}^N & b_{\text{not}}^N & b_{\text{it}}^N & b_{\text{good}}^N \\ b_{\text{that}}^v & b_{\text{is}}^v & b_{\text{not}}^v & b_{\text{it}}^v & b_{\text{good}}^v \\ b_{\text{that}}^J & b_{\text{is}}^J & b_{\text{not}}^J & b_{\text{it}}^J & b_{\text{good}}^J \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} \frac{2+1}{2+5} & \frac{0+1}{2+5} & \frac{0+1}{2+5} & \frac{0+1}{2+5} & \frac{0+1}{2+5} \\ \frac{3+1}{6+5} & \frac{0+1}{6+5} & \frac{1+1}{6+5} & \frac{2+1}{6+5} & \frac{0+1}{6+5} \\ \frac{1+1}{8+5} & \frac{6+1}{8+5} & \frac{1+1}{8+5} & \frac{0+1}{8+5} & \frac{0+1}{8+5} \\ \frac{0+1}{1+5} & \frac{0+1}{1+5} & \frac{0+1}{1+5} & \frac{0+1}{1+5} & \frac{1+1}{1+5} \end{pmatrix}$$

$$= \begin{pmatrix} \frac{3}{7} & \frac{1}{7} & \frac{1}{7} & \frac{1}{7} & \frac{1}{7} \\ \frac{4}{11} & \frac{1}{11} & \frac{2}{11} & \frac{3}{11} & \frac{1}{11} \\ \frac{2}{13} & \frac{7}{13} & \frac{2}{13} & \frac{1}{13} & \frac{1}{13} \\ \frac{1}{6} & \frac{1}{6} & \frac{1}{6} & \frac{1}{6} & \frac{1}{3} \end{pmatrix}$$

(b) Run the forward algorithm to fill those trellis:

	not	that	good
N	$(1/8)*(2/11) = 0.0227$	$0.0227*(2/9)*(4/11) + 0.0578*(2/5)*(4/11) + 0.0536*(0.5)*(4/11) + 0.0208*(0.25)*(4/11) = 0.0219$	$0.0219*(2/9)*(1/11) + 0.00728*(2/5)*(1/11) + 0.00962*(0.5)*(1/11) + 0.00416*(0.25)*(1/11) = 0.00124$
V	$(3/8)*(2/13) = 0.0578$	$0.0227*(4/9)*(2/13) + 0.0578*(2/5)*(2/13) + 0.0536*(1/6)*(2/13) + 0.0208*(0.25)*(2/13) = 0.00728$	$0.0219*(4/9)*(1/13) + 0.00728*(2/5)*(1/13) + 0.00962*(1/6)*(1/13) + 0.00416*(0.25)*(1/13) = 0.00118$
C	$(3/8)*(1/7) = 0.0536$	$0.0227*(1/9)*(3/7) + 0.0578*(1/10)*(3/7) + 0.0536*(1/6)*(3/7) + 0.0208*(0.25)*(3/7) = 0.00962$	$0.0219*(1/9)*(1/7) + 0.00728*(1/10)*(1/7) + 0.00962*(1/6)*(1/7) + 0.00416*(0.25)*(1/7) = 0.000829$
J	$(1/8)*(1/6) = 0.0208$	$0.0227*(2/9)*(1/6) + 0.0578*(1/10)*(1/6) + 0.0536*(1/6)*(1/6) + 0.0208*(0.25)*(1/6) = 0.00416$	$0.0219*(2/9)*(1/3) + 0.00728*(1/10)*(1/3) + 0.00962*(1/6)*(1/3) + 0.00416*(0.25)*(1/3) = 0.00275$

$$\Rightarrow P(\text{not that good}) = 0.00124 + 0.00118 + 0.000829 \\ + 0.00275 = 0.006$$

(c). Following (b) we know:-

$$P(Z_4 = \text{noun} \mid X_{1:3} = \text{"not that good"}) \\ = \frac{\sum_i P(Z_3 = i, X_{1:3} = \text{"not that good"}) P(Z_4 = \text{noun} \mid Z_3 = i)}{P(X_{1:3} = \text{"not that good"})} \\ = \frac{0.00124 \times \frac{2}{9} + 0.00118 \times \frac{2}{5} + 0.000829 \times \frac{1}{2} + 0.00275 \times \frac{1}{4}}{0.006} \\ = 0.308$$

(d)

	not	that	good
N	$(1/8) * (2/11) = 0.0227$	$\max\{0.0227 * (2/9) * (4/11)$ $0.0578 * (2/5) * (4/11)$ $0.0536 * (0.5) * (4/11)$ $0.0208 * (0.25) * (4/11)\}$ $= 0.00975$	$\max\{$ $0.00975 * (2/9) * (1/11)$ $0.00357 * (2/5) * (1/11)$ $0.00383 * (0.5) * (1/11)$ $0.00149 * (0.25) * (1/11)\}$ $= 0.000197$
V	$(3/8) * (2/13) = 0.0578$	$\max\{$ $0.0227 * (4/9) * (2/13)$ $0.0578 * (2/5) * (2/13)$ $0.0536 * (1/6) * (2/13)$ $0.0208 * (0.25) * (2/13)\}$ $= 0.00357$	$\max\{$ $0.00975 * (4/9) * (1/13)$ $0.00357 * (2/5) * (1/13)$ $0.00383 * (1/6) * (1/13)$ $0.00149 * (0.25) * (1/13)\}$ $= 0.000333$
C	$(3/8) * (1/7) = 0.0536$	$\max\{$ $0.0227 * (1/9) * (3/7)$ $0.0578 * (1/10) * (3/7)$ $0.0536 * (1/6) * (3/7)$ $0.0208 * (0.25) * (3/7)\}$ $= 0.00383$	$\max\{$ $0.00975 * (1/9) * (1/7)$ $0.00357 * (1/10) * (1/7)$ $0.00383 * (1/6) * (1/7)$ $0.00149 * (0.25) * (1/7)\}$ $= 0.000155$
J	$(1/8) * (1/6) = 0.0208$	$\max\{$ $0.0227 * (2/9) * (1/6)$ $0.0578 * (1/10) * (1/6)$ $0.0536 * (1/6) * (1/6)$ $0.0208 * (0.25) * (1/6)\}$ $= 0.00149$	$\max\{$ $0.00975 * (2/9) * (1/3)$ $0.00357 * (1/10) * (1/3)$ $0.00383 * (1/6) * (1/3)$ $0.00149 * (0.25) * (1/3)\}$ $= 0.000722$

⇒ The POS tags are:

Not      that      good.  
 (conjunction) (noun)      (adjective).

Q2.

(a).  $P(A) = (0.05 \times 0.75 \times 0.85) + (0.1 \times 0.75 \times 0.15) + (0.1 \times 0.25 \times 0.85)$   
 $+ (0.75 \times 0.25 \times 0.15) = 0.0925$

$$\begin{aligned}EU(\text{with insurance}) &= -100 \times 0.0925 - 20 \times (1 - 0.0925) \\&= -27.4\end{aligned}$$

$$EU(\text{without insurance}) = -500 \times 0.0925 = -46.25$$

$$\Rightarrow \text{price} = -27.4 + 46.25 = 18.85$$

(b)  $Pr(A=1 | S=1, D=0) = 0.1$

$$Pr(A=0 | S=1, D=0) = 0.9$$

$$EU(\text{with insurance}) = -100 \times 0.1 - 20 \times 0.9 = -28$$

$$EU(\text{without insurance}) = -500 \times 0.1 = -50$$

$$\Rightarrow \text{price} = -28 + 50 = 22$$

(c).  $Pr(A=1 | D=1) = Pr(A=1 | D=1, S=0) \cdot Pr(S=0)$   
 $+ Pr(A=1 | D=1, S=1) \cdot Pr(S=1)$   
 $= 0.1 \times 0.75 + 0.75 \times 0.25 = 0.2625$

$$P_Y(A=0|D=1) = 0.7375$$

$$EU(\text{with insurance}) = -100 \times 0.2625 - 20 \times 0.7375 = -41$$

$$EU(\text{without } \sim) = -500 \times 0.2625 = -131.25$$

$$\Rightarrow \text{price} = -41 + 131.25 = 90.25$$

$$(d) EU(\text{with new insurance}) = -100 \times 0.0925 \times 0.9 \\ - 500 \times 0.0925 \times 0.1 - 20 \times (1 - 0.0925) \\ = -31.1$$

$$\Delta EU = -27.4 + 31.1 = 3.7$$

$$\Rightarrow \text{new price should be } 18.85 - 3.7 = 15.15$$

Q3.

(a).  $N = 6^6$  ( $3^6$  also makes sense).

(b). For the initial policy  $\pi_0$ , the transition matrix would be:  
 (Salad = S, yogurt = Y, hamburger = H, Burrito = B, Pizza = Z, poutine = P)

$$T^{\pi_0} = \begin{array}{c|cccccc} & S & Y & H & B & Z & P \\ \hline S & 0.2 & 0.8 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ Y & 0 & 0.2 & 0.8 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ H & 0 & 0 & 0.2 & 0.8 & 0 & 0 \\ B & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0.2 & 0.8 & 0 \\ Z & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0.2 & 0.8 \\ P & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 & 1 \end{array}$$

$$R^{\pi_0} = \begin{array}{c|c} S & 40 \\ Y & 30 \\ H & 20 \\ B & 10 \\ Z & 0 \\ P & 0 \end{array} \quad (I - \gamma T^{\pi_0}) V^{\pi_0} = R^{\pi_0}$$

therefore, by Bellman equation:

$$V^{\pi_0} = (I - \gamma T^{\pi_0})^{-1} R^{\pi_0} = \begin{pmatrix} 107.96 \\ 67.40 \\ 35.10 \\ 12.20 \\ 0 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix} \begin{matrix} S \\ Y \\ H \\ B \\ Z \\ P \end{matrix}$$

(C).

$$\pi' = \begin{array}{c|cc} & S & S \\ Y & & Y \\ H & & H \\ B & & B \\ Z & & Z \\ P & & \end{array}$$

(d) After one iteration, we'll reach the optimal policy.

$$R^{\pi} = \begin{pmatrix} 50 \\ 50 \\ 40 \\ 30 \\ 20 \\ 10 \end{pmatrix} = R^{\pi^*}$$

$$\Rightarrow V^* = (I - \gamma T^{\pi^*})^{-1} R^{\pi^*}$$

$$= \begin{pmatrix} 500 \\ 500 \\ 487.80 \\ 464.90 \\ 432.60 \\ 392.04 \end{pmatrix} \begin{array}{c} S \\ Y \\ H \\ B \\ Z \\ P \end{array}$$

(e)  $V^*$  is unique in this case, since  $V^*(s)$  is the unique solution for the system of non-linear Bellman equations:  $V^*(s) = \max_{a \in A} (R(s, a) + \gamma \sum_{s' \in S} T(s, a, s') V^*(s'))$

(f).

$$\pi^* = \begin{array}{c|c} s & s \\ y & s \\ h & y \\ b & h \\ z & b \\ p & z \end{array}$$

(g) Here both "yes" and "no" would make sense: since there's only one unique deterministic optimal policy, while there're still many non-deterministic policies that yield the same  $V^*$ .

(h). By the matrix-form Bellman equation:

$$V^{(t)} = (I - \gamma T^{\pi_t})^{-1} R^{\pi_t}$$

If we divide all health scores by 10, we'll reduce both  $V^{(t)}$  and  $R^{\pi_t}$  into  $\frac{1}{10}$  of their values. Therefore,  $V^*$  would also be  $\frac{1}{10}$  of the original values, while each

old  $\pi^*$  is still a valid optimal policy in this case.

Q4.

(a).

	t	Rt	At	Qt
	0	/	/	{1, 2, 2, 1, 0, 3}
Y	1	2	1	{2, 2, 2, 1, 0, 3}
r	2	$\sqrt{3}$	2	{2, $\sqrt{3}$ , 2, 1, 0, 3}
Y	3	1	3	{2, $\sqrt{3}$ , 1, 1, 0, 3}
Y	4	0	4	{2, $\sqrt{3}$ , 1, 0, 0, 3}
Y	5	-1	5	{2, $\sqrt{3}$ , 1, 0, -1, 3}
	6	$-\sqrt{3}$	6	{2, $\sqrt{3}$ , 1, 0, -1, $-\sqrt{3}$ }
7	-2	1	1	{0, $\sqrt{3}$ , 1, 0, -1, $-\sqrt{3}$ }
8	$-\sqrt{3}$	2	2	{0, 0, 1, 0, -1, $-\sqrt{3}$ }
9	-1	3	3	{0, 0, 0, 0, -1, $-\sqrt{3}$ }
10	0	4	4	{0, 0, 0, 0, -1, $-\sqrt{3}$ }
Y	11	1	5	{0, 0, 0, 0, 0, $-\sqrt{3}$ }
Y	12	$\sqrt{3}$	6	{0, 0, 0, 0, 0, 0}

(b)

At  $t=1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 11, 12$ , the agent must have selected a random action.

(c) For each state  $i \in A$ , the observed sequence of rewards would be:  $2\cos\left[\frac{\pi}{6}(i-1)\right]$ ,  $-2\cos\left[\frac{\pi}{6}(i-1)\right]$ ,  $2\cos\left[\frac{\pi}{6}(i-1)\right]$ ,  $\dots$ . Hence, the estimated expected reward would be:

$$2\cos\left[\frac{\pi}{6}(i-1)\right], 0, \underbrace{\frac{2\cos\left[\frac{\pi}{6}(i-1)\right]}{3}, 0, \frac{2\cos\left[\frac{\pi}{6}(i-1)\right]}{5}}, \dots$$

so  $\forall i \in A$ ,  $Q^*(i)$  will converge to 0.