UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA, DAVIS

BERKELEY • DAVIS • IRVINE • LOS ANGELES • RIVERSIDE • SAN DIEGO • SAN FRANCISCO SANTA BARBARA • SANTA CRUZ

DANIEL J. KLIEBENSTEIN

COLLEGE OF AGRICULTURAL AND ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENCES
AGRICULTURAL EXPERIMENT STATION
COOPERATIVE EXTENSION

DEPARTMENT OF PLANT SCIENCES
ONE SHIELDS AVE.
DAVIS, CALIFORNIA 95616-8746
PHONE: 530-754-7775
FAX: 530-752-9659
E-MAIL: Kliebenstein@ucdavis.edu

November 09, 2018

Dear Dr. Innes and Dr. Merchant,

We would like to respectfully resubmit our manuscript entitled "Crop domestication and pathogen virulence: Interactions of tomato and *Botrytis* genetic diversity" for possible inclusion into The Plant Cell.

The original decision gave the following central reasons for the decision.

1) Technical issues in the GWAS methods
2) The robustness of our conclusions as to the domestication effect
3) Integration of data from Zhang *et al*. 2017

We have worked to address each of these key points as listed below and in the response to reviewers. We hope that this is sufficient to address the concerns and lead to a positive decision on this manuscript. The key changes are below.

1. We have conducted the bootstrapping analysis as suggested to assess the robustness of the weak but significant domestication observations. We also worked to make it clear that we were trying to convey the message of weak but significant, as it appears that our previous draft overly conveyed the significant aspect.
2. We have included a manuscript that is in preparation that discusses the genetic structure of the *Botrytis* population in question. We will submit the *B. cinerea* genomic diversity manuscript to bioRxiv within four weeks and have included the current draft in this resubmission for the information of the editors and reviewers. We have included references to these diversity data in the current draft of our paper.
3. We have streamlined the manuscript by removing the discussion on the GEMMA based GWA as this did not affect the conclusions and solely muddied the writing.
4. We worked to integrate this work with the data and observations from the previous work on *Arabidopsis*.

I would like to note that we would prefer to keep this manuscript separate from the *Botrytis* genetic diversity manuscript. Combining the two manuscripts would lead to what we feel is an unwieldy manuscript that would have too many points to make any of them clearly.

We hope that you and the reviewers agree that the above changes help to make the manuscript admissible for inclusion into The Plant Cell.

Sincerely,

Daniel J Kliebenstein
Professor of Plant Genomics
University of California, Davis
Kliebenstein@ucdavis.edu